



2007 Modern Studies

Higher – Paper 1

Finalised Marking Instructions

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2007

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from the Assessment Materials Team, Dalkeith.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's Assessment Materials Team at Dalkeith may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

General Instructions

1. Carefully *Process* the answer. By this is meant read the answer, and highlight **on the script**, any inaccuracies and/or irrelevancies. In *processing* the answer, you must check out the validity/accuracy of any exemplification that may not feature in the SQA marking instructions. *Processing* the answer in this way should give you a “feel” for whether or not **taken as a whole**, the answer merits a “pass”.
2. “Pass” and better answers must feature **both** knowledge and understanding of the issue **and** analysis of/balanced comment on, the issue being addressed.
3. If the answer merits a “pass” or better, you should now grade it. “Pass” and better answers are graded taking into account such criteria as the relevancy, accuracy and extent of detailed, exemplified description and analysis of/balanced comment on, the issue.

Before assigning a mark to the answer

4. Review the answer in terms of any requirements such as **for top/full marks candidates must, do not over-credit...etc.**

As only whole numbers may be used in allowing marks to answers, the marks available for each grade are:

C	8
B	9 – 10
A	11 – 15

5. Use the full range of marks, up to and including 15.
6. Be consistent. If, well into your marking, you find yourself crediting/penalising an approach to a question that you previously didn't, **you must** now review your marking of every answer to that question.
7. **NEVER:**
 - Use “**candidates may refer to**” advice in the marking instructions as a check list, ticking off points made in the answer, then applying your own arithmetical formula to arrive at a mark
 - Add your own additional criteria (legibility, length of response) into the mix
 - Make a hasty pass/fail/grade mark judgement on what may appear to be a confused start to the answer.
8. **ALWAYS:**
PROCESS > GRADE > MARK

Section A – Political Issues in the United Kingdom

Study Theme 1A – Devolved Decision Making in Scotland

Question A1

The distribution of reserved and devolved powers means that the most important decisions for Scotland continue to be made at Westminster.

Discuss.

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

The reserved and devolved powers

Decisions arising from these made in Westminster and Holyrood respectively

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the perceived “importance” of these decisions for Scotland.

Answers may refer to:

- reserved powers include constitutional issues, defence, foreign policy, treasury matters and social security
- Westminster decides on the level of the Scottish Parliament’s budget
- any revision of the Scotland Act must be passed by Westminster
- the ‘Sewel Motion’ procedure gives Westminster the power to legislate in an area supposedly devolved to Holyrood
- the range of devolved powers includes education, environment, health, justice and transport
- the Scottish Parliament has limited powers of taxation – it can vary (upwards or downwards) the rate of income tax by 3p in the £; it can vary the business rate – but has no fiscal autonomy
- laws passed by the Scottish Parliament include free personal care for the elderly; free nursery places to 3/4 year olds, free bus travel to pensioners, the abolition of tuition fees, a new voting system for local government, abolition of smoking in public places.
Candidates may comment on the importance of these (and others)
- responsibility for agriculture and fisheries is devolved but the Scottish Parliament can only contribute as part of a UK delegation
- the Scottish Parliament cannot deal directly with Europe on issues such as crime, health and the environment, all of which are devolved
- the Home Office has rejected calls for tougher gun laws and limited the scope of the Fresh Talent Initiative
- despite a widely supported campaign north of the border, the Scottish Parliament could not prevent the amalgamation of the Scottish regiments
- Scotland not allowed a separate protocol on the forced removal of failed asylum seekers
- Westminster can decide how many nuclear power stations should be built but the Scottish Parliament decides on whether or not to award planning permission
- survey results have indicated that only 23% think that the Executive has most influence over how Scotland is run. A majority of voters see the reserved issues as the more important.
- in 2005, Jack McConnell wanted to review the responsibility for making laws on firearms restrictions, drugs, nuclear power stations, casinos, abortion, certain benefits, broadcasting and immigration – he was, reportedly, ordered to halt his “mission-creep” by Westminster
- In a YouGov poll (December 2006) 62% wanted the Scottish Parliament to have more powers
- Other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Study Theme 1B – Decision Making in Central Government

Question A2

To what extent can Parliament control the powers of the Prime Minister?

