



2007 Classical Studies

Advanced Higher

Finalised Marking Instructions

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2007

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from the Assessment Materials Team, Dalkeith.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's Assessment Materials Team at Dalkeith may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

2007 Classical Studies – Advanced Higher

The general principle underpinning the marking of all sections in both parts is that credit is to be given for well-thought out answers, supported by examples from the prescribed texts with direct quotes, if possible. Comparison, where appropriate, with societies other than those of the classical world, will also gain credit for the candidate.

PART 1

SECTION A – History and Historiography

1. Skills assessed: showing understanding, commenting on viewpoint and bias, making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- context is Croesus-Solon interview
- Solon wishes to know who is the happiest mortal
- Cleobis and Biton are poor members of a list of people who are all happier than Croesus, according to Solon
- this astonishes Croesus, who is rich and famous
- the point is that the life of a monarch is not happy, because he must always fear for the future
- Herodotus has a moral purpose for the history
- Croesus is the aggressor of the Greeks. His family's power is based on murder
- Croesus in a later chapter suffers a tragic fate.

10 marks

2. Skills assessed: showing understanding; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- the story is of the rape of Lucretia by Sextus Tarquinius
- the Tarquins were kings of Rome and so members of an institution which ruled by caprice, overriding the law, according to Livy
- Livy wishes to glorify the virtues of Rome
- Lucretia is subjected to an impossible choice, only submitting to the rape to escape worse dishonour
- she is the type of Roman chastity outraged
- some examples of similar episodes of characters behaving with comparable fortitude to escape dishonour.

10 marks

3. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; commenting on viewpoint and bias.

Valid points:

- Polybius wants history to be practical and useful for a statesman
- he insists on trustworthy sources
- he checks out geographical and documentary detail
- he is very dismissive of historians who do not check facts or who introduce irrelevant genealogies, geographical excursus, and myths
- history for use is his byword.

10 Marks

4. (a) Skills: showing understanding of the work studied, comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Herodotus is careful to quote his sources of evidence
- he regarded personal enquiry as best means of finding the truth
- importance of his personal judgement
- however, he does accept some traditions at face value
- he reports some alternative versions without commenting
- he refuses to comment on the truth or falsehood of myth
- the supernatural and the rationalistic coexist at times, without being reconciled
- the displeasure of the gods is of decisive importance.

- Thucydides takes a scientific approach in striving for accuracy, using personal observation or witnesses
- the importance of evidence, and, failing this, of intelligent conjecture
- distinguishing of motives from causes
- the 'reconstructed' speeches show the historian's analytical apparatus rather than the actual feelings of the real speakers
- he is even-handed in his treatment of Athens's and Sparta's successes and failures
- however, he is selective, in order to show Athenian power and character (but this is a theme of his work)
- he views Pericles to the detriment of all his successors
- he does not quote the sources which lead to his analyses.

- Polybius wrote pragmatical history, to be useful to statesmen
- he condemns the free invention of speeches
- while not as revealing of deepest motivations as Thucydides, he does sift causes and pretexts
- he puts a high premium on objective evidence, himself examining terrains, witnesses and documentation

- Livy's patriotic impulse leads to the doctoring of Polybius's account, in order to emphasise Roman virtues
- Livy will use untrustworthy sources if they make an episode more dramatic
- Livy wishes his history to serve as medicine for the sicknesses of contemporary society. The virtues of the past are glorified and this produces distortion.

- Tacitus's viewpoint is always coloured by bias against emperors, and in favour of the old republic
- he was trained in rhetoric, and is anxious to make telling points at the expense of analysis
- he has a view of character as a given, whether good or bad, for all time and with no development possible
- nevertheless much of his writing has been supported from archaeological and other documentary evidence.

20 marks

- (b) Skills: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Herodotus has exceptional ability to tell a story (examples)
- graphic images of Croesus, Xerxes, Leonidas, enlivened by dramatic mise en scene
- dreams, prophecies and oracles are important in the narrative
- there are sharp upturns and reversals of fortune

- Thucydides is more concerned with analysis than with colourful narrative
- cases for and against and careful attention to causes, pretexts and beginnings are of more importance to him

- Polybius gives more attention to evidence and to analysis of cause than to colourful episodes
- Polybius criticises writers who digress into myth or other irrelevant details, merely to give pleasure

- Livy embellishes the description in his source to make it more pictorial
- very pictorial are the accounts of assemblies, towns under siege, and reactions of small groups or individuals within armies in action

- Tacitus has very graphic descriptions of those he praises and of those he abominates
- dramatic settings of speeches during mutinies of the army, senatorial debates etc, with many rhetorical tricks to excite pathos
- murder, attempted murder, poisoning, and incest are all graphically described.

