

## Candidate 1 evidence

**How fully does Source A explain the reasons why there were difficulties in the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I, 1292–1296?**

2. Source A only partly explains the reasons for the difficulties in the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I.

Source A states, 'On 26 December the new king of Scots knelt before the king of England saying, 'Lord Edward, lord superior to the realm of Scotland, I, John Balliol, king of Scots, pay homage for the realm of Scotland.'" This shows that John Balliol, soon after his coronation as

king of Scots, was forced to kneel before Edward and swear fealty. This meant that John was seen as inferior to Edward as he swore loyalty to another king who was both literally and physically above him- this would have been humiliating for John.

Source A also states, 'A week later John released Edward from all the promises he made between 1286 and 1292, and specifically from the terms of the Treaty of Birgham.' This shows that John was forced to free Edward from the Treaty of Birgham which was put in place during the Maid of Norway's reign in order to ensure that England could not invade nor subjugate Scotland. With these measures gone, Edward was free to take over John's country if he pleased.

Source A also states, 'However, the Macduff case exposed the limitations of the new kingship as well as when Macduff complained to Edward, now John's superior lord, the case became a test of Edward's overlordship.' This shows that John's subjects now went to Edward over him if they did not like his judgement as John now answered to Edward, and Edward was able to overrule John's decision in a move that humiliated John.

Finally, Source A states, 'The Scottish king was summoned to Edward's court in late September 1293, and while John was used to such summonses as a baron, it was unprecedented for a Scottish king to be treated in this fashion.' This shows that Edward treated John as an inferior subject, and not as a king as he was able to dictate John's movements and humiliate him.

However, source A fails to mention the Burgess of Berwick, a legal case prior to that of MacDuff where another of John's subjects appealed to Edward as John's overlord and Edward undermined John by changing his decision, subsequently causing difficulties in their relationship.

Source A also fails to mention the Auld Alliance, or the Treaty of Paris, where Edward demanded Scottish troops in a fight against France. John refused and went behind Edward's back to form an alliance with King Phillip of France as they were strong trading partners. This enraged Edward because he believed that as John's overlord, he had full right to demand Scottish troops and John had humiliated him by refusing.

Source A also fails to mention the Sack of Berwick, when English troops invaded Scotland via Berwick and massacred the town as punishment for the Auld Alliance, killing thousands. This was to show John exactly what happened when he disobeyed Edward, and John's subjects had to pay the price whilst their king fled in terror of Edward.

Source A also fails to mention the Battle of Dunbar, where English troops and Scottish troops fought following the Sack of Berwick as John fled from Edward. Edward was enraged by John's defiance and was determined to track him down.

Source A fails to mention that when Edward caught up to John, he stripped his coat of royal regalia and the Royal Seal, denouncing him as king in front of his court. This humiliated John and earned him the nickname of, 'Toom Tabard,' or 'Empty Coat.'

Source A fails to mention that John abdicated in a letter where he publicly announced regret for his actions and swore fealty to Edward once more in 1296, begging for Edward's mercy in an act that was humiliating for a Scottish king.

Finally, Source A fails to mention that Edward imprisoned John in the Tower of London following his capture before exiling him to France, kicking the Scottish king out of his own country in one final act of humiliation.

## Candidate 2 evidence

How fully does Source A explain the experience of immigrants in Scotland?

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION		DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
14)	Source A fully explains the experience of immigrants in Scotland to a certain extent.	
	However, Source A fails to mention that many Lithuanian's changed their surname. This shows experiences of immigrants in Scotland as it portrays how many Lithuanian's changed their names in order to more quickly assimilate & also to avoid any discrimination from Scots. An example would be Bernotaitis becoming Brown.	
	However, Source A also fails to mention that there were many Catholic organisations founded in Scotland. This shows experience of immigrants in Scotland as these organisations were created to provide Irish	



ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION		DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	catholics with a community in their new country. A support network of likeminded people going through the same struggle. A good example is Brother Walfrid founding Celtic FC in 1888.	
	However, Source A also fails to mention that Italian immigrants were hated by the Presbyterian Church. This shows experience of immigrants in Scotland as Italians were disliked by many Protestants, as their businesses remained open on a Sunday, the Sabbath Day, which is supposed to be a day of rest.	
	However, Source A also fails to mention that Italians were in fact liked by many Scots, as they provided a	

valuable service. This shows experience of immigrants in Scotland as Italians made huge contributions to the ever growing leisure industry in Scotland, by opening their famed fish & chips shops & gelaterias.

However, Source A also fails to mention that the Church of Scotland publicly shamed Irish Catholics. This shows experience of immigrants in Scotland as in 1923, the Church released a pamphlet entitled: 'The Menace of the Irish race to our Scottish nationality.'

However, Source A fails to mention that the Irish were perceived as dirty. This shows experience of immigrants

in Scotland as across the country there was a growing stereotype that the Irish were dirty & lazy & drunk. Across many parts of Scotland, typhus became known as 'Irish fever'.

However, Source A also fails to mention that Jews tended to settle in Glasgow, & work in 'sweated trades'.

