



National  
Qualifications  
SPECIMEN ONLY

**S864/77/11**

**Religious, Moral and  
Philosophical Studies**

Date — Not applicable

Duration — 3 hours

**Total marks — 90**

**SECTION 1 — PHILOSOPHY OF RELIGION — 45 marks**

Attempt **EITHER** question 1 **OR** question 2

**THEN** attempt question 3.

**SECTION 2 — 45 marks**

Attempt **EITHER** Part A **OR** Part B

**Part A — RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE — 45 marks**

Attempt **EITHER** question 4 **OR** question 5

**THEN** attempt question 6.

**Part B — MEDICAL ETHICS — 45 marks**

Attempt **EITHER** question 7 **OR** question 8

**THEN** attempt question 9.

Write your answers clearly in the answer booklet provided. In the answer booklet you must clearly identify the question number you are attempting.

Use **blue** or **black** ink.

Before leaving the examination room you must give your answer booklet to the Invigilator; if you do not, you may lose all the marks for this paper.



\* S 8 6 4 7 7 1 1 \*

## SECTION 1 — PHILOSOPHY OF RELIGION — 45 marks

Attempt EITHER question 1 OR question 2 THEN attempt question 3.

1. 'Scientific responses to the cosmological argument show that it is unsuccessful.'  
How valid is this claim? 30
  
2. 'The teleological argument proves the universe is designed.'  
How valid is this claim? 30

Read the following source and attempt question 3.

'There is something infantile in the presumption that somebody else has a responsibility to give your life meaning and point . . . our life is as meaningful, as full and as wonderful as we make it . . .'

*Richard Dawkins*

3. (a) Describe what is meant by the presumption of atheism. 5
- (b) Analyse this source. 5
- (c) Evaluate this source. 5

## SECTION 2 — 45 marks

## Part A — Religious experience

Attempt this part if you have studied Religious experience.

Attempt EITHER question 4 OR question 5 THEN attempt question 6.

- |  |    |
|--|----|
| 4. How valid are sociological accounts of religious experience?  | 30 |
| 5. ‘Swinburne’s ideas about religious experience are the most convincing.’<br>To what extent do you agree? | 30 |

Read the following source and attempt question 6.

‘A feeling of being in a wider life than that of this world’s selfish little interests; and a conviction . . . of the existence of an ideal power.’

*William James*

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| 6. (a) Describe what is meant by a mystical experience. | 5 |
| (b) Analyse this source.                                | 5 |
| (c) Evaluate this source.                               | 5 |

[Turn over for Part B

## Part B — Medical ethics

Attempt this part if you have studied Medical ethics.

Attempt EITHER question 7 OR question 8 THEN attempt question 9.

- |  |    |
|--|----|
| 7. How valid are religious responses to assisted dying?              | 30 |
| 8. ‘Abortion is morally acceptable.’<br>To what extent do you agree? | 30 |

Read the following source and attempt question 9.

‘Organ transplants are not morally acceptable if the donor or those who legitimately speak for him have not given their informed consent.’

*The Catechism of the Catholic Church*

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| 9. (a) Describe what is meant by organ transplants. | 5 |
| (b) Analyse this source.                            | 5 |
| (c) Evaluate this source.                           | 5 |

**[END OF SPECIMEN QUESTION PAPER]**

*Acknowledgement of copyright*

- |                             |   |
|-----------------------------|---|
| Section 1 Question 3        | Quote is taken from “The God Delusion” by David Hawkins. ISBN 9780552773317. Published by Black Swan.<br><b>SQA has made every effort to trace the owners of copyright materials in this question paper, and seek permissions. We will be happy to incorporate any missing acknowledgements. Please contact question.papers@sqa.org.uk.</b> |
| Section 2 Part A Question 6 | Quote by William James. Public Domain.  |
| Section 2 Part B Question 9 | Quote from The Catechism of the Catholic Church. © Libreria Editrice Vaticana.  |



National  
Qualifications  
SPECIMEN ONLY

**S864/77/11**

**Religious, Moral and Philosophical  
Studies**

## Marking Instructions

---

These marking instructions have been provided to show how SQA would mark this specimen question paper.