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

The powers of the Prime Minister

The opportunities afforded Parliament (Commons & Lords) to exercise control over these powers

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the extent to which Parliament can control the powers of the Prime Minister.

Answers may refer to:

- powers of the Prime Minister derived from being party leader with the gift of patronage, leader of Her Majesty’s Government, in charge of the Prime Minister’s office, the leading UK representative on the world stage, the general election date decider and the Parliamentary link with the monarch.
- control traditionally seen as being exercised in both the Commons through debates, Prime Minister’s Question Time, early day motions, select committees, inquiries, the Liaison Committee, the possibility of a no confidence motion, back bench revolts and in the House of Lords (in which at present, the Government does not have a majority)
- the Lib-Dems claim that the Salisbury Convention (do not oppose bills on which the winners campaigned) no longer stands
- Claim that Parliament has seldom been more assertive than in recent years given the number of revolts in the Commons and the increase in the number of Government defeats in the Lords since the removal of most hereditary peers in 1999
- before 2001, Labour MPs were accused of using Prime Minister’s Question Time as a cringe-making competition in sycophancy. This changed in July 2001 when the Commons forced the Government to re-instate the chairs of each of the Foreign Affairs and Transport Select committees. In each vote over 100 Labour MPs voted against their own party
- over top-up fees, the Prevention of Terrorism Bill and the Religious Hatred Bill, the Government gave way on legislation in order to ensure its passage through the Commons
- Tony Blair did respond to the Butler Report’s observation of his informal style of decision making by promising to curb his ‘government by sofa’
- parliamentary control limited by the executive’s control of the parliamentary timetable, the whip system, the payroll vote and the presidential nature of the Prime Minister’s office
- Tony Blair’s first ever defeat in the Commons was in November 2005 on the proposal to allow the detention of suspected terrorists for 90 days
- the rebellions over Iraq – the largest saw 139 Labour MPs defy the whip (2003) – were the largest on any policy since modern British party politics began
- two defeats during passage of the Racial and Religious Hatred Bill were as a result of a failure in whipping.
- the Prime Minister has better jobs to offer than the leader of the opposition, and has all the weight and expertise of the civil service to provide ministers with clever answers to awkward questions and can usually rely upon a healthy majority

- view that the only checks on the Prime Minister's power of patronage are informal – often through opinions voiced in the media (the coming to light in November 2005 of Tony Blair's proposals to award contributors to the political funds of the Labour and Conservative parties)
- parliament's role is to scrutinise not control
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Study Theme 1C – Political Parties and their Policies (including the Scottish Dimension)

Question A3

Assess the importance of party unity in achieving electoral success.

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

The importance of party unity to electoral success
Other factors that may enhance/damage electoral success

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the importance of party unity in achieving electoral success.

Answers may refer to:

- with less electoral party loyalty than in the past, a united election campaign regarded as important to achieving electoral success
- damage was done to the Conservative Party by its obsession with Europe and its leadership wrangles
- electoral successes of ‘new’ (united) Labour
- link between ‘quality’ of leadership and perceived party unity, and its impact on polling indicators of electoral support
- impact of Cameron on support for the Conservative Party
- rivalries between ‘old Labour’ and the ‘Blairites’ and between Brown and Blair claimed to have been one explanation of Labour’s poorer showing in 2005
- continued disagreement between ‘fundamentalists’ and ‘gradualists’ is said to have undermined electoral support for the SNP in the 2003 Scottish Parliament election in which SNP lost 8 MSPs, and its share of the vote fell to less than 20%
- disagreement evident in SNP leadership/deputy leadership elections said to have damaged the party; 2005 General Election popular vote share was lowest since 1987, but did increase the number of MPs from 4 to 6 (the Salmond Bounce?)
- continued sniping at the quality of Charles Kennedy’s leadership of the Liberal Democrats culminated in his resignation
- membership base (the Conservative Party membership has fallen from a peak of over 2 million to less than 250,000) and financial position. (Conservative Party reportedly clear of its £16m debt, January 2007, whilst Labour in debt to tune of £23m)
- the winning habit (importance of local election)
- party policies on key issues
- the media and voters (ST 1C descriptor)
- the electoral system (AMS) in Scotland (appears in neither ST 1C Descriptor nor Coverage, but candidates may transfer KU from either ST 1A or ST 1D)
- view that parties have become more united in recent years as party policies have become less ‘ideological’ and differences between the main parties less ideological too
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Study Theme 1D – Electoral Systems, Voting and Political Attitudes

Question A4

The Additional Member System gives voters more choice and better representation than does First Past the Post.

