



**2014 Classical Studies**

**Advanced Higher**

**Finalised Marking Instructions**

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2014

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from SQA's NQ Assessment team.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's NQ Assessment team may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

## **Part One: General Marking Principles for: Classical Studies Advanced Higher**

This information is provided to help you understand the general principles you must apply when marking candidate responses to questions in this Paper. These principles must be read in conjunction with the specific Marking Instructions for each question.

- (a)** Marks for each candidate response must always be assigned in line with these general marking principles and the specific Marking Instructions for the relevant question. If a specific candidate response does not seem to be covered by either the principles or detailed Marking Instructions, and you are uncertain how to assess it, you must seek guidance from your Team Leader/Principal Assessor.
- (b)** Marking should always be positive ie, marks should be awarded for what is correct and not deducted for errors or omissions.

### **GENERAL MARKING ADVICE: Classical Studies Advanced Higher**

*The marking schemes are written to assist in determining the “minimal acceptable answer” rather than listing every possible correct and incorrect answer. The following notes are offered to support Markers in making judgements on candidates’ evidence, and apply to marking both end of unit assessments and course assessments.*

- 1.** The general principle underpinning the marking of all sections in both parts is that credit is to be given for well-thought out answers, supported by examples from the prescribed texts, with direct quotes, if possible.

**NB.** Credit will be given in both parts of the paper to candidates who put forward relevant points not listed in the marking instructions

**Part Two: Marking Instructions for each Question**

**Section A - History and Historiography**

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
1	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Religious and moralising purpose to many stories in Herodotus</li> <li>• Story of Tellus here told to show that worldly wealth is not the measure of happiness</li> <li>• Tellus dies at the height of his success on the battlefield, leaving children alive and well</li> <li>• Story of Cleobis and Biton told for the same reason: gods grant them death as the greatest happiness</li> <li>• Other stories such as that of Pytheas in Book 7 show that wealth can bring calamity</li> </ul> <p><b>Maximum of 7 if evidence only produced from source</b></p>	10	
2	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Athens fools Sparta re rebuilding her walls</li> <li>• Pausanias' arrogance makes allies want Athens for leader</li> <li>• Naxos and Thasos revolt against Athens and appeal to Sparta</li> <li>• Athens assists Megara against Corinth; Corinth is allied with Sparta. Megara is strategically very important</li> <li>• Athens takes Sicyon, important for control of the Isthmus of Corinth</li> <li>• Suspicious Sparta rejects Athenian offers of help when Helots revolt</li> </ul>	10	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
3	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Livy's History stresses the ethics and morals of his main characters</li> <li>• Among other qualities, characters must show foresight and reason: the opposite sort of character shows rashness and instability</li> <li>• Sempronius Longus shows rashness, violence and headstrong ambition, compared with the careful Scipio, who is weakened by illness</li> <li>• Livy here emphasises moral causes of defeat, using the techniques of the orator. Sempronius must be made to seem very persuasive, if wrong</li> <li>• Compare the description of Flaminius, before the Battle of Lake Trasimene, or other</li> </ul> <p><b>5 + 5 Both parts of the question must be answered to achieve full marks.</b></p>	10	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
4	a	<p><b>EITHER</b></p> <p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <p><b>Herodotus</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Story of Tellus included as a reflection of Ionian philosophical debate on nature of happiness. Not truly 'objective' history</li> <li>• Care for evidence and travel to sites were important features of Herodotus' objective writing</li> <li>• He says he is not bound to believe what people tell him</li> <li>• He centres on Graeco-Persian relations during the reign of historical figures about whom he could glean secure knowledge - Croesus and Cyrus</li> <li>• On the other hand he includes cosmic themes of human destiny, divine retribution for human arrogance, and stories of barbarous Persians versus civilised Greeks</li> </ul> <p><b>Polybius</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In the passage, Polybius careful to describe the two consuls' reasoning in analytical terms of advantage and disadvantage, caution and ambition</li> <li>• He does not use techniques of oratory, eg scene-setting with characters addressing crowds - 'the gossip of the barber's shop'</li> <li>• He is objective in that he tries to sort out causes, pretexts and beginnings; (examples)</li> <li>• He tries to be useful as an educator of statesmen eg the analysis of treaties leading to the Second Punic War</li> <li>• His concern for evidence: he crossed the Alps, checked the tablet at Licinium for the size of Hannibal's forces</li> </ul>	20	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
4	a	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <p><b>Livy</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Livy expands on Polybius' account of Sempronius' actions to emphasise the moral causes of the Roman defeat at Trebia: Sempronius' rashness and ambition. Thus he uses dramatic techniques to enhance the narrative</li> <li>• Livy is biased in favour of interpreting Rome's history as a decline from noble deeds of the past; (examples. See his 'Preface')</li> <li>• In plotting Hannibal's route over the Alps, Livy is not careful about personally checking sites and routes</li> <li>• To be fair to Livy's objectivity, he quotes more likely constructions of events as well as supernatural happenings (eg Romulus either apotheosised or was murdered by senators in Book 1)</li> <li>• Livy believes in the predestined expulsion of the king and the introduction of libertas. This can be seen in stories of the inevitable rise and fall of the arrogant Tarquins</li> </ul>		



