



National
Qualifications
2018

2018 Classical Studies
Advanced Higher
Finalised Marking Instructions

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2018

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is reproduced, SQA should be clearly acknowledged as the source. If it is to be used for any other purpose, written permission must be obtained from permissions@sqa.org.uk.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's NQ Assessment team may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These marking instructions have been prepared by examination teams for use by SQA appointed markers when marking external course assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.



General marking principles for Advanced Higher Classical Studies

The following general marking principles will be applied when marking all candidate responses to questions in this paper. These principles must be read in conjunction with the detailed Marking Instructions for each question. The detailed Marking Instructions that follow these general marking principles are written to assist in determining 'a range of acceptable answers' rather than listing every possible correct answer.

- (a) Marks for each candidate response will **always** be assigned in line with these general marking principles and the detailed marking instructions for the relevant question.
- (b) Marking should always be positive. This means that marks are accumulated for the demonstration of relevant skills, knowledge and understanding: they are not deducted from a maximum on the basis of errors or omissions.
- (c) If a candidate response does not seem to be covered by either the principles or detailed marking instructions, and you are uncertain how to assess it, you must seek guidance from your team leader.
- (d) Where the candidate violates the rubric of the paper and answers more than two 25 mark questions, or questions in more than one section, all responses should be marked and the better mark recorded.
- (e) Markers will use the full range of marks available for each question. The detailed marking instructions are not exhaustive. Other relevant points should be credited.

For credit to be given, points must relate to the question asked.

In this assessment the following skills are assessed:

- analysis
- critical evaluation
- structuring and sustaining a line of argument.

The following question types are used in this paper:

- source evaluation questions **(10 marks)**
- source analysis questions **(10 marks)**
- source comparison questions **(15 marks)**
- source comparison question comparing a classical and modern source **(15 marks)**
- two questions requiring candidates to integrate knowledge, analysis, synthesis and develop a line of argument. **(25 marks each)**

The general principle underpinning the marking of all sections in both parts is that credit is to be given for well-thought out answers, supported by examples from the prescribed texts, with direct quotes, if possible.

NB: The detailed marking instructions for each question provide examples of points that candidates might give in their answer. Credit will also be given in both parts of the paper to candidates who put forward relevant points not listed in the marking instructions.

Marking instructions for each type of question

Section 1 - Source based questions

These detailed marking instructions provide guidance on the application of the general marking principles. Markers should award appropriate credit based on the criteria in the following tables. However, responses which do not fit neatly within the criteria should also be credited. For example, a response which meets most of the criteria in a mark range may be credited some or all of the marks depending on the professional judgement of the marker.

Question type	Overall marks	Marking instructions					
<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>To what extent...</i>’ require candidates to <i>evaluate</i> a source. Candidates will use in-depth knowledge and understanding of the aims and/or qualities of classical sources and writers to make a reasoned judgement. Evaluative comments may relate to, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • origin • purpose • content • cultural or historical context. 	10	<p>0 marks</p> <p>No relevant points of evaluation are made.</p>	<p>1-2 marks</p> <p>One or two relevant points of evaluation are made which respond to the question.</p>	<p>3-4 marks</p> <p>Two or three relevant points of evaluation are made which respond to the question and show understanding of the source content, context or intention.</p>	<p>5-6 marks</p> <p>Four relevant points of evaluation are made which respond to the question and show wider understanding of the source content, context or intention.</p>	<p>7-8 marks</p> <p>Four relevant points of evaluation are made which respond to the question and show full understanding of the source content, context or intention.</p>	<p>9-10 marks</p> <p>Four relevant points of evaluation are made which respond to the question and show full understanding of the source content, context or intention.</p> <p>And</p> <p>The answer is supported with wider reading beyond that specified in the question.</p> <p>And</p> <p>A clear overall judgement is drawn from the points made.</p>

Question type	Overall marks	Marking instructions					
<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>In what ways...</i>’ require candidates to <i>analyse</i> a source. Candidates will identify different aspects/components of a source and clearly show at least one of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links between different components • links between component(s) and the whole • links between component(s) and related concepts • similarities and contradictions • consistency and inconsistency • different views/interpretations • possible consequences/implications • the relative importance of components • understanding of underlying order or structure. 	10	<p>0 marks</p> <p>No relevant points of analysis are made.</p>	<p>1-2 marks</p> <p>One or two relevant points of analysis are made which respond to the question.</p>	<p>3-4 marks</p> <p>Two or three relevant points of analysis are made which respond to the question and show understanding of the source content, context or intention.</p>	<p>5-6 marks</p> <p>Four relevant points of analysis are made which respond to the question and show wider understanding of the source content, context or intention.</p>	<p>7-8 marks</p> <p>Four relevant points of analysis are made which respond to the question and show full understanding of the source content, context or intention.</p>	<p>9-10 marks</p> <p>Four relevant points of analysis are made which respond to the question and show full understanding of the source content, context or intention.</p> <p>And</p> <p>The answer is supported with wider reading beyond that specified in the question.</p> <p>And</p> <p>A clear overall judgement is drawn from the points made.</p>

Question type	Overall marks		Marking instructions			
<p>Questions that ask candidates to '<i>compare different sources...</i>' require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> discuss different areas of comparison between two sources make developed points taken from classical sources in the question to illustrate the comparisons made in the answer. 	15	10	<p>0 marks</p> <p>No relevant points given as evidence for comparison.</p>	<p>Up to a maximum of 10 marks, 1 mark should be awarded for each relevant developed point taken from the classical sources which provide evidence for the comparison(s) discussed in the answer.</p> <p>Developed points will involve the candidate providing, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> additional detail examples reasons. 		
		5	<p>0 marks</p> <p>No relevant area of comparison is discussed.</p>	<p>1-2 marks</p> <p>The answer discusses one or two areas of comparison between at least two sources.</p>	<p>3-4 marks</p> <p>The answer discusses three or four areas of comparison between at least two sources.</p>	<p>5 marks</p> <p>The answer discusses four areas of comparison between at least two sources.</p> <p>And</p> <p>These comparisons are summarised into an overall conclusion which responds to the question.</p>

Question type	Overall marks		Marking Instructions			
<p>Questions that ask candidates to <i>'compare a modern source/quote with classical ideas...'</i> require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> discuss different areas of comparison between the modern ideas expressed in the source and classical texts make developed points of evidence taken from classical texts to illustrate the comparisons made in the answer. 	15	10	<p>0 marks</p> <p>No relevant points given as evidence for comparison.</p>	<p>Up to a maximum of 10 marks, 1 mark should be awarded for each relevant developed point taken from classical texts which provide evidence for the comparison(s) discussed in the answer.</p> <p>Developed points must be taken from classical texts and will involve the candidate providing, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> additional detail examples reasons. 		
		5	<p>0 marks</p> <p>No relevant area of comparison is discussed.</p>	<p>1-2 marks</p> <p>The answer discusses one or two areas of comparison derived from the wording of the modern source.</p>	<p>3-4 marks</p> <p>The answer discusses three or four areas of comparison derived from the wording of the modern source.</p>	<p>5 marks</p> <p>The answer discusses four areas of comparison derived from the wording of the modern source.</p> <p>And</p> <p>These comparisons are summarised into an overall conclusion which responds to the question.</p>

Section 2 - 25 mark essay questions

Analysis - 8 marks

Analysis involves identifying parts, the relationship between them, and their relationships with the whole. It can also involve drawing out and relating implications. Analysis requires candidates to clearly show at least one of the following: links between different components, links between component(s) and the whole, links between component(s) and related concepts, similarities and contradictions, consistency and inconsistency, different views/interpretations, possible consequences/implications, the relative importance of components, and understanding of underlying order or structure.

