



2010 Classical Studies

Advanced Higher

Finalised Marking Instructions

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2010

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from the External Print Team, Centre Services, Dalkeith.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's External Print Team, Centre Services, at Dalkeith may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

2010 Classical Studies – Advanced Higher

The general principle underpinning the marking of all sections in both parts is that credit is to be given for well-thought out answers, supported by examples from the prescribed texts, with direct quotes, if possible. Comparison, where appropriate, with societies other than those of the classical world, will also gain credit for the candidate. Credit will also be given for any valid point even if it is not included in the marking instructions.

PART 1

SECTION A – History and Historiography

1. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; identifying issues and evaluating aspects of the work; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid Points

- Herodotus wishes to show the reasons for the conflict of Greece and Persia, and he has built a picture already of vengeful Persian behaviour.
- Sadism of the east is contrasted with the reasonable Greeks.
- Arrogant authoritarian behaviour of Xerxes who says he marches with his whole family, but who leads a motley army of mercenaries and conscripts.
- Xerxes is superstitious and displays hubris. He believes the Greek cities will be eclipsed just as the sun has been eclipsed.
- Comparable examples of Persian brutality, eg the youths buried alive at ‘Nine Ways’.
- Re Pythius’ story, Herodotus likes a good story with dramatic twists and reversals of fortune.

10 marks

2. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; identifying issues in sources; assessing value and reliability of sources; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

Choosing from affairs of Corcyra, Epidamnus or Potidaea;

- Thucydides wishes to explain the dynamic development of alliances which favoured Sparta or else Athens.
- Growing antagonism between Corinth and Corcyra causing unlikely alliance of Corcyra with Athens. This is dissected step by step by Thucydides.
- Strategic arguments always predominate – no romance!
- In the speeches Thucydides tries to get as near as possible to the truth by conjecturing what people were likely to have said given the course of events in a war in which he himself took part.
- Equally balanced arguments from both of the antagonists: examples.
- Detailed account of the campaign; examples.
- Careful distinction between causes and pretexts for war: examples.
- The varying relations between the city states are linked by Thucydides with the fortunes of the democratic and aristocratic factions.
- No superfluous detail and no anecdotes.
- Human nature does not change.

10 marks

3. Skills assessed: showing understanding; assessing the value of the source; identifying issues; making reasoned statements.

Valid Points

- Polybius carefully distinguishes cause, pretext and beginning.
- The First Punic War important for understanding the background to Rome's conquest of the Mediterranean.
- The importance of Fortune in producing the context for the First Punic War.
- Roman army's greed to plunder Rhegium, spurred by the example of the Mamertines' seizure of Messana; Roman consular army then invades Rhegium to punish the renegades and expel the Mamertines from that city.
- Rome however helps the Mamertines in Messana against Syracuse, to keep Carthage out for strategic reasons!
- Control of Sicily is the real issue, and the ultimate cause of the 1st Punic War.
- All of this narrative is pertinent to Polybius' 'methods'.

10 marks

4. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding; identifying issues; comprehending and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of ancient Greek and Roman civilisation; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- Herodotus depicts the cruelty of Asian tyrants as uncivilised behaviour and therefore unreasonable.
- Other examples of Xerxes' behaviour, eg punishing the Hellespont.
- Capriciousness of Xerxes: eg his superstitious and inconsistent reactions to dreams.
- Behaviour of Candaules, Astyages, and Cyrus with reference to caprice and brutality.
- Tacitus' depiction of tyrant Nero as weak and governed by women (Agrippina, Poppaea).
- Nero inconsistent: when he tires of people he gets rid of them.
- Nero (and Xerxes) surrounded by toadies.
- Nero's pretensions to artistic talent.
- His support for mass executions (Pedanius Secundus' slaves).
- Nero's vicious treatment of Octavia.
- Similar critique of Tacitus' treatment of Tiberius, but with reference to instances of talent and good sense on Tiberius' part.
- Livy's Tarquin and tyrannical behaviour, eg execution of the chiefs of Gabii.
- Tarquin's Rape of Lucretia.
- The pride of Tarquin, in the episode of the Sibylline Books.
- The Tarquins were kings therefore, in Livy's eyes, anti-republican and ruling by over-riding the law.

