



National
Qualifications

X849/77/11

Modern Studies

Marking Instructions

Please note that these marking instructions have not been standardised based on candidate responses. You may therefore need to agree within your centre how to consistently mark an item if a candidate response is not covered by the marking instructions.

General marking principles for Advanced Higher Modern Studies

Always apply these general principles. Use them in conjunction with the detailed marking instructions, which identify the key features required in candidates' responses.

- (a) Always use positive marking. This means candidates accumulate marks for the demonstration of relevant skills, knowledge and understanding; marks are not deducted for errors or omissions.
- (b) If a candidate response does not seem to be covered by either the principles or detailed marking instructions, and you are uncertain how to assess it, you must seek guidance from your team leader.
- (c) Where a candidate does not comply with the rubric of the paper and answers three, 30 mark questions in one section, mark all responses and record the better mark.
- (d) Marking must be consistent. Never make a hasty judgement on a response based on length, quality of handwriting or a confused start.
- (e) Use the full range of marks available for each question.
- (f) The detailed marking instructions are not an exhaustive list. Award marks for other relevant points.
- (g) Award marks only where points relate to the question asked. Where candidates give points of knowledge without specifying the context, award marks unless it is clear that they do not refer to the context of the question.

Marking principles for each question type

For each of the question types the following provides an overview of marking principles.

The extended-response questions used in this paper are

- **discuss . . .** **30 marks**
- **to what extent . . . (research method)** **15 marks**
- **to what extent . . . (source stimulus)** **15 marks**

Discuss . . . questions

Candidates explore ideas about a contemporary issue. They gain marks for analysing, synthesising and evaluating different views and evidence to support a line of argument, leading to a conclusion.

Candidates support their line of argument by drawing on their knowledge and understanding of the issue. They include comparison of the issue in the UK and Scotland with relevant international examples.

To what extent . . . (research method) questions

Candidates draw on their knowledge and understanding of social science research to make an overall judgement on the suitability of given research methods.

Candidates may gain marks in a number of ways, and are expected to include the following

- analysis of the key ethical/practical aspects of using the research method in a given scenario
- evaluation of the relative suitability of research methods for researching a given scenario, supported with contemporary/relevant evidence
- supporting knowledge about social science research methods
- a line of argument leading to an overall judgement on the suitability of a research method.

To what extent . . . (source stimulus) questions

Candidates draw on their knowledge and understanding of social science research to make a judgement on the potential trustworthiness of a source.

Candidates may gain marks in a number of ways, and are expected to include the following

- analysis of the source to identify key aspects* which affect validity/reliability
- evaluation of the reliability/validity of the source in the context of social science research, supported with contemporary/relevant evidence
- supporting knowledge about conducting social science research
- a line of argument leading to an overall judgement.

*Key aspects may include

- provenance
- source evidence
- source errors
- omissions from the source
- bias
- specific issues relating to the source.

‘Contemporary’ refers to the extent to which something is up-to-date.

With regards to viewpoints or arguments, this represents the most relevant, or currently accepted, thinking. Therefore, while viewpoints on Scottish independence are likely to change very quickly, contemporary thinking about the effects of inequality may include theorists who wrote decades ago.

With regard to evidence, it should also be up-to-date. For example, referring to HM Chief Inspector of Prisons’ Annual Report for 2007/2008 may be considered out-of-date unless there is a specific, relevant point to be made from that year, or a trend/pattern/comparison is being established.

Marking grids for 30 mark questions

Analysis

Analysis involves identifying various aspects, the relationship between them, and their relationships with the whole. It can also involve drawing out and relating implications.

Award analysis marks where a candidate uses their knowledge and understanding, or evidence from a source, to identify relevant aspects (for example of an idea, theory or argument), and clearly shows at least one of the following

- links between different aspects
- links between aspect(s) and the whole
- links between aspect(s) and related concepts
- similarities and contradictions
- consistencies and inconsistencies
- different views or interpretations
- possible consequences or implications
- understanding of underlying order or structure.

0 marks	1–2 marks	3–4 marks	5–6 marks	7–8 marks
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • candidate provides no evidence of analysis (purely descriptive response). <p>OR</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analysis is not relevant to the question. <p>For analytical comments to be relevant they must directly address either the question; or issues, arguments or evidence which the question addresses.</p>	<p>Candidate makes relevant analytical comments but</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in the context of their answer, these may not be the key, or most relevant, aspects. 	<p>Candidate makes developed, relevant analytical comments and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in the context of their answer, these are the key, or most relevant, aspects • includes relevant, contemporary supporting evidence. 	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 4 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links analytical comments to evaluative comments • includes relevant and contemporary supporting evidence from an international comparator country. <p>Overall, analysis shows understanding of the question and its implications, by inclusion of sufficient key or most relevant aspects.</p>	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 6 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analytical comments are integrated in-depth with international comparison • analytical comments clearly integrate the ideas and arguments of others with their own. <p>Overall, analysis shows an in-depth understanding of the question and supports a convincing line of argument.</p>

Comparison

Comparison involves making a judgement between two (or more) entities in order to show similarity or difference. Candidates must draw out key similarities/differences and show the extent of these.

0 marks	1–2 marks	3–4 marks	5–6 marks
No evidence of relevant international comparison.	<p>Candidate's comparison</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">explains a key, relevant difference or similarity between the issue in the UK/Scotland and in another country/countriesexplains the extent of the difference/similarity.	<p>Candidate's analysis meets the requirements for 2 marks and in addition</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">points of comparison, including the extent of the similarity or difference, are made throughout their response and are supported by relevant and contemporary evidence.	<p>Candidate's evaluation meets the requirements for 4 marks and in addition</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">points of comparison are integrated into and form a key part of their line of argument.

Evaluation

Evaluation involves making a judgement(s) based on criteria.

Candidate should make reasoned evaluative comments on factors such as evidence that supports their line of argument, and evaluate alternative arguments.

Evaluative comments must relate to, for example

- the extent to which a viewpoint or argument is valid
- the extent to which a viewpoint or argument is supported by evidence
- the relative importance of factors in relation to the issue
- the impact or significance of factors when taken together
- the relative value of alternative arguments.

0 marks	1–2 marks	3–4 marks	5–6 marks	7–8 marks
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• candidate provides no evidence of evaluation (purely a descriptive response). OR <ul style="list-style-type: none">• candidate's evaluation is not relevant to the question.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• candidate makes points of evaluation that are relevant to the question but are not developed. OR <ul style="list-style-type: none">• candidate makes a basic evaluation that is developed and relevant.	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 2 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• makes reasoned points of evaluation• relates points to their line of argument and uses them to make an overall judgement(s) on the question.	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 4 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• shows reasoned consideration of alternative arguments and evidence• provides reasoned evaluation and judgement of an alternative argument(s) or evidence.	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 6 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• integrates points of evaluation throughout their line of argument• uses reasons for discounting or accepting alternatives to clearly support their overall conclusion.

Synthesising information to structure and sustain lines of argument

Synthesis involves drawing two or more pieces of information – knowledge, evidence or viewpoints – together to support a structured line of argument.

A line of argument involves bringing together or linking points in a coherent manner, building towards a conclusion. Candidates' conclusions should go beyond a summary of key issues, and their reasoning and evidence should build to a relevant overall judgement that addresses the specific question. A relevant conclusion with detailed supporting reasons should demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the complex issue, which should include alternative viewpoints. Candidates may include conclusions throughout an extended response, and/or within one separate concluding section.

A well-reasoned conclusion will include

- clear evidence that a conclusion has been reached
- includes detailed reasons to justify the conclusion.

0 marks	1–2 marks	3–4 marks	5–6 marks	7–8 marks
<p>Candidate provides no evidence of</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a line of argument• a clear conclusion.	<p>Candidate draws together pieces of information to summarise key points but</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• there is a lack of sufficient synthesis to support the conclusion• the line of argument in support of the conclusion is unclear.	<p>Candidate shows evidence of</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• an overall conclusion which provides an overall judgement of the question• a line of argument and is supported by detailed reasons/evidence.	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 4 marks and shows evidence of</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• an overall conclusion from a sustained line of argument developed by organising, linking or sequencing ideas throughout the response• an overall conclusion that includes a response to at least one relevant counter-argument.	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 6 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• their line of argument integrates points of analysis and evaluation, which they use to support their overall judgement• their overall judgement is based on several points of analysis or evaluation.