## Section B - Individual and Community

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
5	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is certainly possible to argue that Plato's state in the rigidity of its structure prevents the possibility of social mobility</li> <li>• As such it surely guarantees its ossification and destruction</li> <li>• Plato argues that the state must possess the four cardinal virtues of wisdom, courage, discipline and justice</li> <li>• He believes the state will have wisdom because of the knowledge of the rulers</li> <li>• Courage will come from the Auxiliaries</li> <li>• Self-discipline because of the harmony between all three classes</li> <li>• Justice, he suggests, is the result of 'one man, one job' and minding one's own business</li> <li>• So people do the job for which each is naturally fitted</li> <li>• To break this structure would, in Plato's view, be ruinous for the state</li> </ul>	10	
6	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Aristotle attacks Plato's proposal for a number of connected reasons</li> <li>• He objects to the purpose of the proposal which is to help make the state as much of a 'unity' as possible</li> <li>• Aristotle ignores the fact that, in the Republic, the sharing of wives is not universal but applies only to the Guardians</li> <li>• Plato's proposal is based on issues which Aristotle ignores: eg eugenics and the removal of temptation and rivalry</li> <li>• Aristotle seems to deliberately misunderstand Plato's motivation here</li> </ul>	10	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
7	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In this section of his book Cicero is dealing with the obligations a young man has to fulfil to win himself a reputation</li> <li>• Cicero believes a reputation is essential for anyone interested in political advancement</li> <li>• The best reputations are those achieved through kind and generous acts</li> <li>• His choice of Milo is surprising if we consider Milo as a gang-leader</li> <li>• But Cicero chose to defend him largely due to his hatred of Clodius</li> <li>• His hatred comes from Clodius' role, as a tribune, in Cicero's exile for illegally executing citizens during the conspiracy of Catiline</li> <li>• Cicero is grossly overrating his influence and power if he believed at a time when the Triumvirate was all-powerful that the 'whole destiny of his country' depended on his return</li> <li>• Cicero often seems vain and pompous - examples abound</li> </ul>	10	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
8	a	<p><b>EITHER</b></p> <p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Aristotle implies that Plato is advocating an extreme unity</li> <li>• He misrepresents the kind of unity Plato supports</li> <li>• Plato does not advocate a literal unity</li> <li>• He advocates rather a unity of opinion and of moral standards</li> <li>• He also advocates the agreement by all members of the state that certain political practices, social institutions and aesthetic standards are good, while others are bad</li> <li>• He provides for as much diversity of function between ruler and ruled as Aristotle does</li> <li>• But Aristotle, if slightly confused about Platonic unity, deserves credit for being unambiguous in his advocacy of plurality</li> <li>• Aristotle brings some sensible and powerful objections to his critique of unity</li> <li>• Plato's utopianism is balanced by Aristotle's sober scepticism</li> <li>• Different viewpoints should be allowed in this question depending on the supporting evidence</li> </ul>	20	
	b	<p><b>OR</b></p> <p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is undeniable that Cicero is vain, pompous and overstates his ability to influence events</li> <li>• This failing was to lead to his death at the orders of Mark Antony</li> </ul>	20	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
8	b	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• He was also too conservative to make realistic judgements on the case for agrarian reform</li> <li>• There had been a need for land reform for a long time</li> <li>• The Gracchi brothers were murdered for their support for land reform</li> <li>• How can Cicero advocate justice in his state and yet support the level of inequality that existed between the rich optimates and everyone else</li> <li>• But, although not a strong man, he defended Roscius at the risk of incurring Sulla's wrath. He confronted the Metelli to prosecute Verres, he arguably did save the Republic during the Catilinarian Conspiracy</li> </ul>	<p><b>(50)</b> <b>(scaled to 100)</b></p>	