20 marks

- (b) Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between them; assessing the reliability of sources; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- Herodotus does care for evidence, but enlivens his account to a remarkable degree with ethnographical, geographical and religious material, as well as legend: examples.
- Herodotus' stories embellish and also support his central purposes eg to explain the reasons for the wars between Greece and Persia and to epitomise eastern despotism.
- Thucydides wants to write a 'possession for all time'. He is much more concerned with the analytic, at the expense of entertaining digressions: examples.
- Thucydides History is a strictly human affair, with no place for colourful dreams, omens nor for dramatic characterisation: examples.
- Thucydides point is the moral and social breakdown brought about by the Plague. He is not interested in cheap emotional stories about the course of the disease.
- Polybius is writing a handbook for politicians. He analyses events in terms of cause and effect, and the place of Fortune.
- Polybius has no place for romantic or ethnographical excursions, nor for glorious battle-scenes.
- Polybius' concern is for evidence, not for superstition or melodrama: examples.
- Tacitus is entertaining in his recreation of individuals in 'role' as tyrant, 'dominant mother', 'flatterer', 'tragic victim' etc: examples.
- Tacitus' writing-style is epigrammatic and most striking eg 'the whole point about autocracy is that the accounts will not come right unless the ruler is the only auditor.'
- Tacitus is fascinated by 'twisted' minds (eg Tiberius' insistence on shows of independence by a cowed senate).
- Human interest stories in Livy indicating his feeling for 'tragic history'.
- The recounting of legends by Livy, often with supernatural aspects is colourful; examples.
- Livy's battle scenes are dramatic: examples.
- Livy's demonisation of Hannibal: examples.

20 marks

SECTION B – Individual and Community

5. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; identifying issues and evaluating aspects of the work; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

- Candidates should be able to provide examples of Plato's preference for age over youth which is fundamental to his view of the best way to organise and lead society.
- For example, in 4.425b we find 'the young should observe a proper silence in the presence of their elders, give up their seats to them and stand, and look after their parents.'
- An answer capable of attracting a mark of 8+ should also show an awareness of the reasons for this preference eg as a guarantor of the conservative and rigid nature of the structure of Plato's state.

10 marks

6. Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek civilisation with comparisons; assessing the reliability of sources; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- Plato believed that the duty that each person carried out as he was fitted to was a form of justice.
- Plato defined justice as in terms of two types, group and individual.
- Plato believed that individual justice mirrored political justice.
- For Plato justice was the excellence of people's souls.
- Plato posits two differing versions of education, first the education of the Guardians, the second of the philosopher-kings.
- The Guardians' education should not lead them to lord it over the other citizens.
- Socrates suggests that the Guardians' education should be controlled to make them like 'noble puppies'.
- Education in music for the soul and gymnastics for the body.
- The Guardians' education is primarily moral in character.
- It emphasises the blind acceptance of beliefs and behaviour rather than the ability to think critically or independently.

10 marks

7. Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek civilisation with comparisons; assessing the reliability of sources; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- Plato believes in equal chances for women to give them the potential to achieve.
- In the just society he believes women should have the same upbringing.
- They should have the same education (music, poetry, physical activity).
- But there are limitations on their role.
- Aristotle viewed women very negatively.
- He is very sexist and explicitly states so.
- He believes that women are subsidiary to men due to natural characteristics.
- Candidates should also make clear that they are aware of the reality of women's lives in the classical world.

10 marks

8. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between them; assessing the reliability of sources; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- Candidates should be able to provide examples from their reading of the attitudes of each of the authors to the ownership of private property.
- They should be able to explain why Cicero's natural conservatism as well as the political situation in the late Republic led him to favour strongly the status quo in this matter.
- They should again with Plato and Aristotle be able to provide appropriate examples of their different view in this matter.
- Plato's almost fascistic or communistic inclinations in this area may prompt comparisons with modern totalitarian regimes.
- A personal response on which system is the most practical should also be given credit.