Marking grids for 15 mark (research method) questions

Analysis – award up to a maximum of 6 marks			
0 marks	1–2 marks	3–4 marks	5–6 marks
<p>No evidence of analysis – purely descriptive response.</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Analysis is not at all relevant to the question.</p>	<p>Candidate's analysis identifies aspects of the research method which are relevant to the question but</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • does not identify the most relevant aspects <p>OR</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • does not link the aspects to the scenario. <p>Alternatively</p> <p>Award 2 marks where analysis identifies only one key aspect and links the aspect with the issue in the scenario.</p>	<p>Candidate's analysis identifies key aspects of the research method which is relevant to the question and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • identifies relevant links of key aspects to the source • includes relevant and contemporary supporting evidence. 	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 4 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links analytical comments on the aspects to evaluative comments. <p>Award full marks where analysis shows understanding of the question and its implications, by linking sufficient key or most relevant aspects with knowledge of social science research methods.</p>

Evaluation (research methods) – award up to a maximum of 6 marks			
0 marks	1–2 marks	3–4 marks	5–6 marks
<p>No evidence of evaluation (purely descriptive response).</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Evaluative points are not relevant to the question.</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Evaluative comments lack reasoning.</p>	<p>Candidate makes points of evaluation about the suitability of the research method in question but</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • supporting evidence doesn't back up the evaluation • lack of development in reasoning <p>OR</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • only one developed*, relevant point of evaluation is made which has supporting evidence. <p>*Developed points may include, for example</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • evidence • reasons • background information, support or reinforcement. <p>Award a maximum of 1 mark where the reasoning is not developed or the candidate makes only one evaluative point.</p>	<p>Candidate makes developed, relevant points of evaluation about the suitability of the research method in question and in addition</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • evaluative comments clearly address the stated research method(s) in relation to the specified scenario • addresses the potential effectiveness of the key stated research method in relation to the specified scenario. 	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 4 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • addresses ethical issues in relation to the key stated research method(s) • where there is only one stated method the candidate also evaluates their own alternative method, or combination of methods, of researching the issue <p>OR</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • where there are two stated methods the candidate evaluates both methods and/or their own alternative method, or combination of methods, of researching the issue.

Conclusion – award up to a maximum of 3 marks			
0 marks	1 mark	2 marks	3 marks
No evidence of concluding remarks.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Concluding remarks simply summarise the key elements or main points 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The conclusion follows from a line of argument and is supported by reasons/evidence It is clear which research method is preferred in relation to the specified scenario 	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 2 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> their line of argument integrates points of analysis and evaluation, using these to support the overall judgement their reasons for preferring/rejecting the research methods are clear.

Marking grids for 15 mark (source stimulus) questions

Analysis of a source – award up to a maximum of 6 marks			
0 marks	1–2 marks	3–4 marks	5–6 marks
<p>No evidence of analysis – purely descriptive response.</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Analysis is not relevant to the question.</p>	<p>Candidate's analysis identifies aspects which are relevant to the question but</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • does not identify most relevant aspects <p>OR</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • does not show relevant links. <p>Alternatively</p> <p>Analysis identifies only one key aspect and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links the aspect with the trustworthiness of the source • includes supporting evidence. 	<p>Candidate's analysis identifies key aspects which affect trustworthiness of the source and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • identifies relevant links • includes relevant supporting evidence. 	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 4 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • links analytical comments on the aspects to evaluative comments <p>Award full marks where a candidate's analysis shows understanding of the question and its implications by linking sufficient key or most relevant aspects with knowledge of social science research.</p>

Evaluation of trustworthiness – award up to a maximum of 6 marks			
0 marks	1–2 marks	3–4 marks	5–6 marks
<p>No evidence of evaluation (purely descriptive response).</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Evaluative points are not relevant (do not refer to the source).</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Evaluative comments lack reasoning.</p>	<p>Candidate makes reasoned points of evaluation about the trustworthiness of the source but</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> there is lack of development in reasoning <p>OR</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> they make only one developed*, relevant point of evaluation about the source, which has supporting evidence. <p>*Developed points may include, for example</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> evidence from the source evidence from other social science research reasons background information about conducting social science research. 	<p>Candidate makes at least two developed* points of evaluation which</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> address the strengths and weaknesses of the source are used to support a reasoned overall judgement(s) are supported by knowledge about conducting social science research. 	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 4 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> judgements on strengths and weaknesses are supported by reference to relevant additional research/sources (this may include candidate's own research) the judgement includes consideration of alternative approaches which may increase the trustworthiness of the source.

Conclusion – award up to a maximum of 3 marks			
0 marks	1 mark	2 marks	3 marks
No evidence of concluding remarks	Concluding remarks simply summarise the key elements or main points.	<p>There is a clear overall judgement about the trustworthiness of the source.</p> <p>The conclusion follows from a line of argument and is supported by reasons/evidence.</p>	<p>Candidate meets the criteria for 2 marks and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • their line of argument integrates points of analysis and evaluation, using these to support the overall judgement expressed within the conclusion.