## Section C - Heroes and Heroism

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
9	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Because of the plague sent by Apollo, the Greeks are dying in their hundreds</li> <li>• The plague is the result of the prayers of Chryses, the priest of Apollo, asking for the Greeks to be punished for Agamemnon's refusal to ransom or return his captive daughter</li> <li>• When Agamemnon, under pressure, reluctantly agrees to return the daughter, he compounds his first mistake by demanding, if he hands back Chryses to her father, that as compensation Achilles hands over Briseis</li> <li>• He loves her as much as a Homeric hero can love, but he feels his dignity has been insulted, so he refuses to fight</li> <li>• His mother Thetis goes and begs Zeus to intervene</li> <li>• Hera finds out about their meeting and is enraged</li> <li>• She calls Zeus an 'arch-deceiver'</li> <li>• She accuses Zeus of supporting Achilles and letting the Greeks be slaughtered</li> </ul>	10	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
10	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Homer strikes a balance between the peaceful atmosphere of the land of the Phaeacians and more violent scenes</li> <li>• Athene shown as intervening to help Odysseus</li> <li>• He needs to find a way of getting Odysseus back to Ithaca. He creates a really well-rounded character in Nausicaa</li> <li>• She is beautiful, lazy (until reminded) brave (she does not shy away from confronting Odysseus)</li> <li>• She identifies Odysseus as the sort of man she might want to marry, but is wise enough to see the dangers of being seen going into the city with a stranger</li> <li>• Romantic interlude, safe?</li> <li>• She has a good relationship with her mother and father</li> <li>• All in all, it is a touching characterisation of a young woman in her early teens</li> </ul>	10	
11	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Briseis is bitter at the way Achilles handed her over to Agamemnon without a struggle</li> <li>• She describes herself as 'stolen'</li> <li>• She believes she has the right to make a brief complaint</li> <li>• 'no farewell kiss'</li> <li>• Ignores the fact that Achilles had no choice but to obey Agamemnon</li> <li>• Achilles has done his best to get her back by his refusal to fight</li> <li>• She has no husband, no brothers (all killed). Achilles is, she claims, the nearest thing she has to family</li> <li>• She wants to take up in his arms again, ignoring the fact that the longer he stays away from the battlefield, the more Greeks will be killed, the more concessions Agamemnon will make to get him back</li> <li>• She claims to be ill with missing him</li> </ul>	10	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
12	a	<p><b>EITHER</b></p> <p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The gods are a common feature in all the epic poetry we have</li> <li>• They display human failing - vanity, lust, discord</li> <li>• For example the quarrel between Zeus and Hera in Iliad 1 ends when Zeus threatens to attack and beat up Hera if she does not stop accusing</li> <li>• At the same time he also seems wary of her - he is keen that Thetis makes herself scarce when he sees his wife coming</li> <li>• Apollo turns the tide of battle towards the Trojans when he hears the prayers of Chryses</li> <li>• In passage 4, the intervention of Athena on Achilles' side seals Hector's fate</li> <li>• Hector feels let down by Zeus and Apollo but accepts his fate</li> <li>• In passage 2, it is Athena again who comes to the rescue of Odysseus by persuading Nausicaa that she should wash the family's clothes in preparation for her own marriage</li> <li>• In passage 5, Venus is plotting with and against Juno. In this extract she is briefing Cupid on how he must pretend to be Ascanius and enchant Dido and make her fall in love with Aeneas</li> </ul>	20	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
b	<p><b>OR</b></p> <p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Passage 4 shows us the Greeks (and Trojans) acceptance of Moira (Fate) which is unavoidable which, therefore, means it must necessarily be accepted</li> <li>• Hector accepts his doom</li> <li>• However within the boundaries set by fate an individual has freedom of action</li> <li>• So Hector says ‘Let me at least sell my life dearly and have a not inglorious end’</li> <li>• He could have submitted to Achilles without a fight but that would have been seen in the classical world as cowardly</li> <li>• Virgil has created Aeneas to reflect the virtues of Augustus</li> <li>• Augustus rose from being a brutal warlord to the ‘father of the country’ accolade</li> <li>• But in this passage we see a more Homeric Aeneas</li> <li>• He is unforgiving over the killing of Pallas whom Turnus did not spare</li> <li>• So he kills Turnus - maybe he is a sort of mixture of Mark Anthony and Caesarion, Caesar’s son by Cleopatra - who both had to die to ensure the stability and peace exemplified in the pax Romana</li> <li>• Both examples would have been recognised by a classical audience as necessarily regrettable - vengeance was accepted as normal</li> </ul>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>20</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>(50)</b> <b>(Scaled to 100)</b></p>	

