



2008 Classical Studies

Advanced Higher

Finalised Marking Instructions

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2008

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from the Assessment Materials Team, Dalkeith.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's Assessment Materials Team at Dalkeith may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

2008 Classical Studies – Advanced Higher

The general principle underpinning the marking of all sections in both parts is that credit is to be given for well-thought out answers, supported by examples from the prescribed texts with direct quotes, if possible. Comparison, where appropriate, with societies other than those of the classical world, will also gain credit for the candidate.

PART 1

SECTION A – History and Historiography

1. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing the reliability of the sources; commenting on viewpoints and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions.

Valid points:

- Herodotus is even-handed in mentioning the dead of both sides.
- Mardonius' criticism of the Greeks as unable to agree among themselves is valid and objective.
- Herodotus stresses the gullibility of Xerxes in his behaviour concerning the dreams which advised war.
- Herodotus objectively comments on Xerxes as arrogant in building a canal when he could have arranged for the boats to be carried across.
- Xerxes is described on the one hand as mad and autocratic in the stories of the dismemberment of Pythias' son and the whipping of the Hellespont; but he is also described commenting on the shortness of human life and weeping.
- Leaders of merit on the Persian side: eg Muscames, who with his descendants held Doriscus against the Greeks, and Boges of Eion who sacrificed himself.
- Savagery of Persian customs: eg youths buried alive at 'Nine Ways'.
- Reasoned argument about the importance of the Athenians' stand against Xerxes's demands.
- Persian respect for brave Greek fighters.

10 marks

2. Skills assessed: communicating knowledge and understanding of the work studied; making reasoned statements of personal response in respect of the work studied.

Valid points:

- Pericles exemplified the virtuous politician.
- He was moral in his use of knowledge, patriotism and power.
- He believed in financial incorruptibility.
- He championed Athens as a place of civilised values, civic responsibility, equality in law and aesthetic judgement which did not involve excess.
- He supported the building programme, which glorified Athens.
- Aesthetic beauty and a harmonious polity are brought together in the Panathenaea frieze on the Parthenon, and in Pericles's Funeral Speech.

10 marks

3. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing the value and reliability of the sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- Tacitus hates arbitrary misuse of authoritarian powers by such as Tiberius: Germanicus' conduct is portrayed favourably in comparison.
- Germanicus' father was a republican, and this is mentioned as a reason for Tiberius to hate Germanicus. Tacitus refers to the end of freedom when emperors took over.
- Tacitus praises Germanicus' loyalty to the state and to the emperor, also his kindness.
- Tiberius's procrastination in relieving Germanicus during the mutiny in Germany is criticised by Tacitus.
- Tiberius's jealous, suspicious nature is shown by his envy of Germanicus.
- Tacitus's strongly held view that Tiberius was devious is illustrated in this passage.
- Tiberius surrounded himself with flatterers, including Sejanus, who poisoned his mind against Germanicus and Agrippina.
- Tacitus hints that Tiberius may have plotted Germanicus' murder, using Piso as an instrument. The tyrant would stop at nothing to remove a rival.

10 marks

4. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of sources; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two societies, making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- Polybius strives for truth and objectivity in depicting individuals, compared with Tacitus's theatricality.
- Polybius protests against graphic description at the expense of truth, and against pleasure before utility. Character portraits in Polybius are less colourful.
- Polybius is concerned with political and geographical material rather than biographical. Polybius sketches Xanthippus and Regulus in Book 1, but only as 'fortune's instruments' and examples of historical lessons.
- Tacitus exaggerates good and bad behaviour in his characterisations.
- Tacitus' Tiberius is well described, but as a stock figure of tyranny, as is Livia.
- Germanicus in contrast is brilliant and honourable.
- Tacitus handles psychological aspects of his characters, but he can distort by his need to dramatize.
- Any relevant quotes to prove the writer's obsession with character and its role in destiny.

20 marks

- (b) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation, with comparisons between them; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Herodotus's depiction of Candaules, Gyges, Croesus, Xerxes, etc for graphic impact and for depth or otherwise of character displayed.
- The place of personality in Herodotus's scheme of history.
- Thucydides' depiction of Pausanias, Themistocles, Phormio, Pericles etc for graphic impact and for depth or otherwise of character displayed.
- The place of personality in Thucydides's scheme.
- Tacitus's depiction of eg Augustus, Livia, Tiberius, army commanders and mutineers, Germanicus, Nero.
- Anti-imperial bias in Tacitus.
- The place of personality in Tacitus' theatrical view of history.
- Polybius's lack of interest in personality eg Hannibal: emphasis on Hannibal's implacable hostility to Rome is told for its bearing on the war, not on Hannibal's psychology.
- Polybius' emphasis on writing a practical manual for the statesman precludes interest in personalities.