Marking instructions for each question

Section 1 – Political issues and research methods

Part A

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
1.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> insider v outsider group influence can vary significantly sectional v cause group influence can vary significantly impact of size, membership, financial clout, celebrity endorsements legal framework/legislation over their place and role in political processes receptiveness of government and opposition parties focus of group and political climate in relation to the issue awareness and discussion v actual action mobilising of public support evidence of causes taken on by governments following interest group action evidence of lack of action by governments despite intense interest group action relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Some interest groups are more successful than others at affecting government policy. There are a variety of factors which affect the success of individual groups and most people would suggest that insider groups have more influence; however, it is worth noting that not all insider groups are successful all of the time and not all outsider groups lack the ability to influence political processes. Some of the most influential interest groups in the UK are ones that represent financial and economic interests, as they have the money to afford to pay professionals to target MPs and are often donors to political parties. Resources are often critical in influencing governmental policy. The Confederation of British Industry (CBI) are an insider group because they provide a large source of employment in the UK's economy and represent around 200,000 UK businesses. This means governments must seek their cooperation and support.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence, but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Interest groups are generally more likely to successfully exert influence when a government is broadly sympathetic towards their aims. When a group's goals clash with that of the government, it is consigned to being an outsider. Most would accept that these interest groups' chances of influence are slim and, in fact many interest groups in the UK clearly do not have adequate access or voice. What is perhaps less clear-cut though is that even if these groups are seen as insiders, their ability to actually change anything can be limited too, suggesting that their influence could well be exaggerated. For example, anti-fracking groups, brought together as 'Frack Off', struggle to be as effective in the face of large energy companies and their associated interests. The fact that in the UK, their goals are generally at odds with government policy, which has previously encouraged fracking, also does not help. Similarly, the British Medical Association (BMA), an insider group, whose ability to influence decision making is often lauded, do not always sway government policy. They were actively consulted by the Coalition Government on the Health and Social Care Bill in 2010-12. However, the government passed the bill, despite the BMA's opposition to many of the policies within it. This shows quite clearly that although an insider group may be consulted on policy, there is no guarantee they will actually have an influence over the result, and in this example the BMA's perceived influence going into the process was indeed greatly exaggerated.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The role of interests groups is greatly strengthened when they have the backing of celebrities and those groups who get this tend to find that their influence is greater and, so, not exaggerated. In the UK, this has been seen in the Fawcett Society, who campaign to secure equality for women and to defend women's rights. They have the support of the likes of Bill Bailey, Jenni Murray and Sir Patrick Stewart and it is through the involvement of these high-profile supporters that they are trying to spread their message and encourage more people to join them in putting pressure on the UK government. Similar organisations exist in other countries around the world, such as the National Organisations for Women in the USA, the National Council of French Women and Emily's List in both the USA and Australia. All of these can be seen to play a role in influencing political processes, but with varying success, and much of this relates to whether they have the backing of prominent people in the public eye.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>This kind of exertion of influence can be seen in both the UK and the US, where outsider interests groups will often seek to put significant pressure on individual politicians. This happens more effectively in the US, since the party system is arguably weaker and politicians are less controlled by the party leaders than is the case in the UK, where the party whip has significantly more power than interest groups over how MPs vote or what actions they take. This has been seen recently in respect of influence over US Senators when it comes to their role within the Confirmation process, as part of Congressional Oversight. In September 2018, an article in the New York Times indicated that the controversial Kavanaugh nomination to the vacant Supreme Court seat, had led to a significant number of individuals and interests groups targeting undecided Senators, including Susan Collins, a Republican Senator for Maine, and spending hundreds of thousands of dollars in the process. Planned Parenthood were thought to be behind a campaign to send more than 3,000 coat hangers to Collins' offices, as part of a wider effort to exert influence over her vote at the end of the Confirmation hearing. Judicial Crisis Network, a conservative advocacy group, also ran a \$600,000 advertising campaign to pressure others to announce their opposition. Despite the intense pressure on Collins to oppose Kavanaugh's nomination, she voted in favour, suggesting the interests groups lobbying of her was unsuccessful. The media clearly exaggerated the influence they were likely to have over her decision.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and another country, and an evaluation of their similarities.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Pressure groups vary enormously in their ability to influence public policy. The major core insider groups such as the CBI and the BMA will have vast influence in terms of shaping policy. Generally, this is because they will have access to Health Department officials and Ministers and the Prison Officers Association and the Home Office and have sway over large numbers of employees of these important areas of public life. These groups' ability to influence the political process is not over-exaggerated as they clearly do have the ability to change decisions made by politicians. For example, in 2018, the BMA called for greater investment in public services to support mental health and to support GPs in general, following a poll suggesting that they routinely work beyond the level considered safe by the BMA. The government in turn has promised to increase funding for primary and community care by 4.5 billion over the next five years under the NHS long-term plan.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>All in all, the role and influence of interest groups over the political process could be seen to be greatly exaggerated. These groups experience varying degrees of success and failure in influencing the political process. Well-established, large groups, with seemingly limitless resources, who also enjoy insider status are in the privileged position of often enjoying significant amounts of access to those in positions of power, and it is this access that can determine their ability to enact change. That said, their success in promoting favourable legislation and/or preventing the unfavourable can be seen to have been grossly over-exaggerated. These groups, insider or otherwise, may be given a 'seat at the table', but this does not always translate into action in their favour. It is undeniably the case that those groups who are in positions of strategic importance in society, like the BMA, or who have the broad support of the public, like ASH, do have significant influence. However, all too often those groups who appear to be successful and could argue that they have had an influence on policy-making, are generally those with whom their views tie in with the general policy focus of the sitting government already and, as such, they're not in fact really influencing anything at all.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
2.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • sociological theory • party identification model • dominant ideology • party identification • rational choice theory • social class influences • influence of election systems on voting behaviour • influence of election contexts on voting behaviour • cultural influences on voting behaviour • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award credit for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Social class is no longer a good indicator of voting behaviour in Scotland and the UK as the old ties between the working classes and Labour and the Conservatives and the middle classes have loosened. In the past a vast majority of social class C2DE voters would identify with Labour whilst the majority of ABC1 voters would vote for the Conservatives. However, in the 2017 UK General Election Labour saw a swing in support from the middle classes whilst the Conservatives enjoyed a swing in support from the working classes with both parties gaining record shares of votes from both. Despite these swings, Labour still out-performed the Conservatives amongst C2DE voters while the Conservatives out-performed Labour amongst ABC1 voters which fits with tradition.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence, but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Fifty years ago Pulzer asserted correctly that “class is the basis of British party politics; all else is embellishment and detail”. However, according to Sir John Curtice, Professor of Politics at Strathclyde University, age is the new ‘social class’ of voting behaviour. In the 2017 UK General Election Labour enjoyed a majority of support amongst all age groups under 45 years old while the Conservatives enjoyed the vast majority of support amongst over 45-year-old voters. Labour gained 60% of votes those aged 18-24 year olds while the Conservatives gained 61% of over-64s. This is symptomatic of a general pattern that has emerged in recent elections, as well as the 2016 referendum. In the 2016 European Union withdrawal referendum a majority of 18-24 year olds across all social classes voted to remain while a majority of those in every age group 55+ voted to leave. Surveys showed 62% of young people believing the UK’s membership of the EU was a good thing, with only 14% disagreeing. In subsequent general elections the more anti-EU stance from the Conservatives – to counter the threat of UKIP – appeared to attract support from older voters but drove support away from young, first-time voters. The rise of age as an indicator of voting behaviour has also been apparent in Scotland. The four local authorities that saw a ‘Yes’ majority in the 2014 Scottish Independence referendum were also amongst those with the lowest percentage of population in the 65+ age group. These patterns seem to suggest that constitutional issues related to Brexit and Scottish Independence have become cleavage issues for young and older voters and that these have cut across social class voting patterns and political ties to see age replace them as the key factor influencing voting behaviour.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The dominant ideology theory argues that a ruling class control and use the media to influence individual’s choices and voting behaviour to dominate society and maintain their position and power. Newspapers and television stations have the ability to limit the amount of coverage they give a particular political party or make favourable or unfavourable comments about political party leaders and policies. This theory argues that the mass media, particularly newspapers, traditionally support conservative values and persuade large swathes of working class voters to vote conservatively against their own self-interests to do so. Analysis of the 2019 UK general election showed that the UK press were extremely pro-government and that the Conservatives received largely positive news coverage whereas coverage of the Labour Party was largely negative coverage. This may explain why the Conservatives managed to make substantial gains amongst working class votes and traditional Labour constituencies in 2019. Similarly, in the USA this theory can be represented by Fox news, a conservative news channel. A university study found that Fox news made viewers’ attitudes much more right-wing and therefore more likely to vote for Republican candidates. Without Fox news it estimated that Republican Presidential candidates share of the vote would be between 3-6 % lower.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p>American political scientist, Anthony Downs, in the 1950s saw voters as making the same sorts of decisions as consumers do when they decide which product to buy. This rational choice model recognises that most voters are not strong identifiers and have no real connection with the political parties. Greater volatility of voting and weaker party identification are also indicators of this. Voting behaviour is therefore influenced increasingly less by social class and more by a political party's record, its manifesto and the quality of its leadership with voters basing their decisions on who will benefit them and their families most or which party most aligns with their ideological outlook.</p> <p>Measures of class voting seem to bear this out and show that in the UK there has clearly been a decline in traditional class voting for the Conservative and Labour parties. In the 2019 UK General Election for instance the Conservatives polled 48% of votes amongst the C2DE voters compared to Labour's 33% and out-performed Labour across all social grades. In a study of British elections, Political Choice in Britain, it was found that valence issues gave a better explanation of voting than class or any other social factor. This helps explain Labour's defeat in 2019 despite their main manifesto pledges being widely popular amongst a majority of voters. A range of factors suggests Labour lost to the conservatives firstly due to the public feeling their policies were unaffordable. Secondly, the public had no confidence in Labour's ability to manage the economy effectively. Thirdly, an overwhelming majority of the electorate, 70%, had a negative view of Labour's leader, Jeremy Corbyn, in comparison to Boris Johnson, leader of the Conservative Party. And finally, and most significantly, the issue of Brexit dominated the 2019 election and was the most important issue for the overwhelming majority of voters. This gave an advantage to the Conservatives as their chief policy, to get 'Get Brexit done', resonated more with the electorate's priorities than that of the Labour Party. In fact, health and the NHS, which are traditional policy strengths for Labour and on which Labour campaigned heavily in 2019, ranked as only the second most important issue to voters behind Brexit and further explains why Labour lost.</p> <p>Criticism of the rational choice theory of voting behaviour is its assumption that voters are informed and engaged enough politically to make rational judgements on which parties, candidates and policies most align with their economic needs. Brexit and the 2016 US Presidential election arguably provides evidence that this may not be the case and those populist candidates or political messaging can persuade voters to vote against their own self-interests. In his 2016 election campaign Donald Trump used anti-free trade and anti-immigrant rhetoric to appeal to voters, despite the fact that statistical evidence shows free-trade and immigration to have been economically positive for the US and its economy. The reason this seemed to work is because Trump's message reinforced the bias of many voters that free trade meant and immigration cost American jobs. This supports the anti-elitism theory of Thomas Frank that the Republican party have convinced socially conservative Americans to vote against their best interests by acting as champions of conservative issues such as abortion, immigration, and taxation and arguing that the problems of the white, blue-collar workers are due to liberal elites. This represents a similar pattern to the shift of white, working class voters from Labour to the Conservatives in 2019.