Discuss.

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

The main voter “choice” and “representation” features of the AMS

The main voter “choice” and “representation” features of FPTP

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of whether the AMS or FPTP gives voters more choice and better representation.

Top marks may be achieved without reference to the 2007 Scottish Parliamentary election.

Answers may refer to:

AMS

- voters have two votes: constituency and list
- there are no wasted votes
- degree of proportionality allows for wider range of parties featuring in the Scottish Parliament
- list can be used to increase minority representation and facilitate gender balance
- result likely to encourage consensus rather than conflict politics on the part of the elected, thus broadening the voter representation at the highest decision-making level
- a greater proportion of voters likely to get a policy implemented that they voted for
- gives voters a range of representatives (8 in Scotland) from different parties to discuss an issue with

FPTP

- effective choice limited to marginal seats
- no proportionality
- wasted votes
- a large proportion of voters get neither an MP, nor the Government, nor the policy implementation that they voted for
- said to produce elected dictatorships; in 2005 Labour got 55% of the seats with 36% of the votes – the lowest winning party vote share in history

- in both systems the voter has little say in the selection of candidates
- in AMS closed party lists restricts voter choice as the parties need not name their candidates
- AMS still retains the so-called negative features of the constituency vote and is not wholly proportional, but more so than FPTP; in 2003 Labour polled 32% of the vote for its 38% seats
- there are no by-elections in AMS so voters have neither ‘protest-vote’ opportunities nor any say in who their new government representative should be
- AMS produces coalitions and compromise policies that no one voted for
- AMS produces disproportional representation in the Executive; the Liberal Democrats were the fourth most popular party with 13% of the vote (in 2003)
- the proportion of minority ethnic MPs is higher under FPTP in the House of Commons
- 33.3% of the Scottish Parliament is female; for Westminster the figure is 18%
- “backdoor entry” to Parliament via the list may result in MSPs and even members of the Executive, for whom no one voted
- the role of the regional/list members is obscure. To whom are they accountable?
- arguably little evidence of consensus
- issues arising from the 2007 Scottish Parliamentary Election
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Section B – Social Issues in the United Kingdom

Study Theme 2 – Wealth and Health Inequalities in the United Kingdom

Question B5

To what extent are the founding principles of the Welfare State being met?

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

The founding principles of the Welfare State
Government Welfare State/State welfare policies

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the extent to which Government policies enable the founding principles of the Welfare State to be met.

Answers may refer to: (Be flexible and accept a variety of approaches)

- solution to the problems of want, disease, ignorance, squalor and idleness seen in the “traditional” collectivist approach
- benefits to provide social security to protect the population from cradle to the grave.

Income

- range of Government benefits available for those out of work, including Income Support and Jobseekers Allowance, becoming increasingly means tested
- the National Minimum Wage
- issue of paying for pensions
- launch of campaign against child poverty in 1999, child poverty in Scotland reduced by 25% (target) in 2005 (for UK by 23%).

Health

- evidence of inequalities between social classes and gender/race
- New Labour’s “holistic” approach to health care; good-health promotion campaigns, bans on smoking; PPP; welfare to work strategies aims to improve the quality of life
- SureStart
- Government still provides care but asks individuals to take responsibility too
- issue of charges.

Education

- recent public and privately channelled investment in education
- issue of fees/loans for higher education
- SureStart.

Housing

- lack of available council housing
- impact of boom in property prices on first-time buyers
- role of housing associations
- housing benefit.

