

2005 Modern Studies

Advanced Higher

Finalised Marking Instructions

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments.

Contents

	Page
Study Theme 1 : Comparative Politics and Research Methods	3
Study Theme 2 : Law and Order and Research Methods	10
Study Theme 3 : The European Union and Research Methods	16

STUDY THEME 1: COMPARATIVE POLITICS AND RESEARCH METHODS

SECTION A

Marks

1. Context A: Functions of Political Parties

“The Third Way is a middle way between two alternatives, such as Socialist and Capitalist political and economic policies.”

To what extent have the major political parties in the UK (including Scotland) and either the USA or Germany followed the ‘Third Way’? (30)

General points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- High quality answers will compare across their chosen countries regularly throughout the answer, rather than having a large section on the UK and a smaller section on either the USA or Germany tagged on at the end. Expect more emphasis on the UK from most candidates.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

UK (including Scotland)

Expect some reference to some of the following:

- New Labour changed policies since 1994.
- Commitment by Labour Government to Tory spending plans in 1997, not raising income tax etc.
- Willing to accept policies from left, right and centre. Look for development including up-to-date examples.
- Recent changes in the Conservative Party, especially after IDS and William Hague.
- Recent election results – Labour attracting more middle class voters.
- Scottish dimension eg differences between the Conservative Party in Scotland and the UK Conservative Party.
- Does this exclude SNP, Liberal Democrats and Scottish Socialists?

USA

Expect reference to some of the following:

- Lack of ideological stance in the USA by the Democrats and Republicans.
- The overall system of checks and balance acts to draw parties to the centre and therefore the third way.
- Republican move to the centre with George Bush?
- Lack of coherent party structures in the US leads to less party discipline in Congress. Does this make a move to the Third Way more difficult?
- Still some significant differences and battles between Democrats and Republicans eg Iraq.

Germany

Expect some reference to the following:

- Federalism.
- Coalition administrations.
- Ideological differences between SPD and CDU.
- Schroeder and SPD following New Labour and Blair.
- Policy changes of the major parties.

2. Context B: Functions of Elections

“Proportional Representation ensures a more inclusive and democratic outcome than First Past The Post.”

Discuss in relation to the UK (including Scotland) and either USA or Germany. (30)

General points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- High quality answers will compare across their chosen countries regularly throughout the answer, rather than having a large section on the UK and a smaller section on either the USA or Germany tagged on at the end. Expect more emphasis on the UK from most candidates.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Expect some reference to the UK context and comparisons between Holyrood and Westminster. Do not pass answers that do not cover Germany or the USA. Do not over-credit tokenistic responses to Germany.

Expect reference to some of the following:

- Inclusiveness – relating to minority parties gaining representation and gaining access to power ie the Liberal Democrats in a Scottish context. Expect some development for the different countries.
- Democratic – candidate will probably latch on to the proportionality dimension and compare and contrast a plurality system with a proportional system. This is to be given credit but higher order answers will be able to develop beyond higher grade type responses to give detailed, up-to-date and relevant exemplification in some detail. This would be expected for an ‘A’ pass answer.
- Comparisons based upon issues between Holyrood and Westminster eg tuition fees and free personal care for the elderly.
- Success of Greens in Scotland and Germany.
- Success of the small parties.
- Do not over-credit answers that deal with the mechanics of PR relative to FPTP unless they relate to the context directly.

3. Context C: Decision-making in Central Government

“The mass media have more influence on central government than pressure groups and public opinion.”

Discuss in relation to central government in the UK and either the USA or Germany. (30)

General points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- High quality answers will compare across their chosen countries regularly throughout the answer, rather than having a large section on the UK and a smaller section on either the USA or Germany tagged on at the end. Expect more emphasis on the UK from most candidates.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Expect reference to some of the following:

UK (including Scotland)

- Conflict with Iraq – government going against public opinion.
- Influence of the press over Labour and the EU/Euro.
- Fuel and war protests.
- Union activity.
- Foot and Mouth issues before 2001 election.
- Tension within the Scottish context due to coalition government.
- Countryside Alliance.
- Credit any other relevant well-discussed analysis.

USA

- Conflict with Iraq – loss of public support for British.
- Clinton’s failed health-care reforms.
- Gun control.
- Environmental issues.
- Public support for the war on terrorism.
- Credit any other relevant well-discussed analysis.