0 marks	1-2 marks	3-4 marks	5-6 marks	7-8 marks
<p>No evidence of analysis (a purely descriptive response).</p> <p>Or</p> <p>Analysis is not relevant to the question.</p>	<p>One or two analytical points are made about aspects of a value, concept or system of classical society.</p> <p>These may not be the key or most relevant points, in the context of the question.</p>	<p>Two analytical points are made about aspects of a value, concept or system of classical society.</p> <p>These will be key aspects in the context of the question.</p>	<p>Three or four analytical points are made about aspects of a value, concept or system of classical society.</p> <p>These will be key aspects in the context of the question.</p> <p>Analytical points clearly refer to parts of the set texts.</p>	<p>Four analytical points are made about aspects of a value, concept or system of classical society.</p> <p>These will be key aspects in the context of the question.</p> <p>Analytical points clearly refer to parts of the set texts.</p> <p>And</p> <p>Show a clear interaction between others' ideas and the candidates own.</p>

Evaluation - 8 marks				
Evaluation involves using in-depth knowledge and understanding to make a reasoned judgement based on criteria.				
0 marks	1-2 marks	3-4 marks	5-6 marks	7-8 marks
No relevant, reasoned evaluative points.	<p>Two points of evaluation are made but there are no clear supporting reasons.</p> <p>Or</p> <p>One point of evaluation is made which shows supporting reasons/evidence.</p>	Two or three points of evaluation are made which show supporting reasons/evidence.	<p>Three or four points of evaluation are made which show supporting reasons/evidence.</p> <p>And</p> <p>Clearly refer to parts of the set texts.</p>	<p>Four points of evaluation are made which show supporting reasons/evidence.</p> <p>And</p> <p>Clearly refer to parts of the set texts.</p> <p>And</p> <p>Show a clear interaction between others' ideas and the candidate's own.</p>

Line of argument and conclusion - 9 marks				
0 marks	1-2 marks	3-4 marks	5-6 marks	7-9 marks
No evidence of a sustained line of argument leading to any points of conclusion throughout the response.	<p>The line of argument:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> breaks down or is incoherent. 	<p>The line of argument is:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> largely coherent (there is a link between some of the candidate's points) addresses the question shows evidence of simple reasoning. 	<p>The line of argument is:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> coherent (there is a clear link between most of the candidate's points) addresses the question shows evidence of developed reasoning there is a conclusion which shows some reasoning based on points in the argument. 	<p>The requirements for 6 marks are met.</p> <p>And</p> <p>There is:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a wide range of ideas tying together the candidate's points clear and detailed reference to the prescribed text a conclusion which answers the question and includes a relative judgement about evidence within the prescribed text.

Marking instructions for each question

Section 1 - HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

Part A - Classical Literature

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
1.	<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>To what extent...</i>’ require candidates to <i>evaluate</i> a source.</p> <p>Candidates will use in-depth knowledge and understanding of the aims and/or qualities of classical sources and writers to make a reasoned judgement.</p> <p>Evaluative comments may relate to, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • origin • purpose • content • cultural or historical context. 	10	<p>Possible evaluative points from Source A:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the abilities of the generals were influential eg Nicias is easily fooled • quality of the soldiers is not solely enough to win the war • defenders can much more easily acquire allies than the invaders can • Sparta is able to send reinforcements to shift the balance of power • the generals relied on decisions of the Assembly to coordinate strategy • Athens was sinking its whole army and wealth into a pointless mission • Nicias was left in command unwillingly. <p>Other points which could be made about reasons for failure are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sicilians were better prepared than expected • Syracuse was much bigger than Athenians realised • terrain was unfamiliar • the campaign was not part of Pericles’ plan for the war. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
2.	<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>In what ways...</i>’ require candidates to <i>analyse</i> a source.</p> <p>Candidates will identify different aspects/components of a source and clearly show at least one of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links between different components • links between component(s) and the whole • links between component(s) and related concepts • similarities and contradictions • consistency and inconsistency • different views/interpretations • possible consequences/ implications • the relative importance of components • understanding of underlying order or structure. 	10	<p>Possible analytical points from Source B:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a good ruler rules well when they are able to • there is uncertainty when there is succession • it encourages powerful people to make power grabs or follow their own agendas • the available candidates to succeed are limited • the successors may be much poorer than their predecessor • a family that rules by right can be arrogant and/or cruel • women in the family can influence power. <p>Other points which could be made are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • episodes in the senate emphasise politics operates through flattery • episodes with Nero show that personal problems destabilise government • Drusus is sent to deal with the revolt in Pannonia simply because he is the emperor’s son, even though he is not popular • chosen successors fail to survive long enough to inherit power. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
3.	<p>Questions that ask candidates to 'compare different sources...' require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • explain the content of two or more different sources • make points of comparison between sources. 	15	<p>Possible points for discussion from Source C:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Thucydides highlights his personal involvement from the start • he sees his history as focused on one sequence of events: the war • he sets clearly the starting point for his work • he believes it is worthy to be described, because of its scale • he believes each side was perfectly prepared • he believes all the Greek world was involved • he thinks this is the biggest event in world history that he is aware of • nothing in the past deserves to be written about more than this does. <p>Possible points for discussion from Source D:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Polybius sees his history as focused on one event • he is trying to explain how the whole world came to be dominated by Rome • he believes the process had a clear start and end point, which he is explaining • he will summarise the phases of the process • he sees his history as instructive • he thinks this is the biggest event in world history that he is aware of • nothing in the past deserves to be written about more than this does. <p>Possible points for discussion from other knowledge might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Thucydides' Book 1 is the background and origins of the Peloponnesian War • Thucydides' lack of sources for earlier history • the start of Book 3 is Polybius' account of the background and origins of the Hannibalic War. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
4.	<p>Questions that ask candidates to ‘<i>compare a modern source/quote with classical ideas</i>’ require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • accurately explain the meaning of a modern source/quote • compare the views of the source/quote with classical ideas. 	15	<p>Points for discussion from Source E:</p> <p>History should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • encourage imagination • encourage intellect • tell an account of facts • be filled with adventure and vision • be about character and incident • history is about the drama of human spirit. <p>Possible points for comparison from classical texts might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • dramatic scenes such as in the battles in Livy or Herodotus inspire imagination • Polybius’ analysis of treaties inspires intellectual consideration • speeches in all historians tend to inspire consideration of intellectual arguments • strong story lines are found in Herodotus and Livy especially • the invasion of Hannibal in Polybius shows great adventure • the Sicilian Expedition in Thucydides shows adventure • there are rich characters in Livy and Herodotus and interesting incidents • Tacitus’ history is very character driven with many incidents vividly described • the battle of Thermopylae or the tragic ending to the Sicilian Expedition or the result at Sphacteria capture the drama of human spirit in glory and suffering. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Part B - Classical Society