20 marks

SECTION B – INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

5. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing the value and reliability of the sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- Candidates should be aware of the argument Plato is putting forward here, ie that, morally, most existing poetry is unsuitable because, in its representation of gods and heroes, it describes, and so encourages, various forms of moral weakness.
- Aim that guardians should grow up ‘god-fearing and holy’.
- Examples of behaviour to be avoided can be quoted.
- Candidates may wish to broaden the answer to include a view of the issue of censorship in what children are taught.

10 marks

6. Skills assessed: show understanding of the work; comprehend, interpret and compare sources; comment on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Candidates should be able to place this passage in context.
- It is not so much a discussion on the virtues of justice per se, as a key factor in the maintenance of the sort of apartheid regime which Plato favours.
- What does Plato see as the consequences of failure to prevent people being deprived of their belongings?
- Candidates are expected to offer a personal view on the validity of what Plato is proposing here.

10 marks

7. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Candidates should be able to place this extract in context. 5.10 and 5.11 concern the various origins and downfalls of tyranny and kingship.
- He is opposed to oligarchy.
- Although he gives ‘tips for tyrants’ in 5.11, he clearly disapproves of tyranny as such.
- Aristotle is here trying to show that oligarchies and tyrannies are rarely permanent institutions.
- Aristotle seems very exercised in this section to argue against what was written by Plato in the *Republic*.

10 marks

8. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Roman civilisation, with comparisons between them; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Cicero lived at a time when Rome was controlled by an oligarchy of rich powerful families.
- Cicero as an 'novus homo' needed the support of these families.
- Cicero was a natural conservative.
- Rome was, culturally, a very traditional place eg the 'mos maiorum'.
- The wealth of the oligarchy was, to a large extent, based on their ownership of land.
- The passage is part of an attack on 'greedy' politicians who bring forward bills for the re-distribution of land.

20 marks

- (b) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation, with comparisons between the two societies; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- Different attitudes to the ownership of wealth based on property in the classical world. Mostly support for ownership from our sources.
- Our sources tend to be conservative.
- By 4th century BC there was philosophical discussion on the merits of communal ownership of property, eg Aristophanes' *Assemblywomen*.
- Also in the late 2nd and 1st centuries BC there was a succession of *leges agrariae* brought by *tribuni plebis* which tried to effect the redistribution of land in the face of fierce aristocratic opposition.
- Possible charges of impracticality can be made against the systems suggested by Aristotle and Plato. Cicero at least has practical experience.
- This is still a major issue today eg Chavez in Venezuela, Mugabe in Zimbabwe with their plans to take over lands for poor peasants.

20 marks

SECTION C – Orator and Audience

9. Skills assessed: show understanding of the work; comprehend, interpret and compare sources; comment on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Oratory is an asset of tricks to please the ear.
- There is no ‘art of politics’: it is simply about persuasion.
- Political activity is morally neutral.
- Politics is to truth as cookery is to medicine, or cosmetic is to gymnastics.
- The aspiration of politicians like Callicles is to be a tyrant.
- But tyrants whose success is praised by Callicles have dangerous lives.
- Tyrants have ‘leaky souls’, incapable of satisfaction of the myth of the Danaids.
- All the above points are hopelessly idealistic and demonise politicians by taking the most monstrous examples.

10 marks

10. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Cicero’s use of oratorical techniques, eg crescendos, rhetorical questions, anaphora, aposiopesis etc with examples.
- Sarcasm with examples.
- Irony with examples.
- Argument from analogy with the past when similar cases to Catiline’s were dealt with severely.
- Emotional appeal to patriotism with examples.
- Apostrophising the accused.