Germany

- Influence of the Greens regarding environmental issues and nuclear policy.
- Government’s attempts to appease public opinion on Germany’s position with regard to the war on terrorism and Iraq and distancing itself from the USA’s hard line approach.
- Government was very pro-Euro and did not waver despite growing concerns in public opinion in the period 1999 onwards.
- Credit any other relevant well-discussed analysis.

4. Context D: Central and Devolved/State Government

“In theory, devolution of power gives governments the opportunity to be more responsive to local and regional needs. In reality, there is little scope to act and power remains firmly with central government.”

Critically assess the views expressed in this statement. Answer in relation to the UK (including Scotland) and either the USA or Germany. (30)

General points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- High quality answers will compare across their chosen countries regularly throughout the answer, rather than having a large section on the UK and a smaller section on either the USA or Germany tagged on at the end. Expect more emphasis on the UK from most candidates.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Expect reference to some of the following:

- Discussion of ‘theory’ and ‘reality’.
- Opinion poll evidence suggests that many people in Scotland and Wales are unhappy with the performance of the Parliament/Assembly and they are not responsive to local/regional needs.
- Most don’t want to get rid of the Parliament/Assembly.
- Calls for the Scottish Parliament to have more powers eg more powers to encourage immigration to reverse decline in population and fiscal autonomy.
- Plans of central government versus powers of devolved governments.
- Are devolved parliaments closer to the people?
- Expect candidates to compare and contrast with either the USA or Germany throughout this essay. Some developed examples necessary for a good pass.

SECTION B

Marks

5. In order to gain an insight into the views of grass roots members of a political party, a researcher joined a policy-making forum of the party and took part in the discussions.

(a) What are the advantages of this type of research over non-participant observation? (5)

- Subjects being observed are more likely to be relaxed, open and truthful when they feel they are talking to one of their own.
- The observer is able to guide discussion towards areas they are interested in.
- The observer can invite subjects to develop points or opinions to get follow-up information.
- Develop an empathy with the subjects and gain their confidence.
- Any other relevant factors.

(b) What difficulties might a researcher face in producing valid findings from their observations? (5)

- Personal involvement – may get too close to the subjects to make an unbiased assessment.
- Difficulty of recording the information, particularly from heated discussions.
- Much of the assertions will be based on the observer's opinion/ interpretation of what was said/done.
- Any other relevant factors.

(c) What ethical considerations would need to be taken into account when conducting such a piece of research? (5)

- Confidentiality.
- Obtaining information under false pretences.
- Duty bound to report accurately.
- Any other relevant factors.

6. (a) **Outline the strengths and weaknesses of this source for a researcher interested in measuring public support for ID cards.** (10)

- A maximum of three marks for any one fully-developed point.
- If only strengths or weaknesses are alluded to, go to a maximum of six marks.
- The answer does not have to be equally balanced for full marks. It could be achieved by six marks for strengths and four marks for weaknesses or vice versa.
- Look for development and exemplification of points rather than listing. Do not over-credit list type responses as the candidates must show an understanding as well as a knowledge of the issue under discussion.
- Points to consider might include – MORI are an internationally respected polling company, size of the sample, areas of public opinion on ID cards not covered by the source, telephone interviews, weighting, rounding and date.

(b) **Suggest, giving reasons, one alternative method by which the information could be presented in order to make it easier for a researcher to use.** (5)

- Go up to three marks for a well-developed point. Two points required for full marks.
- Alternative methods might include graphs, pie-charts, tables, use of colour and headings. All marks given for the explanation not the choice of method.

STUDY THEME 2: LAW AND ORDER AND RESEARCH METHODS

SECTION A

Marks

1. Context A: Theories of Law and Order

“The role of lawmakers is to balance individual rights with the needs of the state. However, recent legislation appears to have tilted the balance dangerously in favour of the state”

To what extent is there evidence to support this view? (30)

General Points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Expect candidates to have a balance of theory backed up by exemplification. This is a question which lends itself to analysis and responses should be easy to differentiate to this basis.

For:

- ID cards introduced despite opposition from civil rights groups.
- Anti-terrorist legislation.
- Proposals to change burden on proof.
- UK opted out of Nice convention allowing imprisonment without trial in the UK.
- Refusal to allow public inquiry into collusion of security forces with paramilitaries in killings of human rights lawyers in Northern Ireland.
- Amnesty International has highlighted human rights abuse.
- Gulf War Syndrome where individuals have been refused acknowledgement of this condition let alone compensation.
- Anti-terrorist legislation – home detention on an indefinite basis.