## Section D - Comedy, Satire and Society

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
13	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• When Chremes says, “When bad decrees were made men were in charge.” Aristophanes does not want us to believe things will be better under women’s rule - the play must be a fantasy, because of the very controlled relationship of the sexes at the time</li> <li>• The Citizen’s remark: “Athenians are better at grabbing than giving.” He keeps his goods back till others display theirs, but still takes his share of common goods</li> <li>• If partners shared, then children won’t recognise parents</li> <li>• If genuine sharing of partners, then unattractive people must have first pick</li> <li>• Exaggerated aims of the women’s programme of reform - they claim to put a stop to mugging, poverty and informing</li> <li>• Happy ending</li> </ul>	10	
14	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Paphlagonian and Sausage-seller are competing for the people’s favour</li> <li>• Cleon (Paphlagonian) is attacked as a block to peace</li> <li>• For sheer bribery of Thepeople, the sausage-seller can beat the Paphlagonian (he is an extreme version of a politician like Cleon);</li> <li>• Paphlagonian’s encouragement of informers is satirised</li> <li>• Sausage-seller says Paphlagonian reaped harvest of someone else’s labours in Pylos</li> <li>• Sausage-seller says Thepeople lost the good life in the country for a bribe of three obols a day</li> <li>• Sausage-seller steals the hare the Paphlagonian cooked - analogy with Cleon’s thefts suggested</li> </ul>	10	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
15	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ability - family</li> <li>• What use are family trees if you are a gambler, vicious, empty and effeminate</li> <li>• A worthless aristocrat is like a limbless Herm; explanation</li> <li>• What is blue blood worth if you are like Lateranus, a middle-aged all-night drinker - who should be leading armies, but is still 'sowing wild oats'</li> <li>• Supreme irony of 'rot spreading from the top'. "Now emperors are harpists (Nero) and Nero was worse than Orestes. (explanation)</li> <li>• Catiline and Cethegus (aristocrats), versus Cicero (commoner)</li> <li>• One could be a great warrior, but son of the worthless Thersites</li> <li>• Father</li> </ul>	10	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
16	a	<p><b>EITHER</b></p> <p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <p><b>Humour in ‘The Assemblywomen’</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Women dressing up like men, and Blepyrus in his wife’s clothes</li> <li>• Conventional jokes about women’s love of alcohol</li> <li>• Jokes about equal sharing of partners, children and goods</li> <li>• The Citizen jokes about Athenian greed... even the gods are shown with outstretched hands</li> <li>• Hilarious scene of rivalry between old hag and pretty girl for favours of young man</li> <li>• Dramatic humour</li> <li>• Could say what he liked</li> </ul> <p><b>Humour in Juvenal 10</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bitter humour uppermost in descriptions of dangers of wealth</li> <li>• Futility of reaching high office when ruin and execution await; cf Sejanus: humour of the epigrams; eg his statues turned into chamber-pots</li> <li>• Epigrams generally: eg crowd only cares about ‘bread and circuses’ OR ‘few tyrants die in their beds’ OR ‘the strength of a weak fig-tree will crack a famous man’s statue.’</li> <li>• Contrast paltry remains of Alexander or Hannibal with their grand ambitions of conquest of the world</li> <li>• Caricature of Hannibal: ‘one-eyed brass-hat on his monstrous beast’</li> <li>• This Satire involves humour at the expense of those who take themselves too seriously</li> <li>• Through himself</li> <li>• Juvenal had to watch what he said</li> </ul>	20	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
16	b	<p><b>OR</b></p> <p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <p><b>Aristophanes</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Honourable generals, Nikias and Demosthenes, are beaten up by the Paphlagonian (Cleon): explain Pylos</li> <li>• The over-ambitious Paphlagonian is himself beaten up by the Sausage-seller. But all the politicians are slaves of Thepeople, and so all obsessed with pleasing Thepeople</li> <li>• According to Aristophanes, self-interest dictates Cleon's actions to Athens' disadvantage</li> <li>• Comment on the writer's humour in making the case</li> </ul> <p><b>Horace</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• His case is for the good life, without political power; explain 'golden mean'</li> <li>• One provokes hostility by success; examples</li> <li>• Frugal, honourable upbringing prepares one to accept the simple lifestyle; examples</li> <li>• But is it so simple? Maecenas' generosity makes it possible</li> </ul> <p><b>Juvenal</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sejanus' success depended on the whims of an unreliable emperor; would it not have been better to be mayor of an obscure town?</li> <li>• Sejanus' great fall was commensurate with his rise to supreme power</li> <li>• Fickle rabble only cares for 'bread and games'</li> <li>• Other examples of fall from greatness: Demosthenes, Cicero and Hannibal</li> <li>• Juvenal's use of humour to make his point; eg Sejanus' statue now broken up into chamber-pots; Hannibal's rivers of blood wiped out by a poisoned ring</li> </ul>	20	