Employment

- the welfare-to work (a hand up, not a hand out) strategy
- Tax Credits
- New Deals
- Pathways to Work
- SureStart
- the idea of universalism has faced substantial pressure in the past few years
- instead of universal benefits that are largely flat rate, the expansion of means-testing, ('targeting') has led to the creation of benefits like Pension Credit and also tax credits
- Tax Credits are near universal benefits directed at all but the richest 10% of families with children
- progressive universalism
- proposals for incapacity benefit
- contributory principle under threat
- the idea of a state monopoly has been tempered to some degree by greater involvement of the private and voluntary sectors
- UK has one of the highest child poverty rates in developed countries
- labour market polarised between the work-rich and work-poor households
- financial support for working parents is now amongst the most generous for low-paid employees in the OECD
- no set targets for reducing poverty in the population as a whole; work may reduce the risk of poverty but it does not eliminate it
- Government policy has been most successful in dealing with "blockbuster" poverty – the poverty suffered by the greatest number of people – by giving the poor more money
- Government would insist that changes are in keeping with the concept of 'modern' collectivism
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Question B6

To what extent do social and economic inequalities continue to exist in the UK?

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

Inequalities in the UK

Government policies to reduce these inequalities and/or reasons for these inequalities

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the extent to which inequalities continue to exist in the UK.

Answers may refer to: (Be flexible and accept a variety of approaches)

Social and Economic Inequalities linked to age, gender, race, social class, region;

- huge inequalities in the way that care and support are made available to older people
- continued evidence of “glass ceiling” (might be cracked, not yet broken). New “glass partition” – women concentrated in the less well-paid sectors of the professions
- women still earning less than men in part-time and full-time jobs; men in full-time employment now earning 18% more an hour than women
- extent of racism
- ethnic minorities find it difficult to get jobs; and many are more likely to be unemployed than white males of the same age and level of education
- the social class wealth and health gap
- claim that the “disadvantaged dying” become part of the “revolving door” system; labelled as “bed blockers” as if being ill and not getting treatment were their own fault
- North-South wealth and health divide
- gap in living standards between the well paid and those on benefits
- lone-parent families
- continued existence of poverty: view that the UK’s most troubled group, in both absolute and relative terms, is poor, white and British born
- expansion of the middle class has made it harder than ever for the working classes to get better high-earning professional jobs
- all groups have become more prosperous but the gap between the classes has not narrowed
- North-South split widening; difference within regions; Glasgow labelled “a swamp of poverty” because all ten of the most deprived areas in Scotland are in the city (Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation); Northern areas of England have higher obesity rates, more smoking related deaths and lower life expectancies than Southern areas
- view that gender equality is no longer a live issue – girls are high achievers at school; high % of women MSPs; Solicitor General is a woman; opening up of medicine, the legal profession and the church (where there is an increasing demand for part-time clergy) to women
- General Household Survey analysis shows that UK born ethnic minorities seem to be doing the same jobs as similarly qualified Whites and earning similar amounts
- children of Afro-Caribbean and Indian immigrants have completely closed the earnings gap with Whites in both professional and blue-collar work
- other relevant points and issues.

Government/local policies/strategies to reduce inequalities:

- candidates may select from a wide range of these and should demonstrate a link with the “wealth/health inequalities” features in their answer
- promise to end child poverty forever
- gender and race legislation
- Equalities Act (2006) – under the Act the Commission for and Human Rights (CEHR) will bring together the Disability Rights Commission and the Equal Opportunities Commission from October 2007. The Commission for Racial Equality will join in 2009, putting expertise on equality, diversity and human rights all in one place
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Section C – International Issues

Study Theme 3A – The Republic of South Africa

Question C7

Its political system has all the features of a democracy but South Africa has become a one party state.

Discuss.

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

The *democratic* features of the South African political system

The part played by the ANC and other political groups in the South African political system
and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the suggestion that South Africa has become a one party state.

Answers may refer to:

- South Africa is a constitutional democracy with a three tier system of government and an independent judiciary
- Party List Electoral system
- 16 parties represented in parliament
- 97 parties contested the 2006 elections
- President, elected by the National Assembly, is permitted to serve a maximum of two five-year terms (but nothing, technically, to prevent someone serving a third term as president of the ANC)
- written Constitution and Constitutional Court
- Constitutional (Bill of Rights) guarantees include property rights and education
- free press and a robust legal system
- recognition of trade unionism
- ANC has a huge majority in the National Assembly and is the dominant party in the provinces
- there are 6 non-black “co-opted” cabinet members
- ANC has not tampered with the Constitution and accepted decisions of the Constitutional court
- no concept of a “loyal opposition”; the Democratic Alliance Party, the second largest in the National Assembly has 50 seats (ANC has 285) out of 400
- ANC is said to dismiss ideas from outside its own bureaucracy (response to the HIV/AIDS crisis) and to meet any criticism with accusations of racism
- claims by Desmond Tutu of the emergence of a culture of “sycophantic obsequious conformity”
- some SABC commentators blacklisted in 2006 for being too critical of the Government; judges and journalists are told to “work together to build the nation”
- Inkatha Freedom Party claims that the ANC is determined to alter or remove the legislative authority of the provinces and warns against the danger of South Africa becoming a one party state
- COSATU plays little part in economic policy decisions
- Jacob Zuma on record as claiming that the ANC will remain in office “until Jesus comes back”