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is reproduced, SQA should be clearly acknowledged as the source. If it is to be used for any other purpose, written permission must be obtained from [permissions@sqa.org.uk](mailto:permissions@sqa.org.uk).

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (ie secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the user's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance.

## General marking principles for Advanced Higher Religious, Moral and Philosophical Studies

*Always apply these general principles. Use them in conjunction with the detailed marking instructions, which identify the key features required in candidates' responses.*

- (a) Always use positive marking. This means candidates accumulate marks for the demonstration of relevant skills, knowledge and understanding; marks are not deducted for errors or omissions.
- (b) If a candidate response does not seem to be covered by either the principles or detailed marking instructions, and you are uncertain how to assess it, you must seek guidance from your team leader.
- (c) Where a candidate violates the rubric of the paper and answers both optional 30 mark questions in a Section/Part, all responses should be marked and the better mark recorded.
- (d) Use the full range of marks available for each question.
- (e) The detailed marking instructions are not an exhaustive list. Award marks for other relevant points.
- (f) Award marks only where points relate to the question asked. Where candidates give points of knowledge without specifying the context, award marks unless it is clear that they do not refer to the context of the question.
- (g) In this question paper the following skills are assessed
  - knowledge and understanding
  - analysis
  - evaluation.
- (h) For essay questions candidates must integrate these skills with their knowledge, in response to the question or statement. Essay questions may include the following command words
  - 'How valid...'
  - 'To what extent do you agree...'
  - 'Discuss...'
- (i) For source questions candidates must demonstrate the skills of knowledge, analysis and evaluation in short responses. Source questions always use the following command words
  - 'Describe...'
  - 'Analyse...'
  - 'Evaluate...'

Essay questions

|          | 26-30   | 21-25  | 16-20  | 11-15   | 6-10   | 0-5  |
|----------|---|--|--|---|--|--|
| Overview | The essay is clearly focussed on the question at all times. | The essay is clearly focussed on the question but at times refers generally to the topic rather than the question. | The essay is focussed on the question at times but drifts into general comments about the topic. | The essay is focussed more on the topic rather than the question. | The essay is focussed more on the topic than on the question and has information that lacks relevance. | The essay lacks relevance to both the question and/or the topic. |

|                             | 9-10   | 7-8   | 5-6  | 3-4   | 1-2   | 0  |
|-----------------------------|--|---|--|---|---|--|
| Knowledge and understanding | KU is consistently in depth, accurate and relevant.  | KU is mainly in depth, accurate and relevant.   | KU has inconsistent depth but is mainly accurate and relevant.   | KU lacks depth overall but is mainly accurate and relevant.   | KU lacks depth overall and has issues with accuracy or relevance.   | KU is superficial and is not consistently accurate or relevant.                                  |
|                             | There is clear evidence that the candidate has drawn together relevant and appropriate information from a range of specific sources or perspectives. | There is clear evidence that the candidate has drawn together mainly relevant and appropriate information from some specific sources or perspectives. | There is some evidence that the candidate has drawn together relevant and/or appropriate information but references to sources and perspectives tend to be more general and limited. | There is evidence that the candidate has attempted to draw together relevant and/or appropriate information but references to sources and perspectives are general in nature and limited. | There is some evidence that the candidate has attempted to draw together relevant and/or appropriate information but references to sources and perspectives are brief, undeveloped and general in nature. | The essay lacks evidence of sources and perspectives and those used lack relevance and accuracy. |

