



**2007 Modern Studies**

**Higher – Paper 2**

**Finalised Marking Instructions**

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2007

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from the Assessment Materials Team, Dalkeith.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's Assessment Materials Team at Dalkeith may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

**Questions 1 to 3 are based on Sources A to C on pages 2 – 5. Answer Questions 1 to 3 before attempting Question 4.**

**In Questions 1 to 3, use only the Sources described in each question.**

### **Question 1**

Use **only** Source C1 and Source A.

*To what extent does the evidence support Russell Barclay?*

Russell Barclay claims (Source A) that “long-term sickness and disability is the most common reason given by both men and women for not working” (1).

Source C1 shows this to be true of men (1) but not of women (1).

**3 Marks**

### **Question 2**

**(a)** Use **only** Source C2(a) and Source A.

*Why might Russell Barclay be accused of exaggeration?*

Russell Barclay claims (Source A) that “the UK already spends a greater percentage of its GDP on schemes for disabled workers than any other country in the EU” (1).

Source C2(a) shows that the UK spends less than most of the other EU countries listed (1).

**2 Marks**

**(b)** Use **only** Source C2(b) and Source B.

*Why might Irene Graham be accused of exaggeration?*

Irene Graham claims (Source B) that charities already “spend more on the disabled than on any other group” (1).

Source C2(b) shows that more is spent on children (1).

**2 Marks**

### **Question 3**

Use **only** Source C3(a), Source C3(b) and Source B.

*To what extent does the evidence support Irene Graham?*

Irene Graham claims (Source B) that “UK Government spending on the sick and disabled is already lower than for any other group and a lower percentage of one-parent families receive Incapacity/Disability Benefit than any other benefit” (1).

Source C3(a) shows spending on (any one of) three other groups to be lower (1).

Source C3(b) shows that, for the benefits listed, 9% (by far the lowest) of one-parent families receive Incapacity/Disability Benefit (1).

**3 Marks**

#### Question 4

You are a social policy researcher. You have been asked to prepare a report for a committee investigating welfare provision in which you recommend or reject the proposal to introduce an Employment and Support Allowance (ESA).

- Zone Mark: A pass = 14 and above  
B pass = 12 or 13  
C pass = 10 or 11
- Use the full range of marks up to and including 20/20
- Do not over credit answers that simply paraphrase the source information in isolation
- The report must feature background knowledge if it is to pass
- Use must be made of all specified sources

#### Credit

A style appropriate to a report (sub-headings, chapters etc) with:

- an introduction that indicates an awareness of the role to be adopted and makes a clear recommendation
- developed arguments in support of the recommendation
- identification of and comment on (rebuttal of) counter arguments
- synthesis of source information
- provision and use of appropriate background knowledge
- an overall conclusion.

#### Arguments for the proposal may feature:

- increased spending must be brought under control
- evidence that not all claimants are incapable of work
- proposal maintains original aims of the welfare state in encouraging work/discouraging idleness
- work is now less physically demanding
- work is beneficial to the individual
- provision of useful training for those who can work
- genuine claimants will be better off
- existing recipients of IB not affected.

#### Arguments against the proposal may feature:

- reduction in number of claimants already happening as the existing system is already a tough one
- charities have to underpin an under-funded welfare state
- increased stress on vulnerable individuals
- concern of experts over implications
- priority should be to overcome employer prejudice
- UK spends less on helping disabled workers than most EU states
- original aims of the welfare state being compromised
- yet another money saving device.

**Accept, but do not ‘check list’, background knowledge-based argument developed from references in:**

**Source A**

- *We are encouraging welfare dependency at the expense of individual responsibility* (lines 12/13).
- *...and give the taxpayer better value for their money* (line 15).
- *We are determined to continue to move people from welfare into work* (lines 24/25).
- *...the fundamental principles of the welfare state* (lines 29/30).

**Source B**

- *...the cost of the welfare state* (line 9).
- *...other groups vulnerable to poverty, such as lone-parents* (line 17).
- *“Welfare to Work” policies* (lines 18/19).
- *Effective laws to prevent discrimination against the disabled* (line 25).
- *...social exclusion and ...the collectivist principles of the welfare state* (lines 29/30).

**Other background knowledge-based argument may include:**

- the long-term increase in the cost of social welfare which was not anticipated by Beveridge (infinite demand for finite resources)
- whether or not the proposal is in conflict with the original aims of the welfare state
- the extent and causes of poverty in the UK
- political debate: Labour back-bench revolt over IB reform; policy differences between Blairites and traditional Labour
- foreign comparisons
- recent media coverage
- other relevant issues/points.

**20 Marks**

**Total 30 Marks**

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]