

**2005 Modern Studies**

**Higher Paper 2 DM2**

**Finalised Marking Instructions**

**These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments.**

## DECISION MAKING EXERCISE 2

### MARKING SCHEME

Questions 1 to 3 are based on Sources A to C on pages 2 – 5. Answer Questions 1 to 3 before attempting Question 4.

In Questions 1 to 3 use only the Sources described in each question.

#### Question 1

- (a) Use **only** Source C2 and Source A.

Why might Charlie Dunne be accused of exaggeration?

The Source A claim *Not only does the public have complete trust in the Government's ability to improve the NHS but there is no longer any opposition to private sector involvement in the NHS* is exaggerated.

Source C2 shows over 50% do not trust much/at all and 37% responded “no” when asked *Should private companies provide NHS services?*

**2 Marks**

- (b) Use **only** Source C2 and Source B.

To what extent does the evidence support Gerry Hamilton?

The Source B claim *a majority have little or no trust in the Government* is supported by Source C2.

However

The Source B claim *most do not approve of private sector involvement* is not supported.

**2 Marks**

#### Question 2

Use **only** Source A and Source B.

Contrast the views of Charlie Dunne and Gerry Hamilton on who will control foundation hospitals.

Charlie claims (Source A) *that local people will have control through elected boards* while Gerry claims (Source B) *that the Government will still have control.*

**2 Marks**

#### Question 3

- (a) Use **only** Source C1, Source C3 and Source A.

To what extent does the evidence support Charlie Dunne?

The Source A claim *we spend more per person on health than in England* is supported by Source C3 (£1,176 – £987).

However

The Source A claim *our cancer survival rates are the lowest in the UK* is disputed by Source C1 that shows Wales to be lower.

**2 Marks**

(b) Use **only** Source 3 and Source B.

Why might Gerry Hamilton be accused of exaggeration?

The Source B claim *in every measure of health care provision England comes out worse than Scotland* is exaggerated as Source C3 shows England to have proportionately both fewer on the waiting lists and lower bed blocking figures than Scotland.

**2 Marks**

**Total 10 Marks**

#### Question 4

You are a health policy expert. You have been asked to prepare a report for the Scottish Executive in which you recommend or reject the proposal that foundation hospital trusts should be introduced into the NHS in Scotland.

- Zone mark: D = 9 – 9.5 C = 10 – 11.5 B = 12 – 13.5 A = 14+
- Use the full range of marks up to and including 20/20.
- Do not over credit answers that simply describe the Source material in isolation.
- Reports that have no background knowledge must not pass.

#### Credit

- An introduction that indicates an awareness of the role to be adopted and makes a clear recommendation.
- Developed arguments in support of the recommendation.
- Identification of, comment on and rebuttal of counter arguments.
- Synthesis of the Source information.
- Provision and use of appropriate background knowledge.
- An overall conclusion.
- A style appropriate to a report (sub-headings, chapters, etc).

#### Accept but do not 'check-list' Source development:

For the introduction of foundation hospital trusts:

- The need to introduce new systems to obtain best value.
- Efficiency rewarded, innovation encouraged and staff motivated.
- More local control/involvement by both staff and patients.
- Statistics show Scotland behind England in several key areas.
- Proposals maintain original aim of the NHS to be free at point of use.
- Co-operation with private sector is desirable and is no threat to NHS.
- A regulator will ensure high standards.
- Other well made points.

Against the introduction of foundation hospital trusts:

- NHS is already efficient and has no need of politically driven change.
- Statistics show Scotland spending more per head on health care.
- Will be divisive and lead to a two tier NHS.
- May lead to a privatised NHS.
- Will remain under central political control.
- The original aims of the NHS are at risk.
- Other well made points.

**Accept but do not ‘check-list’ relevant background knowledge:**

- Is the proposal in harmony or conflict with the NHS’s original aims?
- Impact of infinite demand for finite resources.
- NHS spending plans and international comparisons.
- Reforms already in place and in the pipeline.
- Priority clash between Blairite England and traditional Labour Scotland.
- Reports on progress and performance of foundation hospital trusts.
- Audit Commission and other evidence on performance of Scottish NHS.
- Scottish NHS is no less efficient than the English NHS – it has greater, more diverse problems to deal with.
- Other points.

**20 Marks**

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]