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
5.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss events described in Book 1 of Herodotus balancing whether they have historical merit or merely work as legends.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>Any individual parts of the book may be discussed with appropriate analysis and evaluation such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Herodotus tries to rationalise actual myths to make them ‘coded’ versions of history to explain the enmity between East and West • story of Candaules and Gyges is probably not necessary for the history of the Persian Wars, but he intends it to show the character of Eastern peoples • Gyges’ rule confirmed by Delphi, gives some legitimacy to the Lydian kingdom • stories of Alyattes (Lydia vs Miletus) are of historical merit • story of Arion is more of a moral tale than history • stories of Croesus are designed to show the role of fate or fortune in history • Persian War with Lydia seems to become more historical • Croesus consulting the Delphic oracle centres the drama in the Greek world • stories of Athenian tyrants sets the background to the Athenians in the same way he set the background to Persians • stories about the origins of Cyrus are designed to explain the power of Persia and its character • many stories in the second half of the book are designed to give an explanation of Babylon and its country • the overall narrative of Book 1 is the origin of conflict between West and East and the rise of Cyrus the Great • Book 1 is designed to introduce the Persian nation, as well as the Athenians and Sparta at the time. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
6.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss the historical advances contained within the stories of the seven kings and their importance.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>Romulus</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • foundation of city • provided the military security needed for the city to grow • creation of sustainable population • origins of governing structure – senate. <p>Numa</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • institution of religious laws • origin of good relation with the gods. <p>Tullus Hostilius</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • conquest of neighbours • unification with Alba Longa. <p>Ancus Marcius</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • military expansion throughout Latium • expansion of the city across Tiber onto Janiculum • foundation of Ostia, linking Rome to the sea. <p>Tarquinius Priscus</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • expanded control over more Latin towns • defeated people beyond Latium • expanded the senate • built the Circus Maximus.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Servius Tullius</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • social reform of the class structure • reformed the army • introduced coinage • formed the Latin League with Rome at its head. <p>Tarquinius Superbus</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • extensive building work inside the city • finished the temple to Jupiter on Capitoline • built sewers • secured the loyalty of Latin towns • made peace with the Etruscans. <p>Other evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • much of the history is speculative/legendary • parallels with Julius Caesar and Augustus may be forced • in reality not many details could be specifically attributed to each king • moral degeneration of kingship leading to the establishment of the Republic • the last three kings were Etruscan. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
7.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers need to discuss events from the battle of Trebia to the battle of Cannae showing how Polybius identifies reasons for Hannibal’s success.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Polybius appears to have placed Hannibal’s camp on the wrong side of the Trebia in his description prior to the battle • Polybius makes clear that the Gauls’ desertion prior to the battle of Trebia led to significant disruption of Roman forces • there is extreme overconfidence among the Romans ‘they need only show themselves on the field of battle to be victorious’ prior to Trebia • Longus felt political pressure to achieve a victory because he was a departing consul • Polybius describes the battle very clearly • illustration of clear description of battle • clearly describes the strategic response of the Roman government to impede Hannibal’s advance and prepare for war • consuls attempt to take him in pincer movement up each side of the Appenines • Hannibal lives in disguise and courts allies • Polybius describes Hannibal’s plan to exploit Flaminius’ rashness • Hannibal made sure he understood the weaknesses of his enemies • Romans still only thought of their own strengths • description of Trasimene trap • Hannibal’s treatment of prisoners • appointment of Fabius was successful for the Romans for a while • Polybius explains the differences between the Roman and Carthaginian armies.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Carthaginian</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a professional army trained for war since adolescence • a general of huge experience • army and general had worked together for years • they had won many battles in Spain • previously defeated Romans in large scale battles • their only hope of escape was victory. <p>Roman</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • militia army of citizens and allies with limited experience • generals sometimes of limited experience • previously suffered huge losses to Carthaginians • victory was not their only hope for survival • description of the Roman trap on plains of Capua • description of Hannibal's escape • how Hannibal took advantage of Minucius • the rejection of Fabian tactics in Rome • character of Paullus and Varro • contrasts indecision and disagreement of consuls with fixed singular plan of Hannibal • very conservative Roman tactics contrast with creative Carthaginian ones • Romans commit everything into an attack based on brute strength. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
8.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss descriptions of events concerning Germanicus and/or Agrippina the Elder and explain whether it idealises them unjustifiably.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ‘Germanicus was the greatest emperor that never was’ in Tacitus’ opinion • Germanicus seems to share Tacitus’ republican views • reference to Germanicus’ father • in settling the mutiny in Germany, Germanicus seems to deal fairly with the soldiers • this is compared with Drusus settling the revolt in Pannonia • the soldiers describe Germanicus as a beloved leader, despite complaining about their treatment and conditions – seems odd • Germanicus sends Agrippina and Caligula away to avoid the danger of the rabble, which seems to imply he was not as beloved as indicated • Germanicus’ speech to the men excludes mention of Tiberius, making Germanicus appear to be the legitimate heir of noble Roman rulers (Tiberius is his uncle who gave him this command) • Germanicus allowed the men to settle the affair, which led to slaughter – then Tacitus claims Germanicus was not responsible for this • if Germanicus did allow the men to settle the mutiny, it would be a risky strategy to allow a rabble control of the camp • Germanicus sends word to the next camp that he will execute the leaders of the mutiny and the men take the law into their own hands there too • Germanicus is successful on the Rhine and Tiberius praises him in the senate, yet Tacitus claims Germanicus was still not being treated fairly • Germanicus is granted a triumph in Rome • Germanicus almost leads the army into disaster on the site of Varus’ massacre

Question			General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agrippina heroically helps to save the day by inspiring the men not to destroy the bridge of escape • Tiberius is said to be annoyed by Germanicus' actions – natural since he almost lost the army for what seems a 'PR stunt' • Germanicus is not criticised for his fairly incompetent withdrawal of the troops • Germanicus escapes by ship, leaving most of the army to march through the marshland to reach safety • Tacitus has an agenda to demonise Tiberius. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Section 2 - INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