**Part 2**

**Section A - History and Historiography**

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
1	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Political backdrop of the Persian/Greek struggle allows Herodotus to tell many tragic, human-interest stories</li> <li>• Croesus thought himself luckiest of men, but lost his son and his kingdom</li> <li>• Phrygian Adrastus fulfils destiny by inadvertently killing the son of his benefactor</li> <li>• Cyrus facing defeated Croesus feels pity</li> <li>• Story of Xerxes' expedition itself is a tale of divine temptation, superhuman arrogance and ambition, and eventual defeat and despair</li> <li>• In Book 1 Gyges feels himself impaled on the horns of a dilemma when Candaules' angry queen forces him to make the tragic choice between murdering his master and dying himself</li> <li>• Croesus' story prefigures Xerxes' story: in both cases success tempts them to go too far</li> <li>• In Book 7, Xerxes' thoughts when reviewing his troops at Abydos. He weeps to think they will all be dead in 100 years</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
2	<p><b>Valid points</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Inevitable growth of hostility between Athens and Sparta is charted logically, in a detached manner, in the affairs of Epidamnus, Corcyra and Potidaea</li> <li>• Epidamnus appeals to Corinth for help in a civil war, thus alienating the mother city, Corcyra. Corinth is in an alliance hostile to Athens. Corcyra appeals to Athens</li> <li>• Effective use of speeches for and against this alliance: examples of arguments used</li> <li>• Simple narrative of events leading up to the breaking of the treaty between Athens and the Peloponnesians. Thucydides does not intervene with judgements</li> <li>• Potidaean situation similarly narrated; details</li> <li>• Speeches at Sparta when war is declared. Arguments laid out for and against, without judgements</li> <li>• Speeches of Archidamus and Sthenelaidos - examples of objective argumentation from the Spartan side</li> <li>• Description of Plague in Book 2. Clinical observation of symptoms (Hippocrates' influence). No attribution to the gods</li> <li>• Pericles: strongly characterised as the virtuous politician. He champions Athens as a place of civilised values, Funeral Speech is delivered through the lips of Pericles</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
3	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <p><b>Strengths</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Literary appraisal may be more appropriate for Livy than historical appraisal eg his narration of sieges aims at dramatic and pathetic treatment. He assesses the effects on the emotions of the besieged. He does not elaborate gory descriptions</li> <li>• Much of Livy is 'patriotic', but he does praise the characters of non-Romans when they measure up to his ideal, and he condemns Romans who do not</li> <li>• Success and failure of protagonists accounted for by moral qualities or the reverse</li> <li>• Livy sees into the minds of individuals and groups. The speeches are interesting descriptions of the participants' state of mind - examples from Saguntum, Ticinus and Trebia. He is good at eliciting fear and pity in readers.</li> </ul> <p><b>Limitations</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Concern to depict Rome's greatness causes him to depict Hannibal as a monster, who owes his success to fortune</li> <li>• His bias against Hannibal is clear in the speeches before the battle of Ticinus - here Scipio refers to divine displeasure at Hannibal's breaking of treaties, while Hannibal's speech shows him ascribing his success to fortune. How could Livy know what Hannibal said?</li> <li>• He does not acknowledge Hannibal's strategic competence</li> <li>• Inconsistency in the portrait of Hannibal: contemptuous of gods at one moment; praying to Jove at another</li> <li>• Limits to his knowledge of battle-sites and geography. Dramatic features are his interest.</li> <li>• Any other valid points</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
4	<p><b>Valid points:</b>  <b>Polybius and statesmen</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Intention is to explain for statesmen how Rome in particular came to dominate the Mediterranean world</li> <li>• Polybius says he teaches statesmen to bear the vicissitudes of fortune from examples such as Hannibal's</li> <li>• He aims to teach about the affairs of cities, peoples and rulers. Need to know men's character</li> <li>• In his ordering of content he emphasises importance of causes and consequences of events, or of the lessons implicit in great men's lives. Examples</li> <li>• Polybius could report first-hand as he was a diplomat in this period. He travelled a lot, to correct errors of earlier writers</li> <li>• Polybius analyses the degree of acceptance by Carthage of defeat after the first war. He also analyses the treaties leading to the second war. His purpose is didactic</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
4	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <p><b>Tacitus and statesmen</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• His description of Augustus' rise to power is a useful lesson, although he is critical of autocrats; eg fiction of the Republic is maintained</li> <li>• Tiberius insidiously takes on more powers and deprives Assembly in favour of Senate. He lessens consuls' powers</li> <li>• Tiberius' handling of mutinies in Pannonia and Germany was astute; details</li> <li>• 'watch out for tyrants and how they operate' is a useful lesson for statesmen; examples – eg 'the whole point of autocracy is that the accounts will not come right unless the ruler is their only auditor'</li> <li>• However, Tacitus is much more interested in giving psychological insights into flawed personalities through his own epigrammatic asides and through highly crafted speeches from the protagonists than he is in giving lessons for statesmen. For Tacitus there is no realistic way back to the Republic</li> </ul>		