20 marks

SECTION B – Individual and Community

5. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- there is an element in Plato's advocacy of the primacy of the state which seems to override the needs and rights of individuals
- this applies also to education where he is keen to support education for the young provided it produces workers and, where appropriate, leaders for the society he is proposing
- candidates should note inconsistencies in Plato's views
- candidates may reasonably be expected to have a view as to how well Plato's educational theories might work
- candidates might well wish to mention echoes of Plato in the confused and confusing world of modern educational theory.

10 marks

6. Skills: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Aristotle's views on censorship are that young are vulnerable to corrupting talk, stories or painting and, therefore should be prevented from hearing or seeing anything judged likely to lead them astray
- Plato is much more 'utopian' in the way he wishes to 'freeze' society with the same educational programme forever
- Aristotle, from his study of different constitutions, understood better how the best of them were able to change and adapt to change of circumstances – he is much more pragmatic
- candidates should be given credit for pointing out the difficulties, from today's point of view, of understanding censorship in classical Greece.

10 marks

7. Skills assessed: showing understanding; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions, making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- candidates are expected to acknowledge the liberal nature of what Cicero says
- the justification for these words is given as divine morality
- there should be a discussion of how this passage reflects Cicero's general political outlook
- was Rome, in general, welcoming to foreigners? Contrast Juvenal's attitude
- consider the views of the oligarchic families with whom Cicero was allies.

10 marks

8. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding of work studied; interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; comparisons between classical society and modern British society; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- difficulty of understanding today the political programme of fascist and communist parties as offering a solution to the failures in the early 1930s of democratic capitalism
- Plato's system, with its rigid caste system and strong centralised control resembles fascism and, to a lesser extent, communism more closely than does Aristotle's system
- the organisation of society is accepted as desirable and necessary
- fascism and communism were both economically ruinous – is this unavoidable in totalitarian states
- all totalitarian states are interested in education as a means of control and indoctrination
- use of censorship
- the state more important than the individual
- persecution of minorities an essential component of fascism.

20 marks

- (b) Skills assessed: showing understanding of work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two ancient societies and with modern society.

Valid points:

- candidates should understand the essence of Human Rights legislation and see it as greater than the demonised version presented in the press
- candidates should then identify elements of the organisation of society as proposed by the different philosophers which would be acceptable to Human Rights legislators – passage 4 is clearly a good example of this
- examples can be found in passages 1, 2 and 3 of proposals which seem less acceptable today, candidates should explain why
- the following phrases from the passengers may be profitably quoted – 'the right lines', 'we can admit to our state no stories...', 'the forbidden things'.

20 marks

SECTION C – Orator and Audience

9. Skills: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; comparing ancient with modern society.

Valid points:

- Andocides does not wish to leave Athens for a life of luxury and so he should be shown forbearance!
- he expects to be shown leniency because he asserts that the accused's lot is harder than the accuser!
- he colours his argument by referring to former perjurers who are against him (irrelevant to this case)
- he wishes the good deeds done by his ancestors for the state to be taken into account.

10 marks

10. Skills: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Athenian inactivity means that Philip has seized many cities allied to Athens in north Greece
- if Philip had acted as Athens is acting now, none of these cities would have been taken
- if Athens becomes energetic and enterprising, then she can recover these places
- shame should move Athens to action
- Athens is so craven that if Philip died, she would erect another monster in her imagination
- in Philippic 3 Demosthenes stresses the need to work towards union of all Greeks against Philip.

10 marks

11. Skills: showing understanding; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Caelius's youthful exploits with Clodia and others are merely 'sowing wild oats'. This shows a demeaning of women
- the lasciviousness of women is a literary trope and Cicero uses it to lampoon Clodia
- the introduction of Appius Claudius's ghost is an excuse to contrast the gravity of old Roman masculine mores with the frivolity of modern female turpitude
- Clodia is associated in Cicero's attacks with the lowest kind of sexually depraved women, of very inferior social class.