Part A - Classical Literature

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
9.	<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>In what ways...</i>’ require candidates to <i>analyse</i> a source.</p> <p>Candidates will identify different aspects/components of a source and clearly show at least one of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links between different components • links between component(s) and the whole • links between component(s) and related concepts • similarities and contradictions • consistency and inconsistency • different views/interpretations • possible consequences/implications • the relative importance of components • understanding of underlying order or structure. 	10	<p>Possible evaluative points from Source A:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plato develops two early cities • the first city meets basic needs, allowing men to survive • Socrates’ followers call this city the ‘city of pigs’, as in their view it is only fit for pigs to live in • in this first city, Plato begins to develop his theory of division of people into groups • this city develops into a second city, which goes beyond basic needs and meets men’s wants rather than just their needs • the source reveals the type of people needed • this city begins to encroach on the land of its neighbours and vice-versa • this requires warriors/guardians. <p>Other points which could be made are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Socrates describes it as a ‘fevered city’ – an early comment on consumerism • Socrates argues that these warriors must be like good guard dogs – they require spirit, to enable them to defend their own people, but they must have self-control so as not to turn on their own people • later these develop into the guardians, who need to be philosophers, as Plato explains later in the ‘Republic’ • the division of labour becomes important in Plato’s socially rigid Republic. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
10.	<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>To what extent...</i>’ require candidates to <i>evaluate</i> a source.</p> <p>Candidates will use in-depth knowledge and understanding of the aims and/or qualities of classical sources and writers to make a reasoned judgement.</p> <p>Evaluative comments may relate to, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • origin • purpose • content • cultural or historical context. 	10	<p>Possible evaluative points from Source B:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristotle is suspicious of democracy as practised in Sparta • Aristotle equates democracy with mob-rule • giving power to poor people can result in bribery as they are more likely to be corrupted • ‘aristocracy’ is a superior system of government • aristocracy for Aristotle means ‘rule of the best’ • however, Aristotle does not rule out democracy altogether, so long as the system elevates the correct people to power • he seems to be prepared to allow people to vote for representatives who are intelligent enough to vote. <p>Other points which could be made are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristotle’s view in this source is not fully representative of his views on democracy • it is important to have a political system which does not give too much power to any part of the constitution – modern day concept of ‘checks and balances’ • later in the Politics he describes the aristocracy as being a leisured, educated, property-owning class • this ensures that they have enough income to avoid being bribed, and enough education to make good decisions • he later states that sometimes it is better to reach decisions collectively, rather than leave power with an individual or a small group • some political offices should be reserved for the poor • if the poor are ignored, they may cause a revolution • famously he uses the analogy that many people can tell when a house is well built, but not build the house themselves – people might be able to judge and decide on their ruler, but not be fit to rule themselves • he seeks a ‘mixed constitution’ which combines some elements of democracy tempered with rule of the ‘aristocracy’. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
11.	<p>Questions that ask candidates to ‘<i>compare different sources...</i>’ require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • explain the content of two or more different sources • make points of comparison between sources. 	15	<p>Possible points for discussion from Source C:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plato argues that it is permissible for the state to lie to individuals • both future rulers and ruled may be deceived • Socrates is ashamed to lie, and seems to understand that it is morally questionable • the deceptions of Plato aim at ensuring the stability of the state • the first one seems to be aimed at convincing rulers that they are born to rule by divine providence • the second one is aimed at persuading the ruled that their rulers are set by divine providence • the ‘noble lie’ remains a problem in Plato’s work and to many tarnishes his image, especially in a book establishing what is justice • to others it suggests that the state is justified, in some circumstances, in lying to its citizens for the greater good. <p>Possible points for discussion from Source D:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cicero provides an example of a statesman proposing a dishonourable act • Cicero uses a real world historical example • it differs from Plato as it involves deceiving another state • Cicero’s example gives the dilemma of a state acting dishonourably to promote its own interest, which is similar to Plato • Cicero concludes that such deception is always unacceptable, and praises the attitude of the Athenians who refuse to even listen to a dishonourable act • Cicero argues that a state would be tarnished by dishonourable action. <p>Possible points for discussion from other knowledge might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • later in the ‘Republic’, Plato advocates deceiving the population over state organisation of reproduction • Cicero later on states that there are moral circumstances when you can break a promise ie when you are deceived • Cicero’s overall point is that it is essential to maintain a good reputation at all costs. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
12.	<p>Questions that ask candidates to ‘<i>compare a modern source/quote with classical ideas</i>’ require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • accurately explain the meaning of a modern source/quote • compare the views of the source/quote with classical ideas. 	15	<p>Points for discussion from Source E:</p> <p>Education:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • is at the core of a state • creates good citizens • provides skills for employability • is a vehicle for social mobility • is for personal fulfilment. <p>Possible points for comparison from classical texts might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plato argues that it must be used to shape the thinking of the guardians • it contributes to his view that rulers must be philosophers • he discusses the importance of key subjects such as music and physical education • he would censor literature (eg tragedy and epic poetry) to ensure that the guardians understood that the gods were perfect • Plato would agree that education should provide skills for employability, but only discusses the education for the ruling elite. He says nothing about the education provided for the other classes of society • Plato would not see education as a vehicle for social mobility; his political system was based on those who did not possess fully developed reason being kept out of power, through if necessary, indoctrination • similarly, Plato would not see education as about personal fulfilment • Plato would agree that people needed to be good citizens – that is the point of the political structure he creates • Plato would ensure that his citizens would understand their responsibilities through the ‘noble lie’. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Part B - Classical Society

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
13.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss aspects of life of rulers and ruled in Plato's Republic.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>Rulers</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • education system: limited in scope; heavy emphasis on music and PE, and censored literature • could not possess property beyond basic means • had to open their homes up to constant inspection to ensure they were not enriching themselves • Adeimantus, Socrates' companion, asks him whether anyone would wish to be a guardian in these circumstances • his reply that the satisfaction of running a well-ordered state is reward enough might seem naïve • rulers would be rulers for life, it was a full-time profession. <p>Ruled</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • would have to accept that they had no political role • would be subject to state direction in their lives • Plato states that they would have to 'mind their own business' – they could not hold their rulers to account • would have to accept being lied to • their children would be taken from them • their sex lives would be regulated by the state • Plato gives them no individual rights to safeguard their freedoms against the power of the state.

Question			General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
					<p>Challenge to the statement</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plato places the establishment of a just state and a just individual at the centre of his polis – this is a noble aspiration • he warns against those who seek power for themselves, or to enrich themselves, as outlined by the sophist Thrasymachus • many of his comments on women seem enlightened • Plato might be correct in understanding that it is wise not to allow just anyone to rule • philosophers might indeed make fine rulers. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
14.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss the significance of nature and natural in Aristotle’s view of society and government.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristotle begins his discussion of the Politics with an attempt to examine what is natural • Aristotle discusses the concept of nature, the natural and biology in other works such as ‘Physics’ • Aristotle’s father was a doctor, and tradition states that he too practised medicine; hence his interest in nature • Aristotle defines what is natural outside politics as the normal and correct state of affairs, which we can see by observing the world around us, and which is organic – it develops by itself • a general approach to key aspects of social and political life are whether they can be found in nature. This is linked to Aristotle’s idea that everything has a purpose (teleological argument) and if it does not have a purpose, it is defective in some way • Aristotle argues that the family unit is natural, as it can be found in the natural world. The family unit is created to ensure reproduction • within the family unit, we also see ‘natural’ states; the male dominates the female and the master the slave, as the male possesses more reason • hence slavery and a male-dominated world are ‘natural’ • Aristotle admits that some slaves should not by nature be slaves, but argues that the institution itself is natural • Aristotle also argues that it is natural that Greeks are superior to other races due to their superior reason • Aristotle states that it is natural to own property as we need property to survive, and we can observe in nature how animals carry food or provide protection for their offspring • candidates may wish to discuss how the term ‘natural’ is seen in a positive light, as opposed to ‘artificial’ – eg marketing of food. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
15.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss Cicero’s argument that there is no need for a politician to ever be dishonourable.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cicero has written the book to prove to his son that there is no conflict between the honourable and the expedient • Cicero outlines the importance of a politician understanding and applying key ethical considerations such as wisdom, justice, magnanimity and propriety • he is providing a way in which politicians may apply philosophical ideas and practices in their conduct • parts of Cicero’s work, such as the determination of a just war, have been admired for the moral position they take, even compared to modern ethical ideas • his aspiration that politicians should always act honourably is an admirable position when contrasted, by example, with Machiavelli • Cicero sees a politician’s reputation as important and their conduct in their personal life as important; many would agree with this general statement • Cicero is trying to promote the idea that participation in public life is honourable in itself • however, as Cicero himself admits, it is not always easy to decide when a course of action is honourable or not for a politician: eg when it is correct to divulge information; is it correct to try to gain popularity by distributing wealth? • Cicero shows how other philosophers disagree on what is honourable in discussing for example property transactions, thus showing the difficulty in making judgements • often Cicero himself takes stances which appear to be morally dubious to modern audiences

