



2012 History

Higher – Paper 2

Finalised Marking Instructions

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2012

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from SQA's NQ Delivery: Exam Operations.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's NQ Delivery: Exam Operations may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

**2012 History Higher
Paper 2
Marking Instructions**

Introduction

- 1 Marking is positive and relates to the points made.
- 2 For credit to be given, points must relate to the question asked.
- 3 If relevant evidence is selected, from either the source and/or recall, but no explicit evaluation is made then the maximum mark that may be achieved is 3 for questions out of 5 and 6 for questions that are out of 10. This means that implicit evaluation will still be credited, but only to a notional maximum of 18.
- 4 For the marking of particular types of question, detailed guidance is given below

Source Evaluation items

How useful is Source A as evidence of... 5 marks

Feature of marking	Mark allocation	Mark given	Overall mark
Evaluation of Provenance	Up to 2 marks		
Evaluation of Content	Up to 2 marks		
Evaluation of relevant Recall	Up to 2 marks		

- Up to two marks may be given for points about ORIGIN and PURPOSE. At the basic level, this may be good CREDIT level approach, but this can only achieve one mark. For two marks to be given some explanation as to the importance of the origin and purpose is needed.
- The candidate can achieve up to two marks for their interpretation of the parts of source they consider are useful in terms of the proposed question. For full marks to be given each point needs to be discreetly mentioned and its usefulness explained. Listing can only be considered to be one point.
- The remaining marks, up to a maximum of two, are achieved by the application of relevant and developed recall that they provide. This has to be developed in terms of the question for full marks to be given.

Source Comparison items

To what extent do Sources B and C agree about... 5 marks

Feature of marking	Mark allocation	Mark given	Overall mark
Overall comparison	Up to 2 marks		
Direct comparisons	Up to 4 marks		

- The question has the more complex, 'To what extent...' style beginning, indicating that the overall evaluation is important. In other words, the candidate shows understanding of the views, rather than simply rehearsing content. This can gain up to two marks.
- Candidates are expected to compare content directly on a point by point basis, but this has to be more than a simple, A says, but B says... *Some basic explanation of what the two sources agree/disagree about, combined with illustration of the point from the sources is needed for a full mark to be given.* This allows for articulation from good practice at Standard Grade and Intermediate, while requiring a more sophisticated Higher level response.

Contextualisation items

These questions ask about a specific issue/sub-issue in the course, seeking to assess depth of knowledge.

How fully/far does Source D explained/illustrate/show...

10 marks

Feature of marking	Mark allocation	Mark given	Overall mark
Use of Source	Up to 4 marks		
Use of Relevant Recall	Up to 7 marks		

- The candidate can achieve up to four marks for their interpretation of the parts of the source they consider are relevant in terms of the proposed question. For full marks to be given each point needs to be discreetly mentioned in terms of the question. Merely selecting relevant information and/or listing can only be considered to be one point.
- The remaining marks, up to a maximum of seven, are achieved by the application of **relevant** and **developed** recall that they provide. This has to be **developed in terms of the question** for full marks to be given. Again, the quality of the response matters as does the relevance of the information. Points of recall may be developed from the source and/or be new points. The quality of both is comparable.

Annotation of Scripts when marking.

The following annotation should be used when marking.

Specifically identify when credit is being given by using the following symbols;

P: Provenance: covering both Origin and Purpose, when used appropriately.

S: Relevant point from source, when used appropriately.

R: Relevant point of recalled information, when used appropriately.

O/C: Relevant overall comparison point.

C: Valid, explained individual comparison point.

When you identify relevant points from Provenance, Source and Recall, BUT they are not being used correctly: i.e. they are listing information, use the same annotation, but surround with brackets like so:

(P)

(S)

(R)

(O/C)

(C)

SPECIAL TOPIC 1: THE WARS OF INDEPENDENCE, 1286 – 1328

Question 1: To what extent do **Sources A** and **B** agree about the Scots' attempts to protect their independence after the death of Alexander III? **(5)**

The candidate makes a judgement on the extent to which **Sources A** and **B** agree about the Scots' attempts to protect their independence in terms of:

Overall both sources generally agree that the Scottish Guardians were concerned about maintaining the independence of Scotland. **Source B** offers a more detailed summary of how the kingdom would function under a dual monarchy and seems to suggest more optimism than the frank statements of the actual treaty.

Source A

- No one of the kingdom of Scotland shall be held to answer outwith that kingdom for any agreement entered into, or for any crime committed, or in any other cause contrary to the laws and customs of that kingdom
- The rights and liberties and customs of Scotland shall be wholly preserved
- We promise that the kingdom of Scotland shall remain separate and divided from the kingdom of England
- We grant that no tenant-in-chief of the king of Scotland shall be forced to go outside the kingdom to do homage or fealty.

Source B

- Persons in Scotland who had been accused of a crime or sued at law should not have to answer in a court outside their country
- The guardians above all anxious to do nothing that might impair the "rights" or the integrity of Scotland
- The treaty envisaged two feudal kingdoms – England and Scotland – ruled separately
- Tenants in chief of the Scots Crown need do homage for their lands in Scotland only.

Question 2: How useful is **Source C** as evidence of the subjugation of the Scots by Edward I in 1296?