10 marks

12. (a) Skills: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Andocides does not go in for grand style, relying on the achievements of his ancestors and on his manipulation of dates and facts
- Andocides relies on the sympathy of the jury with his predicament when he lied to save his family
- Demosthenes creates a tangible and spreading web of threat to Athens by his description of Philip's encroachments in north and central Greece
- Demosthenes excites pity Olynthus and other cities taken by Philip through his rhetoric
- Demosthenes engenders shame at inactivity in his audience by showing how they have cravenly allowed Philip to extend his influence even into Athens itself
- Cicero uses humour extensively in the Pro Caelio, to get the jury on his side
- Cicero appeals to the jury's patriotism by reminding them of the great days of Appius Claudius
- Cicero uses the appeal of the jurors that Caelius was just 'one of the lads', in order to get a cheap laugh at Clodia's expense.

20 marks

- (b) Skills: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of the ancient societies.

Valid points:

- Andocides prejudiced against Callias and his sexual proclivities (no bearing on the case)
- Demosthenes is prejudiced against Philip as a barbarian, as an autocrat, and as an imperialist threat to Athens, who was herself imperialist (examples)
- Cicero taints Catiline by association with nefarious people and characterises him as a bankrupt aristocrat playboy (examples)
- Cicero uses prejudice against women as lascivious creatures (examples).

20 marks

SECTION D – Comedy, Satire and Society

13. Skills: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; comparing ancient with modern society.

Valid points:

- universality of difficult father-son relationships throughout the ages (numerous examples able to be accessed)
- laughs very important to Aristophanes – desire to win play competition
- playboy life of son contrasted with hard-working attitude of father
- corrupt effects of city life on son
- virtues of country life
- importance of father-son differences to the overall plot of the play.

10 marks

14. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- numerous references in Aristophanes' plays to how Cleon manipulated the Ecclesia
- direct attack on Cleon in *Knights*
- Thucydides' analysis of how Cleon operated – similar points made by Aristophanes about Cleon, including flattery of urban poor, misuse of state funds, cheating of allies, climate of fear
- credit to be given for any candidate who argues that Cleon had some virtues eg personal courage, and therefore Thepeople is not an accurate portrait of Cleon.

10 marks

15. Skills assessed: showing understanding; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- adultery viewed by Horace as not in line with his Epicurean philosophy
- lust seen as a sin, deserving of punishment
- is this not a bit hypocritical, given Horace's numerous sexual liaisons
- episode with young women on journey to the south of Italy with Maecenas
- any other valid point.

10 marks

16. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- the best answers will approach this question from both sides. Yes, Horace is guilty of selfishness. There is a sense at times that he has made it, succeeded in life and become the favourite poet of a powerful man like Maecenas, but when, for example, the bore asks for an introduction to Maecenas, Horace is quick to turn him down and to justify his action in satire. There are also numerous examples in the 2 books of Satires of Horace's self-absorption
- on the other hand, there are also a number of examples of Horace's love of friendship which may be quoted to provide a more balanced picture. The impact of Epicureanism on his attitudes may also be cited.

20 marks

- (b) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- difficulties for Juvenal of criticising the working of the imperial system in his own lifetime, even under a reasonably benevolent ruler like Trajan
- common feature of Juvenal to look for past periods of history (or even myth as in the Golden Age section which begins satire 6) to use comparatively
- critics of the faults in the imperial system (eg Tacitus) often look back uncritically to the late Republican period as a senatorial utopia
- contrast this with his frequent attacks on the corruption of the nobility in his own time
- credit for explaining what Juvenal means by 'honour'.

PART 2

SECTION A – History and Historiography

1. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Thucydides' preoccupation with truth means he uses personal experience, eye-witness accounts, evidence, and only after that does he estimate probabilities. Thus the composition of the speeches benefit from this approach
- the speeches are well-balanced, logical arguments on either side concerning important incidents, but they are Thucydides' attempts at analysis after the event. Also they could hardly be factually accurate in every detail
- Pericles' funeral Oration is a self-contained picture of Athenian way of life versus the Spartan
- he seems to have chosen out of a number of speeches made on those occasions, and he usually chose a pair, in order to lay bare the argument
- "I make the speakers say what 'in my opinion' was called for on each occasion", so he is subjective
- Dionysius says that Pericles's funeral speech is deliberately misplaced. Also why do we get the reconsideration of the Mytilenian Debate, when we should be getting the original debate? This is because he is making a moral point by concentrating on the reconsideration
- practical necessity and expediency are the mainsprings of the Mytilenian Debate. These do not use appeals to morality and decency. But extant speeches from Athens are replete with such appeals to morality. Therefore, this speech is unlikely to be verbatim
- evidence for subjectivity in Pericles' speech in Book 1 which decides Athens on war. But he seems to know what had been said in Sparta, which could not have, and he rebuts it. Also for once there is no opposing speaker
- Thucydides is trying to escape from the tyranny of the concrete and the unique, in order to understand the mainsprings of political behaviour, and the speeches reflect this.