10 marks

- (b) Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between them; assessing the reliability of sources; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- This question gives the candidates an opportunity to display the range and the depth of their knowledge on the structuring of society.
- They should show awareness of the social background of the societies being discussed.
- They should be aware of the conservative nature of classical societies.
- They should be able to explain why Cicero's political background made it unlikely that his suggestions for the structure of society would be radical or innovative.
- They may wish to see Plato's proposals as innovative with their emphasis on the primacy of the state as a result of the failures of democracy in 5th and 4th century Greece.
- They may feel that his emphasis on requiring citizens to adapt to the state's structures and the concept of different tasks for different groups provided little scope for social mobility and was decidedly negative.
- They may like the ideas of Aristotle on a constitution as positive.
- Likewise on the very modern concept of the duties of a citizen.
- Likewise, education as liberating.
- Finally, the rights of the individual seen by Aristotle as helping establish stability and so laying the basis of social innovation.

20 marks

SECTION C – Heroes and Heroism

9. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; evaluate aspects of ancient Greek civilisation, with comparisons with modern society; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

Achilles can feel aggrieved because

- Agamemnon caused the plague by mistreating Chryses the priest.
- He also abused Calchas, when he gave reasonable advice.
- Agamemnon should accept the reasonable offer of recompense for Chryseis when Troy falls.
- In a shame culture he cannot give way.

Agamemnon can feel aggrieved because

- He is the commander, and of all who have won booty, he is the one to lose his prize.
- As commander he deserves obedience.
- Achilles' action in withdrawing support is out of proportion to the offence.
- In a shame culture he cannot give way.

10 marks

10. Skills assessed; showing understanding; evaluate aspects of Greek civilisation; identifying issues; make reasoned statements.

Valid points

Paris is typical of the anti-hero because

- He is a 'show-off' who likes to display his lovely armour in a distinctly non-heroic way.
- He is attracted to luxurious living, and to women, in an obsessive way.
- Any further explanation of the simile of the stallion which devalues Paris.
- Hector criticises Paris for shirking the fighting to be with Helen.
- Helen regrets her and Paris' action.
- Hector, the mainstay of Troy takes pathetic leave of his wife and son. This throws Paris' unheroic behaviour into harsh relief.
- HOWEVER, Hector does admit that Paris, when he wants to be, is a good fighter.

10 marks

11. Skills assessed; showing understanding; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation; making reasonable statements of personal response.

Valid points

Rights and wrongs of Neptune's anger

- Laomedon's non-payment to Poseidon for building the walls of Troy.
- Ambivalence and capriciousness of Poseidon, who normally protected Troy.

Rights and wrongs of Juno's anger

- She lost the Beauty Contest on Mount Ida and hates Paris and Troy.
- Juno loved Carthage, fated to be destroyed by Troy's offshoot, Rome.
- The anger is out of proportion in its expression.
- Juno descends to unseemly anger at the Trojans, to compete with Athene, who has punished the Greeks.

Rights and wrongs of Athena's anger

- She lost the Contest too!
- The expression of anger is out of proportion eg the killing of Laocoon and sons.

Rights and wrongs of Jupiter's anger

- Jupiter just wants a quiet life with Juno, who supports the Greeks.

In general the gods are petty and capricious if powerful. For example, Venus and Jupiter bargain: Venus asks for permission to found Rome since Jupiter has allowed the destruction of Troy. The humans are pawns in a game.

10 marks

12. (a) Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two ancient societies and with modern society; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

Agamemnon and Achilles

- Agamemnon's action is high-handed and it is unworthy of a commander, to seize a subordinate's slave.
- Achilles' revenge prolongs the war, resulting in many deaths and the tragic loss of his friend.
- Scenes of great pathos caused by vengeance of Achilles eg Hector's death.
- HOWEVER the shame culture does not allow one to lose face, thus making tragic dilemmas inevitable.