(5)

The candidate makes a judgement as to how useful **Source C** is as evidence of the subjugation of the Scots by Edward I in 1296 in terms of:

- **Origin** – Primary source written in the early 14th century by the canon of Guisborough Priory in the Bruce lands of Yorkshire. The chronicle details events throughout the period of the Scottish wars (though there is a gap between 1316 and 1326); it is generally considered a reliable document. Events detailed during the reign of Edward I are a contemporary record of events.
- **Possible purpose** – Walter's work is a record of English history, dating from the conquest in 1066, as with many chronicles it is an attempt to set the world in context. The Guisborough Priory suffered during the Scottish wars, and housed many refugees from other religious houses during the wars. There could be a trace of bias due to this.
- **Content** –
 - When the city was taken more than 8,000 were killed
 - Taking of hostages like Lord William Douglas
 - Taking the oaths of loyalty from two hundred men.

Points from recall which support and develop those from the source:

- Despite the Scots' early confidence, and the fortification of Berwick, the city fell quickly to Edward's more professional and experienced army
- The garrison of the castle surrendered under the laws of chivalry and Edward allowed them to go, but the townsmen and Burghers were slaughtered
- Edward forced the women and children to abandon their homes and re-populated Berwick with people from Northumbria.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- The Earl of Surrey defeated the Scottish army at Dunbar, many Scottish knights and nobles were captured
- Edward I captured important castles such as Roxburgh, Edinburgh and most importantly Stirling, there was no attempt at resistance at Stirling
- Edward's march northward to Elgin, and the acceptance of oaths of loyalty from nobles along the way (Ragman's Roll)
- King John's humiliating surrender at Kincardine Castle (Toom Tabard)
- Edward's removal of the Stone of Destiny and Scottish legal documents to prevent an inauguration of a future king
- The appointment of the Earl of Surrey as Lieutenant of Scotland
- Any other relevant points.

Question 3: How far does **Source D** show the changing military balance between Scotland and England, 1298 - 1301? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement as to how far **Source D** shows the changing military balance between Scotland and England, 1298-1301 in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- The Scots army is forced to retreat north, deploying scorched earth tactics. It can be surmised that this would have had a negative impact on the people living in the area as well as the local economy
- Edward seized and repaired Stirling Castle, a vital stronghold in the defence of Scotland
- Edward holds a parliament at Carlisle and divides Scottish land out amongst his supporters
- Wallace is forced to resign as Guardian because he cannot work with the jealous nobles.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- It was not Wallace's decision to attack that was the mistake, but his tactics at the Battle of Falkirk that cost him his victory and his position as Guardian of Scotland
- Wallace understood the power of the English cavalry. His tactics of fortifying the positions of the schiltrons behind stakes and ropes meant that they were essentially impregnable as far as the English cavalry were concerned, but easy targets for the Welsh archers
- Despite the crushing defeat at Falkirk, there was no capitulation before Edward, as there had been after Dunbar.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- New Guardians were chosen, including Bruce and Comyn, and later Bishop Lamberton
- They planned to attack Roxburgh castle, still in English hands, but a pre-emptive strike by Edward forced them to retreat to their own lands and organise their defences. Unlike Wallace who had no lands to defend, these lords were concerned about more than just the independence of Scotland
- The Scots did have some success, Bruce, Comyn and Lamberton were able to capture Stirling Castle in late 1299 and succeeded in harassing Edward's armies with small forces operating out of Scotland's rugged terrain. In the Southwest, the Galloway hills and in the central borders, Selkirk Forrest offered ideal bases for hit and run activities
- However, they also had their share of misfortunes. The highly important castle of Caerlaverock was captured in 1300 by Edward; its fall meant that the Scots army had to flee across the moors to avoid destruction
- Distrust and arguments between Bruce and Comyn
- Bruce eventually resigned his Guardianship and instead settled for defending his lands in the south west
- By the end of 1300 the Scottish resistance was in balance. Edward had succeeded in defeating the Scots at Falkirk and thus had forced Wallace's resignation, but the Scots continued to fight tenaciously. However the arguments in the Scottish camp weakened their ability to present a united front against Edward
- Any other relevant points.

Question 4: How fully does **Source E** explain the reasons for the ultimate success of Bruce in maintaining Scotland's independence? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source E** explains the reasons for the ultimate success of Bruce in maintaining Scotland's independence in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Robert rewarded his followers from lands of his enemies and thus ensured their loyalties
- Robert raided northern England to try and force the English king to negotiate
- Robert negotiated an uneasy truce with England in 1323
- Robert negotiated a mutual defence treaty with France in 1326 as part of his policy to ensure a stable inheritance for his son.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Bannockburn represented a major victory for Robert, it was the start of his fearful reputation as a great warlord who couldn't be beaten
- Bannockburn had more of an impact on domestic politics in Scotland than any real long term military benefits. Robert passed legislation forbidding nobles holding land in both England and Scotland
- Robert took land from the disinherited at Cambuskenneth and shared it among his supporters to gain loyalty
- The war in the north of England was a significant and often overlooked aspect of the Scottish wars.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- As well as the 1315 invasion, Robert attacked England no fewer than 5 times (1316, 1318, 1322, 1323 and 1328)
- The campaign of 1322 was particularly impressive and culminated in the battle of Old Byland, which almost saw a repeat of Bannockburn and the capture of Edward II
- In 1320 the Declaration of Arbroath, a rebuttal to the papal decrees against Robert, was dispatched to Rome along with other letters. It is often seen as a key defence against English insistence that the papacy intervene on their behalf. By 1323 papal attitude to Scotland had significantly improved
- The campaign of 1328, following the murder of Edward II by Isabella and Mortimer is a final decisive move by Robert
- He re-opened his Irish campaign with a new army invading Ulster, at the same time his most trusted lieutenants raided northern England, skilfully running rings around Mortimer and the young newly crowned Edward III
- Robert's announcement that he intended to annex Northumbria eventually forced Isabella and Mortimer to sign the Treaty of Edinburgh 1328
- Edward Bruce invaded Ireland to take war to the English and create a pan-Celtic alliance. Overran Ulster quickly, but became bogged down
- Any relevant recall 1306 – 14
- Any other relevant points.