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • his keenness to justify the murder of Julius Caesar shows that these judgements might be subjective: the suspicion is that he justifies it as Caesar was a political opponent as much as a morally dubious politician • his insistence that debts must always be paid whatever the consequence might be seen as dishonourable (eg national debt in the developing world, unreasonable extension of credit) • Cicero denies that wealth should be redistributed through taxes • he states that it is not dishonourable to defend a person, even although they are guilty so long as they have a good character • he defends oratory as ‘eloquence’, but is this judgement an oversimplification? • at times, he takes up positions which might be ethically questionable, such as when it is correct to break promises • Cicero discusses how important it is to win ‘glory’, but this must be at times morally questionable • Cicero talks about people who are ‘useful’ and ‘useless’; modern audiences might find these terms distasteful • Cicero’s scope is limited. ‘De Officiis’ is really about the duties a Roman aristocratic politician had to his peers, rather than looking at the structures of society themselves. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
16.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss the types of lesson which problems and solutions in classical writer's work provide.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>Plato</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • discusses the problem of what justice really is • Plato discusses the nature of justice beyond subjective terms, such as paying debts and treating people as they deserve, so that people can benefit from doing just acts • Plato offers a vision of justice which shows people act justly without expecting a reciprocal benefit • by challenging Thrasymachus in Book 1, Plato challenges those who see politics as only a way of benefiting themselves • Plato challenges received wisdom, and offers a radical/utopian vision of how to reframe society, as shown in his ideas about the family • Plato explores how states develop, from meeting the basic needs of its citizens to meeting their wants • Plato explores when a state is justified in misleading or lying to its citizens (the noble lie) and looks at censorship (of undesirable literature) • Plato seeks to examine what characteristics our leaders need and who should be involved in the political process • Plato argues that the correct education of the ruling classes is vital, and that philosophical knowledge, based on reason, is essential • Plato argues that private property is often detrimental to good governance • Plato argues that there is a strong connection between the state and the individual, and that the state can produce a just citizen body (and vice-versa) • Plato points out the flaws in democratic government and challenges assumptions about its superiority.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Aristotle</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristotle seeks to use nature and reason to determine what is appropriate in society • Aristotle seeks to determine what the true purposes of everything in the world is, using this to determine what are appropriate social structures (eg the family) • Aristotle places reason as his key determinate in who should rule • Aristotle defends private property as a key aspect of state stability • overall Aristotle seeks a 'conservative' solution, and often defends existing institutions and beliefs • Aristotle considers three key forms of government (rule by one, rule of a few, rule of the many) • Aristotle is even-handed in his approach to each, commenting on the strengths and weaknesses of each type of government • he concludes that in practice rule by one degenerates into tyranny • he argues for a political system in which the middle classes rule, although he suggests that democratic participation might be useful • Aristotle discusses revolutions, their causes and how to avoid them • like Plato, he places great emphasis on education for the citizen body • Aristotle points out the dangers of demagoguery to a citizen body.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Cicero</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cicero gives a moral code for politicians to follow • he examines the tension between the need to seek popular support and the ethical questions this raises • he believes that it is always possible to remain a successful politician without ethically being compromised • he places the concept of reputation at the heart of his system, arguing that the loss of reputation should at all times be avoided • he synthesises current philosophical thinking into what he views as a working model; thus like both Plato and Aristotle he argues that philosophical reflection is essential for an ethical and effective politician • Cicero argues that it is correct to participate in public affairs, and rejects the Epicurean view that it is best to withdraw into private life • Cicero discusses key concepts such as the ethics of warfare, and when it is correct to slay a tyrant. <p>Candidates may illustrate their answer with contemporary political issues and ideas.</p> <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Section 3 - HEROES AND HEROISM

Part A - Classical Literature

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
17.	<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>To what extent...</i>’ require candidates to <i>evaluate</i> a source.</p> <p>Candidates will use in-depth knowledge and understanding of the aims and/or qualities of classical sources and writers to make a reasoned judgement.</p> <p>Evaluative comments may relate to, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • origin • purpose • content • cultural or historical context. 	10	<p>Possible evaluative points from Source A:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • he doesn’t believe in seers and priests, which could be hubris • he is facing up to his responsibility • he is following the will of the gods • he is carrying out his duty to mourn the dead • he is accepting that fate will determine whether he lives or dies • he is honouring the heroic code by bringing so many gifts • he shows great bravery. <p>Other points which could be made are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • he is very brave in Achilles’ hut • he humbles himself before Achilles in order to get his son back • he has encouraged his sons to fight bravely in the war • he is too old to play the role of hero in the war • when Hector is facing death, he asks him to come back into the city. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
18.	<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>In what ways...</i>’ require candidates to <i>analyse</i> a source.</p> <p>Candidates will identify different aspects/components of a source and clearly show at least one of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links between different components • links between component(s) and the whole • links between component(s) and related concepts • similarities and contradictions • consistency and inconsistency • different views/interpretations • possible consequences/implications • the relative importance of components • understanding of underlying order or structure. 	10	<p>Possible analytical points from Source B:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • women were expected to do the washing • they should be thinking about marriage when they are young • they should try to wear the most attractive clothes that they can • they should care about the reputation they have • they should want to please their parents • they spun yarn and made clothes. <p>Other points which could be made are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • they could be expected to run a household • they could be given as spoils of war • they were at the mercy of men such as Odysseus’ maids or the Trojan women • they should support the heroic exploits of men • they should be faithful. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
19.	<p>Questions that ask candidates to 'compare different sources...' require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • explain the content of two or more different sources • make points of comparison between sources. 	15	<p>Possible points for discussion from Source C:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • heroes were thought to be children of gods • being a child of a god gives him the right to be honoured • fate gave Achilles a short life • he has a right to honour in return for a short life • taking Achilles' prize has dishonoured him • he has no loyalty to his people • gods will help Achilles as a personal favour • the gods determine what happens • Thetis is very sympathetic to Achilles' self-obsessed rage. <p>Possible points for discussion from Source D:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aeneas is also the son of a goddess • Venus does not approve of Aeneas' rage • Aeneas should not put his honour first • he should obey his mother/the gods • he should look after his family • the gods ultimately decide what happens • she mentions he may be afraid to run away and not act as a hero • he should escape from the slaughter. <p>Possible points for discussion from other knowledge might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achilles only returns to fight when he loses Patroclus • Aeneas abandons Dido because of the gods. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
20.	<p>Questions that ask candidates to ‘<i>compare a modern source/quote with classical ideas</i>’ require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • accurately explain the meaning of a modern source/quote • compare the views of the source/quote with classical ideas. 	15	<p>Points for discussion from Source E:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • heroes represent the best of human qualities • anyone can be a hero • heroes can lead nations • heroes can simply be role-models for a few • heroes show courage in the face of problems • heroes help others when they can • women can be heroes. <p>Possible points for comparison from classical texts might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • there are a range of qualities shown by heroes in our texts, but they are characterised as being better than ordinary people • in classical texts only noble characters can be heroes • Agamemnon is not very heroic • Priam does show more heroic qualities • Dido also has led her people well • Odysseus is a role-model for his son • Odysseus and Aeneas both tackle major problems head on and courageously do what needs done • the Trojan women could be seen as heroic in standing up to the suffering they face • Cassandra seizes on the one good thing that can be achieved in her miserable situation • Hecuba and Helen both refuse to simply give in • heroes in the Greek tradition tend not to be trying to help others • Aeneas is trying to help his people, but his main motivation is to be faithful to the gods. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Part B - Classical Society