10 marks

11. Skills assessed; showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisations with comparisons between the two and with modern society; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- The imperial system censors debate, and therefore oratory, in the interests of autocracy.
- If by ‘well-organised’, the speaker means an orderly empire, then only safe exercises in speaking, such as ‘declamationes’ or ‘suasoriae’ were possible: set-piece debates on fantastic or historical themes, which were completely untopical.
- Cicero and Demosthenes, great political orators, were speaking against autocrats and they paid with their lives.
- Because the state is settled now, the young are lazy, given to luxury and uninterested in politics and oratory.
- An orator’s talent swells with the size of the events it has to deal with. The Gracchi were good speakers, confronting great injustice. However the main effect of their oratory was to destabilise an already disturbed state.

10 marks

12. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation, with comparisons between the two societies; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- Humour in Plato: shorter on humour; *however*: amusing put-downs of the young Polus; the witty analogy between oratory and philosophy on the one hand, and cookery and medicine, or cosmetic and gymnastic.
- Humour in Cicero: Humour even in the serious speech on Catiline eg Cicero says that Catiline asked for lodging under his roof when Cicero was actually scared of having Catiline in the same city as himself; Clodia's louche behaviour is subject of much repartee eg "her *husband*...sorry, I mean *brother!*", "how could I quarrel with a woman who is so intimate with everyone?"; The account of Licinius's alleged handing over of the poison to Clodia's slaves in order to murder her is hilarious.
- Culture in Plato: familiarity with myth eg Danaids, Tantalus, Sisyphus, Damocles, and the ease with which he uses them as metaphors.
- Culture in Cicero: Historical examples used to point to the weakness of the contemporary state eg invidious comparison with ancestors' resolute treatment of Saturninus and the Gracchi; the comparisons between Clodia and Medea (literary allusion); quotations from literature; characterisation of the historical figure, Appius Claudius, as a type of stern republican morality.
- Parry and thrust in Plato: defeat of Gorgias, Polus and Callicles with examples eg trips up Callicles on his definition of 'the good life' which is proved to be, simply, a life of inexhaustible desire.
- Parry and thrust in Cicero: effective use of aposiopesis eg "no need for me to mention...", often used as an effective put-down of the opposition; rhetorical questions eg "how could he be complicit when he himself accused one of the criminals?"; fabrication of charges by the opposition neatly dealt with by logical argument.
- Delicate charm of Plato: the speech entices us by its subtle characterisation and by the development of the argument from a linguistic disquisition into an ethical point of view.
- Delicate charm of Cicero: triviality of the case against Caelius is the subject of Cicero's ironic start to his speech; charm with which Cicero makes the case for not taking Caelius's youthful folly too seriously; gentle put-down of the young prosecutor Atratinus, whom Cicero actually compliments in his speech.

20 marks

- (b) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two societies.

Valid points:

- Plato and oratory's respectability: dichotomy between oratory and philosophy: analogy of cookery versus medicine and cosmetic versus gymnastic; the first of each pair is only concerned with appearances and pleasure: the second is concerned with the real well-being of the body and the soul.
- For Plato, oratory was merely a set of tricks and techniques of persuasion.
- For Plato the business of man is to discover and do what is right; oratorical training in his day was opposed to this ideal, he maintains. It existed 'to make the worse argument the better'.
- Cicero and oratory's respectability: wholehearted belief in the worth of oratory as proved by his writing of comprehensive textbooks on the theme eg 'Brutus' and 'De Oratore'; his lifelong belief in the merits of persuasion before a real audience on subjects of political and ethical importance as evidenced by many speeches.
- Cicero's pleasure in fashioning cadences, crescendos, interlaced with humorous comments and wise counsel, all within a credible portrait of a statesman who believed, 'warts and all' in what he was doing.
- Tacitus and oratory's respectability: Tacitus respects old-fashioned oratory, not new style 'declamations'.
- He believes (Dialogus) that they are good insofar as they consider the importance of the subject, the circumstances of the time, and the pleasure of the audience.
- Knowledge of the arts is important, but only if the orator carries an audience who can choose ie not an audience of toadies and flatterers.
- Oratory is 'the companion of sedition' and flourishes under difficult circumstances, as he says.

20 marks

SECTION D – Comedy, Satire and Society

13. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Candidates should be able to identify the main theme of the play (the common ownership of land and property) being discussed in this passage.
- They should be able to express a view on the importance or otherwise of this issue in Athenian political and philosophical circles at the time the play was written.
- They should be able to explain Praxagora's motives for raising this issue in the context of the play.
- They should be able to express a view as to whether Aristophanes is promoting communism as a serious solution to some of the problems facing Athens at this time or whether it is merely a device for getting laughs.