Source questions

|          | 9-10   | 7-8  | 5-6  | 3-4  | 1-2   | 0  |
|----------|--|--|--|--|---|--|
| Analysis | The analysis clearly identifies specific issue(s) related to the question.   | The analysis identifies specific issue(s) related to the question but the depth is uneven at times.                                    | The analysis identifies a mix of specific and general issue(s) that are related to the question and there is insufficient depth and explanation of them. | The analysis identifies some general issue(s) related to the question and there is insufficient depth or explanation.                                | The analysis identifies a few issue(s) but they are not clearly related to the question and coverage is superficial.                  | Any analysis often fails to identify issues and those that have been identified are not clearly related to the question and superficial. |
|          | The explanation of issues takes account of a range of clearly identified perspectives and demonstrates a clear understanding of their relevance to the question. | The explanation of issues takes account of some perspectives and demonstrates a good understanding of their relevance to the question. | The issues are explained and there is evidence of some understanding of their relevance to the question which at times is general in nature.             | The issues are explained and there is evidence of some understanding of their relevance to the question at times but which is generally superficial. | The issues are briefly explained but there is evidence of some understanding of their relevance to the topic but not to the question. | There is evidence of some understanding of the topic but not the question.   |

|            | 9-10  | 7-8  | 5-6  | 3-4  | 1-2   | 0  |
|------------|---|--|--|--|---|--|
| Evaluation | The evaluation is insightful, valid and clearly reasoned.   | The evaluation is valid, may be insightful and is mainly clearly reasoned.         | The evaluation is valid but not consistently and clearly reasoned.               | The evaluation is valid but not clearly reasoned and lacks sufficiency.  | There is limited valid evaluation but it is not clearly reasoned and lacks sufficiency. | The evaluation either lacks validity or relevance to the issue/question. |
|            | It has relevant judgements on the issues and/or perspectives on the issues.                         | It has mainly relevant judgements on the issues and/or perspectives on the issues. | It has some relevant judgements on the issues and/or perspectives on the issues. | It has relevant judgements on the issues and/or perspectives on the issues, however it is simply a judgement with brief reasoning. | It may have judgements on the issues but there is some brief reasoning behind them.     |  |
|            | Conclusions have successfully been woven throughout the essay/drawn at the conclusion of the essay. | Mainly clear conclusions have been drawn.  | There has been some attempt to draw conclusions but they lack depth.             | There has been some attempt to draw brief conclusions but they lack depth.   | Conclusions may be restricted to closing comments.                                      |  |



Detailed marking instructions for each question

Section 1 – Philosophy of religion

| Question |  | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question  |
|----------|--|----------|---|
| 1.       |  | 30       | <p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Aquinas’s argument from motion, contingency and causation</li> <li>• Leibniz’s Principle of sufficient reason</li> <li>• Kalam argument</li> <li>• scientific responses</li> <li>• sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of cosmological arguments and scientific responses</li> <li>• consequences of cosmological arguments and scientific responses</li> <li>• connections between different cosmological arguments and scientific responses</li> <li>• explanations of sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul> |

| Question |  | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question  |
|----------|--|----------|---|
| 2.       |  | 30       | <p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Aquinas’s argument from design</li> <li>• Paley’s argument from design</li> <li>• argument from intelligent design</li> <li>• scientific responses</li> <li>• philosophical responses</li> <li>• religious responses</li> <li>• sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of teleological arguments and responses</li> <li>• consequences of teleological arguments and responses</li> <li>• connections between different teleological arguments and different responses</li> <li>• explanations of sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul> |

| Question |     | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question   |
|----------|-----|----------|--|
| 3.       | (a) | 5        | <p><b>Describe what is meant by...</b></p> <p>Candidates demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective of the source.</p> <p>Possible knowledge and understanding marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Accurate, relevant and developed points which demonstrate an understanding of the perspective, that is, what is meant by 'atheism'.</li> </ul> <p>Award 1 mark per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>The word atheism comes from 'a' meaning <i>without</i> and 'theism' meaning <i>belief in God or gods</i> therefore an atheist is someone who does not believe in God/gods or anything supernatural. Atheists presume that there is no God until strong evidence can be presented which will prove the existence of God. As it is the theists who are saying that God does exist then it is up to them to provide evidence. Antony Flew said 'the onus of proof lies on the man who affirms, not on the man who denies.'</p>   |
|          | (b) | 5        | <p><b>Analyse this source</b></p> <p>This question requires candidates to demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible analysis marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Demonstrate, through interpretation or paraphrasing, a clear understanding of the source.</li> </ul> <p>Do not award marks for simply quoting points from the source. Candidates must paraphrase or interpret them to gain credit.</p> <p>Award 1 mark per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>This source by Dawkins clearly shows that he is against the idea that a God exists. Dawkins argues that belief in God is simply attempting to fill some sort of void in our lives, and people are therefore just filling that with God. He argues that we can find meaning and purpose ourselves, we just need to live life to the best of our ability. Dawkins' use of the word 'presumption' indicates that he feels that people believe in God but lack evidence for this belief. The use of the word 'infantile' shows that he would dismiss any reason that the theist could provide as evidence for God's existence as futile.</p> |