SPECIAL TOPIC 2: THE AGE OF REFORMATION, 1542-1603

Question 1: To what extent do **Sources A** and **B** agree about the changes brought in by the Treaty of Edinburgh in 1560? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Sources A** and **B** agree about the changes brought about by the Treaty of Edinburgh in terms of:

Overall both sources look at and agree about the changes brought about by the Treaty of Edinburgh of 1560 signed between England and France.

However, **Source A** says that while Scottish nobles and people had to fulfil and observe the terms set out in the treaty while **Source B** says that king and queen were obliged to fulfil their treaty obligations due to the Scots' obedience and loyalty.

Source A

- All warlike operations shall cease
- All military forces of each party shall withdraw from the realm of Scotland
- King Francis and Queen Mary shall abstain from using or carrying the said title or arms of the kingdom of England or Ireland
- Francis and Mary will fulfil all those things which were granted to the nobility and people of Scotland provided that the nobility and people of Scotland fulfil and observe what was contained in those conventions and articles.

Source B

- Truce arranged between England and France
- All foreign soldiers were to withdraw from Scotland
- Francis II and Mary, Queen of Scots, would abstain from displaying the English arms with those of Scotland
- Francis and Mary would fulfil all their treaty obligations since the Scots had spontaneously and freely professed and acknowledged their obedience and loyalty towards their king and queen.

Question 2: How useful is **Source C** in explaining Mary's difficulties in ruling Scotland?

(5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how useful **Source C** is in explaining Mary's difficulties in ruling Scotland, in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- **Origin** – The source was written by James Melville, a trusted member of Mary's household who witnessed the murder of David Riccio.
- **Possible Purpose** – To explain the reasons behind the murder of David Riccio and the difficulties Mary faced from the nobles within her court.
- **Content**
 - David Riccio as Mary's secretary was envied and hated by the nobility
 - Mary's husband, Darnley, agreed to the murder of Riccio which Scottish Lords had planned so that they could control the court and parliament
 - Mary was unable to save Riccio and kept as captive.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- As the Queen's husband, Darnley wanted the 'crown matrimonial'. Mary refused as she believed he was unfit to rule
- As Darnley became more resentful, ambitious Scottish nobles encouraged his anger and Darnley joined a plot to murder Riccio
- George Douglas took Darnley's knife to strike the first blow. He left the knife in Riccio's body to show that Darnley was involved in the murder
- During the struggle, Mary was seized and threatened. Her life was in danger and so was the life of her unborn child.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation:

- Many nobles including Mary's half-brother, the Earl of Moray hated Darnley and they viewed the marriage unfavourably. This led to the Chaseabout Raid in 1565 and although Mary demonstrated her authority over the nobles, she lost the support of many powerful men
- Mary had called a Parliament to punish the said nobles by confiscating their titles and property. They offered to help Darnley if he intervened to prevent this. The murder took place two days after the Parliament opened
- While some nobles hoped to benefit from her death; others planned to imprison her and make her child their ruler because they would gain from another minority
- Rivalry between noble families would be one of the main sources of trouble in Mary's reign
- Religion was the most serious problem of Mary's reign. A Catholic Queen ruling a Protestant country was viewed with suspicion by the Kirk
- Mary favoured French influences and often preferred to hide away with servants
- Queen Elizabeth viewed Mary, her cousin and heir, with suspicion. Mary feared that her cousin might assist Scottish Protestants to rise against her
- Mary a woman
- Any other relevant points.