10 marks

14. Skills assessed: show understanding of the work; comprehend, interpret and compare sources; comment on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Aristophanes has a long record, from *Acharnians* written in 431 onwards, of advocating peace and making clear its benefits for ordinary citizens.
- The production of this play at a time when a real treaty (the peace of Nicias) was about to be concluded between Athens and Sparta again speaks of Aristophanes support for peace.
- There are frequent references in the play to the link between peace and prosperity, culminating in the party at the end of the play.
- Aristophanes shows a particular sympathy for the plight of farmers like Trygaios who have, in many cases been forced off their land and lost their livelihood as a result of the war.
- There are frequent attacks on war profiteers and generals in the play.
- All of the above suggest that Aristophanes had clear and deep sympathy for the sufferings of the ordinary citizens of Athens during the war.

10 marks

15. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Roman civilisation, with comparisons between the two different societies; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- Candidates should focus their answers on both the similarities and the differences between the approaches of Horace and Juvenal.
- Both writers are using simple food and luxurious eating food as ways of illustrating the corrupting dangers of excess.
- Horace's sermon on the virtues of simple living is put into the mouth of Ofellus.
- He argues that enjoyment is diminished by excess.
- The wise man practises moderation.
- The glutton ruins his health and reputation.
- Unlike Horace's advice, Juvenal links excessive eating to the moral decline of society.
- Candidates should be aware that 'Curius' suggests a member of a powerful noble family.

10 marks

16. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation, with comparisons between the two societies; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- This passage specifically refers to the abusive and demeaning nature of the patron-client relationship.
- Candidates should first consider what they can write about this particular institution.
- This may lead to the tendency among all 3 writers to look at the past through rose-tinted glasses.
- In the case of Aristophanes, it could reasonably be his veneration of traditional education in *Clouds*.
- Horace claims not only to advocate simple living but to practise it on his Sabine farm. Is he being disingenuous?
- Finally, it also gives the candidate to discuss Juvenal's apparently reactionary rants.

20 marks

- (b) Skills assessed; showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisations with comparisons between the two and with modern society; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Different approaches to answering this question are possible. Credit should be given for any answer which is well and reasonably argued and is exemplified by references to the texts.
- All answers must show an awareness on the part of the candidates of the limited impact satirical writers were likely to have in the classical world.
- All 3 writers, even Aristophanes, were writing at times when it would have been unwise, perhaps even dangerous to offer solutions other than those advocated by the ruling elites.
- The best answers will recognise these limitations, but draw on the source material in passages 1-5 to show that the lifestyles which the writers are advocating, including peace, prosperity, simple living, moderation, consideration for others, are important and of benefit in improving society.

20 marks

PART 2

SECTION A – History and Historiography

1. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of the sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of ancient Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two societies and with modern society; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Herodotus broke new ground. Previously there were writers of prose narrative who simply recast traditional stories from epic poetry.
- He investigated cause and effect with reference to early relations between Greece and Persia.
- However he often relapses into a mixture of myth, fantasy and entertainment.
- Entertainment was important in that works were meant to be recited.
- History as a notion was yet to be formulated. So there was a heavy emphasis on natural history, art, geography and ethnography at the expense of politics and economics.
- Herodotus's concern with truth was confirmed much later by eg verification of events, eg the canal through Athos.
- "My business is to record what people say, but I am by no means bound to believe it." A sceptical approach.
- Herodotus's respect for evidence – examples.
- Greek tragic world view in the 'Annals' would not be an approach favoured by a modern historian. Hence the stories of natural order disturbed by excess, followed by punishment (eg Xerxes punishing the sea and the inevitable failure of his expedition.).
- Use of moral example, depiction of dramatic reversal in human fortunes and great entertainment value are not essentials of good history writing, but they characterise Herodotus. Some pertinent examples.
- Compare Thucydides' cold, analytical and didactic approach with Herodotus's sympathetic, imaginative writing. Examples.