**Section B - Individual and Community**

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
5	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Aristotle supports the principle of a constitution</li> <li>• Aristotle puts strong emphasis on the duties of a citizen</li> <li>• Aristotle views education as a powerful liberating factor</li> <li>• Aristotle regards the rights of the individual as a basis for developing stability</li> <li>• This in turn, he believed, would lead to political and social success</li> <li>• Aristotle, like Plato, reluctant to allow anyone to opt out of the state</li> <li>• Little sympathy for individuals trying to 'go it alone'</li> <li>• Interdependence of the citizen body seen as a necessary element in stabilising the state</li> <li>• One of the main ideas in Plato's Republic is the primacy of the state</li> <li>• Distrust of democracy after defeat of democratic Athens in 5<sup>th</sup> century</li> <li>• Significance of the manner of his defeat</li> <li>• Plato's citizens conform to the proposed structures of the state</li> <li>• Division of tasks in Plato's state a key element</li> <li>• Effect of rigid structure on social mobility</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
6	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Plato's ideas on women's status would have seemed revolutionary to ordinary Greeks</li> <li>• Plato asks whether the difference of sex is a proper basis for differentiation of occupation and social function</li> <li>• He sees the main difference between men and women as one of physical function - child-bearing by women</li> <li>• He argues that men and women can perform the same functions</li> <li>• They should receive the same education</li> <li>• Comparison possible with Aristophanes' comedies</li> <li>• It is important that candidates set the issues in context - different times, different values</li> <li>• The reality of life for Greek women was that they faced prejudice on a daily basis</li> <li>• Important to emphasise that there were both advantages and disadvantages to what he is proposing from the point of view in modern feminism</li> <li>• The content of one modern society too should not be glossed over</li> </ul> <p><b>For full marks candidates must address both Plato's and modern society</b></p>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
7	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <p><b>Strengths</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The proposals reflect Cicero's genuine commitment to a Roman society which empowers 'all good men'</li> <li>• Cicero has a practicality missing from Plato and Aristotle</li> <li>• Unlike Plato and Aristotle, Cicero was an experienced politician</li> <li>• He understands what is achievable</li> <li>• He has clear views on what is right and what is wrong</li> <li>• Note his views on tyranny and justice</li> </ul> <p><b>Weaknesses</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cicero's proposals are certainly less extreme than some of the ultras among the Optimates faction in the Senate but they are still very conservative</li> <li>• There are no revolutionary elements in his proposals</li> <li>• The populus Romanus remains disconnected from power</li> <li>• He is writing for an elite for whom change is anathema</li> <li>• He is committed to the concept of the mos maiorum</li> <li>• Change of a deeper kind was needed to regenerate Rome's social systems</li> <li>• All the proposals will serve only to postpone, not avoid, the societal change that was necessary</li> <li>• Republican Rome was imploding as he wrote</li> <li>• Real power was now in the hands of the triumvirs</li> <li>• Civil war was a reality of life</li> <li>• Cicero himself had to endure a period of exile</li> <li>• There were attempts to overthrow the state</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
8	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This should be an awareness from candidates' of modern viewpoint on the place of the individual in society</li> <li>• There should be an acceptance of the necessity of some form of social organisation in every state - the alternative brings chaos</li> <li>• It is rare to find the priority given to the needs of the individual as opposed to those of the state</li> <li>• Some may quote politicians eg Mrs Thatcher's famous (or infamous) statement 'There is no such thing as society'</li> <li>• Plato's state requires its citizens to adapt to the structures of the state</li> <li>• Both Plato and Aristotle view the state as the core round which a society is built</li> <li>• Candidates may speculate on the extent to which their views have been informed and influenced by the failures of Athenian democracy</li> <li>• Aristotle proposes a constitution which sets out the responsibilities and duties of all citizens</li> <li>• We should note, however, that it would be simplistic to ignore Aristotle's occasional authoritarian viewpoints or likewise Plato's determination not to allow the system to become a tyranny</li> <li>• Cicero is unique, however, in offering in his proposals practical freedoms for the citizens</li> </ul> <p><b>Marks awarded for modern and classical</b></p>	50	