The gods

- Juno's vengeance leads to the destruction of Troy, and all the concomitant suffering.
- Athene's vengeance is less stable, and she reverses her allegiance, going over to the Trojans, because of Greek mistreatment of Cassandra.
- Zeus is more concerned with placating his wife. He has had many good sacrifices from Trojans and would have preferred to support Troy: the relationship between mortals and gods was a bargaining one.

Odysseus

- His main desire is to get back home to his wife. His home has been polluted by the suitors and his wealth used up. Therefore vengeance is justified.
- The battle with the suitors is vividly described, complete with partial reverses and a gradual build-up. This produces a satisfying response to Odysseus' victory.
- The goddess Athene, his protector, gives sanction to his massacre of the suitors.
- HOWEVER the victory scene is triumphalist in a bad sense. "Odysseus and his men are like vultures – the floor smokes with blood".
- Other examples of the horror of the scene.
- Also, Odysseus' savage treatment of the maids.

20 marks

- (b) Skills assessed: showing understanding; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two; making reasoned statements of personal response; comprehending interpreting and comparing sources.

Valid points

- **In passage 1**, Achilles' death has been foretold to his mother Thetis and so he is not in control.
- The gods are always arbiters of human destiny, themselves ruled by Fate.
- The gods control human behaviour: eg Athene stops Achilles from striking Agamemnon.
- Agamemnon is a commander, with many admirable qualities, but Homer makes him weak as well, and unable to give way when wrong.
- **In passage 2**, Paris had awarded the beauty prize to Aphrodite and he chose her to get Helen. From then on, admirable hero as he was, his doom was sealed.
- Paris was left alone with Helen by a gullible Menelaus. Paris had no chance against the power of Aphrodite.
- **In Passage 4**, Odysseus' delayed return was caused by the anger of Poseidon. He was annoyed by his son's blinding by Odysseus.
- The delay meant the suitors had time to waste Odysseus' resources and chase his wife.
- Athene encouraged Odysseus in the massacre of the suitors.
- All of Odysseus' actions are controlled in some sense by the arbitrary will of the gods: eg it was only because Poseidon was absent from Olympus that day, that Athene got Zeus' support for Odysseus.
- **In Passage 5**, Dido is the wronged woman in a tragic affair. She is pathetic in her entreaties and she is passionately loyal to her men, both Sychaeus and now Aeneas.
- But she fights destiny and gods' will.
- Juno, who would have supported her, transferred allegiance and joined with Venus to make her fall for Aeneas.
- Juno wanted to stop Aeneas getting to Italy. Venus wished to protect Aeneas. So their interests coincided in making Dido fall for him.
- Destiny must be fulfilled. Aeneas must found a colony in Italy...and eventually Carthage must fall to Rome. Dido is the unfortunate first victim.

20 marks

SECTION D – Comedy, Satire and Society

13. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing value and reliability of the sources; commenting on the viewpoint and bias in the sources; making judgements and stating conclusions.

Valid points

- Praxagora has devised a scheme to let women take control of the Assembly.
- The second element in her plan is the communal ownership of property.
- There are elements of the plan eg the sharing out of women which are clearly not meant to be taken seriously.
- Nevertheless the basic idea of a form of communism was certainly being discussed in philosophical circles at this time.
- There is no real evidence of a populist or political initiative at this time towards communism in property.
- Any other relevant point supported by evidence from the text.

10 marks

14. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; assessing value and reliability of the sources; commenting on the viewpoint and bias in the sources; making judgements and stating conclusions.

Valid points

- The chorus of the Clouds have a very limited role in what they actually do in the play.
- They represent the airy ideas of Anaxagoras and Socrates.
- Socrates is portrayed as living among the Clouds which stimulate his intellect.
- A good answer will focus on the actions and words of the chorus during the play.
- Candidates should also comment on the perception of the chorus by the other characters.
- Finally they may also wish to speculate on the audience's reaction to the Clouds.

10 marks

15. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; identifying issues in sources; assessing value and reliability of sources; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

- In this satire Horace has been dealing with people's lack of tolerance in social relations.
- In this section he moves from friendship to society as a whole.
- He argues in this passage that we need to be fair in our punishments as everyone does wrong.
- This is aimed at the Stoics who argued that all sins were equally culpable.
- Horace is advocating proportionality – an Epicurean view.
- The Stoic preacher ends the satire alone and risible.