50 marks

2. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the works studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of ancient Greek and Roman civilisation, with comparisons between the two societies; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Thucydides wants to affirm laws of human psychology at work in his History. He looks for unchanging rules which govern relations between events. Examples from the speeches with comments on effectiveness.
- For Polybius the national spirit of Rome is the unchanging substance that underlies all progress. Examples of Roman determination and resilience in 1st and 2nd Punic Wars.
- Thucydides analyses the growing conflict between Athens and Sparta, tracing it to: their rivalry during the Persian Wars; the growth of the Athenian Empire and subsequent difficulties for Sparta and her allies in trade; the build-up of tensions between Athenian and Spartan colonies; the identification of aristocratic and democratic factions with Athens and Sparta.
- Athens's occasionally high-handed treatment of her allies led to revolt.
- The cause of the Plague in Athens is treated scientifically, in the spirit of Hippocrates.
- Compare Polybius' useful discrimination between causes, pretexts and beginnings, eg in his account of the 1st and 2nd Punic Wars.
- The Affair of Messana and the resulting embroilment of Rome and Carthage, who were already rivals for Mediterranean trade.
- Polybius' careful argumentation as to whether Hannibal or the Carthaginian state were the prime movers for war; his analysis of Hamilcar's character; the pretext of Saguntum; the Carthaginian Assembly's resentment at Roman victory and peace terms after the First War.

50 marks

3. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Livy's concern to depict Rome's greatness, makes him depict Rome's enemies as monsters.
- This concern makes him attribute Hannibal's success to fortune, while Polybius credits Hannibal with great strategic ability and versatility.
- Livy's bias against Hannibal is clear in the speeches before the Battle of Ticinus. Here the Roman Scipio refers to divine displeasure at Hannibal's breaking of treaties, whilst Hannibal's speech shows him ascribing his success to fortune. How did Livy know what Hannibal said?
- Livy's picture of Hannibal lacks consistency. At one moment he has Hannibal disregarding truth, honour, religion and the sanctity of oaths, while later he has Hannibal praying to Jupiter and Hercules.
- Hannibal's reliability on oath is maligned; but later he is shown honourably freeing ransomed prisoners – inconsistency.
- Livy is however consistent in his portrait of Hannibal's cruelty and cunning: cruelty beginning with the treatment of the Saguntines, and cunning as exemplified in the frequent references to Hannibal's deceit and ambushes.
- But Livy also emphasises Hannibal's strength of character: his powers of endurance, bravery and leadership skills. Great rhetorical passages, designed to be recited. Examples.

50 marks

4. Skills: showing understanding of the work; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response in respect of the work studied.

Valid points:

Tacitus biased.....

- Tacitus is biased in favour of a version of republicanism (cf his praise for Camillus, descendant of an old republican family)
- His appraisals of empire are all critical: eg seduction of the army; slavish obedience of upper classes
- The imperial family are almost all depicted as corrupt: examples
- In an autocracy "the ruler is sole auditor"
- Are Tacitus' descriptions of Tiberius's paranoia a little obsessive?
- Germanicus was hated by Tiberius because of his father's republican leanings
- Tiberius was jealous of his own son Drusus
- Tacitus's use of hyperbole, irony and other figures of speech, in order to criticise the senate's obsequiousness to emperors. Examples
- Exaggerated praise of Germanicus ("he solved every eastern question")...and the insinuation that Tiberius had him assassinated.

Tacitus unbiased.....

- Tiberius a 'good ruler'. Examples
- Augustus put the state in order, using force sparingly
- Tiberius helped just claimants to get money grants
- Tiberius refused inheritances unless he was a friend of the deceased
- Tiberius established a 'prudent peace' with Maroboduus.

50 marks

SECTION B – Individual and Community

5. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek civilisation with comparisons with modern society.

Valid points:

- Candidates should be able to show an awareness of the differences as regards ‘freedoms and choices’ between classical societies and modern states.
- Individual rights key element in modern democratic societies as illustrated Human Rights legislation.
- In classical societies primacy of state rights over individual rights.
- Lack of social mobility a characteristic of classical societies.
- Status of women in classical societies. What are Plato’s views on this issue?
- Different times, different values.
- Candidates may wish to consider if the lack of comparable ‘freedoms and choices’ in Plato’s society are compensated for by other benefits.

50 marks

6. Skills assessed: communicating knowledge and understanding of the work studied; making reasoned statements of personal response in respect of the work studied.

Valid points:

- The best answers will consider this question from both sides, ie that Aristotle’s ideas are impractical on the one hand, and that they are based on experience and workable on the other.
- The candidates will be required to show a good understanding of the main aspects of Aristotle’s ideas including the duties of a citizen, a proper constitution, an effective education system, a system for all with no ‘opt-outs’.
- The question which then arises is the workability of such a system and here candidates should draw on their knowledge of Greek political history to consider where Aristotle’s system might fail. Is it too idealistic, too egalitarian?
- Should the state seek to control people’s lives or provide only the most basic levels of support?