This shows experience of immigrants in Scotland as the widespread approach of the Scottish-Jewish community was to remain in close, tight-knit communities in places like the Gorbals or ~~Heaton~~ Newton Mearns.

Source A does state: 'The visibility of the Irish in

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>Scottish society was significantly increased by their tendency to concentrate in mining areas where the Irish played a key role in trade union activity, which improved working conditions. This shows experience of immigrants in Scotland as the Irish immigrants became heavily involved in coal mining trade unions, attempting to improve wages &amp; conditions for them &amp; their Scottish colleagues, winning some of their Scots colleagues' favour &amp; respect.</p>
	<p>Source A also states: 'Communities of people of Irish descent grew up in boom towns like Airdrie, Coatbridge &amp; Motherwell where intermarriage with local protestants became common. This shows experience of immigrants in Scotland as it</p>

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>highlight in areas with newly large Catholic communities, integration with their Protestant neighbours became more common. This is shown through regular marriage across religious lines in these areas.</p>
	<p>Source A also states: "A minority of all immigrants were Protestant, who were much more easily assimilated in Scotland than the Catholic Irish. This shows experience of immigrants in Scotland as those with the same faith as Scots were assimilated &amp; accepted quicker than Catholics, highlighting the level of discrimination in Scotland at the time.</p>

## Candidate 3 evidence

How fully does Source A explain the domestic impact of the Great War on Scottish society and culture?

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION		DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
14.	Source A explains the domestic impact of the great war on Scottish society and culture to a limited extent.	
	Source A says "However, in 1915 the Tenants across the city started a sustained protest against increases in their rents imposed by their Landlords" This shows that full scale, determined rent strikes began in 1915 and persisted.	
	Source A also says "Defiant notices were put up in the windows across the city with the message "Rent strikes against increases. were not Removing." This shows that the strikers were stubborn in their stance, refusing to remove and standing their ground.	
	Source A also says "The single entrances to the tenements in Dundee meant they could be used to make the flats a fortress to defend the strikers". This shows the extreme lengths strikers were willing to go to to achieve their goal, becoming	



ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	almost militant
	Source A also says "It was further reported that householders in various properties and streets had been combining to refuse to pay the increase expressing their determination to oppose removal." This shows that many tenants became united against the rent rises and used this to their advantage.
	Source A fails to mention Women in Munitions. By late 1917, 90% of Munitions workers were women, with 9000 being employed at Gretna alone
	Source A fails to mention George Square riots. The raising of the red flag in Glasgow's George Square led to fear of a Bolshevik rising and the arrest of leaders of red Clydeside such as Willie Gallacher.
	Source A fails to mention Pacifism. The ILP's membership trebled during the war as pacifism and general opposition to the war continued to grow

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION		DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	Source A fails to mention Women in Medical Support. Dr Elsie Inglis proposed the idea of front line hospitals and was a key player in the Scottish Womens Medical Committee, which sent 1000 female nurses and orderlies to European Warzones, all of whom were brave Volunteers like Mairi Chisholm.	
	Source A fails to mention <del>the</del> The success of rent strikes. The strikers won, as their strikes impacted war production so they gained trade union support and frustrated Landlords. This led to the Rents restriction Act which froze rent at 1914 levels unless improvements were made to the property.	
	Source A fails to mention Dilution of work. Strict rules agreed with trade Unions were "Diluted", allowing skilled work to be broken down into individual processes for unskilled women to complete	





## Candidate 4 evidence

How much do Sources B and C reveal about differing interpretations of the relationship between the Crown and the Kirk in the later part of the reign of James VI, 1585–1603?

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION		DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
7	<p>The overall view of Source B is that there was a very difficult &amp; tense relationship between Crown &amp; Kirk in the later part of James VI reign.</p> <p>Source B states "strained relations were clear &amp; recurrent, most notably over the King's unwillingness to enforce anti-catholic laws or take action against catholic nobles." This shows that the James demonstrated some sympathy towards Catholics by not doing anything to prevent them from practicing, or punishing them. This created difficulty between crown &amp; Kirk as the Kirk were angry with James's catholic <del>sym</del> sympathies, they felt he should only be supportive of the Kirk &amp; actively forbid and take action against Catholicism.</p> <p>Source B also states "Furthermore, in 1587 the Kirk refused to take action against two ministers that James wanted to be punished because they did not say prayers for Mary, Queen of Scots before her execution that year."</p>	



ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	Supremacy over the Kirk which angered them.
	Source also states "James also took more control over the management of General Assemblies of the Kirk; from 1597 to 1603 he attended every General Assembly." This shows that James was striving to have more control over the Kirk by making sure the Kirk didn't meet without his presence. This maintained his authority as the General Assemblies gradually became more agreeable to his aims, <del>however</del> however this angered some members of the Kirk worsening their relationship.
	However, the source fails to mention other reasons <del>for the diff</del> which led to a difficult relationship between Kirk & crown in the later part of James's reign.
	The source doesn't mention that in 1597, James deposed Andrew Melville as rector of St Andrews. Melville was a harsh critic of James & this was a purposeful act from James to assert his dominance. This worsened the relationship between crown & Kirk.