50 marks

2. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two ancient societies and with modern society.

Valid points:

- a modern historian needs to (a) fasten on the unknown, to try to discover it; (b) deal with actions of humans in the past; (c) interpret evidence; (d) regard history as teaching what man has done, and what man is
- modern historian also needs to treat history not as legend but as research. Events are not events in a dateless past: they exist in a dated past, a certain number of years ago
- history has no superstitions themes.

So how do our ancient historians measure up?

- There are theocratic or mythical elements even in Thucydides, and these are notoriously frequent in Herodotus.
- Both Thucydides and Herodotus examine cause and effect in a well constructed narrative.
- Herodotus complies with (a) and (b) and (d) above.
- Herodotus still ascribes divine power over history (1, 32) ‘gods are envious and destabilising’.
- Herodotus has a moral purpose in writing. He believes excess in one direction leads to a change to the opposite (Croesus).
- He thinks that history helps you to indicate points of danger in rhythms now going on.
- The Greeks used evidence of eyewitnesses, but modern historians can use printed memoirs. However Thuc and Herodotus do sift eyewitness accounts critically.
- Greeks’ use of eyewitnesses not as good as nowadays, because they were reduced to the recent past only. Therefore Herodotus’s 6th Century BC material has no scientific value.
But the Greeks invented scientific history.
- Thuc’s speeches are not real, flesh and blood speeches; they are Thuc’s reconstructions of speakers’ motives and intentions. Unacceptable to a modernist.
- Polybius, with his critical and philosophical bent, only began his narrative where his authorities became trustworthy.
- For Polybius, history is a school and a training ground for political life. This is unacceptable to a modernist.
- Polybius is concerned with pragmatic, unconditional search for truth.
- Polybius condemns the free invention of speeches.
- Livy depends on literary qualities.
- Livy assembled the traditional records of Roman history and welded them into a single, continuous narrative. But Livy fails because his method is too simple to cope with the complexity of his material. Also he has too many fabulous elements.
- Tacitus is psychological-didactic, a dramatist rhetorician. But he is humanistic; it is the history of man’s deeds that interests him. He admits a divine agency, but the function of this agency is strictly limited.
- However Tacitus is compelling narrative.

50 marks

3. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

Polybius's version of causes

- he distinguishes causes from pretexts and from beginnings
- Polybius criticises former historians by always appealing to 'the facts', without being prejudiced by the writers' nearness in time to events described
- Polybius says the real causes were: the anger of Hamilcar Barca; the Roman seizure of Sardinia from Carthage; Carthage's rebuilding of power in Spain
- he reinforces the story of Barca's anger with the story of Hamilcar and Hannibal at the altar
- beginnings and pretexts: Hannibal takes over; all acclaim him; he wins all of Spain south of the Ebro; Saguntum becomes a political football
- back to causes! Hannibal was in a mood of unreasoning anger at Rome. He should have asked for Sardinia back (the real cause of hostility). Instead he concentrated on Saguntum's bad treatment of Carthage's allies.

Livy's version of causes

- Livy is more preoccupied with engaging his readers through dramatic descriptions and psychological observations
- he is much more interested in colourful narrative and episode
- he stresses the passion on both the Roman and the Carthaginian side (rage of Romans at unprovoked attack by a beaten enemy; resentment of Carthage at the grasping attitude of conquering Romans)
- passion exemplified by Hannibal's oath as a boy, egged on by Hamilcar
- Rome took Sardinia when Carthage had domestic troubles and asked for tribute in addition. Hamilcar resented this
- Hannibal's prior attacks on Olcades and Vaccaei and Carpetani south of Ebro isolates Saguntum
- attack on Saguntum.

Effectiveness of the analysis

- logic and depth
- interest for the reader
- application to particular and universal circumstances.