Question 3: How far does **Source D** illustrate the efforts of James VI to control the Kirk? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source D** illustrates the efforts of James VI to control the Kirk in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- When local feuding between the Catholic Earl of Huntly and the Protestant Earl of Moray led to the latter's murder, the incident was used by the Kirk to gain concessions in the Golden Act
- Despite the Golden Act, James never conceded the principle of royal supremacy over the Kirk
- James made a number of successful efforts to tighten royal control over the general assembly and re-establish diocesan episcopacy
- James appears frustrated by the lack of respect he receives from his subjects and is determined to bring Scotland's remote localities under more direct royal control.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Relations with the Kirk deteriorated after 1592, leading to conflict in 1596
- James' belief in the divine right of monarchs clashed with Melvillians' view that the Monarch should be accountable to the authority of the Kirk
- In his writings, James asserted that no human institution could limit the powers of a monarch
- Extreme Presbyterians/Melvillians were marginalised on account of James' views
- Further detail of Trew Law and Basilikon Doron.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- The Second Book of Discipline (1578) had proposed a Presbyterian Kirk which could make the church independent of the King and his nobility
- By 1581 plans to establish 13 Presbyteries appeared to challenge royal authority
- In 1584, all ministers were required to accept the 'Black Acts' abolishing Presbyteries and asserting royal authority over the Kirk
- In 1592 the 'Golden Act' accepted the recovery of Presbyterian influence within the Kirk, but did not reduce the power of the King
- James sought to extend the power of the monarch and bishops over the Kirk by: having bishops recognised as moderators of Presbyteries; allowing them to hear cases of excommunication and deposition of ministers
- Elders were excluded from Presbyteries and the monarch had the power to determine time and place of the General Assembly
- James would have the General Assembly meeting in Perth or Aberdeen where he could expect more ministers would support the King
- As a result of rebellion in December 1596, James fled from Edinburgh, but this made him more determined to control the Kirk
- 1597 riot in Edinburgh after a sermon preached against the King. James VI had the ministers of Edinburgh briefly imprisoned. The King ordered that no minister was to be appointed without his consent
- in 1597, Andrew Melville was deposed as rector of St Andrews
- James attended every General Assembly from 1597 to 1603, by which time assemblies were becoming more agreeable to the King's aims
- James preferred form of Church government was by bishops and in 1600 he appointed three bishops to Parliament
- Any other relevant points.

Question 4: How fully does **Source E** explain the impact of the Reformation on Scotland? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source E** explains the effects of the Reformation on the lives of the people of Scotland in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- There was a new religious fervour demonstrated by support for Presbyterian beliefs
- Congregations had the right to choose their own minister
- The place of music in the lives of people generally and in the church services was to suffer
- There remained a compassionate attitude towards representatives of the Catholic faith.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Emphasis was placed upon attendance at daily and Sunday services. There were to be no distractions which might detain a congregation from their duties
- The *Second Book of Discipline* led indirectly to a regular meeting of ministers from 10 to 20 parishes for discussion of doctrine, which became the presbytery
- The Kirk removed all organs from places of worship
- It proved impractical to dispossess the Catholic clergy of their benefices so they were allowed to retain two-thirds of their revenues for life
- Concessions made to Catholic clergy, on the grounds of old age or ill-health.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- At the beginning of 1560, Scotland was a Catholic country with a Protestant minority. By 1603, it was a Protestant country with a small Catholic minority
- The Reformation did not lead to a significant transfer of wealth from the Church and much of the lands of the Catholic Church remained in the hands of the nobility
- The new church still had the problem of not having enough revenue for the parishes
- James VI was reluctant to enforce anti-Catholic laws
- Kirk sessions were instruments of moral and religious control
- The elaborate interiors of Catholic churches were replaced with plain, whitewashed parish kirks
- Observance of Catholic festivals and saints' days and festivals were discouraged
- Literary works and Kirk sermons were conducted in English rather than Latin. (The only Protestant Bibles available to lowland Scots were in English)
- Assistance given to the poor from the friaries ended. New plans to help the poor by the Presbyterian church faced difficulty
- The aim of a school in every parish not achieved but some advances were made in central Scotland
- Literacy rates improved during this period
- Many of the issues prevalent within the Catholic Church prior to the Reformation remained, such as: attendance; poverty of some parishes; and poor quality of preaching
- Scots merchants continued to trade with England and trading ports across the North Sea
- Scots focused on trade with the Protestant Dutch
- Trade with France continued despite the change in religion – although pro-French foreign policy was replaced with pro-English under James
- Any other relevant points.

SPECIAL TOPIC 3: THE TREATY OF UNION, 1689-1740

Question 1: To what extent do **Sources A** and **B** agree about worsening relations between Scotland and England between 1690 and 1705? **(5)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Sources A** and **B** agree about worsening relations between Scotland and England in terms of:

Overall **Source A** and **Source B** agree that Scotland's economy was affected by England; **Source A** attributes this to a combination of factors and **Source B** suggests that English actions were responsible.

Source A

- Scotland tipped over the edge of an economic abyss
- English wars leading to damaging loss of French trade
- Protective tariffs blocked the export of certain Scottish goods
- Outcome was incorporating union with England.

Source B

- Scots aware of sinking economic condition of their nation
- Visible damage both to trade and wealth of Scotland
- Problems owing to the disadvantage of tariffs
- One way for Scots to restore themselves was incorporating union and alliance with England.