- ANC remains extremely popular; its vote share has risen in each of three elections (1994/1999/2004) due to a combination of factors: the struggle to end apartheid and bring democracy/its record in office/the opposition parties are so weak
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Study Theme 3B – The People’s Republic of China

Question C8

Critically examine the effects of social and economic reform in China.

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

Recent social and economic reform policies of the Chinese Government

The impact of these reforms on Chinese society

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the overall effects of social and economic reform.

Answers may refer to:

- relaxation of the *hukuo* – urban/rural classification of population
- dismantling of the *danwei* – work unit behaviour control organisation
- relaxation in rural areas of One Child Policy
- reduction in waiting time for those who qualify to have a second child
- better rights for women
- development of private education and health services
- right to own property now written into the Constitution
- encouragement of foreign investment
- promotion of capitalist ideas – introduction of easier credit for business, support for entrepreneurs
- increase in subsidies and greater investment in agriculture
- tax reform
- “great development of the west” policy to boost development in western regions
- awarding of the “dragonhead status” to favoured districts
- gradual changes to the judicial system: increased legal representation
- huge and sustained rises in economic growth
- incomes have risen in the cities, particularly in the coastal areas
- mining held up as an example of the success of policy to invest in the west of China
- claim that the number of poor has fallen sharply in recent years
- greater social freedoms
- expanding wealthy middle class and greatly improved standard of living
- paper recycling tycoon Zhang Yin became the first woman to top China’s rich list in October 2006
- uneven rise in farm income
- as a result of tax reform and subsidies, rural incomes have increased but urban incomes have grown much faster
- huge urban/rural and employed/unemployed income/lifestyle inequalities
- homelessness and overcrowding in the large cities exacerbated by migration
- poor working conditions in many factories
- allegations of corruption on the part of local CPC officials in managing change
- the UN Development Programme claims that 50 million farmers have been thrown off the land with little or no compensation
- 20-30 million State Owned Enterprise workers have lost their jobs
- widespread and sustained rural protest: 87,000 “contradictions within the people” recorded in 2005
- problems associated with pollution
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Study Theme 3C – The United States of America

Question C9

To what extent do ethnic minorities influence the outcome of elections in the USA?

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

Ethnic minority participation in elections in the USA

The importance of the minority ethnic vote/ethnic minority issues to the outcome of elections in the USA

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the extent to which ethnic minorities influence the outcome of elections in the USA.

Answers may refer to:

- minorities make up 30% of the US population and their population share is growing, with Hispanics being the fastest growing
- minority groups less likely to either register or vote than Whites; only African Americans have registration and turnout in excess of 50%
- registration of APIs and Hispanics is less than 40% and turnout fails to reach 30%
- for Whites registration is almost 68% and turnout just above 60%
- concentration on ethnic minority voters in key ‘swing states’ of California, Texas, New York and Florida gives them disproportionate influence in the presidential elections
- growing potential impact of the Hispanic vote in Arizona, Colorado, Nevada and New Mexico
- traditionally the ethnic minority vote has gone to the Democratic Party; although a majority for Kerry in 2004, Bush still won the presidential elections
- importance of the ethnic minority vote recognised in the composition of the Bush Cabinet
- Blacks are most solid in their support of the Democrats (90%); for Hispanics the level of support is 55% and for APIs, 59%
- Democrats use a variety of methods to get out the minority vote. Republicans more likely to be accused of using “dirty tricks” to prevent black voters getting to the polls
- most of the Democrat Blacks in Congress come from majority Black districts
- at local levels, electoral success may depend upon involvement of ethnic minority voters in a coalition with Whites; Antonio R Villariagosa, LA’s first Latino mayor since 1872 was elected in 2005, with 59% of the vote by forging a coalition that included Black voters as well as Latinos and Whites
- nine Indian Americans were winners in the November 2006 US elections to national, state and local offices including Minnesota State Senator Chaudhary (Democrat) whose constituency is largely White
- view that Hispanic voters – annoyed by the Republican hard line on immigration, turned out in force, and helped the Democrats win the November 2006 congressional elections
- both Hillary Clinton and Barack Obama has been courting the minority vote in their presidential candidate campaigns
- thanks to gerrymandering and the ease with which those in power can raise money, usually, 90% of those who run for the House of Representatives tend to be re-elected