10 marks

- 16. (a)** Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response in respect of the work studied.

Valid points

- Candidates may wish to make clear that this is one of Juvenal's more understated and more effective satires.
- He starts with the physical effects of ageing.
- He mentions the illnesses that old age brings.
- He is very effective in describing the mental collapse.
- He touches on fathers who outlive their sons, mentioning both historical and mythological characters.
- Candidates must illustrate their answers with examples from the text.

20 marks

- (b)** Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two ancient societies; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- Candidates to attract a mark of 15+ in this question must support their conclusions with evidence from a variety of sources.
- The main point to be made is that our satirists do offer solutions – Aristophanes deals with political corruption (Knights), the benefits of ending the war (Peace), the inequalities of the Athenian Assembly (Assembly Women).
- The Roman satirists are less political (candidates should explain why) but tackle social issues well and constructively.
- Horace is sound on philosophical dilemmas.
- Candidates must reach the conclusion that because satirists have limited political power and also a need to entertain there is a clear limit to the extent to which they can bring about change.

20 marks

PART 2

SECTION A – History and Historiography

1. Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; assessing value and reliability of sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias; making.

Valid points

- Herodotus purpose is to describe the cause of the war between Greeks and barbarians.
- He distances himself from the sources which mythologise causes, by ascribing initial blame to a historical figure, Croesus.
- Herodotus tells stories about Croesus' interesting ancestors, stories of guilt and cruelty which we associate with the barbarians.
- The story of Croesus' life shows the subservience of man to destiny – a theme of 'The Histories'.
- Herodotus loves the unusual in human behaviour: examples.
- Eastern despotism is epitomised by whipping of Hellespont, punishment of Pythius etc.
- Freedom is highly rated in Herodotus as the story of Xerxes' and Demaratus' conversation about Sparta shows.
- Thucydides analyses the growing conflict between Athens and Sparta tracing it to their rivalry during Persian Wars; the growth of the Athenian Empire and consequent difficulties for Sparta and her allies in trade; the interference of each with the other's colonies; the build-up of tensions between Athenian and Spartan colonies; the identification of aristocratic and democratic factions with Athens and Sparta.
- Thucydides wants to affirm laws of human psychology at work in his history. He looks for unchanging rules which govern relations between events. Examples from the speeches.

50 marks

2. Skills assessed: showing understanding; identifying issues; assessing the value and reliability of a source; commenting on viewpoint in source; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- Polybius' intention is to explain how Rome, rather than Macedonia or Persia, came to dominate the Mediterranean world. All his techniques are marshalled to this end.
- Polybius teaches politicians how to bear the vicissitudes of fortune eg career of Hannibal; Regulus.
- Polybius aims to teach politicians about the affairs of cities, peoples and rulers. This means political and military history.
- In his ordering of content Polybius emphasises the vital importance of the causes of events, or of the lessons implicit in great men's lives: examples.
- Polybius, the pragmatist is opposed to graphic or fabulous episodes in his history. 'History is not an idle or unprofitable tale'.
- Importance of geographical information through personal enquiry.
- Polybius could report first hand as he was a diplomat during this period.
- HOWEVER, Polybius' belief that history must fulfil practical and moral aims is tendentious, entailing bias.
- Comment on any of the above for Polybius' effectiveness.

50 marks

3. Skills assessed; showing understanding; evaluating aspects of Roman civilisation and comparison with modern society; identifying issues; commenting on viewpoint and bias; making judgements and stating conclusions.

Valid points

- Livy maintains it is credible that Romans were descended from Mars (The Preface).
- His is a view of Rome as ideal in the beginning, declining thereafter, and corrupt in the present, but likely to flourish under Augustus.
- Lucretia is the ideal spouse, killing herself for her honour.
- He depicts the great male figures of the past eg Romulus and Numa, as prototypes for Augustus.
- The end of our history, he says, is in the present: “Augustus Caesar brought peace to the world”.
- Livy maintains that history is a medium for moral instruction: examples.
- His is a complex picture of Hannibal, cruel but gifted and tragic.
- He has great regard for religious observance, and for harmony between social orders, which transcends his patriotism.