Question 2: How useful is **Source C** as evidence of attitudes towards the union in Scotland?
(5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how useful **Source C** is as evidence of attitudes towards the union, in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- **Origin** – Petition sent by Stirling Town Council during debates.
- **Possible purpose** – To give reasons for opposing union with England.
- **Content** –
 - Treaty will bring insupportable taxation which will ruin manufacturing
 - Burghs will lose right to be represented in legislative power
 - Scotland will be suppressed as its parliament is extinguished with fatal consequences.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Royal burghs would be deprived of rights
- Fear of loss of European trade
- British parliament would favour English trade over Scottish.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Attitudes against union:
 - English currency, weights and measures to be introduced
 - Public opinion against union
 - Reduction in status of Scottish nobility in British parliament
 - Scots Episcopalians opposed union and Hanoverian succession – only Stuart dynasty might restore episcopacy to Scottish church
 - Protestants feared a British parliament dominated by Anglican Episcopalian church with bishops' seats in the House of Lords
 - Fear of 'Scotlandshire'
 - Scots' liberties at risk.
- Attitudes for union:
 - Advantages in commerce and trade
 - Economy would improve – national product would increase
 - Scotland's trade would catch up with other European nations'
 - Free trade with English colonies
 - Protection of being in Great Britain
 - Common interests already with England
 - Advantages of Scottish politicians being part of the court of the king in London
 - Hanoverian succession offered security to Protestantism
 - Threat from "Popery" reduced
 - Property preserved
 - Any other relevant points.

Question 3: How far does **Source D** explain the passage of the Treaty of Union through the Scottish Parliament? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source D** explains the passage of the Treaty of Union through the Scottish Parliament in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Opposition was divided and poorly led by unpredictable Hamilton
- Hamilton may have been bribed by the Court party
- Hamilton refused to participate in planned walkout of parliament
- Failure of armed rising proved that opponents of union were not willing to engage in violence.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Hamilton divided opponents of union and obstructed arguments against union
- Bribery of Scottish ministers/politicians
- Disagreement amongst opponents of union unable to act together
- Political management was vital to make the outcome certain
- Court party fundamental to final victory.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- The Equivalent: £398,085.10s to cover the taking on of English debt
- Expectation of the Equivalent influenced support for treaty in parliament
- Those who lost out to Darien failure were beneficiaries
- Payment made to wool industry as well as payment of Scottish public debt
- Unspecified payments made to Scottish Commissioners for Union
- £20,000 paid to various Scottish politicians through Earl of Glasgow
- Court members voted consistently through all Articles of the Treaty
- Promise of favours, pensions, military patronage, high-ranking positions and cash ensured government majorities
- Threats of loss of civil list pension
- Squadrone Volante's hold on balance of power key to Court party's success
- Some Squadrone members believed they would share the Equivalent
- Assurances that new parliament would support Scots economy over taxation
- Scottish parliament given incentive of free trade with England and its colonies
- Last minute concessions from English on issues such as salt, wool and liquor
- Seats in House of Lords for 16 Scottish peers
- Other Scots peers to retain privileges – Treaty appealed to self-interest
- Act of Security for the Kirk would allow Church of Scotland to continue
- Rights of burghs and Royal Burghs to remain
- Inherited offices for Lords to continue
- Scots laws and Scottish courts to remain
- Security of liberty and stability under one parliament
- English forces moving north and fear of invasion if no treaty was agreed
- Peace secured by being part of Great Britain
- Role of Daniel Defoe in informing the English government during Treaty's passage through the Scottish Parliament
- Any other relevant points.

Question 4: How fully does **Source E** explain the effects of Union up to 1740? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source E** explains the effects of Union up to 1740 in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Scotland not extinguished, it retained identity, attitudes, ideas; traditions were not eradicated
- Treaty did exert strong Anglicising influence
- Guarantees to Scottish legal system and Church had influence on Scotland
- Continuation of Scottish systems of education and local government were significant achievement of Union.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Scottish tradition still evident in culture, music, art, literature, law, religion, education; Scottish Enlightenment, Scott, Smith, Hume, Burns
- Influence of English agricultural techniques and innovations.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Political effects: 1711 – parliament banned Scottish peers with English titles
- Highland clans divided between Hanoverian and Jacobite loyalties
- 1713 – motion to repeal Act of Union defeated by 4 votes
- Whig election victory in 1715 led to government delaying Malt Tax
- 1725 – Secretary of State for Scotland replaced by Home Secretary
- Economic effects: Scottish industry could not compete with English competition; only small number of Scots engaged successfully with colonies
- Taxes led to increases in smuggling and loss of revenue for government
- Paper industry failed; Scottish linen industry suffered
- Merchant shipping benefited, particularly trade with Baltic and Caribbean
- Tobacco industry developed in Glasgow
- Agriculture improved; increased investment; 1727 – Royal Bank of Scotland
- 1730s – favourable economic climate; industries such as linen recovered
- Jacobite reaction: Jacobites led national sentiment in literature and songs
- 1708 – abortive French-sponsored invasion by the Old Pretender
- Jacobite rising of 1715; Earl of Mar played leading role; Battle of Sheriffmuir in November 1715 claimed as victory by both government and Jacobites
- 1716 Disarming Act banned holding of weapons by Highlanders
- 1719 – failed attempt at rising in north-west Scotland by Earl Marischal
- Other effects: claims of the unpopularity of union made vocally by opponents
- 1712 – House of Lords became court of appeal for Scottish cases
- 1724 – outbreak of fence-smashing by levellers; 1725 – Shawfield riots in response to Malt Tax; 1736 – Porteous riots in Edinburgh
- Military road-building; establishment of forts in Highlands
- 1710 – Tories in parliament failed to remove Church of Scotland's privileges;
- 1711 – Greenshields case; 1712 – Toleration Act and Patronage Act
- 1722 Marrow affair in Church of Scotland; 1733 secession from state church
- Initial dissatisfaction with the Equivalent being paid
- Scots joined East India Company in large numbers
- Increased Baltic trade
- Any other relevant points.