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p><i>With the decline in traditional class voting patterns in the UK and USA it is therefore reasonable to conclude that rational choice, or in some cases, irrational choice, may best explain voting behaviour.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and another country, and an evaluation of their similarities.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>It is clear that the influence of social class has declined as an influence on voting. There are now weaker links between working class voters and the Labour Party, and middle-class voters and the Conservatives. Recent voting patterns show that age now appears to be the biggest social influence and indicator of voting behaviour. This also appears to be based on voters using their vote to vote for what is in their own self-interests. Therefore, social factors no longer exert the most influence on voting behaviour. Instead, it is voters' preference on issues and the personality of candidates that now exerts greater influence.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Overall, it is difficult to accurately estimate the relative importance of the various voting behaviour models or factors considered above. It is likely that class alignment and strong party identification has declined significantly but that they nevertheless continue to be major determinants of voting behaviour for a sizeable minority of voters. However, voters that are more volatile are increasingly more likely to be influenced in various ways by perceptions of party leadership, competence, valence issues, party policy and their ideological preferences and perceptions. Furthermore, voting decisions are influenced to some extent by the mass media's coverage of political issues. These patterns appear to be similar across both the UK and USA as well as other western democracies and coincide with an expansion of rolling news, technological developments and an explosion of social media platforms. Nevertheless, election cycles and shifts in power show voting behaviour is neither fixed nor permanent, suggesting no single factor or theory adequately exerts a consistent force or offers a consistent explanation of voting behaviour. Random events, as Harold MacMillan is said to have alluded to, such as war and economic crisis often shape voting and election outcomes as much as anything social factor.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
3.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • various forms of Nationalism, for example, expansionist, civic, cultural, conservative • growth of nationalism in regions of the UK, across Europe and the world – in government, as opposition, those yet to gain a foothold but forcing agenda • themes of self-determination, patriotism, volkism/gemeinschaft • backdrop to growth-backlash against establishment, financial crisis, migrant crises, long-standing views on national identity, impact of globalisation • apparent divisive aspects of nationalism – hostility to immigration, anti-Islamic rhetoric and Euroscepticism • continued strength and/or dominance of conservative, socialist and liberal ideologies in the face of the rise of the right • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>In the past ten years there has been a huge growth in the number of nationalist parties across the world and the support they are receiving from voters. Across Europe, nationalist and far-right parties have recently made electoral gains. Some have won elections and a place in the government, others have become the main party of opposition, and even those yet to gain a political foothold have forced centrist leaders to adapt. At the same time, these parties have seen big increases in their membership, whereas other parties have seen their numbers fall. For example, the SNP have seen their membership more than double following the failed Independence referendum in 2014 and Sky News reported in June 2018 that SNP membership applications had risen by 10,000% after MPs' mass walkout in Westminster against what was described as a Tory Brexit 'power grab'. Meanwhile, the Conservative Party membership numbers have declined from 177,000 in 2010 to 124,000 in 2018.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence, but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>While many nations still do not have nationalist parties in government, the rise of nationalist populist and far-right wing parties across the world indicate their ever increasing prominence in the world of politics. In the last decade nationalist parties have grown in number and in strength, with many either winning elections or winning enough seats/votes to become a key element of the opposition. The SNP in Scotland is a prime example of this. In the first election to the Scottish Parliament in 1999 they gained just 27% of the vote and 35 seats, but by 2016 this had increased to 46.5% of the vote and 63 seats, and since 2007 they have formed either both minority and majority administrations. Additionally, at a UK level, they have seen even greater success, winning 56/59 Scottish seats at Westminster in 2015 and 35/59 in 2017 a significant increase in their fortunes when compared to the 2010 election when they held just 6. The SNP are now the third party in the UK Parliament and see themselves as an important element of the opposition, with Angus Robertson going so far as to claim the SNP are ‘the real opposition’. While this could show a shift to nationalist policies and politics becoming more dominant, Jan Eichhorn writing for the LSE’s British Politics and Policy blog, does not believe that the increase in SNP support is tied to increasing nationalism. Instead their success is probably largely down to the progressive policies the party presents, which were seen as lacking in other parties’ manifestos.</i></p> <p><i>It would be difficult to overestimate the significance of nationalism to modern politics. However, there have been claims since the late twentieth century that nationalism is becoming an anachronism in a global community. Nation-states are losing authority and ethnic and regional political identities are arguably displacing national ones.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>There has been a surge in support for nationalist parties in Europe in recent years, suggesting a rise in dominance of the ideology. In 2019, there were five nationalist parties in government in European countries and a further 11 nationalist parties who give parliamentary support to the party of government. In addition, eight nationalist parties form the government in countries that also have regional level governments. This includes the SNP in the Scottish Parliament and The Basque National Party in the Basque Parliament. The SNP have been in government in Scotland since 2007 and the Basque National Party have formed part of their government at ten of the last eleven elections. Previously the SNP did not tend to do so well in elections, but the formation of the devolved parliament has helped their fortunes.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Nationalism has arguably come to dominate the political landscape. This can be seen in Scotland and the UK in recent years, in discussions over and reactions to the referenda on Scottish Independence and Brexit. Much of the growth here centred on the quest to allow Scottish voices to be heard and for Scotland not to be taken out of the EU without her support, as well as more conservative nationalists focusing on trying to regain aspects of British sovereignty they see as having been eroded over the years by the EU. In the UK, much of the nationalist feeling centred on membership of the EU has also focused on the perceived threat to our national identity because of immigration. This has also been a factor in the rise of nationalism and far-right support across Hungary, Greece and Italy. Marine Le Pen, leader of the National Front party in France, embraces anti-globalisation and anti-immigration policies. According to The Economist, the main attraction of far-right parties in the Scandinavian countries is the perception that their national culture is under threat. Yet, other reasons exist in other nations. Ruth Wodak, in an article published in 2014, identified that the growth could be seen for various other reasons including an ambivalent relationship with fascist and Nazi pasts, as seen in Hungary, and a perceived threat from Islam. What is clear, regardless of the reason for their growth, is that nationalism has scarcely ever been more important than it is today, with new waves of nationalist populism and nativism paving the way for campaigns based on 'Making the Netherlands Great Again', 'France for the French' and 'America First, alongside arguably more civic and inclusive forms of nationalism in the likes of Scotland.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Nationalism does indeed now dominate the political landscape. Other ideologies are in decline and voters are increasingly supporting parties with nationalist views, like the SNP. While UKIP have lost votes and support recently, their role in achieving a referendum on leaving the EU and prompting more voters to question the idea of British national interest should not be forgotten.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Overall, it seems clear that nationalism does not dominate the political landscape, but it has certainly seen an unexpected revival across Europe and further afield in the last decade, leading to it growing significantly in prominence. In an ever more global and inter-connected community, there ought really to be a downward trend of nationalism, with nation-states and borders being less and less important. However, the reality is that national identity and the desire to protect and ‘look after your own’ remains to lesser or greater extents in many countries the world over. The increased fortunes and success of nationalist parties both in the UK and abroad, show that nationalism is an ideology that cannot be ignored. Parties like the SNP have become hugely important. As the party of government in the devolved Scottish Parliament and now in their position as the second party of opposition in Westminster, the SNP have certainly gained more dominance, even if they are not in fact dominant. However, across other nations these parties are seen as extreme, divisive and, in some instances worthy of a protest vote when the election is less important, but they are unlikely to gain dominance because of their far-right and extreme rhetoric.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
4.			30	<p>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways <i>up to a maximum of 30 marks</i>.</p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • core values of socialism • alternative ideologies, including conservatism, liberalism and nationalism • ideological perspectives and approaches to • human rights and civil liberties • national security • national sovereignty • taxation • welfare • economic policy • authority and the distribution of power • political representation • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award credit for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Socialism's influence on approaches to welfare in the UK has been limited since 2010 due to the dominance of the Conservative party in government, their promotion of austerity and the introduction of their welfare reforms. Responding to the 2008 financial crisis the Coalition and subsequent Conservative governments introduced and promoted policies that resulted in government spending reductions, the rolling back of the state and the removal of some aspects of the welfare safety net in some areas. For instance, from 2010-2019 more than £30 billion in cuts were made to public spending resulting in a reduction of state support. These policies, influenced by capitalist ideas and values, encouraged individual and national economic responsibility rather than collective responsibility. However, the underlying values of welfare and healthcare remain influenced by socialist and social democratic values of collectivism. Despite their programme of austerity, the Conservatives maintained funding of the NHS and ring-fenced it from austerity cuts. Furthermore, the NHS still operates under the principle of being paid for through national insurance contributions and general taxation and remains free at the point of use, based on need rather than ability to pay.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence, but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>The SNP's dominance of Scottish politics, the surge in support for a second Scottish independence referendum and Brexit appears, at first glance, to be representative of nationalist values, rather than socialist values, dominating the key constitutional issues in Scotland and the UK over the past decade. The SNP, and therefore Scottish nationalism, has dominated the Scottish political landscape since 2007. Since this juncture the SNP, either as minority administration or as a majority from 2011-2016, have been in government in Scotland whilst also consistently being the largest party in UK general elections in Scotland, particularly from 2015-2017 when they gained 56 seats and again from 2019 when they gained 48 of the 59 seats available. Their nationalist agenda has therefore dominated the constitutional debate, coinciding with the 2014 referendum, subsequent devolvement of powers from the UK Parliament to make the Scottish Parliament the most powerful devolved assembly in the world and further calls for a second referendum on Scottish self-determination. However, the SNP are not only shaped or influenced by nationalism. Their form of civic nationalism diverges from the ultra, ethnic nationalism of political parties such as the BNP. Immigration is accepted and encouraged rather than actively discouraged and decried. It is as much influenced by pragmatism and centre-left, socialist and social democratic values as much as any ideology. Furthermore, the SNP's centre-left policies have also included keeping university tuition free, abolishing prescription charges and opposing spending cuts and welfare reforms including the bedroom tax. These clearly fit with the principle of being free to use and collectively paid for, classic socialism in other words. Despite these policies of the left, the SNP have also shown a tendency towards fiscal conservatism. They maintained a nine-year freeze on council tax until 2016 when they allowed local authorities to increase by 3% for 25% in the top tax bands. This change suggests that contemporary political parties and governments are ideologically flexible and motivated as much as by political opportunism as by any strong attachment to nationalist, socialist or any other ideology.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Recent economic reforms enacted in the UK and France appear to see each diverging from their Traditional approaches. The UK government under then Chancellor, George Osborne, announced the phased introduction of the national living wage with the aim it would rise to 60% of median earnings by 2020. This interventionist approach to tackle low pay runs contrary to conservative free-market philosophy and was widely criticised by retailers and businesses, which argued that it would reduce profits and, in some cases, require costs being passed to customers. The conservative-led coalition and Conservative governments have also overseen significant renationalisation of the British railway network. This appears to show, even under the Tories, ideas and policies associated with socialist beliefs adopted. France on the other hand appear to be going in the opposite direction under Emmanuel Macron. Under his leadership, France introduced major reform of their labour code and labour laws in 2017 to make the economy more flexible in a direct attempt to tackle France's high unemployment rate of 8-10%, almost double that of the UK's. This approach was more influenced by liberal economic values and therefore suggests that in contemporary France ideas from the right are more influential at the moment, whereas ideas of the left are to an extent more influential in approaches to the UK economy in response to recent elections and issues around Brexit.