50 marks

4. Skills assessed; showing understanding; identifying issues; assessing the reliability of the source; commenting on bias, making judgements and stating conclusions.

Valid points

- Appropriate use of speeches to illustrate crises. These must be made up after the event; eg Percennius and Germanicus and Segestes in Annals Book 1.
- Graphic scenes depicting crowd psychology: eg Pannonian rebellion and instability of the rebels dramatically described.
- Pictorial battle scenes eg Caecina v Arminius.
- Theme of war is subservient to T's grander purpose ie to depict corruption at court in Rome: eg Camillus 'survived' his triumph (Book 2). Tacitus' cynical appraisal of Tiberius' jealousy of Camillus.
- Tacitus' interest in war as a teacher of morals eg Germanicus at Actium, contemplating the tragedies of his ancestors on both sides of his family.
- Graphic description of rebellion in Britain: eg Druids' behaviour, burning of Camulodunum and London, Boadicea's last battle.

50 marks

SECTION B – Individual and Community

5. Skills: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias, making judgements and stating conclusions; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

- Aristotle supports the idea of a constitution.
- Strong emphasis by Aristotle on the duties of a citizen.
- Strong emphasis by Aristotle on the importance of education – idea of education as liberating.
- Rights for the individual seen as helping establish stability and so helping to create the correct political and social success.
- Aristotle reluctant to allow anyone to opt out of the state.
- Some opportunity for social mobility.
- Candidates need to be aware that there was little sympathy in the classical world for individuals to ‘go it alone’. Opting out was not acceptable. The interdependence of the citizen body was seen as both desirable and necessary.
- Candidates may consider all or some of the points mentioned above as relevant to life in modern Britain.

50 marks

6. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating aspects of Greek civilisation with comparisons with modern society.

Valid points

- There are a number of elements which are crucial to Plato’s ideal state, but would not be acceptable to anyone who enjoys the freedom of living in a modern democracy. These include the status of women, the lack of social mobility, the emphasis on the primacy of state rights over individual rights.
- The hierarchical nature of Plato’s state is also an issue – especially its rigid nature.
- As to what is admirable in such a state we may consider the stability and order which is to be found in such states attractive.
- It is important that the candidates set the issues in context – different times, different values, for example, the reality of life for Greek women was that they faced prejudice on a daily basis and that there were advantages as well as disadvantages in what he is proposing from the point of view of modern feminism.
- The best answers will, therefore, seek to explore all that Plato is proposing, then set it in context and finally draw appropriate comparisons and contrasts with modern society.

50 marks

7. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources: evaluating aspects of Roman civilisation: making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

- Strengths which Cicero brings to political philosophy.
- It reflects the author's involvement in Roman politics over a long and troubled period eg the Catilinarian conspiracy and his year as consul, his period of exile, the first triumvirate, the domination of Caesar.
- There is a practicality, missing from Plato and Aristotle, about many of his ideas, and perhaps as a result of his time in politics, he understands what is achievable and what is not.
- He understands what is right and wrong – note his views on tyrannicide and justice.

50 marks

8. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources: evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisations: making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

- This is a complex question which demands an understanding of the relationship between the freedom of the individual and the need for structure within a state.
- It also needs an awareness on the part of candidates that of the schemes of societal organisation suggested only that of Cicero offers practical freedoms.
- Both Plato and Aristotle believe in the state as the core round which a society is built.
- Plato's state requires its citizens to adapt to the structures of the state.
- Aristotle's state is based on a constitution which sets out the duties and responsibilities of all citizens.
- Answers should, however, avoid simplistic conclusions, as Aristotle can take an authoritarian view at times and Plato is too astute to deny the citizens control or to allow the system to become a sort of tyranny.