SPECIAL TOPIC 4: MIGRATION AND EMPIRE, 1830–1939

Question 1: To what extent do **Sources A** and **B** agree about the reasons for Scottish migration to Canada? **(5)**

Overall: The sources agree about the push factor of poverty and the pull factor of prosperity. Although almost a hundred years apart both sources remark on the poverty of life in rural Scotland with high unemployment and the difficulty of providing for families. In contrast both sources comment on the opportunities to be had in Canada, particularly the availability of employment and land for farming.

Source A

- Occupying a farm that does not pay him in Scotland
- Quite unable to support his family in Scotland
- So much land lies in Canada to occupy
- A farmer continuing to remain in Scotland even when unemployed.

Source B

- The pay is good as experienced men can at the very start earn £5 to £6 a month in Canada
- The inability of the crofts to satisfy the hunger of the families in Scotland
- The men also have the prospect of becoming tenant farmers and later on owners of their own farms in Canada
- Lack of employment generally in Scotland.

Question 2: How useful is **Source C** as evidence of the assimilation of immigrants into Scottish society? (5)

The candidate makes a judgment on how useful **Source C** is as evidence of the assimilation of the immigrants into Scottish society in terms of:

Points from source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- **Origin** – memories of an immigrant child and his assimilation into Scottish society in the 1920s and 30s.
- **Possible purpose** – to record the experiences of his family arriving in Glasgow in the 1920s and how they became established in their new home.
- **Content** –
 - I found myself surrounded by classmates chanting at me because I was a foreigner
 - Our family moved house a few times in an effort to improve our lot
 - In no time at all I was a complete Glaswegian.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Assimilation of Italians helped by popularity of ice cream parlours and fish and chip shops
- Young Italians soon adopted local speech patterns due to frequency of contact in catering trade
- Some tension between Catholic Italians and Presbyterian Scots. Italian cafés criticised by Scottish Presbyterian church leaders for opening on the Sabbath
- Italian café owners also met with criticism from local people who claimed the cafés were sometimes the scenes of unruly behaviour. Glasgow Herald article claimed ice cream parlours were morally corrupt and reported the ‘ice cream hell’
- There was a greater degree of acceptance of Italian cafés from the Temperance Movement as the cafés chose not to sell alcohol.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

Catholic Irish:

- Often resented as competition for jobs
- Blamed for spread of diseases and poverty
- Catholic Irish workers were also accused of being strike-breakers and being willing to work for less money than Scottish workers
- Often blamed for being ‘benefit scroungers’ claiming poor relief after 3 years residence
- The Education (Scotland) Act 1918 allowed Catholic schools into the state system funded through education rates. It also gave the schools the right to give Catholic religious instruction and select their own teachers
- The Catholic Irish had a shared experience with the Scottish worker in that they were affected by industrialisation, urbanisation, as well as fighting together during the First World War
- Even into the 1930s Catholic Irish faced persecution, sometimes organised by Church of Scotland.

Protestant Irish:

- Irish Protestants had a lot in common with the average Scot – long term and deeply embedded cultural interaction between Ulster and lowland Scotland
- Much easier assimilation because of religion
- The first Scottish Orange Lodge opened in 1800 in the weaving centre of Maybole in Ayrshire. The growth of the lodge system in Scotland shows the spread of Irish Protestantism.

Jews:

- Prejudice and discrimination affected the Jews in Scotland – The Daily Record – Aug 1905 'Alien Danger: Immigrants infected with loathsome disease'
- Anti-Semitism never that widespread, possibly owing to low numbers of Jewish immigrants in relation to other groups
- Very few Jews received any help from local poor relief. It was members of the Jewish community that helped each other eg The Glasgow Jewish Board of Guardians and the Hebrew Ladies Benevolent Society in 1901 were dealing with 500 cases of needy Jews.

Lithuanians:

- Between 1860s and 1914 about 7000 Lithuanians decided to settle in Scotland
- Scots complained about the Lithuanians being dirty and immoral but soon most were accepted
- Settlements in mining areas of central Scotland such as Coatbridge
- At first Lithuanians used as strike breakers but soon Lithuanians joined with the local workers and joined the strikes
- Many Lithuanians integrated by changing surnames to Scottish names
- During Great War Lithuanians between eighteen and forty-one faced the choice of conscription into the British Army or deportation for military service in Russia. Of the 1,800 Lithuanians who were called up, 700 joined the British Army and 1,100 chose to be deported to Russia
- Any other relevant points.

Question 3: How far does **Source D** show the contribution of Scots to the economic growth and development of the Empire? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source D** shows the contribution of Scots to the growth and development of the Empire in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- The most obvious field of Scottish achievement in Australia was farming/sheep grazing and the wool trade
- Scots also invested heavily in mining/the Gold Rush of the 1850s brought to Australia a considerable number of Scottish miners
- Shipping and trade were other areas of enterprise in which Scots excelled; example of McIlwrath McEachan and Burns Phillips
- Scots played large part in creating the sugar boom of the 1880s in Northern Queensland.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

Examples of Scots contributing to economic growth and development in Australia:

- Many Scots sheep and cattle farmers squatted on land until allowed to buy squatters licenses
- After gold discovered in Victoria and New South Wales, many gold camps were recognisably “Scottish”
- Role of Church of Scotland in developing education in Australia, eg Australia College, Scots College in Melbourne, and influence of development of Melbourne and Sydney universities.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

Examples of Scots contributing to Canada:

- Scots gave a thorough and honest character to Canadian business and financial life
- George Stephen organising finance and creation of Canadian Pacific Railroad
- Scots’ control of the fur trade
- Religious development through Church of Scotland
- Contribution to laws and learning/education (eg McGill University).