**Section C - Heroes and Heroism**

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
9	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Odysseus broke into the Cyclopes' cave and was on the point of stealing his possessions</li> <li>• He blinded the Cyclopes in a fearful way</li> <li>• On the other hand, the Cyclopes was a cannibal and was eating his men</li> <li>• When he is with Nausicaa, he is polite and thinks of her feelings</li> <li>• Can his treatment of the Cyclopes be justified as an example of Homeric morality</li> <li>• When he believes his dignity has been slighted as in the case of the suitors he is ruthless, killing nearly all the suitors despite their pleas for mercy and willingness to make reparation</li> <li>• As a specific example he kills Leodes, one of the suitors despite his begging to be spared</li> <li>• He refuses to let Eurycleia celebrate the slaughter – a step too far?</li> <li>• He hangs the maids who slept with the suitors</li> <li>• He butchers Melanthius after killing him</li> <li>• Good candidates will include a section focusing on the difference in moral values between classical societies and societies today</li> <li>• Other valid points</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
10	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The subordinate status of Penelope to not only her husband, Odysseus, but also to her son Telemachus</li> <li>• The importance of Briseis when taken from Achilles' camp to Agamemnon's</li> <li>• The fate of all the women who became prisoners</li> <li>• Women meant to accept fate, not fight against it</li> <li>• Odysseus' strong feelings toward Calypso - became lovers, last night of love</li> <li>• Infidelity acceptable for men but dangerous for women</li> <li>• In the Nausicaa episode the recurrent theme is Odysseus and how he gets home</li> <li>• Once Odysseus returns, Penelope becomes very much a secondary character with the focus clearly on Odysseus and his vengeance</li> <li>• Dido's love for Aeneas manipulated by Juno and Venus</li> <li>• She gives him everything - complete committal</li> <li>• His first wife is dead as is her first husband with whom she is still in love</li> <li>• The gods via Mercury order Aeneas to leave</li> <li>• He tries to deceive Dido - making preparations in secret for his departure</li> <li>• Her threats of reprisals</li> <li>• Her awareness that she has lost everything (her reputation, the support of her people, the love of her heart for a man who is now abandoning her)</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
11	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <p><b>Penelope</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Troy's capture not worth price</li> <li>• Feelings of abandonment - 'deserted bed'</li> <li>• Days pass slowly for her - not sleeping at night</li> <li>• Imagined fear for Odysseus</li> <li>• Describes herself as powerless</li> <li>• Desire to be a whole family again - Odysseus, Penelope and Telemachus</li> <li>• Odysseus is letting down 3 generations of his family through his absence</li> <li>• She is growing old</li> </ul> <p><b>Briseis</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• She describes herself as 'stolen'</li> <li>• She describes Achilles as 'my master and my beloved'</li> <li>• She complains about being handed over to Agamemnon too quickly 'no farewell kiss'</li> <li>• Feels Achilles should be angrier</li> <li>• Her husband and brothers had already been killed - she now relies on Achilles to fulfil these roles</li> <li>• Willing to be Achilles' slave</li> <li>• Begs him to return to fight</li> <li>• She would prefer death to loneliness</li> </ul> <p><b>Dido</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Does she not expect her pleas to Aeneas to be considered</li> <li>• She is being 'abandoned'</li> <li>• She feels he is breaking his pledge</li> <li>• He is giving up supreme power in Carthage</li> <li>• He will not find a better opportunity</li> <li>• She is ablaze with love</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
11	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• She sees Aeneas as unresponsive and an ingrate</li> <li>• She asks him to delay his departure</li> <li>• She hints at suicide</li> <li>• Aeneas had abandoned his first wife to death in Troy</li> <li>• She feels she has betrayed the memory of Sychaeus, her first husband</li> <li>• She claims she might be pregnant</li> <li>• He will be responsible for her death</li> </ul>		

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
12	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It seems likely that the pupils will focus on the qualities and virtues that the heroes possess</li> <li>• They may choose also to see the doomed heroes like Hector, Achilles or Turnus as admirable fighters against fate</li> <li>• The hero may display not only war-like prowess but also show a more human side including pity and compassion</li> <li>• The hero may display human weakness, and fallibility</li> <li>• The hero may try to show respect for women</li> <li>• Another characteristic the candidates are likely to find in a hero of the 21<sup>st</sup> century is facing fate and often failure with dignity</li> <li>• Candidates may wish to draw attention to the changing nature of heroism between the times of the Homeric heroes and the Augustan - like Aeneas</li> <li>• It is likely that Aeneas may be, therefore, regarded as the most evolved and multi-faceted as the one most suitable for 21<sup>st</sup> century Scotland</li> <li>• However any sound arguments for any other hero should be accepted</li> </ul>	50	