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country</p> <p>Response 2 <i>An essential component of socialism is the redistribution of wealth which in practice is achieved through a combination of progressive taxation, welfare and legal protection to ensure fairness and equality. In the UK direct taxation of income has become increasingly more progressive based on tenets of fairness more commonly associated with socialism, which may be surprising, as recent changes have been enacted under Conservative-led governments. By 2020 the basic rate at which earners started to pay income tax in both Scotland and the UK had been raised to £12,500 per annum. As a consequence, this resulted in around 43% of the working-age population not paying any tax. At the same time the share of income tax paid by the top 1% rose to just under 30%. In Scotland, where the Scottish government have greater fiscal autonomy, there has been divergence from the rest of the UK with the introduction of even more progressive scaling of income tax. Scotland now has a starter rate of 19%, rather than 20% which the rest of the UK has, and now also has a higher top rate of 46%, compared to 45% in England, Wales & Northern Ireland, paid by earners with incomes over £150,000. Similarly, to Scotland and the UK, the USA operates a largely progressive income tax system where the lowest earners are exempt from paying tax while the highest earners pay a higher share of tax. Figures from the IRS in 2019 showed that the top 1% of earners in America paid almost 40% of Federal income tax, which equates to the same paid by the bottom 95% US taxpayers. Likewise, France too is broadly progressive when it comes to income tax. It follows a similar maxim of the lowest earners not paying tax and being entitled, in some cases, to subsidies or welfare as to that of the previously mentioned countries. It would therefore appear that in almost all modern capitalist democracies, whether conservative or liberal, the general approach to taxation is</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p><i>largely progressive and arguably still influenced by the socialist values of redistributing wealth in support of government measures which support the poorest in society and provide basic standards of living.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Socialism no longer exerts a strong influence within the UK. Brexit has shown that in relation to issues on borders, immigration and constitutional matters, nationalism and self-determination have been the biggest drivers. Economically, the UK remains largely a liberal economy based on capitalist ideas, free trade and low taxation. In Scotland, the SNP and their nationalist agenda dominate the political system and although they diverge from the UK on matters of austerity and approaches to welfare these differences are driven more by political opportunism rather than any significant association with socialism.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Socialism's influence has greatly dwindled in Scotland, the UK and France. In Scotland, the civic-nationalism of the SNP has dominated for a generation. Whilst some commentators argue that the SNP and their continued domination of the Scottish political system suggest some residual elements of socialism remain influential, the case can also be made that any vestiges of socialism in Scotland are motivated just as much by opposition to Conservatism as to any deep-seated love of socialism. In the UK, the overwhelming rejection of Corbynism's 'old'-Labour socialism in 2019 signified the further decline and outright rejection of the socialist ideology by the UK electorate. While in France, economic necessity has led to a rejection of both right and left philosophy and emergence of a more pragmatic, centrist philosophy represented by Emmanuel Macron, which has seen France shift more rightward on matters related to the economy in particular. These political systems suggest that modern liberalism remains the more significant ideological influence on contemporary politics rather than socialism.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
5.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that make reference to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • benefits of codification – stability, judicial review and oversight built in, clearly defined rights, separation of branches of government is clear • limitations of codification – inflexibility and rigidity, judicial tyranny by unelected officials, erodes right to legislative sovereignty • benefits of being uncoded – responsiveness, flexibility, parliamentary sovereignty, not bound by traditional and outdated law • limitations to being uncoded – limited protection of rights, too much power to elected bodies, lack of clarity on power • current constitutional situation in the UK – devolution, Fixed-Term Parliaments Act, Brexit • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The idea that the UK needs a constitution that is written down in one single document has become more pressing in recent years, especially as uncertainty has grown over post-Brexit arrangements. Some would suggest Brexit would not have happened if the UK had had a formal codified constitution, as it came about due to what could be called ‘constitutional meddling’. One of the positives of an uncoded constitution is its flexibility and the ability to change the constitution when necessary, following the exact same process as you would to change or introduce any other law. That has long been held up as a reason why the UK should not want to have a codified and more restrictive constitution, but the recent turn of events in terms of the UK being able to leave the EU off the back of a very close referendum, with places like Scotland voting to remain in greater numbers than to leave, would suggest that a more robust constitution would be preferable.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>For any state to achieve a sense of order and identity, it requires a shared set of values to be recognised and accepted by its citizens. Such values tend to be instilled by a system of fundamental laws and principles, upheld by parliaments, courts and other institutions established to maintain and reinforce them. This notion of shared membership, of collective rights and responsibilities is known as a ‘constitution’ and the vast majority of countries around the world now have a codified version of this; however, in the UK, the constitution is instead built upon the principles of the rule of law and the supremacy of parliament and not codified. This lack of a single written constitution, covering all areas of political power, can be seen as a real problem and leads many to argue that we now need to codify. Having an uncoded constitution, based on a wide variety of historical sources, has meant that convention also dictates accepted practice rather than a sensible modern set of rules and practice, and in 2020 that seems a rather backward position to remain in. It makes sense then that in an ICM poll asking for a response to the question that ‘Britain needs a written constitution providing clear legal rules within which government ministers and civil servants are forced to operate’, 73% agreed. That said, others believe firmly in the flexibility that an uncoded constitution brings and both the ability to change the constitution with relative ease when required and to equally not be beholden to the legislative decisions made by those who came before it better lends itself to adapting with the times. As such, it is worth noting that in a Ministry of Justice poll taken in the same year as that mentioned previously, to the less-loaded question ‘Should the UK have a written constitution?’, just 44% were in favour with a significant 39% against.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The UK’s constitution has allowed it to be responsive to changes in society and viewpoints. If lawmakers want to change it, they simply introduce a bill and work that law through the system in the same way as any other idea for a new law. A simple majority is required for the change to pass through Parliament. This can be seen in the granting of a greater range of powers to the devolved Scottish Parliament recently, which happened fairly easily. The same cannot be said of the situation in the USA, where any change to the Constitution goes through a much stricter process. Two thirds of members of the House of Representatives and the Senate must vote in favour of the proposed amendment in order for it to happen, which might explain why the Constitution has been changed just 27 times in the last 200 years. This does not seem like something many people in the UK would support.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>The vast majority of countries in the world today have a formal, codified constitution. The UK remains one of the few, alongside Israel, New Zealand and San Marino, to continue to adopt a constitution that is uncoded, but there have increasingly been calls in many of these countries to change that situation and public support is beginning to sway politicians to look into this more readily. In the UK, an ICM poll found there to be overwhelming support (80%) for a written constitution that would set clear legal rules within which government ministers and civil servants must operate. Similarly, a poll by TVNZ found that 82% of those surveyed thought New Zealand should have a 'written constitution'. Much of this comes as a consequence of campaigning by the likes of former Prime Minister Sir Geoffrey Palmer QC, who wants to see the creation of a written constitution for New Zealand, on account of 'the situation, which makes it very difficult for the ordinary person to know how New Zealand is governed.' In New Zealand, the current constitution comes from a variety of sources, much like the UK's, including 45 Acts of Parliament, including six passed in the UK, 12 international treaties, nine areas of common law, eight constitutional conventions, three and a half executive instruments, one prerogative instrument, one legislative instrument and half a judicial instrument. In addition, much of the constitution is made up of constitutional conventions that are not legally binding. This is remarkably similar to the situation in the UK and the arguments in favour of a New Zealand constitution give weight to those in respect of the UK's. However, what makes the situation in New Zealand perhaps a little different is the strength of the campaign, and the weight behind it, to work towards this reform. Sir Geoffrey Palmer's quest and two subsequent books on the topic exploring both the reasons why it is necessary and, crucially, how it might look in practice, are a big step further down the line in making a potential change than currently exists here.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>The time seems most certainly to have come for the UK to have a written, codified constitution. There has been so much constitutional change in recent years, including the creation of regional Parliaments and the giving of more power to them, Brexit, House of Lords reform and then also the failed attempts to change the electoral system and for Scottish Independence. For many political thinkers, the speed of change, the uncertainty it has created and the fact that many of these changes have progressed means that the UK needs a codified constitution, which makes change harder to make. The UK remains one of the last countries to adopt a codified constitution and it is probably time she caught up.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>The arguments in favour of codification are clear and the evidence points to the real positives that the UK would gain were she to go down this route. Given the turmoil of recent years, with huge swathes of constitutional change afoot, many would welcome a codified constitution with far clearer parameters on what the government can and cannot do, with the rights of citizens more readily defined and enshrined, ensuring an obvious separation of powers and clarity in respect of oversight in respect of significant constitutional change. The process of judicial review would be more precise and transparent and it would have the effect of better safeguarding citizens' rights, an issue more pressing now than ever. That said, an important and highly valid argument against the UK pursuing a codified constitution is that it is simply unnecessary. The uncoded nature of UK politics has ensured that the UK has a long-history of democracy, where change comes about as a result of public pressure. Powers and rights are still clear, despite being uncoded, and the flexibility drawn from a system based on existing law, convention and parliamentary sovereignty, means our lawmakers can adjust to changing public opinion, changes in circumstance and it paves the way for our system to be far more forward thinking, adaptive and up-to-date. In addition, it is important to recognise that the lack of US-style tied-down constitutional constraints allows the UK's executive government to be strong and decisive, which is exceptionally important. Overall, therefore, while codification would bring the UK into line with most other modern democracies, it is hard to argue truly that the UK needs a codified constitution we have certainly managed without one in arguably a far better way than the like of the US have with theirs.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
6.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the Constitutional Reform Act (2005) and the UK Supreme Court • the principle of parliamentary sovereignty in the UK • codified constitutions and separation of powers • judicial review and legislation • judicial review and human rights • executive power, checks and balances • legislative power, checks and balances • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award credit for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1 <i>The notion that the judicial branch is the weakest branch of government was clearly disproved by the UK Supreme Court's intervention in Brexit via its' intervention and decision in the case brought by Gina Miller against the government in 2017. In this case, Gina Miller challenged the Executive's, that is, the UK Government's, right to leave the European Union without a debate and vote being taken by the legislative body, Parliament. The government defended this arguing that royal prerogative powers meant it was unnecessary to hold a vote in Parliament. The Supreme Court unanimously rejected the government's case on the basis that constitutional change required the consent of the Parliament.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks evaluation.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>The UK government's prorogation of parliament in 2019 is an event that illustrates the extent and limits of the UK judiciary's power. Parliament was to be prorogued on 9 September and summoned again on 14 October for a new session. The controversy surrounding this Executive use of prerogative power was the extensive amount of time that parliament would be prorogued and not sitting. Opposition and legal challenges to this decision argued that prorogation was a calculated attempt by the UK government to stifle scrutiny of the EU withdrawal agreement and prevent the possibility of parliament blocking a "no-deal" Brexit, which loomed with the Brexit deadline set for 31 October 2019. Legal challenges to the UK Government's action were made in the High Courts of England & Wales, Northern Ireland and Scotland with opposite rulings. The High court of England & Wales judged that prorogation and royal prerogative were issues out with the scope of the courts to pass judgment on. The Court of Session in Scotland reached a different conclusion, stating that courts could rule on the issue and that the UK Prime Minister was deliberately attempting to prevent Parliament carrying out its role of holding the UK government to account. Because of these opposite legal decisions, the UK Supreme Court heard an appeal.</i></p>