Against:

- Human Rights Act.
- Whistle blowers.
- Freedom of Information Act.
- Data Protection Act.
- Health and Safety legislation.
- Working time directives introduced even though not good for the economy.

2. Context B: Crime and Public Disorder in the UK

Examine the belief that the highest crime levels are always found in the poorest urban areas.

(30)

General Points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

For:

- Crimes of violence, car theft, burglary, criminal damage have highest incidence in these areas.
- Expect to find poverty, frustration, alienation etc in these areas.
- Greatest concentration of people, therefore highest number of crimes.
- Chicago School model crime rates remain constant in an area though residents move on.
- Less sense of community and therefore less social control in urban areas leading to high crime.
- More single parents and therefore less social control in urban areas leading to high crime.
- Social class explanations eg Marxism, Left Realism.

Against:

- Crime numbers higher but rates open to dispute.
- Some crimes rural based eg stealing cattle, sheep and horses.
- White collar crime located in CBD and suburbs.
- Police efforts concentrated in these areas, therefore more likely to get higher figures.
- Much crime goes unrecorded/unreported eg domestic abuse.
- Crimes such as drug abuse are high in some rural areas eg North East.
- Will depend on the definition of levels (total or per capita?)

3. Context C: Responses to Crime and Public Disorder in the UK

How successfully have the police adapted their methods to deal with the challenges of crime in the 21st century? (30)

General Points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Candidates may choose to examine this topic on a macro or micro level.

At macro level expect reference to:

- Reassurance policing.
- Problem orientated policing.
- Zero tolerance policing.
- Spotlight campaign – Strathclyde, Safer Central, Central Scotland etc.
- Creation of national FBI style police force.
- Creation of specialist units eg to deal with Internet fraud and child abuse.

On a micro level references may be made to:

- Use of DNA – used in wide range of crimes.
- CCTV.
- Speed cameras.
- Number plate recognition cameras.
- Tracking devices, bugs, helicopters.
- Greater use of firearms.
- Greater awareness of cultural sensitivities.
- Shared intelligence network among forces.

Discussion will probably centre round the effectiveness of these measures. Reward candidates highly who give some (credible) statistical back-up to their arguments.

Arguments may also cover whether crime is rising/falling – particularly reward those candidates who identify specific areas of crime that are falling and contrast this with ones where rates are rising.

4. Context D: The Penal System

“Experience has shown that the most effective method of deterring criminals is imprisonment.”

Examine the validity of this claim.

(In your answer you may refer to examples from outwith the UK)

(30)

General Points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

This question allows candidate to bring in a wide range of knowledge from both the UK and abroad. Credit highly candidates who bring in exemplification from outwith the UK; however, do not penalise those candidates who base their responses solely on the UK experience.

Expect reference to some of the following:

For:

- Most criminals try to avoid prisons, therefore must be a deterrent to some extent.
- Provides a place for concentrated rehabilitation over a long period of time.
- If prison wasn't successful then the UK (and countries in every part of the globe) wouldn't be sending them there.
- There is a belief among the public and general consensus among politicians that incarceration works.
- Many developed countries eg USA going for higher incarceration rates.
- Alternatives regarded by many criminals as a soft option.
- Alternatives don't work – fines not paid, tags have technical problems.
- Crime rates for burglary have dropped since sentences increased.

Against:

- Recidivism rates for prison are very high.
- UK incarcerates more than just about any European country and has one of the highest crime rates.
- Alternative schemes such as electronic tagging restrict freedom but keep offenders out of a criminal academy – re-offending rates are significantly lower than for prison.
- Capital punishment is a better deterrent than incarceration.
- Many crimes are committed when the offender is not thinking rationally, therefore unlikely to consider consequences of their actions. Thus no deterrent in these cases.

SECTION B**Marks**

5. *“In order to gain an insight into the views of grass roots members of a political party on Law and Order issues, a researcher joined a policy-making forum of the party and took part in the discussions.”*

(a) **What are the advantages of this type of research over non-participant observation?** (5)

- Subjects being observed are more likely to be relaxed open and truthful when they feel they are talking to one of their own.
- The observer is able to guide discussion towards areas they are interested in.
- The observer can invite subjects to develop points or opinions to get follow-up information.
- Develop an empathy with the subjects and gain their confidence.
- Any other relevant factors.