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
21.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss words and deeds of Odysseus to assess how far he can be considered a) successful and b) an anti-hero.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>Odysseus:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • needs to rely on the help of others • is determined to battle all obstacles • battles against the gods • sleeps with Calypso despite wanting to leave her • can build a raft given the raw materials • can talk respectfully to gain help from others • is merciless when he needs to restore order • shows the proper respect to the gods he encounters • is helped by Athena and Hermes • has endured many misfortunes since Troy • never gives up hope • refuses to give up when Poseidon attempts to drown him • does not abandon hope of seeing his family again • shows guest-friendship respect for Nausicaa • is able to persuade Nausicaa to help him • takes advantage of Nausicaa’s hopes for marriage • is cautious and plans his revenge carefully • carefully recruits trusted allies for the battle • plans the battle ground • ensures that his side has the advantage of weaponry • ensures that the suitors are unarmed when he kills them • fights very bravely against the odds • inspires his son to become heroic • ensures that his wife and the women are shielded from the battle • does not show mercy to any of household who supported the suitors except the minstrel • oversees the punishment of the survivors who had abused his trust. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
22.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss the words and deeds of Aeneas in the context of being a role-model encapsulating Roman values.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Augustus encouraged Virgil to write a national epic • the Roman Empire’s success was based on the values of Aeneas. <p>Aeneas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • is created to be a Roman role model • has a goddess to guide him (Venus) • is always respectful to the gods • fights heroically to defend Troy • resists the temptation to kill Helen when guided by Venus • resists the temptation for a heroic death at Troy • tries to protect his men after the shipwreck • is respectful and is able to gain the aid of Dido • prioritises his responsibility towards <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - his son - his father - his people (nation) - the gods • leaves Dido when he is advised to by Mercury • puts his people’s safety above his heroic honour • inspires Latins to join him – forms alliances • leads military alliances • is loyal to those in alliance • has heroic glory in Book 12 • considers sparing Turnus but acts decisively when he sees Turnus is wearing Pallas’ belt. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
23.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers need to discuss the morality shown in the play. Candidates can answer this philosophically in that there is a morality, it's just not what we would recognise as moral; or they can answer it as if the word morality means 'what we would recognise as decent behaviour'.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the capricious nature of the gods is illustrated in the prologue between Poseidon and Athena • the gods are amoral in a modern sense • for the gods, something is moral if it suits their present wishes • Hecuba makes clear that everything that could be relied on as a moral truth has simply been removed by the war • the women are being sold as slaves like possessions • even the allotment of the women was hypocritical – Talthibius states lots were drawn, then without noticing any contradiction that Agamemnon simply chose whom he wanted • Cassandra was raped by Ajax the Lesser during the sack, which has annoyed Athena because it was in her temple • Polyxena is made a human sacrifice contrary to all normal custom • it is accepted that the victors can take the defeated in any way they like • Cassandra is a virgin dedicated to the gods, but the Greeks do not honour that • Cassandra accepts the 'moral code' more easily than the other women – she is looking forward to the murder of Agamemnon as her victory • the choral song about the Trojan horse reminds us that the war was won through a sacrilegious trick

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the slaughter during the sack is also recounted • Astyanax is murdered to prevent him taking revenge on the Greeks • Andromache says that the life they are left is worse than dying • Andromache suffers so much because she was the wife of a great hero • Menelaus rejoices in his opportunity to hurt Helen while acknowledging that it is Paris who is guilty of wronging him • Hecuba and the women after watching a full play of horrors inflicted on them by the Greek heroes, still blame Helen for their suffering • Helen presents a good argument that she is only a pawn of the gods and does not deserve to be blamed • Menelaus after claiming he would punish Helen, will take her back without punishment • mention of the Athenian treatment of the Melians. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
24.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss references to the heroes in the poems and assess whether a different view of their deeds is being presented.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>Penelope</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • she says that the sack of Troy was not worth the abandonment of her family • she says that the only thanks wives give is that their husbands are still alive, suggesting that heroism is not worth dying for • the destruction of Troy does not provide any tangible good for the family left at home • she points out the pointlessness of warfare since the land of Troy is being farmed and living again – life will always spring up again from destruction • it is the land of the ‘victors’ like Odysseus, who have not made it home, which is left untended and barren • any illustration with reference to the ‘unwarlike’ family left behind at the mercy of the suitors • his absence has stolen Penelope’s best years as well: she is left an aged woman now • credit can be given for comparison with Penelope in the Odyssey. <p>Briseis</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • her perspective is as a war captive/slave • she criticises Achilles for failing to protect her/letting Agamemnon take her • she criticises his wish to value his honour above the apologies of Agamemnon because it meant she was not protected • illustration of her weakness in her begging to be taken away to work, as a slave as long as he takes her with him • she argues that softening pride for the sake of love is better than the old heroic stubbornness • credit can be given for comparison with Briseis in the Iliad.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Dido</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • she calls Aeneas a traitor in Virgil and Ovid • she does not think that it is heroic to head into the unknown • she believes he will betray another woman in Italy just as he has done with her • she questions whether he behaved as a hero in the sack of Troy since he left Creusa to die alone • she says his sense of duty to his family made her believe he'd be dutiful to her • credit can be given for comparison with Dido in the Aeneid. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Section 4 - COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

Part A - Classical Literature

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
25.	<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>To what extent...</i>’ require candidates to <i>evaluate</i> a source.</p> <p>Candidates will use in-depth knowledge and understanding of the aims and/or qualities of classical sources and writers to make a reasoned judgement.</p> <p>Evaluative comments may relate to, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • origin • purpose • content • cultural or historical context. 	10	<p>Candidates should evaluate whether Aristophanes’ depiction is accurate or inaccurate.</p> <p>Points from Source A:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • that Socrates had a school – Socrates unlike other philosophers, such as Plato, never opened a school • that Socrates taught for money – Socrates did not teach for money and criticised those who did – such as the Sophists • that Socrates taught the wrong argument – Socrates is being depicted as a stereotypical Sophist • that Socrates was not a sophist for hire and there is no evidence to suggest that he supported this style of education • that Socrates was interested in winning legal cases, there is no evidence to suggest that Socrates had experience of winning legal cases in Athens. <p>Other points which could be made are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristophanes did not intend his depiction of Socrates to be accurate • Socrates was chosen by Aristophanes as he was an Athenian and relatively well known in Athens as a philosopher • it suited the comic requirement of satirising public figures to embody them in a single recognisable character • Aristophanes’ representation of Socrates is a composite of Sophists and Natural Philosophers • Socrates is never shown doing the type of philosophy that he was famous for – does not talk about moral philosophy