Question		Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
			<p><i>All eleven SC justices unanimously agreed the prorogation was unlawful and Parliament returned to sit the next day. This historic judgment showed that the judiciary would and could intervene to check excessive and unconstitutional use of Executive powers by the UK government. However, the action to be taken based on its' judgment was left for the UK Parliament, the legislative body, to decide. This suggests the judicial system lacks 'bite' under current UK constitutional arrangements.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>A case can be made for arguing that legislatures rather than the judicial branch have become the weakest branch within the political system in many nations. In the UK we have regularly seen periods where Executive power goes unchecked, particularly when governments are returned with large overall majorities. Tony Blair's Labour governments suffered only four defeats in ten years of power between 1997 and 2007. It is therefore unlikely that the UK Parliament and the Commons in particular, will be able to effectively scrutinise or check Boris Johnson's Conservative government, elected in 2019 with a whopping majority of 81. Similarly, in the United States Congress has regularly been overwhelmed by Executive power. Presidents have increasingly by-passed Congress by using Executive orders that cannot be scrutinised or blocked by legislative power. For example, by January 2020 President Trump had issued 138 Executive Orders. Although these are subject to judicial review, they are not subject to any checks by Congress.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p> <p>Response 2</p> <p><i>The principle of judicial independence, whereby the judiciary is separate from other branches of government, underpins most constitutions. Theoretically, this enhances judicial authority and prevents improper influence over it from other branches of government. However, there are many aspects, which can politicise and reduce the judiciary's authority and ability to hold other branches of government to account. Constitutionally, the UK Supreme Court tends to be above party politics. A Selection Commission, which is independent of political influence, nominates who should become a Supreme Court judge. The nomination of UK SC justices is based on legal expertise and qualification. As a result, the appointment process to the UK Supreme Court is uncontroversial and to supports its ability to remain removed by political interference from the Executive or legislative branches of government. In contrast, appointments to the US Supreme Court are much more politically driven. Supreme Court Judges are nominated by the President and confirmed by the Senate. A Supreme Court justice is increasingly seen as a political appointment in the USA as it allows the Executive and Legislative branches to influence the judicial branch of government and shape the ideological outlook of the Supreme Court and, consequentially, the constitutional set-up of the country as a whole. Both of President Trump's Supreme Court picks during his first term in office, Neil Gorsuch and Brett Kavanaugh, were conservatives and shifted the composition of the court in that direction which aligns with the</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p><i>ideological perspective of the Republican party. Supreme Court Justices' life tenure means the influence of the President and Congress over the court lives long after their term in office ends. Similarly, Japan's judiciary is also, in theory, underpinned by the principle of judicial independence. In reality, like the United States, it is much more politicised. As a result, it is viewed as being amongst the most conservative judicial systems in the world. In a process similar to that of the United States, Supreme Court justices in Japan are appointed by the Cabinet and ratified by the Emperor. This gives the Executive vast influence in shaping the composition and outlook of the Japanese Supreme Court in a way that critics argue makes the Japanese Supreme Court timid and reluctant to check Executive power. The fact that the Japanese court has only struck down eight laws since its creation in 1947 appears to support this criticism. These examples suggest that the strengths of the judicial branches of government, while determined by powers laid out in their respective constitutional arrangements, are enhanced or diminished by their freedom from interference from politicisation. Therefore, while perhaps less powerful than some of its counterparts, the UK Supreme Court is arguably more politically independent than them and therefore better able to exercise its' limited powers to better scrutinise the decisions of other branches of government.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>It is quite clear that the judiciary is the weakest of the three branches of government due to its passive role in governing and legislating. It cannot initiate or introduce legislation. The judicial branch only really has the power to judge. In the UK, the judicial branch's influence is limited further by it being prevented from passing judgment on certain areas of legislation enacted and relying on Parliament to decide what action to take where it judges laws are incompatible with human rights and the law.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>The judicial branch is clearly the weakest of the three. As Hamilton asserted, this is chiefly due to the fact it has control of neither 'sword nor the purse'. In other words, it cannot enforce its decisions through strength or wealth and relies upon the Executive to enforce its decisions. The judicial system's only real only power is the power to judge. However, this authority means the judiciary is not entirely powerless. In fact, it plays a crucial role in interpreting and determining the legal and political landscape of the nation. In cases of judicial review, the judiciary determine the law, human rights and constitutional matters. This power is highly significant and far-reaching, allowing the judiciary to pass judgments that the authority of both the Executive and Legislative branches of government. In such matters, there is no power above the judiciary. This authority is extended further in a system such as the United States where Supreme Court justices' power and judgements are underpinned by life tenure. Consequently, there is almost no authority to</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p><i>remove them. This is a key distinction, along with the ability to ‘strike down’ legislation that demonstrates the greater power and authority of the US judicial system to that of the UK.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Part B