(b) **What difficulties might a researcher face in producing valid findings from their observations?** (5)

- Personal involvement – may get too close to the subjects to make an unbiased assessment.
- Difficulty of recording the information, particularly from heated discussions.
- Much of the assertions will be based on the observer’s opinion/interpretation of what was said/done.
- Any other relevant factors.

(c) **What ethical considerations would need to be taken into account when conducting such a piece of research?** (5)

- Confidentiality.
- Obtaining information under false pretences.
- Duty bound to report accurately.
- Any other relevant factors.

6. (a) **Outline the strengths and weaknesses of this source for a researcher investigating the link between homicide rates and geographical location in Scotland in recent years.** (10)

- A maximum of three marks for any one fully-developed point.
- If only strengths or weaknesses are alluded to, go to a maximum of six marks.
- The answer does not have to be equally balanced for full marks. It could be achieved by six marks for strengths and four marks for weaknesses or vice versa.
- Look for development and exemplification of points rather than listing. Do not over-credit list type responses as the candidates must show an understanding as well as a knowledge of the issue under discussion.

Strengths:

- Covers all of Scotland.
- Easy to discern patterns at a glance eg West Central darker, East lighter.
- Statistics come from a reliable source ie Scottish Executive.
- Covers long period, therefore reduces statistical blips.
- Done per million, therefore allowing accurate comparison.

Weaknesses:

- Not specific enough eg two councils could have some shading but one could have nearly double number of homicides.
- Difficult to see for small authorities which may nevertheless have large populations.
- Out of date, only up to 2002.
- Large scale killings could alter figures eg Lockerbie, Dunblane.
- A sparsely populated area eg Orkney, Shetland can have their rates altered drastically by one or two homicides.
- Printed in greyscale so difficult to see some variations.

- (b) **Suggest, giving reasons, one alternative method by which the information used to produce this source could be presented in order to make it easier for a researcher to use.** (5)

Candidates can be expected to suggest:

- Graphs – bar line.
- Tables showing actual figures.
- Amended map showing colour rather than greyscale.
- Map with figures in table beside it or map with figures on it.

- All marks given for the explanation not the choice of method.

STUDY THEME 3: THE EUROPEAN UNION AND RESEARCH METHODS

SECTION A

Marks

1. Context A: The United Kingdom and the European Decision-making Process

“There are deep divisions both within and among major UK political parties about UK participation in the European Union.”

Discuss

(30)

General Points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Expect reference to some of the following:

- Long-standing consensus about UK membership.
- Examples of ‘pro’ and ‘anti’ debates within parties, especially referring to Labour and Conservative.
- Examples of particular causes of debate (Euro, constitution, movement of labour). Possibilities for opportunism.
- UKIP – influence and effect.
- Cross-party alignment.
- Outline of current party positions on EU – compare/contrast Scottish dimension.
- ‘Britain in Europe’.
- Thatcher/Major/ Blair got rebate/reserved positions.
- Place in current UK political context.
- Difficulty of reneging on treaties.
- Potential dispute over UK rebates (03/05).
- Profile, or lack of it, of EU issues during General Election Campaign.
- Minimal mention of ‘Euro’ in budget.
- Referenda on ‘Euro’ and constitution.

2. Context B: Representation in the European Parliament

To what extent are electoral systems to blame for poor turnouts in European Parliamentary elections across the European Union? (30)

General Points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Expect reference to some of the following:

- Review of different electoral systems, particular reference to UK acceptable.
- Little relationship between systems and turnout.
- Long-standing members becoming apathetic.
- Analysis of turnouts over time and place.
- Comparison of old members and new members.
- Disillusionment with EP as body.
- Enlargement - more 'distant'.
- Seriously differential turnouts.

3. Context C: Decision-making in the European Union

"In the decision-making process, the European Commission has greater power than any other EU institution.

How far is this claim justified? (30)

General Points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Expect reference to some of the following:

- Outline powers of Commission.
- Analysis of power relationship with other bodies – checks/balances.
- More complex EU becomes, more forceful civil service becomes.
- Expanded powers of EP – influence of expansion/constitution.
- Council of Ministers still has most clout.
- Enlargement of EU to benefit of Commission – can initiate policy but...
- 'hands-on' – knowledge is power.
- Manages policies – negotiates trade and co-operation agreements.
- Bigger number – coherence undermined?