| Question |     | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question  |
|----------|-----|----------|---|
|          | (c) | 5        | <p><b><i>Evaluate this source</i></b></p> <p>This question requires candidates to assess the validity or invalidity of the perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible evaluation marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Insightful, valid and clearly reasoned judgements on the source.</li> </ul> <p>Award <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>I agree with Dawkins to a certain extent as I think that it is delusional to believe that human beings need to believe in God in order to provide them with a reason for living. Dawkins describes belief in God as ‘infantile’, which I would agree with because there is no convincing evidence to support the existence of God. I think it is very childish to need to believe in a higher power in order to find meaning, value and purpose in life. This is similar to a child needing guidance from a parent, something which we grow out of as we mature and develop our own sense of morality and values. We cannot look to God to provide constant direction in our lives, nor can we hold God accountable when things do not go well, as God is merely a fictional being.</p> |

Section 2 – Part A – Religious experience

| Question |  | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question   |
|----------|--|----------|--|
| 4.       |  | 30       | <p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• sociological accounts of religious experience</li> <li>• psychological accounts of religious experience</li> <li>• scientific accounts of religious experience.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of sociological accounts of religious experience</li> <li>• consequences of sociological accounts of religious experience</li> <li>• connections between accounts of religious experience</li> <li>• explanations of sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul> |

| Question |  | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question   |
|----------|--|----------|--|
| 5.       |  | 30       | <p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Swinburne’s ideas about religious experience</li> <li>• James’ ideas about religious experience</li> <li>• Otto’s ideas about religious experience.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of Swinburne’s ideas about religious experience</li> <li>• consequences of Swinburne’s ideas about religious experience</li> <li>• connections between ideas about religious experience</li> <li>• explanations of sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul> |

| Question |     | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question   |
|----------|-----|----------|--|
| 6.       | (a) | 5        | <p><b>Describe what is meant by...</b></p> <p>Candidates demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective of the source.</p> <p>Possible knowledge and understanding marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Accurate, relevant and developed points which demonstrate an understanding of the perspective, that is, what is meant by 'a mystical experience'.</li> </ul> <p>Award <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>A mystical religious experience is where the person feels a sense of union with God. Mystical religious experiences are ineffable and noetic. Mystical religious experiences are found in all religions and it emphasises personal revelations such as visions and dreams. Saint Teresa of Avila is an example of someone who received many mystical experiences; she felt that God was within her.</p>  |
|          | (b) | 5        | <p><b>Analyse this source</b></p> <p>Candidates demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible analysis marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Demonstrate, through interpretation or paraphrasing, a clear understanding of the source.</li> </ul> <p>Do not award marks for simply quoting points from the source. Candidates must paraphrase or interpret them to gain credit.</p> <p>Award <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>This source from William James explains what happens when you encounter a mystical religious experience. James deems a mystical experience as a feeling that can only be explained when you have an interaction with a higher power that is God. He says that the feeling takes you to a place that is more than just sense perception and is something that goes far beyond human understanding. James suggests that a mystical experience is also hard to define because it is personal and unique to those who encounter it.</p> |