Question	Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
7.	15	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 15 marks.</i></p> <p>Benefits of official statistics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • easy and cheap to access – saves time and money as data already exists • usually high-quality data based on large, representative samples • contemporary, for example, official statistics will be gathered and published periodically • usually collected in a standardised and systematic manner – makes it easier to analyse • trends over time can be identified • comparisons can be made between groups and countries. <p>Limitations of official statistics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • may not relate exactly to the issue being studied due to definitions by the collector differing from the user • open to manipulation and being ‘massaged’ for political or economic reasons • socially constructed, may be more useful as studies of the collector rather than the respondents • quantitative data tells us very little about the human stories or interpretations of why things happen as they do • statistical data is only a snapshot of an issue at that moment in time and only represents a partial picture of reality • Marxists criticism of official statistics that their purpose is to conceal or distort reality to maintain the hierarchical status quo. <p>Reference to alternative methods could include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • interviews • focus groups • surveys • questionnaires • case studies. <p>Ethical issues including</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • consent • privacy • harm • deception. <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching voting behaviour amongst 18-24 year olds as it will save time and money as the data already exists and will speed up the research process.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a relevant issue.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2 <i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching voting behaviour amongst 18-24 year olds as it will save time and money as the data already exists and will speed up the research process. For example, data on elections and voting is produced by the Parliament, Office for National Statistics and the Electoral Commission, all of which can be easily accessed via their websites online.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a relevant point and supporting evidence.</p> <p>Response 3 <i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching voting behaviour amongst 18-24 year olds as it will save time and money as the data already exists and will speed up the research process. For example, data on elections and voting is produced by the Parliament, Office for National Statistics and the Electoral Commission, all of which can be easily accessed via their websites online. However, official statistics being quantitative data means they are only partially useful in telling us how many people vote a certain way. They fail to explain ‘why’ young people vote the way they do and the factors that affect this.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point and supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario.</p> <p>Response 4 <i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching voting behaviour amongst 18-24 year olds as it will save time and money as the data already exists and will speed up the research process. For example, data on elections and voting is produced by the Parliament, Office for National Statistics and the Electoral Commission, all of which can be easily accessed via their websites online. However, official statistics being quantitative data means they are only partially useful in telling us how many’ people vote a certain way. They fail to explain ‘why’ young people vote the way they do and the factors that affect this.</i> <i>An alternative method that could be used to overcome this defect is interviews. By interviewing young voters, researchers could ask open questions which produce qualitative data and can be designed to elicit their voting intentions and what factors tend to influence their use. A drawback of using interviews, compared to official statistics, is that it is more expensive and time consuming as this is research the researcher will have to generate themselves.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point, supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario and analysis of an alternative method.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 5 <i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching voting behaviour amongst 18-24 year olds as it will save time and money as the data already exists and will speed up the research process. For example, data on elections and voting is produced by the Parliament, Office for National Statistics and the Electoral Commission, all of which can be easily accessed via their websites online. However, official statistics being quantitative data means they are only partially useful in telling us how many people vote a certain way. They fail to explain ‘why’ young people vote the way they do and the factors that affect this.</i></p> <p><i>An alternative method that could be used to overcome this defect is interviews. By interviewing young voters’ researchers could ask open questions which produce qualitative data and can be designed to elicit their voting intentions and what factors tend to influence their use. A drawback of using interviews, compared to official statistics, is that it is more expensive and time consuming as this is research the researcher will have to generate themselves. However, if a researcher were to use interviews as a method of gathering information they would have to ensure they had informed consent from those interviewed. The British Sociological Association statement of ethical practices states that participation in research should be based on the freely given informed consent of those studied. Therefore, it is the researcher’s duty to explain to participants what the research is about, who is undertaking and financing it, why it is being undertaken, and how it will be distributed and used before going ahead.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point, supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario, analysis of an alternative method and consideration of ethical issues related to one method.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 6 <i>Official statistics are a more effective method for gathering data on voting amongst young people because it is a quick, easy and cheap method for researchers using data that already exists.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark summarises key points – 1 mark.</p> <p>Response 7 <i>Official statistics are a more effective method than interviews for gathering data on voting amongst young people chiefly because it is a quick, easy and cheap method for researchers using data that already exists. Official statistics also tend to be quantitative and taken from large sample sizes meaning findings about the group studied in the sample can be applied to make generalisations about the wider population.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark clearly shows which method is preferred, supported with reasons – 2 marks.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 8</p> <p><i>Official statistics are the best method for investigating this issue to a large extent. They are better than interviews for gathering data on voting amongst young people chiefly because it is a quick, easy and cheap method for researchers using data that already exists. Official statistics also tend to be quantitative and taken from large sample sizes, meaning findings about the group studied in the sample can be applied to make generalisations about the wider population. Although interviews can produce more qualitative information to explain why young people may vote the way they do, it is difficult for this approach to generate a sample large or representative enough to make generalisations about the wider population that are valid.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark clearly shows which method is preferred, supported with reasons and reasons for rejecting an alternative method – 3 marks.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
8.			15	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 15 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <p>Arguments that the source is valid and/or reliable</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> researched, produced and published by an academic institution carried out by trained researchers following academic protocols national cohort of around 16,000 in study is a large sample argument that 7,707 respondents of a cohort of around 16,000 is a relatively high response rate conducted between August 2015 and September 2016 so relatively up-to-date web, telephone or face-to-face interviews conducted – likely to gain a higher response rate interviews allow researchers to clarify questions to respondents which increases reliability data relates to the political interests of young people meaning it would be valid to political researchers longitudinal studies can produce both quantitative data and rich, qualitative data longitudinal studies trace developments over time, rather than just taking a one-off ‘snapshot’ of one moment – this mean there will be other data sets available to examine and identify trends and causes of issues over time. <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Arguments that the source’s validity and/or reliability are questionable</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> no information on the date of publication – there may have been a significant time lag between research and publication time lapse of over one year to conduct sweep of cohort is also significant as attitudes may have changed cohort only drawn from England so findings cannot be applied to Scotland or the rest of the UK or Scotland relatively low response rate of 7,907 out of cohort of around 16,000. longitudinal cohort studies risk sample attrition – members of the cohort dropping out or not being contactable which reduces reliability no indication cohort or sample is representative or weighted research was transferred from one body, Next Steps, to another, the UCL Centre for Longitudinal Studies – possible that a different approach to collating and quantifying data has been used meaning that direct comparison over time is not reliable web and telephone interviews cannot authenticate identity of respondents – may be completed by others further information is required on use of interviews to ensure reliability source appears to only contain summary information information is omitted from the source, for example, no information or data relating to figure 2 yet this is available for figures 1 and 3. <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Source A has been produced by academics from the Institute of Education at UCL. This could be one reason for it to be considered trustworthy, as the research will have been produced by trained researchers who have followed academic protocols.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of one key aspect related to the trustworthiness of the source.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Source A is based on responses by a sample of 7,707 respondents which is a large sample which will probably have been calculated by the research designer to allow generalisations about the wider population to be made and a reason to consider the source trustworthy. A variety of methods for contacting these respondents were also used including web, telephone and face-to-face interviews which would have ensured a high response rate from the cohort selected and increases trust in the source.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis, supported by evidence, of one key aspect related to the trustworthiness of the source.</p> <p>Response 3 <i>Source A was conducted between August 2015 and September 2016 so relatively up-to-date and therefore likely to be an accurate reflection of the cohort and young people in the England's political attitudes. However, we are unaware of the date these findings were published. It can be argued that due to the time it takes to analyse and collate findings in a longitudinal study that the data in Source A is now a number of years old and may not accurately reflect the attitudes of the cohort which may have changed substantially since they were interviewed in 2015-2016. This then lowers the trust that we can place on the information in the source. Nevertheless, as this source is part of a longitudinal study the researchers can revisit and repeat this research with the cohort and update their findings which make it a reliable source.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis and evaluation of strengths and weaknesses of one key aspect of the source, supported by knowledge of social science research.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 4</p> <p><i>Source A can be considered reliable as it is from a longitudinal study. This research method can produce both quantitative data and rich, qualitative data depending on the design of the study questions. Quantitative data is produced from closed questions or scaled closed questions using a rating scale. Figure 1 in Source A illustrates quantitative data which has been gathered and presents the results of respondents' 'interest in politics' in an accessible, graphical form which makes it easier for the reader to analyse and interpret. The fact the question asked has been the same for all respondents increases the reliability of the source. This also means that the research can be repeated as the same question can be asked again in the future to see if the results are similar or different. The ability to repeat the research with the same cohort or sample is a further reason the source is trustworthy.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis and evaluation of a key aspect of the source supported by knowledge of social science research and reference to additional or alternative approaches which increase the trustworthiness of the source.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 5</p> <p><i>Overall, Source A is extremely trustworthy as it has been conducted by trained, academic researchers who have gathered information from a very large sample.</i></p> <p>This example contains a simple summary of key points – 1 mark.</p> <p>Response 6</p> <p><i>Despite some limitations associated with use of longitudinal studies, such as sample fatigue, Source A is largely trustworthy. The methodology employed by researchers will be academically robust and the sample size ensures that the findings are likely to be an accurate reflection of the sample population.</i></p> <p>This example contains a clear overall judgement about the trustworthiness of the source supported by reasons/evidence – 2 marks.</p> <p>Response 7</p> <p><i>Source A is highly trustworthy. The source is valid as a piece of political research as it details information on political perspectives of young people. Trust in Source A is also enhanced by the fact that it has been researched and produced by academic researchers using an extensive sample population and methods which can be repeated, all of which increase the reliability of the information presented. Although further information on the date Source A was actually published would increase the degree of reliability and trust we can place on it, this does not detract from the overall trustworthiness.</i></p> <p>This example contains a clear overall judgement about the trustworthiness of the source supported by analysis and evaluation – 3 marks.</p>