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>The source fails to mention that in 1597, a hot sermon preached against the King led to riots. James had the ministers of <sup>in Edinburgh</sup> Edinburgh briefly imprisoned &amp; stated that no minister should be appointed without his approval. This created a difficult relationship between crown &amp; Kirk by antagonising the Kirk.</p>
	<p>The source doesn't mention that in 1592, parliament passed the Golden Acts which allowed recovery of presbyteries but did not reduce the powers of the King. <del>Thus James</del> Despite James attempts to extend his powers over the Kirk angered them.</p>
	<p>The source doesn't mention that James believed bishops should be part of the Kirk and that he should appoint them. This is known as episcopalianism. James reinstated 3 bishops in 1600. This frustrated the Kirk who saw Bishops as a symbol of Catholic corruption.</p>
	<p>The source doesn't mention James's book</p>





## Candidate 5 evidence

Evaluate the usefulness of Source D as evidence of the political effects of the Union, up to 1740.

12	Source D says "Our rightful and natural King James, who, by the grace of God, is now coming to relieve us from our oppressions of the Hanoverian Succession and it is now the time for us to fight to restore him." This is useful as it shows a political effect of the union was continued Jacobite	
----	---	--

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION		DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>opposition from those loyal to <del>the</del> James II who felt the union betrayed Scottish independence and <del>the</del> the Stuart dynasty leading to many rebellions.</p> <p><del>There were</del></p>	
	<p>Source D also says "Now I am persuaded the Union has no benefit for Scotland, and his Majesty's thoughts are shared with our cause for he is deeply concerned about the failure to repeal the Union in the House of Lords." This is useful as it shows a political effect of the union was the attempt to reverse the union in 1713 which was supported by all Scottish representatives and lost by 4 votes <del>proving</del> proving how many people were unhappy with the union.</p>	
	<p>Source D is less useful as it fails to mention the loss of political power as 45 Scottish representatives <del>there</del> were sent to the house of commons and 16 were sent to the house of lords.</p>	



ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>With most decision making taking place in London showing that a political effect of the union was a lack of Scottish control and limitations on Scottish say in decision making.</p>
	<p>Source D is less useful as it fails to mention the stricter beacon laws placed on Scotland in 1709 showing a political effect of the union was changes to Scotland's legal system that England promised would remain independent checking all ranks and further proving the idea that Scotland would be ruled not represented.</p>
	<p>Source D is less useful as it fails to mention the <del>abolition</del> abolition of the privy council in 1708 which dealt with many of Scotland's affairs showing a political effect of the union was reduced Scottish control over their affairs, and more English dominance.</p>

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>Source D is a letter to Jacobite supporters <del>which</del> which is useful as it shows open, uncensored opinions about Jacobite <sup>views</sup> of the political effects following the Union, up to 1740.  → not in support of the Union,</p>
	<p>Source D was written in 1715 this is useful as it was just before the Jacobite rebellion proving that people were unhappy with the political effects of the Union only 8 years after it passed showing the immediate effects.</p>
	<p>Source D was written by the Earl of Mar this is useful as the Earl of Mar <del>was a Jacobite supporter</del> <del>and lost his position in the Scottish Secretary position</del> <sup>and</sup> led the 1715 Jacobite Rebellion showing the point of view of someone <del>against the Union</del> who switched sides after the political effects of the Union.</p>

## Candidate 6 evidence

Evaluate the usefulness of Source D as evidence of the impact of the empire on Scotland, to 1939.

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
16	
Source D is quite useful as evidence of the impact of the empire on Scotland.	
Source D states: 'Mr Robertson observed that the principal imports carried by the Middlesex to Glasgow were lamb, butter, cheese, fruit, honey & wool'. This shows impact of the empire on Scotland as imperial connections allowed Scotland to gain access to food & goods it couldn't have been able to before.	
Source D also states: 'The Lord Provost said that the Empire was very aware of their national & imperial trading links which were to the financial benefit of the market traders of Glasgow & would lead to an increase in trade	



ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION		DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>Scots had the chance to go to places like India &amp; work as soldiers, civil servants or doctors. All expanding the horizons of middle class Scots.</p>	
	<p>However, the Source also fails to mention that the Empire encouraged martial tradition in Scotland. This <del>is important</del> shows impact of empire on Scotland as Scottish soldiers especially from the Highlands, were adored for defending the empire, wearing proudly Scottish tartan. This created the impression that Scots were brave &amp; <del>very</del> loyal warriors.</p>	
	<p>Source D was written likely by a New Zealander journalist. This is useful as New Zealand is an empire nation,</p>	

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION		DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>           B Therefore the author will be aware of the basic workings of the Empire. The author is also a journalist, meaning what's written is likely factual &amp; accurate.         </p>	
	<p>           Source D is a New Zealand newspaper. This is useful as the information is likely to be accurate &amp; factual, while also coming from a source within the Empire, increasing its reliability.         </p>	
	<p>           Source D was written in 1932. This is useful as this was still during a period of high pan-empire trade, <del>which means</del> where there was still close connection between places like Glasgow, &amp; New Zealand.         </p>	