| Question |     | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question  |
|----------|-----|----------|---|
|          | (c) | 5        | <p><b>Evaluate this source</b></p> <p>Candidates assess the validity or invalidity of the perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible evaluation marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Insightful, valid and clearly reasoned judgements on the source.</li> </ul> <p>Award <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>I agree to an extent with James because if a person does have a mystical religious experience, it is a personal encounter that only they have the ability to explain to others as it is their truth and no one else should have the authority to deny that experience happening for that person. I also agree with James when he says that this type of experience persuades a person to believe that a higher power exists as these experiences are rare and do not happen to everyone. However, the problem with a mystical experience is that it only happens to a handful of people which makes it difficult to know for certain if they are genuine. A final challenge with James's quote is that he is far too vague in his description which basically allows any form of religious encounter to class as a 'religious experience.'</p> |



Section 2 – Part B – Medical ethics

| Question |  | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question  |
|----------|--|----------|---|
| 7.       |  | 30       | <p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• sanctity of life</li> <li>• end of life care</li> <li>• assisted dying</li> <li>• religious responses</li> <li>• non-religious responses.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of religious responses to the end of life</li> <li>• consequences of religious responses to the end of life</li> <li>• connections between patient autonomy and sanctity of life</li> <li>• explanations of sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul> |

| Question |  | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question  |
|----------|--|----------|---|
| 8.       |  | 30       | <p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• sanctity of life</li> <li>• moral debate surrounding abortion</li> <li>• religious responses to abortion</li> <li>• non-religious responses to abortion.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of religious responses to abortion</li> <li>• consequences of religious responses to abortion</li> <li>• connections between religious and non-religious viewpoints</li> <li>• explanations of sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul> |

| Question |     | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question   |
|----------|-----|----------|--|
| 9.       | (a) | 5        | <p><b>Describe what is meant by...</b></p> <p>Candidates demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective of the source.</p> <p>Possible knowledge and understanding marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Accurate, relevant and developed points which demonstrate an understanding of the perspective, that is, what is meant by 'organ transplants'.</li> </ul> <p>Award <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>Organ transplants are where an organ is removed from one body and placed into the body of another as part of a medical procedure. Most donated organs and tissues are from people who have died, however, it is possible to donate a kidney or part of your liver whilst living. The most common transplants are: heart, liver and lung. Over 6000 people are waiting for a transplant in the UK.</p>  |
|          | (b) | 5        | <p><b>Analyse this source</b></p> <p>Candidates demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible analysis marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Demonstrate, through interpretation or paraphrasing, a clear understanding of the source.</li> </ul> <p>Do not award marks for simply quoting points from the source. Candidates must paraphrase or interpret them to gain credit.</p> <p>Award <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>This source from the Catholic Church is not in favour of organ transplants unless consent has been given by the donor or their family. The Catholic Church would regard informed consent to be the most acceptable method of organ transplants because this means that the organ donor has been fully aware of the process and volunteers to donate their organ out of love and compassion. They would be concerned with presumed consent because the donor may feel under pressure from friends or family to keep their name on the organ donor register. This means that the act is no longer acceptable as the donor has acted out of obligation and not out of generosity. The Catholic Church makes it clear that at the heart of organ transplants is altruism.</p> |

| Question |     | Max mark | Marking instructions for this question   |
|----------|-----|----------|--|
|          | (c) | 5        | <p><b><i>Evaluate this source</i></b></p> <p>Candidates assess the validity or invalidity of the perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible evaluation marks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Insightful, valid and clearly reasoned judgements on the source.</li> </ul> <p>Award <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response</b></p> <p>I agree with this source because taking organs from someone without their consent removes the human value of the act because they are not freely choosing to help others. Also, it gives the government too much control over our bodies when we die, and could also result in the deceased being used as ‘spare parts’ to help the living. On the other hand, I disagree because many people would gladly accept an organ if needed, therefore they should be made to donate. This is an example of living according to Jesus’ second greatest commandment, “love thy neighbour as thyself”. Finally, people are dead and therefore have no use for their organs.</p> |

[END OF SPECIMEN MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]