Examples of Scots contributing to New Zealand:

- Scots founded banks and financial institutions as well as having a political impact
- Scottish influence on NZ education.

Examples of Scots contributing to India:

- Scots’ impact on education, the development of the banking system.
- Many Indian institutions such as elite schools, universities and press owed much to Scottish emigrants
- Scots’ contribution to development of tea plantations and the jute industry
- Any other relevant factors.

Question 4: How fully does **Source E** explain the effects of migration and Empire on Scottish society? (10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source E** explains the effects of migration and Empire on Scottish society, in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- The movement of the Irish changed the population balance of several lowland towns
- A huge reservoir of Irish labour which ... was ready and willing to move anywhere and do anything to find work
- Huge construction schemes of nineteenth century relied on this vast labour
- The Irish presence vital to an understanding of Scottish culture as Catholic Irish have played such an influential role in the evolution and shaping of Scottish society ranging from literature to music and on to football.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Details of economic contribution of Irish immigrants to Scottish industrial development
- Development of Celtic, Edinburgh Hibernian, Dundee United, etc
- The Education (Scotland) Act 1918 allowed Catholic schools into the state system funded through education rates. It also gave the schools the right to give Catholic religious instruction and select their own teachers. Resentment in Scotland for 'Rome on the Rates'
- Sectarian divisions, Orange v Green.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- One in four immigrants from Ireland were Protestant and brought their own distinct culture which had an impact in Scotland, especially through the Orange Lodge
- Large numbers of poorer Jews arrived between 1880 and 1914 – by 1919 over 9000 lived in Glasgow alone. Most lived in the Gorbals and maintained separate identity – eg spoke Yiddish, the Jewish language
- Jewish immigrants tended to work in particular jobs such as peddling and hawking (selling door to door)
- Sweated labour was associated with immigrants and Jews in particular: tailoring and cigarette making
- Impact of Lithuanians to the economy through the coal-mining industry around Coatbridge
- In 1861 there were about 120 Italians in Scotland, by 1901 the Italian population was 4051
- Italians were usually found in catering trades, especially ice cream and fish and chips
- Italian businesses met with success – number of Italian cafés/takeaways in Glasgow increased: 1903 – 89, 1905 – 337, broadening the average Scots social experience
- In addition to catering, Italians became established as hairdressers – they established the College of Italian Hairdressers in Glasgow in 1928 adding another distinct contribution to Scotland
- Role of Empire in making Scots rich
- Role of Empire as a market for Scottish goods and emigrants
- Empire helped the export orientated Scottish economy to develop, at least up until 1914, especially in production of shipping, locomotives, etc
- Empire as a source of competition to Scottish economy: farm produce from Australia, Jute mill development in India, etc
- Any other relevant points.

SPECIAL TOPIC 5: THE IMPACT OF THE GREAT WAR, 1914 — 1928

Question 1: To what extent do **Sources A** and **B** agree about the experience of Scots on the Western Front? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement as to how far **Sources A** and **B** agree about the experience of Scots on the Western Front in terms of:

Overall: **Source A** and **Source B** offer some similar and some contrasting opinions on the experience of Scots on the Western Front with regard to the taking of Hill 70. **Source A** reflects the tenacity and dogged determination required by the Scots during a long and difficult attack whilst **Source B** skirts over difficulties and gives the impression of an easier, successful attack. Both agree that the pipes played during the attack and that no reinforcements arrived.

Source A

- We made for the top of Hill 70 through murderous rifle and machine gun fire
- We made for the top to the sound of the pipes and led by our brave old colonel
- We were desperate for reinforcements but no help could we see
- Shows determination of Scots; "A Cameron never can yield". This time we meant to do or die.

Source B

- For a time there was a kind of Bank Holiday crowd on Hill 70 as the German machine gunners ... initially dared not fire
- Shriller than the scream of shells was the skirl of pipes going with them
- We must hold on until the reinforcements arrive. None came
- Shows determination, 'to go all out and press onto Hill 70.'

Question 2: How useful is **Source C** as evidence of the impact of the war on Scottish women? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how useful **Source C** is as evidence of the impact of the war on Scottish women in terms of:

Points from source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- **Origin** – Glasgow Herald, daily Scottish newspaper. Contemporary source.
- **Possible purpose** – To report on the opposition in Glasgow to increased rents and the eviction of tenants.
- **Content** –
 - Reports on the first attempt to enforce eviction of a woman in Merryland Street, Glasgow who had not been paying her rent
 - Role of Mrs Barbour of the GWhA addressing demonstration of strikers
 - Details methods used by demonstrators, mainly women.