50 marks

SECTION C – Heroes and Heroism

9. Skills assessed: showing understanding; evaluating aspects of ancient society with comparisons then and now; identifying issues; making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

- In Homer Book 6, Helen blames herself for her affair. She is affected by the noble behaviour of Hector.
- The sacrifice of the blameless Iphigeneia can be blamed on Helen and Paris equally.
- Helen more to blame than Paris because she was married.
- However the tragedy of Troy can be blamed on both equally.
- Paris' award of the apple to Aphrodite meant disastrous love for Helen.
- In Euripides, the Greeks are blamed for getting Helen's adultery out of proportion (Cassandra).
- Helen never had a chance because she was accursed from the start (Andromache).
- Helen's own case is: Paris should have been killed at birth, since everything is foretold; the Greeks would have been ruled by an Asian king if she had not caused the ruin of Troy; Menelaus should not have left Paris alone with her; Love is superior to Zeus.

50 marks

10. Skills assessed: showing understanding; evaluating aspects of the two ancient civilisations with comparisons between them and with modern society; comprehending and comparing sources; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

In the Odyssey

- Women are legitimate male possessions, not supposed to complain.
- Penelope has to tolerate the suitors, and if Odysseus is dead then her son is to marry her off.
- HOWEVER Penelope is a loyal and sympathetic character.
- Odysseus loves his wife, but clearly desires Calypso, another compassionate and loyal woman.
- After Calypso agrees to help Odysseus, he enjoys a last night of love with her.
- The man and his return home are again all important in the Nausicaa episode. Nausicaa has to be made to fall for Odysseus so he can get back home. Odysseus' and Nausicaa's meetings are not deep love, but are instruments of divine will.
- Clearly the hero's homecoming to his wife is predominant theme in the last books, but there is little psychological interest in Penelope's depiction.

In the Aeneid

- Aeneas' first wife conveniently disappears to allow him at last to marry an Italian.
- There is a deep portrayal of female love in Dido.
- Dido is reluctant to forget her dead husband.
- Dido does give way to love, but divine compulsion fights with her own shame. Virgil poses a tragic dilemma.
- Aeneas, creature of destiny, anxious to leave Dido, is a less convincing character here. Virgil has struck a modern note.
- Dido loses everything for Aeneas, only to be left abandoned.
- Dido, fully human, threatens Aeneas with revenge.
- She uses ploys to keep him.
- Tragic irony of the line 'woman is fickle'.

50 marks

11. Skills assessed: showing understanding; evaluate aspects of the two ancient civilisations and make comparisons; identify issues; compare sources; make reasoned statements.

Valid points

Hector and Achilles

- Pathos of context for Hector. Leavetaking of his wife and child; his father's dire predictions.
- Pathos of context for Achilles. Loss of his friend. His mother's prediction of his own early death.
- Hector's abandonment by the gods.
- The whole duel fought with the weight of a fatal destiny for both warriors.
- The arrogant treatment of Hector's body by Achilles and the effect on Hector's family.

Aeneas and Turnus

- Turnus is the local hero: Aeneas is the interloper.
- Turnus will die because of his love for Lavinia.
- We know that Aeneas is fated to win.
- Pathos of Turnus losing Juno's support. Only his sister left to help him.
- At prayers preceding the battle, the Latins are already considering a world without Turnus.
- Graphic description of twists of fortune within the duel, but never really the case that destiny will be overturned.
- Turnus' orgy of killing when Aeneas is wounded loses him some sympathy.
- Sympathy or antipathy aroused by the various epic similes (with examples).
- Bravery of Turnus, who realises he can stop the massacre by offering to fight a duel.
- Odds stacked against Turnus.
- Reconciliation of Juno to the idea of Rome (as long as the Trojan name does not continue) means the end for Turnus. People as playthings of the gods and destiny.
- Gradual withdrawal of help for Turnus.
- As with Achilles and Hector, Aeneas recognises the armour of Pallas on Turnus, and deals the death blow.