**Section D - Comedy, Satire and Society**

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
13	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Political satire such as this thrives in opposition to the contemporary regime, whose weaknesses it seeks to expose. Comedy first and foremost</li> <li>• The Athenian democracy was undermined by the war and by its own internal problems</li> <li>• Aristophanes can seem to hanker after traditionalism, which keeps things stable: examples</li> <li>• But he could mock traditions too: eg Dikaeopolis fighting the old boys of Marathon with coal-scuttle</li> <li>• Aristophanes is clearly anti-war in Acharnians and Peace and Knights, and so against the democratic leaders. Examples</li> <li>• In Knights he presents Demos as ultimately ruining his elected masters - is this the writer trying to deflect the charge of 'defaming democracy'?</li> <li>• The plays are comic fantasies, vehicles for satire, and attacks on politicians of all shades of opinion</li> <li>• They always end in riotous party scenes, to provide the audience with an escape from harsh reality</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
14	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• His writing is about individuals, not institutions: it is moral. See Satire 1.1 for evidence that 'enough is all you need.'</li> <li>• His writing is a social corrective, using examples of balance and restraint</li> <li>• Folly as opposed to good sense in sexual relations is an example of defective vision in Satire 1.2</li> <li>• Critics of others who miss their own lapses is subject of Satire 1.3. Also in Satire 3 the Stoic sage cannot see that he is an object of ridicule</li> <li>• His father's practical advice on morality - examples in 1.4, 1.6 and 2.6. Horace can live as he likes, without the need to keep up with appearances</li> <li>• In 1.9 his pride in his social success is threatened by the charge of pretentiousness - therefore he laughs at himself</li> <li>• In 2.1 simple living exemplified by Ofellus. Do not be deceived by the appearance of food. 'Hunger is the best sauce'</li> <li>• Pompous, over-fastidious gourmet in 2.4</li> <li>• Candidates must comment on the effectiveness of Horace's writing in making the above points</li> </ul>	50	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
15	<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'Indignation makes me write' is the motive for much of the earlier writing, while there is a more detached, philosophical approach in Satires 10 and 11</li> <li>• But 'hopes, fears, anger and pleasure' are still in evidence in 10 and 11</li> <li>• Greed, hypocrisy, sexual misbehaviour for gain or lust, and monstrous perversions are themes of the earlier satires: examples</li> <li>• Inappropriate behaviour of aristocrats too in earlier satires - 'unroman Romans'. Examples</li> <li>• Snobbery of Juvenal directed at Greeks, freedmen and upstairs in 1, 2, 3 and 5 and trenchant satire on cynical treatment of guests at a dinner party, much more bitter than the equivalent in Horace</li> <li>• Money and its abuse, and its perversions of social relationships in Satire 3, with highly critical vignettes of life in Rome</li> <li>• High-class women behaving badly in Satire 6</li> <li>• HOWEVER, in Satires 10 and 11, Juvenal's aim is to encourage the peaceful, Epicurean life (to some extent similarly to Satire 3, the 'Roman' Satire)</li> <li>• In Satire 10, the attack is on excessive desires, political, literary and military and on the lives ruined by them. Examples - Cicero, Sejanus, Demosthenes, Hannibal</li> <li>• Satire 11 is a constructive epicurean piece, whereas Satire 5 is destructive on same theme, ie dinner parties</li> <li>• Bitterly realistic picture of old age, to discourage prayers for longevity</li> </ul>	50	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
15		<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>On the other hand, Juvenal's examples throughout the Satires are models of effective rhetoric which he may be using for artistic reasons of hyperbole, or contrast tending to a witty climax. See: fall of Sejanus, depravity of Messalina, and is he really sympathetic to the poor man crushed to death in Satire 3, pictured freezing without a fare on the banks of the Styx?</li> </ul>		
16		<p><b>Valid points:</b></p> <p><b>Juvenal</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Concerned with vice and crime: forgery, robbery, adultery, fraud and murder, and 'unnatural' acts such as male prostitution and cannibalism. Perverted and monstrous examples</li> <li>The women satirised in Satire 6 are worst-case scenarios: examples</li> <li>Satires 2 and 9 are bitter, 'unsmiling' attacks on the hypocrisy of the upper classes and so-called intellectuals</li> <li>Pessimistic view of human nature even in Satire 10; examples</li> <li>But, no evidence that Juvenal wanted the Principate abolished. He dislikes the displacement of folk like himself by upstarts</li> </ul>	<b>50</b>	

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
16	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <p><b>Horace</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Satires not just about “folly, not vice”. He does attack greed and envy; adultery; cruelty; snobbery and ambition; witchcraft and superstition; gluttony and meanness; avarice, legacy-hunting; lust. But always humorously! Examples</li> <li>• Horace’s objection to the above is that they make the man himself unhappy. He presents his targets as ludicrous and pathetic rather than vicious. Examples</li> <li>• Great difficulties are usually removed more forcefully by laughter rather than vituperation (Satire 1.10,14-15) For example, the adulterer who falls from a roof while trying to get away; other funny examples</li> </ul> <p><b>Comparison</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2.6 of Horace and 3 of Juvenal. Horace glad to escape noisy merry-go-round of Rome: Juvenal’s Umbricius leaves to escape charlatans, pimps and gangsters, and rotten Roman women</li> <li>• In Juvenal 11, the most Horatian of his Satires, he still bitterly attacks snobbish Greek cuisine, lubricious entertainments and suspect wives in an ‘un-Horatian’ manner</li> <li>• Juvenal chastises tyranny and vice with great rigour, whereas Horace is a well-mannered courtier; examples. However, Horace’s concerns are more social and philosophical, and anger is out of place</li> </ul>		

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]