- importance of **gender** (women have tended to be more significantly supportive of the Democrat candidate than men); **religion** (Protestants more pro-Republican and Catholics more pro-Democrat) and the “religious right”; the ‘**wealth gap**’ – not as influential as it was; **geographic region**, with the Northeast having become the new heartland of the Democratic Party and the Republicans now in control of the socially-conservative South
- in congressional (and presidential) elections the big issues are at present terrorism, the war in Iraq, the economy and jobs and moral issues. However, an alleged racial slur said to have cost the incumbent George Allen (Virginia) his seat in the Senate, losing to the Democrat James Webb by 0.3% of the vote
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Study Theme 3D – The European Union

Question C10

To what extent is there agreement amongst member states on EU social and economic policies?

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

The main agreed social and economic policies of the EU

Issues on which there is disagreement amongst the current membership

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the extent to which there is agreement on social and economic policies in the EU.

Answers may refer to:

Agreed aims of:

- regional policy
- social policies
- common agricultural policies
- fisheries policy
- economic policy.

Disagreement “issues”:

- criteria for regional aid
- the working time directive
- response to UK proposal on a prison transfer scheme
- reform of CAP and the UK rebate issue
- response to the ETS (emissions trading scheme)
- fish stock protection measures and quotas: allegations that some national enforcement agencies are less efficient than others; resistance to reform by entrenched interests in Spain, France, Portugal and Greece
- single currency; 13 countries “in” and 3 “out”
- single market; consequences of economic migration
- the budget
- further enlargement
- an EU constitution
- foreign policy
- rules for accepting workers from Eastern Europe
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Study Theme 3E – The Politics of Development in Africa

Question C11

With reference to specific African countries (excluding the Republic of South Africa):

Foreign aid alone is no guarantee of development.

Discuss.

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, Specific African countries exemplified, knowledge and understanding of:

The contribution of sources/forms of foreign aid to the development needs of African countries

Factors that may limit the impact of foreign aid on development

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the suggestion that foreign aid alone is no guarantee of development.

Answers may refer to:

- sources of foreign aid: international; governmental; non-governmental; the forms they take (grants, donations, loans, advice, short and long-term projects, food aid etc) and their contribution to development
- the Millennium Development Goals: eradication of extreme poverty and hunger; achievement of universal primary education; promotion of gender equality and empowerment of women; reduction in child mortality; improvement in maternal health; combating HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases; environmental sustainability; global partnership for development
- misuse of aid – not only confined to military spending by those in authority. In Nigeria, bed nets for protection against the mosquitoes were made into wedding gowns
- money does not always go where it is intended
- consequences of civil and international strife
- questions over the relevance of some aid: many threats to public health do not need hospitals, highly trained clinicians or expensive medical treatment. On the other hand there is little benefit in handing out AIDS drugs without the infrastructure to back them up – major investment in nurses, hospitals, sanitation and utilities
- terms of trade policies of the developed world
- view that DOHA did not deliver because of the trade policies of poor countries. 50% of what developing countries would gain from fully free trade would come from their own tariff cuts because 1/3 of their exports are to other poor countries and their tariffs are much higher (many relying on tariffs as a source of revenue)
- view that the trade liberalisation is no substitution for either domestic reform or foreign aid
- view that if Africa increased its share of world trade by just 1%, it would bring an extra £34b per annum (five times what it receives in aid). Freer trade would cut the number of Sub-Saharan Africans in absolute poverty by 60 million
- “aid without trade is a lullaby – a song you sing to children to get them to sleep” (Yoweri Museveni)
- selective approach of Heavily Indebted Poor Countries Initiative – debts of Somalia and Sudan have not been dropped
- view that wiping out debt acts as a disincentive to those trying to become financially stable and rewards those that do not
- problems of so-called “failed states” whose people suffer from “bad governance”