4. Context D: The European Union and the Wider World

Analyse the view that measures taken by the European Union to expand trade with developing nations have benefited members of the European Union and not the citizens of developing countries. (30)

General points:

- Quality answers will have a coherent structure and balanced analysis.
- Reward up-to-date exemplification.
- Credit candidates who make implicit conclusions throughout the essay.
- One-sided responses should merit a maximum of 14 marks.

Expect reference to some of the following:

- Review of range of agreements.
- EU commitment to expansion of policies to reduce poverty, encourage sustainable development.
- NGO perspective exemplification/critique.
- WTO shambles at Seattle.
- Some conventions/successors offer opportunities, but conditions.
- Famine and poverty continue.
- How much money reaches producers?
- EU members also in UN – specialised agencies.

Section B

5. In order to gain an insight into the views of grass roots members of a political party on European issues, a researcher joined a policy-making forum of the party and took part in the discussions.

(a) What are the advantages of this type of research over non-participant observation? (5)

- Subjects being observed are more likely to be relaxed open and truthful when they feel they are talking to one of their own.
- The observer is able to guide discussion towards areas they are interested in.
- The observer can invite subjects to develop points or opinions to get follow-up information.
- Develop an empathy with the subjects and gain their confidence.
- Any other relevant factors.

(b) What difficulties might a researcher face in producing valid findings from their observations? (5)

- Personal involvement – may get too close to the subjects to make an unbiased assessment.
- Difficulty of recording the information, particularly from heated discussions.
- Much of the assertions will be based on the observer's opinion/interpretation of what was said/done.
- Any other relevant factors.

(c) What ethical considerations would need to be taken into account when conducting such a piece of research? (5)

- Confidentiality.
- Obtaining information under false pretences.
- Duty bound to report accurately.
- Any other relevant factors.

6. (a) **Outline the strengths and weaknesses of this source for a researcher interested in finding out about the attitude of European Union member countries to the “Euro”.** (10)

- A maximum of three marks for any one fully developed point.
- If only strengths or weaknesses are alluded to, go to a maximum of six marks.
- The answer does not have to be equally balanced for full marks. It could be achieved by six marks for strengths and four marks for weaknesses or vice versa.
- Look for development and exemplification of points rather than listing. Do not over-credit list type responses as the candidates must show an understanding as well as a knowledge of the issue under discussion.

Strengths:

- Straightforward question.
- Covers all candidate countries.
- Gives ‘average’ as well as individual countries.

Weaknesses:

- Out of date.
- Includes non-members.
- No explanation of responses.
- Messy presentation – not clear.
- Doesn’t have every member.
- Doesn’t explain ‘Laeken 10’ or ‘CC13’.
- Crude presentation.

(b) **Suggest, giving reasons, one alternative method by which the information could be presented in order to make it easier for a researcher to use.** (5)

- Table of figures/countries in alphabetical order.
- Coloured pie-charts or map – immediate visual comparison.
- Countries in order of population.
- All marks given for the explanation not choice of method.

National Qualifications 2005

Advanced Higher

Modern Studies – Supplement (Dissertation)

Marker's No _____

Centre Name _____ Centre No _____ **Total**

Name of Candidate _____ Candidate No _____ **Mark**

Title _____

AIMS

Inightful aims	<input type="checkbox"/>
Appropriate aims	<input type="checkbox"/>
Inappropriate aims	<input type="checkbox"/>

Comment

METHODOLOGY

Wide variety of methods	<input type="checkbox"/>
A variety of methods	<input type="checkbox"/>
Too much reliance on single source	<input type="checkbox"/>
Allows hypothesis to be tested	<input type="checkbox"/>
Few academic sources used	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sources not used in dissertation	<input type="checkbox"/>

Comment

/10

CONTENT/ANALYSIS

Too descriptive

Simplistic structure

Well structured and written

Sources are synthesised

Information used to test hypothesis

Balanced analysis given

Information analysed in depth

Argument well developed

Comment

--

/25

CONCLUSION

Conclusion based on evidence collected

Conclusion relates to hypothesis

Conclusion sophisticated

Conclusion simplistic

Comment

--

/10

Other comment if required

--

Total Mark /45

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]