50 marks

4. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Tacitus wishes to engage our emotions and inspire pathos, and this is a tradition in post-classical, Hellenistic historians
- uses of speeches to clarify character, with examples
- moral purpose, and virtue versus vice prompts Tacitus to dramatise – examples
- Tiberius depicted as the stock tyrant and Germanicus as the noble saviour of Roman values
- the speeches are set-pieces, balanced viewpoints as in tragedy, rhetorical crescendos, sententiae, manipulation of the audience as in the theatre.

50 marks

SECTION B– Individual and Community

5. Skills: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- candidates need to be aware that there was little sympathy in the classical world for individuals to 'go it alone'. Opting out was not acceptable. The interdependence of the citizen body was seen as both desirable and necessary
- Aristotle supports the idea of a constitution
- strong emphasis by Aristotle on the duties of a citizen
- strong emphasis by Aristotle on the importance of education – idea of education as liberating
- rights for the individual seen as helping establish stability and so helping to create the correct political and social success
- Aristotle reluctant to allow anyone to opt out of the state
- strong emphasis in Plato on the primacy of the state
- impact on Plato's thinking of the failures of democracy in 5th and 4th century Greece
- Plato's state requires citizens to adapt to the structures of the state
- importance in Plato's state of the concept of different tasks for different groups
- little opportunity for mobility.

50 marks

6. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek civilisation with comparisons with modern society.

Valid points:

- there are a number of elements which are crucial to Plato's ideal state, but would not be acceptable in a modern democracy. These include the status of women, the lack of social mobility, the emphasis on the primacy of state rights over individual rights
- the hierarchical nature of Plato's state is also an issue
- it is important that the candidates set the issues in context – different times, different values, for example, the reality of life for Greek women was that they faced prejudice on a daily basis and that there were advantages as well as disadvantages in what he is proposing from the point of view of modern feminism
- the best answers will, therefore seek to explore all that Plato is proposing, then set it in context and finally draw appropriate comparisons and contrasts with modern society
- the reality of modern society should not be glossed over.

50 marks

7. Skills: showing understanding of work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- in answering this question candidates should show understanding of the conservative nature of Roman society during Cicero's lifetime
- difficulties for a novus homo like Cicero of advancing politically unless he manages to gain the support of the nobility who control the senate
- Cicero's own conservative outlook is very clear
- candidates should be able to have an opinion on how well Cicero's ideal state is suitable for Roman society
- they should also be able to give examples (and there are several) of how the structures proposed by Cicero are capable of use in other societies, including those of today's world.

50 marks

8. Skills assessed: showing understanding of work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons with modern society.

Valid points:

- there should be an expectation that candidates studying this option have some awareness and understanding of modern standpoints on the place of the individual in society. Margaret Thatcher's policies advertised her commitment to the individual over the state. However, she was probably grandstanding when she made the controversial and extreme statement that society did not, as such, exist
- that said, candidates have clear statements from all 3 of our sources that they did believe in society as the basis of the states which they are advocating
- there are distinctions between all 3 authors as to how they define society (which was Mrs Thatcher's point) and they should be discussed fully.

50 marks

SECTION C– Orator and Audience

9. Skills: showing understanding of the work; assessing value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, comparisons with modern society; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- standard techniques used: rhetorical questions, antithesis, tricolon crescendos, irony (examples)
- Cicero shows Catiline that he is hemmed in on all sides
- Cicero shames the senate into action by quoting examples of heroic senatorial reaction in the past
- Cicero indicates his knowledge of all Catiline's plans, with Catiline sitting in front of him
- he taints Catiline by associating with vice and with the dregs of society.

50 marks

10. Skills: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

Great orator

- effective presentation of a case, with attention to structure
- sound use of rhetorical techniques
- playing on the audience's sympathies and fears
- shaming an audience into action by reference to past glory, present vacillation and comparisons with others in similar situations
- humour, as seen in irony, prosopopoeia etc
- effective use of repetition and silence (aposiopesis)
- awareness of history, to draw comparisons
- case made for any writer, using a combination of the above.

50 marks

11. Skills: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions.

Valid points:

- use of prejudice against women to construct hilarious, exaggerated claims of Clodia's misconduct
- demolition of aspects of Clodia's case by logical arrangement of the evidence, results in a view of her claim as farcical
- frequent asides concerning Clodia's sexual misdemeanours
- prosopopoeia of Appius Claudius creates opportunities for amazing contrasts of standards of behaviour, between Clodia's and her ancestors'
- amusing case made by Cicero for a tolerant attitude to youthful peccadillos.