50 marks

12. Skills assessed: showing understanding; evaluate aspects of the ancient civilisations with comparisons then and now; make reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

Taking any hero, candidates could consider:

- models of today – celebrity cult versus the hero of the past
- the ways in which the ideas of heroism have changed/stayed the same over time
- the hero enlisting our sympathies for his fallibility
- the hero as confronting impossible odds with dignity
- the hero as subject to tragic dilemmas, who wins our interest and a measure of self-identification
- the hero as a protector or a convincing lover of women
- as a magnificent fighter in a noble cause
- as exhibiting human feelings, doomed not just by destiny but by mortality
- the hero's qualities of leadership
- the hero's capacity for pity.

50 marks

SECTION D – Comedy, Satire and Society

13. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied: assessing the value and reliability of the sources: commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources: making judgements and stating conclusions: making reasonable statements of personal response.

Valid points

Pupils should be clear that Aristophanes was not a traitor and from there move on to a balanced discussion of the following points.

- Aristophanes is not a social historian, still less is he a partisan political creature.
- There is much speculation on Aristophanes' purpose in writing the type of comedies he did.
- There was a need for Aristophanes to reflect in his plays real issues of public and audience concern eg the corruption of politicians, the war-mongering of generals, the declining standards of morality.
- Remember the comedies are part of a play competition which Aristophanes was keen to win.
- Impact of the above consideration on the content and themes of his plays.
- Effects of comic exaggeration.
- Real people attacked in plays – for plays to be credible their needs to be some basis of truth.
- Does satire really claim to show us the reality of political life – modern comparisons.

50 marks

14. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work: comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources: evaluating aspects of Roman civilisation, with comparisons: making reasoned statements of personal response.

Valid points

- Horace gives us (or, at least, claims to give us) his reasons for writing satire in 1.4.
- His writing is an amusing pastime.
- His observations are meant to lead to improvements in his own behaviour.
- He does not target the innocent.
- He is not after fame for himself.
- Besides, the political circumstances when he wrote were not conducive to political criticism (post civil war).
- He admires and likes men like Maecenas and Augustus.
- He is dependent on the patronage of Maecenas.

50 marks

15. Skills assessed: showing understanding; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; evaluating aspects of Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between them; assessing the reliability of sources; making reasoned statements.

Valid points

- Juvenal attacks what he sees as changes in the moral values in his society and the loss of the traditional values of the past.
- He attacks homosexuality and what he claims is its corrupting effect in Satire 2, though he does so under the guise of an attack on hypocrisy.
- He attacks corruption among the aristocracy.
- He attacks immorality, particularly among women.
- He attacks the terrible crime rate in Rome.
- He attacks the corruption which he claims foreign immigrants are bringing to Rome.
- For the second part of the question, candidates might consider if the more considered tone and language of Satire 10 is more effective than the venom of Satires 2 and 6.

50 marks

16. Skills assessed: showing understanding of the work studied; comprehending, interpreting and comparing sources; commenting on viewpoint and bias in the sources, making judgements and stating conclusions; evaluating Greek and Roman civilisation with comparisons between the two societies; making reasoned statements of personal response in respect of the work.

Valid Points

The main similarities are

- A sense of nostalgia for virtues and values lost.
- A dislike of the changing nature of society.
- A longing for a 'golden age'.
- Suggestions as to how best to survive in such societies.
- A focus on populist concerns.
- No real solutions in a political sense.

The main areas of contrast are

- Greek comedy was written under a democratic system of government with considerable freedom of speech, eg Aristophanes attacks on Cleon and Hyperbolus, while the situation in Rome at the times of both Horace and Juvenal made it much more difficult to attack contemporary political figures or to question decisions made by the ruler of the period.
- Greek Old Comedy had certain conventions about the way it delivered to its audience a mixture of slapstick, political comment and spectacular choruses.
- Most of Aristophanes' work was produced against the background of the war with Sparta and is concerned with the need to end this war.
- Roman satire developed over a much longer period and the work of Horace was very different from that of Lucilius, while that of Juvenal was different again.
- The main targets of Roman satire are not the ruling elite, either at the time of Horace or of Juvenal, but rather those vices which weaken society.
- It is social and personal vices which Horace and Juvenal deal with well.

50 marks

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]