50 marks

7. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of the sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of ancient Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two societies.

Valid points:

- Different experiences of Plato and Aristotle, living and working in a Greek democracy and, (in the case of Aristotle) other Greek political systems as well in contrast to Cicero who lived and rose to be consul in an oligarchical system.
- But philosophers should not be limited by their own personal experiences.
- Cicero is the only one of the three with practical political experience, though Aristotle acted as adviser to powerful men.
- Aristotle and Plato both seem to wish to create new systems while, in contrast, Cicero wants to improve an existing system.
- Cicero lived through a time of huge political change.
- Roman political life took place on a larger stage than did its Greek equivalent.

50 marks

8. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Roman and Greek civilisations, including comparisons with more modern societies; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- The main issue to be addressed is the extent to which society can and should be organised.
- Candidates should show awareness of the way most classical societies were organised (or not).
- They should have a awareness of how Plato, Aristotle and Cicero believe society should be organised including similarities and differences in what they advocate.
- They will need to be aware of the ideas from the 1930s, including fascism and communism, on the way society should be organised and, possibly the effect of Keynesian ideas on democracies at this time.
- They may also wish to consider the views of Mrs Thatcher and her commitment to the rights of the individual over the state.

50 marks

SECTION C – Orator and Audience

9. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing the value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources; making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- Demosthenes uses Athenian pride and sense of history to provoke action against Philip; This implies D's attachment to an ideal of nationalism.
- He was interested in Macedonia's cynical exploitation of alliances and its encirclement and destruction of potential enemies. He saw this as a threat to the whole of central Greece.
- Demosthenes sought to arouse all social classes in Athens in a defence of Athenian democracy.
- Philip's career of conquest had succeeded in isolating Athens, with obvious political repercussions.
- Examples of Philip's encroachment on and destruction of free states were real enough: eg the Chalkidean League, Phocis and Thebes.
- Demosthenes reminds Athenians of their appeasement of Philip and its evident failure as policy.
- Philip's tricks are exposed through a description of tactics of deception.
- Demosthenes could 'hear his hearers' pulses' and respond by playing on their emotions.

50 marks

10. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of the source; evaluating aspects of ancient Greek and Roman civilisation, with comparisons between the two societies and with modern society; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Oratory is an attractive but difficult study. Cicero shows that oratory is hard work and depends on more branches of study than people suppose. Examples.
- A discussion of whether a knowledge of literature, history and philosophy is necessary for an orator.
- Comparison of needs for an orator nowadays.
- Whatever the theme, the orator will state it better than the specialist. But he needs to talk to specialists. Examples.
- Orator must know men's character and how to rouse/pacify them.
- Orator must be able to master the confusion and din of the forum and not be obsessed by need to speak with truth about a specialism. Examples.
- BUT, 'there is no art of speaking, just the skills we are born with'. Examples to prove this.

50 marks

11. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two societies; making reasoned statements of personal response in respect of the work.

Valid points:

- Andocides presents his opponents as monsters of depravity (eg Callias).
- He hopes to prove his innocence by saying he chose to remain in Athens knowing he would face charges. Commentary on this line of argument.
- Andocides says he was clever enough to secure a tax concession before his accusers got it, prompting their envy and so their unreliability in court.
- Like Cicero, Andocides is very methodical in rebutting his opponents' charges.
- Both Andocides and Cicero refer to evidence that would not be admissible in a modern court, eg the personal character of the antagonists with intimate details of their lives.
- Implication by both Andocides and Cicero that their opponents were lying (with examples) and their relative effectiveness at using this technique.
- Cicero's sophisticated use of oratorical techniques eg tricolon crescendos, rhetorical questions, personification of historical characters, humour, aposiopesis....all with examples.
- Cicero more sophisticated at enlisting his jurors' sympathies ('we were all young once' etc) and soliciting their attention by reminding them that he and they were cultured associates who could share literary and cultural perceptions and ethical and political views of Rome's destiny.

50 marks

12. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing the value and reliability of the sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of ancient Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two societies.