- NEPAD has accepted that in order to secure foreign aid, African governments must reform and be more transparent in their use of aid from Developed Nations
- claims that aid causes corruption, creates dependency and discourages entrepreneurship
- view that addressing infrastructure impediments is the most effective way to stimulate poverty reduction and economic growth
- even when aid is “properly” used, development does not come overnight; when Zambia’s foreign debt was reduced, most of the savings spent on recruiting teachers and improving health care (fees for basic health care removed). Nevertheless, Zambia remains poor and still depends on aid
- recognition by both the UN Investing in Development: A Practical Plan to achieve the Millennium Goals and the Commission for Africa that “more aid is needed to meet Africa’s development needs”. However “outsiders cannot deliver development, it must be done by Africans” (Commission for Africa report)
- Millennium Project has set up 12 “research villages” (target of 1000 by 2009) in 10 African countries to pioneer models of development (The Magnificent Seven) that can be copied but there is an admission that successful implementation depends upon foreign aid
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

Study Theme 3F – Global Security

Question C12

Examine the effectiveness of international responses to threats to global security.

“Pass” and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:

Threats to global security

Sources (candidates may select from UN, NATO, AU, EU, USA and coalition allies) and forms of international responses to threats to global security

and

Balanced comment on/analysis of the effectiveness of international responses to threats to global security.

Answers may refer to:

Threats:

- civil conflict
- international disputes
- nuclear proliferation
- post-conflict recovery (peace building)
- terrorism
- unstable regimes

Responses:

- UN – Democratic Republic of the Congo, Eritrea, Lebanon, Ethiopia, Sudan; response to acquisition of nuclear weapons by North Korea
- NATO – Bosnia, Macedonia, Kosovo, Afghanistan (where in October 2006 it took charge of Afghanistan’s eastern provinces, which had been in control of US forces since Taliban ousted in 2001)
- African Union – Sudan (forces airlifted there by EU and NATO)
- EU – Bosnia, where EUFOR took over control of peacekeeping operations from NATO in February 2005 (80% of the force simply changed badges); diplomatic response to Iran’s nuclear ambitions
- USA (and coalition allies) – Iraq and The War on Terrorism against “the axis of evil”
- 2005 Rand Corporation study of American and UN peacekeeping operations concluded that UN missions were not only cheaper, but had higher success rate and enjoyed greater international legitimacy
- Canadian study attributed the dramatic decline in the number of conflicts in the past decade to the “huge increase” in preventative diplomacy and peacekeeping “for the most part authorised and mounted by the UN”
- for most of the UN’s history the powerful have by-passed the Security Council when they chose to
- UN is hampered by its Charter, veto, and modus operandi: fact finding mission > Security Council approval > need to find peacekeepers
- UN resolutions ignored by members
- sanction breaking
- AU initially turned down offer of UN help in Darfur
- initial refusal of Sudanese government to allow UN intervention in Darfur, accusing the UN of being an agent of the West. However, it agreed to allow in a “hybrid” UN and AU force

- Sudan has the backing of China and Russia who consistently water-down attempts to impose sanctions
- UN resolution 1718 (October 2006) belatedly imposed sanctions on North Korea (China had hitherto blocked) but included no reference to military intervention as USA had proposed
- USA lobby to put an American in charge of all UN peacekeeping operations seen as a move that could offer Washington an exit strategy in Iraq. (USA contributes 0.5% of UN peacekeepers)
- despite its headline failures, the scandalous behaviour of some of corrupt officials and the unacceptable behaviour of some of its peacekeepers, the UN is still regarded as an essential organisation for achieving a better, fairer, more peaceful world
- view that the UN Secretary General (Ban Ki-moon) cannot succeed without Washington's co-operation and reform of the organisation
- election held in the DR (Democratic Republic) Congo (2006)
- EU unable to agree over either war in Iraq (2001-2003) or Israel's war in Lebanon
- difficulties facing NATO in defeating the Taliban militarily
- USA-British difficulties in Iraq
- other relevant points and issues.

15 marks

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]