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Socrates may deny that he is a Sophist, but the common view of Athenians would have seen him in this way • the sources suggest that Socrates has skill in debating, this is accurate as his philosophical approach focused on drawing out ideas, cross examining and offering counter arguments • Aristophanes' physical depiction of Socrates was accurate, he did walk barefoot, and he was fairly ugly and unkempt • the overall idea is that Socrates is poor and again this matches with the evidence. Socrates was not interested in wealth or material possessions • many Athenians saw philosophers as useless layabouts who corrupted the youth with new ideas that threatened to break down the traditions that defined their society • Aristophanes has produced a comedy to win a dramatic festival • his work is a piece of fiction and although it provides excellent social commentary of Athens in the 5th century BC, it must always be remembered that he was not a social historian. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question		General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
26.		<p>Questions that begin ‘<i>In what ways...</i>’ require candidates to <i>analyse</i> a source.</p> <p>Candidates will identify different aspects/components of a source and clearly show at least one of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links between different components • links between component(s) and the whole • links between component(s) and related concepts • similarities and contradictions • consistency and inconsistency • different views/interpretations • possible consequences/implications • the relative importance of components • understanding of underlying order or structure. 	10	<p>Possible candidate analysis of the ways Horace demonstrates his view:</p> <p>Points from Source B:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • those who understand that you need to keep your body healthy through simple exercise lead better lives • they understand that by working up an appetite they will derive the pleasure that food is supposed to give by nourishing the body • the man who overeats becomes unhealthy and fat, food in this case is having the opposite effect to the healthy man who exercises. It will ultimately cause health related damage and pain to the man who pursues the life of luxury rather than pleasure • he is suggesting that those who consistently eat food which is expensive, and is supposed to be a treat, deprive themselves of the pleasure that the food should bring • by overindulging in something that was once pleasurable they have numbed themselves to the enjoyment and comfort it could bring • the man derives the most pleasure from the food consumed as a treat as it is something truly enjoyed on occasion and not excessively consumed • Horace is suggesting that if the fortunes of the man who has excessively enjoyed a life of luxury were to change he would not be well equipped to cope with the problems he faces.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Other points which could be made are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Horace is using both Epicureanism and Stoic philosophy to support his view, that a life led simply is better than one given over to luxury • philosophy supported the avoidance of any excessive behaviour as it always resulted in suffering, to live a truly happy life people had to be moderate in everything they did. Defined as the golden mean – the desirable middle point between two extremes • the final lines support a Stoic view on life that the man who recognises what is truly important in life needs little to be happy and this happiness cannot be affected by external factors • in Satire 2.2 the pursuit of the golden mean is again demonstrated by contrasting excessive overconsumption of luxury food with simple diet • in Satire 2.2 the character Ofellus is also introduced to further show Horace’s view that a life led simply is better than life given over to luxury • the ways in which Horace demonstrates that the simple life is better than one given over to luxury is discussed in his other satires with the support of further Epicurean doctrine for example in: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Satire 2.4 – Reinforcement of the golden mean - Satire 2.6 – The contrast between the lives of the country and city mouse. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
27.	<p>Questions that ask candidates to 'compare different sources...' require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • explain the content of two or more different sources • make points of comparison between sources. 	15	<p>Possible points for discussion from Source C:</p> <p>Aristophanes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • depicts women's lives as being centred on the home • depicts women as having no part to play in governing Athens • depicts women as having a religious role • depicts women as adulterers and wine-drinkers • the rights, duties and constraints on women as wives and housekeepers in Athens in the 5th century BC • their lack of involvement in the wider society and government of Athens in the 5th century BC • the important religious role of women in Athens in the 5th century BC • the stereotypical depictions of women are being used by Aristophanes for comic purposes, not as an accurate reflection of how women behaved. <p>Possible points for discussion from Source D:</p> <p>Juvenal:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • depicts the importance of women for producing heirs • depicts women as being married • women as adulterers • depicts women as having a religious role • women as being morally depraved • the rights, duties and constraints on women as wives in Rome in 1st century AD • the Lex Julia, its purpose and its impact on marriage • the important religious role of women in Rome in the 1st century AD • the stereotypical depictions of women being used by Juvenal for satirical purposes not as an accurate reflection of how all women behaved. Often creates types and refers to mythology to prove his points • Juvenal also refers to historical characters to provide some proof for his depiction of women later in the satire: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Messalina line 115 - Agrippina line 620 - Pontia line 638.

Question			General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
					<p>Possible points for discussion from other knowledge might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristophanes depicts women as important contributors to society, taking care of the efficient management of the home • Juvenal attacks other aspects of women in society eg education • Aristophanes was a traditionalist who uses his play to criticise social ideas expressed by Plato which would have threatened the value of family life if carried out in Athens. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
28.	<p>Questions that ask candidates to <i>'compare a modern source/quote with classical ideas'</i> require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> accurately explain the meaning of a modern source/quote compare the views of the source/quote with classical ideas. 	15	<p>Points for discussion from Source E:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> all politicians are corrupt being powerful requires being corrupt corrupt people are more successful in government corrupt people will do things that moral people wouldn't corrupt people are self-seeking. <p>Possible points for comparison from classical texts might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aristophanes' attitude is that some contemporary politicians are corrupt as seen in the depiction of Cleon as the Paphlagonian the character of the Sausage-Seller, who can only succeed politically by behaving worse than the Paphlagonian the depiction of Nicias and Demosthenes as moral politicians who cannot succeed against the corrupt Paphlagonian Aristophanes describes the immoral qualities that are required to achieve political success <ul style="list-style-type: none"> pander to the people intimidate bribery lie fraud the Sausage-Seller restores the people to its senses despite being supposedly corrupt the system of direct democracy used by the Athenians suggests they did not believe that political involvement led to corruption, as citizens were encouraged and were required to be as active in the government of Athens in the Acharnians the behaviour of the politically corrupt ambassadors and council is exemplified the ambassadors lie to the assembly for personal gain in the Peace, Pericles and Cleon are criticised as demagogues and warmongers. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Part B - Classical Society

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
29.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss the unrealistic political ideas which attempt to create a utopia.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristophanes’ intention to mock ideas that are in Plato’s Republic and his proposals for an ideal state • a discussion of the impossibility of the creation of the ideal state eg one man’s heaven, another man’s hell • discussion of the problems with the play, particularly the ending, and how this affects our analysis • Athens has lost the Peloponnesian War • Athens’ democracy has been overthrown and restored, but is now weakened • Athens is impoverished due to the loss of its empire • candidates may further discuss the question by making comparisons between the proto-communist model proposed by Praxagora and the communist societies of the present and past eg USSR. <p>Candidates should analyse Praxagora’s proposals for an Ideal State:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • to share everything equally • to reject ownership of property, privacy and individualism • to remove the family unit • to sexually share people results in forced sexual relations • to make men redundant • Praxagora becomes all powerful. Presumption that she is infallible and all knowing • only possible with the use of slaves • only the poor, old and ugly truly benefit from this society • Praxagora’s society only looks after the physical needs of Athens, everything else is ignored.