Valid points:

- Plato believed that oratory can be learned and that it is a series of techniques.
- Cicero believes that oratory is a combination of natural ability and technique; that a good education is necessary to enable an orator to ornament his speech with examples from history and literature.
- Cicero and Tacitus believe that an apprenticeship in the forum with an older lawyer helps inculcate technique.
- In Athens there was a long tradition of oratory in the law courts before Demosthenes's time, and he would have learned from this.
- In the later age of Latin oratory there was a need for 'fluent arguments, brilliant reflections, short, sharp epigrams and poetic colouring. All this presupposes great learning, wide skills and comprehensive knowledge, as opposed to a narrow training in oratory.
- Knowledge of the arts and practical experience are all needed according to all these writers.
- Tacitus says that technical study is necessary to enable you to deal with 'hostile, prejudiced, envious or frightened people'.
- However talent is important, of course!

50 marks

SECTION D – Comedy, Satire and Society

13. Skills assessed: communicating knowledge and understanding of the work studied; making reasoned statements of personal response in respect of the work studied.

Valid points:

- Good marks should be allocated to those candidates who are able, using supporting evidence, to draw a distinction between being ‘anti-democratic’ and criticising failings in the operation of democracy in Athens during and after the Peloponnesian war.
- Candidates should comment and exemplify what Aristophanes writes about corruption in the politics of Athens. The primary source for this is *Knights*, but material can be found in all five plays.
- An important point is that Aristophanes is a traditionalist in social as well as political issues as exemplified by his attacks on Socrates and the ‘New Learning’ in *Clouds*.
- However, candidates should not ignore A’s criticisms about the gullibility of the Demos and the self-obsession of the Council in *Knights* and their susceptibility to flattery by unscrupulous politicians.
- Candidates may wish to mention A’s sympathy for the victims of the war, especially the farmers, and his distaste for war-mongers (passim).

50 marks

14. Skills assessed: show understanding of the work; comprehend, interpret and compare sources; comment on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points:

- Candidates should endeavour to present a balanced view of Horace’s life and the philosophy he seems to advocate.
- This would include an account of how his own personal experiences in the civil war shaped his outlook.
- It would necessarily include a view of his relationship with Maecenas and an informed analysis on how well his condemnation of, for example, ambition sits with his close friendship with such a powerful political figure.
- Is it possible that Horace in the *Satires* is adopting a persona and that his views on a range of moral and social issues is more artifice than personal belief.
- Candidates should be given an ‘A’ mark if they consider all the above-mentioned points.

50 marks

15. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing the value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources; making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response to the work.

Valid points:

- Candidates should be aware of the political circumstances which prevailed during the principates of Domitian and the contrast between that period and the principates of Nerva and Trajan which followed. Was touching on political issues still dangerous for Juvenal?
- Does Juvenal deal with any contemporary political or social issues in his *Satires*?
- What sort of exemplars does Juvenal use to illustrate the arguments he puts forward in this area/Is this an effective method?
- Satire 10 may be mentioned as an illustration of how this approach can work.

50 marks

16. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two societies; making reasoned statements of personal response in respect of the work.

Valid points:

- Any judgement on the effectiveness of the use of satire and comedy as a source for the political and social issues of the time needs a balanced approach and consideration should be given to the following points.
- As is implied in the question the cultures of Greece, especially Athens, and that of Rome towards political criticism of the ruling elite were very different. Candidates should examine why this should have been and the consequences for those writing comedy and satire.
- Candidates should consider the limitations on what criticism Aristophanes could reasonably make eg pro-peace, but not pro-Spartan.
- Differences between the political situation in Horace's time and that when Juvenal lived should be explained.
- Similarities between the difficulties facing all 3 writers should be identified.
- Above all, candidates must show an understanding of the need for caution in using satire and comedy in a way in which it was never intended to be used as a source for political and social history.

50 marks

Conversion Table 50 – 100

Points	Marks
50	100
49	98
48	96
47	94
46	92
45	90
44	88
43	86
42	84
41	82
40	80
39	78
38	76
37	74
36	72
35	70
34	68
33	66
32	64
31	62
30	60
29	58
28	56
27	54
26	52
25	50

Points	Marks
24	48
23	46
22	44
21	42
20	40
19	38
18	36
17	34
16	32
15	30
14	28
13	26
12	24
11	22
10	20
9	18
8	16
7	14
6	12
5	10
4	8
3	6
2	4
1	2
0	0

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]