Points from recall that support and develop those in the source:

- Rent Strikes took place following large increases in rents and increased cost of living. Women at home with men away particularly vulnerable
- Rent Strikes began in May 1915; 25,000 tenants joined the movement by the end of the year
- Rent Strikes saw a prominent role played by women – formation of tenants' strike committees, Glasgow Women's Housing Association and many local "Women's Housing Associations"
- Roles of Mary Barbour, Helen Crawford, Agnes Dollan and Jessie Stephens
- Agitation, Rent Strikes and role of women in other areas such as Aberdeen and Dundee.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Migration of thousands of workers into munitions districts had led to acute housing shortages
- War led to women being more involved in local politics and changing male attitudes
- The war led to dilution of labour and the employment of more women for example at Gretna in the huge munitions works
- Anti-war groups formed like the No Conscription League: leading role of women in these groups
- Role of women as workers on the land, etc
- Any other relevant points.

Question 3: How far does **Source D** illustrate the economic difficulties faced by Scotland after 1918? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source D** illustrates the economic difficulties faced by Scotland after 1918 in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significance views:

- Many of the changes brought by the war were temporary
- The war shifted the balance of international trade against Scottish shipbuilders
- War shifted the balance against textile manufacturers
- The war demonstrated the fragility of the Scottish heavy industry base.

Points from recall which support those in the source:

- War affected Britain's ability to trade. Loss of markets had a long term effect on industry
- Concentration on a narrow group of heavy industries meant Scotland was affected badly when the post-war boom turned into a slump. Exemplification, such as decline in shipbuilding
- Dundee jute companies saw price collapse with removal of trade restrictions on India
- The textile industry in Scotland had a varied experience – wool price rose but falling exports of cotton and woollen goods.

Points from Recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

Initial effects of the war such as:

- War delayed long-standing structural problems for the Scottish economy and its reliance on a narrow range of heavy industries that were reliant on exports
- Initial post-war boom in some industries like ship-building – warship yards built passenger liners and merchant ships to replace those lost
- Mines were nationalised and the miners made good wages. After the war the mines returned to their original owners. Lack of investment and fierce foreign competition resulted in decline
- The Admiralty cancelled the cost-plus system and went back to competitive tendering for orders: The demand for ships, and therefore steel, declined
- Yards suffered because of labour disputes and a shortage of material
- Wages were cut in autumn of 1921, men were laid off and Yarrow's closed. Industrial unrest and late delivery of ships damaged the Clyde's reputation
- Other countries increased their steel-making as well as their ship-building capacity. Falling demand for ships affected steel
- Jute prices collapsed after the war. Trade restrictions removed. Competition from abroad. Resulting in unemployment, social misery and discontent
- In Dundee, several firms went into liquidation others amalgamated, to form Jute Industries Ltd
- The collapse of foreign markets for herring from Germany, Poland, Czechoslovakia, Bulgaria, Russia and the Baltic greatly affected the industry. European countries started to compete
- Cheap foreign imports of food like refrigerated meat from Argentina and frozen lamb and tinned fruit from Australia and New Zealand competed with indigenous agriculture when trade was resumed after the war
- Any other relevant points.

Question 4: How fully does **Source E** describe the impact of the war on political developments in Scotland? (10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source E** describes the impact of the war on political developments in Scotland in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significance views:

- The war years showed that support for Scottish home rule continued
- Arthur Henderson and the Labour leadership in London were forced to concede a separate Scottish Council of Labour
- The war undermined the organisation of Scottish Liberalism, but also much of its moral authority
- The ILP was able to emerge as the natural successor to liberal radicalism.

Points from recall which support those in the source:

- Home rule still prominent. September 1918 the Scottish Home Rule Association formed
- The Labour Party manifesto of 1918 included a commitment to home rule for Scotland
- The ILP MPs from Clydeside elected November 1922 were committed to home rule
- Initial instances of radicalism after war: 1919 – George Square
- In the 1922 election Labour made the breakthrough as the second political party
- ILP members' activities – involved in resisting the Munitions Act of 1915; in opposing the introduction of the dilution of labour; anti-conscription...
- ILP in Scotland had many women prominent in the party such as Mary Barbour, Agnes Dollan and Helen Crawford.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- It was difficult for Home Rule to make progress in Westminster parliament
- Private members' Home Rule bills failed
- Support for Home Rule waned within the Labour Party
- Glasgow University Scottish National Association formed 1926
- 1927 Jon McCormack and Roland Muirhead, formed the National Party of Scotland. It distanced itself from the Labour Party. Drew support from intellectuals like Hugh MacDiarmid
- Some Liberals and Conservatives formed the Scottish Party at the end of the 1920s and proposed some form of devolution in an effort to attract Liberal and Unionist supporters
- The Labour Party emerged as an important political force with seven seats in Scotland, winning as many votes as the Conservatives. Continued success in the 1922 election
- The role of Manny Shinwell, Willie Gallacher, John MacLean
- In Scotland the ILP was to the fore, campaigning on major issues. Membership increased
- Clydeside ILP MPs confronted Conservatives and Liberals, even leadership of PLP. MPs on issues of poverty and unemployment
- The Conservative Party was strengthened as they worked hard to gain middle class support, helped by Presbyterian churches. Scottish legal system also had strong links with the Conservatives
- Events in Ireland – growing fears in Scotland of extremism
- Any other relevant points.

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]