Question			General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
					<p>Aristophanes makes clear the society will fail through the following characters:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the Citizen who does not have faith in Praxagora's proposals and does not want to give up his property • Aristophanes is posing the question what will happen to people who do not want to participate in the new regime • the Young Man, Young Woman and the Three Hags. This scene results in forced sexual relations between the Young Man and the Three Hags. This causes misery to the Young Man, misery and rape cannot be part of an Ideal Society. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
30.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss whether Horace successfully makes the reader pay attention to the following societal issues in Roman society.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>Greed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in Satire 1.1 Horace uses the character of the miser to demonstrate Rome’s obsession with wealth and the dangers of extreme behaviour • the wealthy miser will not spend his money and this leads to a poorer life and is hated more than most. <p>Lust</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in Satire 1.2 Horace highlights the issues surrounding male sexual infatuation and the increase in adultery in Roman society • he addresses the issues of losing a good name, wealth and the physical dangers of being caught as an adulterer. <p>Parasitic Behaviour</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in Satire 1.9 Horace makes clear the issue surrounding the behaviour of the socially ambitious, they are prepared to use any immoral means to get closer to power and privilege • the leech in the Satire 1.9 has nothing to offer Maecenas, but still believes he should be allowed access and opportunity to improve his social standing • in Satire 2.5 Horace uses an impoverished Odysseus to simulate the behaviour of legacy hunters in Rome • in Satire 2.5 Tiresias acts as Odysseus’ advisor and instructs him in all manner of immoral behaviours to gain access to the wills of the wealthy, including flattery, lies and even prostituting Penelope. Again the desire for wealth is seen as corrupting.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Extravagant Living:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Satire 2.2 contrasts the lives of the excessively rich with that of the countryman. He highlights the dangers for the individual of doing so • Satire 2.6 another contrast between the dangers given over to a life of luxury compared to the simple life. Horace uses his own experience and the fable of the town and city mouse to make clear that a life led modestly is better • each time the vice is explored, exemplified and followed with advice on how to lead a better life. <p>The Quest for Peace Of mind:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • many Romans were no longer satisfied with the answers proffered by the state religion and turned to philosophy for guidance on how to lead a better life and gain peace of mind • Horace repeats the message of Epicurean moderation as being the key to happiness. He produces a clear philosophical message of Epicureanism throughout his satires. <p>The Patron-Client System:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in Satire 1.6 the workings and benefits of the Patron-Client system is made clear. Horace as client to Maecenas owes his current lifestyle and status to him. <p>Social Reform and Augustus:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Horace's Satires focus on teaching men how they should behave and making clear the behaviours that should be avoided. This was in line with Augustus' plans for the social reform of Rome. Horace's views would support Augustus' plans to encourage morality in Rome.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Horace fails to address the social issues of his time:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Horace does not in any significant way address the civil wars, or any of the events that surrounded them, that led to the breakdown of the Republic and the rise of imperial Rome • Horace does not in any significant way address Augustus and his rise to power in Rome • Horace does not address in any significant way the social issues that affected the poor or women in society, he wrote for the upper class male elite • Horace does not address the empire of Rome • the political circumstances that he writes in are not conducive to political criticism. Augustus had shown he was ruthless at removing those he perceived as a threat eg proscriptions. He cannot truly address the issues of his own time without endangering his life • he cannot address any major social issues he instead deals with the behaviour of the individual. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
31.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss how far Juvenal's attitudes to Roman society are negative and ignore the benefits of living in Rome.</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>Juvenal's background</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • possibility Juvenal suffered under Domitian • Rome has suffered under several corrupt emperors since transforming into an imperial power eg Tiberius, Caligula, Nero • Juvenal refers to historical events and people to prove his point, but they are from the past, he provides none from his own time • the patron-client system is no longer necessary and people like Juvenal, the entitled but impoverished middle class, suffer as a result. <p>Rome as a dangerous and corrupting place to live as suggested by Juvenal in:</p> <p>Satire 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Juvenal describes the world of Rome as he sees it • we see Rome through the eyes of someone who is being jostled in the streets of Rome • a pedestrian who is swept aside by attendants of corrupt rich men, who has to step aside to let a successful and well known forger pass on a litter, who can stand at every busy street corner and count the crooks and the murderers who have risen to wealth while he is poor • the patron client system no longer functions as it should. Greedy patrons no longer look after their clients • he is compelled by what he sees to write Satire and address the negative aspects of Roman society.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Satire 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • deals with hypocrisy and the corrupt nature of Roman society • people pretend to be moral but in fact often participate in the acts they publicly criticise • moral corruption as a result of a decadent society, the old Romans of the past, (Aeneas and the Gracchi), would fail to recognise the men who now call themselves Roman • sees Rome as an infectious sickness that corrupts those with which it comes in contact • suggestion that the countryside is not as dangerous or as corrupt as Rome. <p>Satire 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Juvenal depicts Umbricius who explains why he is leaving Rome, because it is dangerous and corrupt • Juvenal makes clear the dangers of living in Rome as a poor man: fire, collapsing houses, squalor, lack of sleep due to noise, traffic accidents, falling tiles and attacks by thugs • Roman identity has been diluted with other cultures. Juvenal shows xenophobic attitudes towards the Jews and Greeks, blaming them for much of the corruption of Roman society • Umbricius cannot succeed as he is not corrupt, there is no place for him as he 'is a hopeless liar'. Juvenal has the Greeks and other foreigners surpass Umbricius in immoral tricks which guarantee them success • a good name and family count for nothing, your worth is determined by your wealth. This enables the wealthy to abuse the courts and manipulate verdicts • rents are too high and standards of living too low • everything is for sale in Rome and if you have no money to buy you cannot succeed • the country is idealised as being a simpler and more moral place to live as a contrast to Juvenal's Rome.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Satire 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the subject is a dinner provided by a rich Patron Virro • those who are invited in friendship are treated well, but those invited out of duty are ignored by the guests and slaves and they are fed sub-standard food and wine • the satire was written to further emphasise the corruption and decay of the traditions that held Patron and Client together • the continual contrasts between the rich and poor dinner guests serves to illustrate the greater problems in Roman society outside the dining room • the suggestion is that imperial Rome is a corruption of its past self. <p>Satire 6</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • women are seen as dangerous and corrupt members of Roman society • candidates should acknowledge that Juvenal’s depiction is extreme and even when presented with a moral woman like the mother of the Gracchi he still rejects her • they are not chaste and are adulterers like Eppia who ran away with a gladiator and Messalina, the wife of Claudius • they no longer fulfil their roles as good mothers. They kill their children, they hand them over to slaves and are shown as being a bad influence on their daughters • women are particularly vulnerable to the effects of wealth, will corrupt themselves for money. Wealth also gives them a new freedom that has led to their moral corruption • Juvenal also attacks men who marry for money • Juvenal also feels that women have become more masculine and are corrupted by the education they now have access to • Juvenal is following a long-standing literary tradition of misogyny showing women as completely different from men ie in their eyes worse • Juvenal’s real target is Roman decline and Juvenal believes this was caused by the corrupting influence of wealth and he uses women to exemplify this idea.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Satire 9</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the male prostitute, Naevolus and his relationship with a wealthy Roman called Virro represent for Juvenal the corruption of Roman society • everything the prostitute and Virro do is convertible into cash or real property • therefore, they are both characters ruined by money and material wealth • Virro also represents the hypocrisy that Juvenal believes exists in society. Publicly Virro is a respectable married man with children, but Naevolus reveals that they are his children • Naevolus talks with no shame and feels as though he has been cheated, despite not working in a moral manner. <p>Juvenal does not acknowledge any of the benefits of living in Rome:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • aqueducts and sanitation • roads bringing in goods from all over the empire • social mobility if you are willing to work, unlike Juvenal who would see it as a form of slavery • entertainment – amphitheatre, theatre, Circus Maximus, the baths • security from invasion • corn dole • education • Hadrian. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
32.	<p>These questions require candidates to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analyse • evaluate • synthesise points into a line of argument. 	25	<p>Answers should discuss events and plots in Aristophanes comedies showing the political problems facing Athenian society in 5th century BC.</p> <p>Candidates may use the comedies of Aristophanes to make clear the following political problems, these points should be further developed with reference to historical context:</p> <p>Possible points for discussion may include:</p> <p>The Acharnians</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the Peloponnesian War • the suffering caused by the war • the weaknesses within the democratic system • political corruption. <p>The Knights</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the weaknesses of the democratic system • the power of demagogues • focus on Cleon as a dangerous political leader, the character of the Paphlagonian • increased hostility towards Athens from Delian League allies • the Peloponnesian War and the capture of the Spartans at Pylos • political corruption. <p>Peace</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the suffering caused by war • divisions between cities in Greece • political corruption.

Question	General marking principles for this type of question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p>Assembly Women</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the after-effects of losing the war with Sparta • inconsistency in government • an impoverished Athens after the loss of her empire. <p>Aristophanes' plays do not make clear the problems:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristophanes' plays represent his opinion on the problems that faced Athens, this does not mean that this was the opinion of the wider citizen body eg the citizens supported Cleon until his death at Amphipolis • Aristophanes' plays are comedies, they exaggerate and caricature, they cannot be taken always as an accurate record of events. Candidates should discuss the historical context of the time to make clear where Aristophanes teaches us about his society and where he fails to provide a clear picture eg the discussion of the Megarian Decree in the Acharnians and Peace • Aristophanes fails to touch on many of the problems facing Athens, for example the plague, and the conflicts with the allies. <p>Any other reasonable point.</p>

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]