50 marks

12. Skills: showing understanding of the work studied; interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; comparisons between the two ancient societies; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

De Oratore

- oratory important to the state
- requirement for deep knowledge to be effective with a crowd
- orator better than a specialist at speaking on a subject
- need to know about the art of war before you defend a commander
- orator must be trained in all the liberal arts.

Gorgias

- cookery is to medicine, as oratory is to philosophy
- oratory is to philosophy as cosmetic is to gymnastic
- oratorical techniques enable you to make the worse case sound the better
- as oratory is produced by techniques related to opinions and not to true knowledge as testable by criteria, oratory is inferior to philosophy
- because it is pleasing to the ear, oratory is the preserve of rabble-rousers.

SECTION D – Comedy, Satire and Society

13. Skills: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions.

Valid points:

The best answers will consider this question from both a positive and negative point of view.

No

- Aristophanes purpose was to write comedies – he was not a political or social historian. These topics are raised by him to access and provide the setting for comical situations.
- The constant exaggeration by Aristophanes makes it difficult to extrapolate consistent messages.
- We should be wary about seeking unbiased viewpoints on the state of Athenian democracy or the mindset of the Athenian people during the war from Aristophanes. He is certainly no friend of radical democracy.
- The point should be made that these comedies were written as part of a play competition and that this has an impact on their content and the style in which they were written.

Yes

- Anti-war themes in many plays.
- Anti-corruption themes in many plays.
- Support for traditional values frequently shown.
- Need for content of play to reflect audience concern – so dealing with real issues.
- Real people attacked in plays – for plays to be credible there has to be some basis of truth.
- Does modern political satire (eg Yes, Minister, The Thick of It, Rory Bremner) deliver a consistent message.

50 marks

14. Skills: showing understanding of the work studied; interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; comparisons between the two ancient societies; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- this question can be argued from either point of view, but it is really looking for a candidate to use what they know of both the work and the background of Horace and Juvenal to support their case
- Horace's personal experiences in the civil war and its aftermath make him less aggressive in his writing and more conciliatory. He has also been successful and has the friendship of Maecenas and the financial security which that has brought. He is also content (eg satire about Sabine farm)
- Juvenal's poetry reflects the personal frustrations – middle class security collapsing under pressure of imperial favouritism and foreign immigration – dislike of changing society – therefore lots of rants against foreigners, especially Egyptians and Greeks, against women, against the corrupt nobility. But remember – there is more to Juvenal than ranting
- need a view on which style is more effective in making the reader think about the issues.

50 marks

15. Skills: showing understanding of the work studied; interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; comparisons between the two ancient societies; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- the answer to this question has to start with the quote and to consider if the targets which Aristophanes attacks are different from those attacked by Horace and Juvenal
- is it possible that the Romans did not regard Aristophanes' comedies as strictly satire in the purist sense? (see Horace's comments on this)
- the next point to be considered is whether it is possible to see a consistent pattern in the vices targeted by Horace and Juvenal
- common targets may be ambition, corruption, hypocrisy
- common aims – peace of mind, contentment.

50 marks

16. Skills: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions.

Valid points:

- a good answer (capable of gaining 75% or more) will not merely focus on Satire 6, although an extensive knowledge of it is essential
- satire 10 gives us an excellent, though wholly biased depiction of Messalina
- there must be, in the answers, more than just a narrative account of the vices he attributes to women – some analysis is required
- is he particularly antagonistic towards noble women (eg Messalina, Eppia?) – if so, what does that tell us about him?
- are there any examples of him praising women?
- general portrayal of women by other Roman authors. Is Juvenal so different?

50 marks

Conversion Table 50 – 100

Points	Marks
50	100
49	98
48	96
47	94
46	92
45	90
44	88
43	86
42	84
41	82
40	80
39	78
38	76
37	74
36	72
35	70
34	68
33	66
32	64
31	62
30	60
29	58
28	56
27	54
26	52
25	50

Points	Marks
24	48
23	46
22	44
21	42
20	40
19	38
18	36
17	34
16	32
15	30
14	28
13	26
12	24
11	22
10	20
9	18
8	16
7	14
6	12
5	10
4	8
3	6
2	4
1	2
0	0

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]