Section 2 – Law and order and research methods

Part A

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
9.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that make reference to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • state surveillance protects society and citizens • the average law-abiding citizen will not be impacted by government surveillance efforts • state surveillance can be easily abused by those in power • state surveillance does not work in stopping many terror related acts today • addressing the root causes of terrorism • adopting effective counter-radicalisation strategies • surveillance creates anxiety and fear • state surveillance is compromising freedom of expression • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>State surveillance has no place in society especially in the United Kingdom. State surveillance infringes on the civil and human rights of citizens whether living in a democratic society or not. People have a right to privacy and governments need to suspect someone has done something wrong before restricting their freedom. State surveillance that monitors international calls, text messages, web-browsing activities and email essentially prevents citizens from being free. Surveillance abandons the very rights and freedoms terrorists want to attack. The Government Communications Headquarters (GCHQ) conducts mass interception of communications by tapping undersea fibre optic cables landing in the UK. This violates Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights. The UK government's mass interception programme also involves the interception of both content and metadata. Metadata records one's web activity which reveals what one has purchased, news sites visited, forums joined, books read and movies watched. Pieced together this information allows for an intrusive and comprehensive view into a person's private life.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Whether the enhancement of state surveillance should be feared or not has caused considerable debate among legal scholars, the public and governments. The UK Government has argued that the Government Communications Headquarters (GCHQ) has a duty to protect the lives of its citizens and monitoring some communications is necessary and makes citizens feel safer. The UK Government argues that it causes no harm to individuals and that it has foiled dozens of terrorist plots in the last decade. It also argues that government surveillance has a deterrent effect on future terrorists. Simply knowing that the government is monitoring communications means that the risk of trying to carry out an attack is too great to even attempt. If terrorists discover that they have no chance of hiding from the law, they may be demoralised and deterred in their plans. However, Amnesty International and other civil liberty organisations argue that mass surveillance infringes on the privacy of citizens and such a collection of data gives the government a tremendous amount of power. One's internet history can be used to predict voting patterns, political preferences and a range of other behaviours. Therefore, to suggest that only those with something to hide should fear state surveillance is misleading especially in a modern, democratic society such as the United Kingdom.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Mass surveillance is used across the world, but authoritarian regimes are now becoming bolder in both censoring and monitoring citizen behaviour on-line. According to the Open Net Initiative, Iran has proposed a national internet which would increase government control over individual connections but also restrict foreign users from accessing Iranian websites. Additionally, individuals in Iran are now required to provide their identity to even use a cybercafé. The Iranian government has also developed phone apps to use against political dissidents which suggests that surveillance in Iran is being used to keep the government in power, rather than to prevent terror attacks. As the number of people in Iran who use online platforms increases, the government continues to introduce new censorship laws as well. The Chief of Iran's Cyber Police has even warned the public about the government's ability to monitor messaging applications such as WhatsApp. While the government may only be looking for inappropriate content it nonetheless has raised concerns from internet rights groups in the West who complain that state surveillance in Iran is far worse than in most European countries, including Britain.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2 <i>Government surveillance has certainly increased around the world in recent years. In authoritarian regimes, mass surveillance is increasingly used to weed out dissidents and censor access to information which may jeopardise that regime's grip on power, rather than prevent crime or a terrorist attack. In democracies around the world there is no doubt that governments are increasingly collecting more and more of their citizen's communication. In Singapore, the nation's largest telecom provider has close ties to the government and their broadly worded laws allow for government to have a greater hand in collecting data from texts, email and the Internet search histories of its citizens. China's 'social credit' system is also gradually rating users on-line and this rating system is carefully overseen and monitored by China's government. China's mass surveillance is much further along when compared to mass surveillance in the United Kingdom, but the level of democracy in each makes a comparison difficult. The UK is a full-fledged democracy yet GCHQ monitors communications coming into the country and some claim that the level of data gathering goes even further. While it may be true that only those who have something to fear should be worried about such state surveillance, China's 'social credit' system would suggest that everyone is developing a detailed on-line profile and this invasive data collection is much greater and more of a worry when comparing to data collection in the United Kingdom.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Only those with something to hide should fear the enhancement of state surveillance. State surveillance does not hurt law abiding citizens and people are becoming more and more accustomed to being tracked and recorded. Whether it be CCTV, facial recognition data bases, on-line shopping or social media behaviour, big data is part of daily life in many developed countries and citizens should accept this and begin to get used to it. On-line advocacy groups suggest that data can also improve the lives of people by making consumers more efficient on-line. Most Britons and Americans are supportive of government data collecting because they know it will help prevent future terrorist attacks.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>To conclude, mass surveillance is occurring around the world in increasing levels. Many argue that mass surveillance does more harm than good, but most Britons support its use if it means catching more terrorists and foiling more plots. The UK Investigatory Powers Act of 2016 enhanced the ability of the UK Government to collect mass electronic data which has continued to anger advocates of strong civil liberties. Pronouncements by international human rights experts as well as the Court of Justice of the European Union claim that mass surveillance is inherently disproportionate and therefore violates international human rights law. Even the Commissioner for Human Rights has stated that retaining all traffic for all subscribers to the internet violates the right to privacy which is enshrined in the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU. Therefore, it is not only people who have something to hide but all citizens who should fear such massive government intrusion in to the privacy of its citizens.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
10.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • equality within the criminal justice system, including race/ethnicity, gender, class • national security, including terrorism, • policing, including resourcing, numbers, criticisms • surveillance, including CCTV, protection/safety, infringement of rights • underinvestment in the system, including shortages of duty solicitors and independent experts, court closures, barriers to accessing legal aid, crucial evidence not being disclosed • reductions in successful prosecutions, including effects of police cuts, rising crime, rows over disclosure, falling confidence and backlash to a series of collapsed cases. • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award credit for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The Criminal Justice System faces many crises which are difficult to overcome. One major crisis they are currently facing is concerns members of the public have over how few cases are actually prosecuted successfully through the courts. Just 8.2% of the 5 million recorded crimes in England and Wales were prosecuted in the previous year. Lawyers, police officers and victim support workers interviewed by The Independent blamed a “perfect storm of police cuts, rising crime, rows over disclosure, falling confidence and the backlash to a series of collapsed rape cases.” People fully and rightfully expect when crimes are reported that they are dealt with by the police, sent onto the courts and that the people responsible for crimes are dealt with. However, it seems like this is very often not the case and this is a real worry for a lot of people in this country.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence, with basic evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>The Law Society of England and Wales, who represent 180,000 solicitors, recently issued a Parliamentary Briefing in which they argued that the “criminal justice system is facing a crisis following years of underinvestment and neglect. The report goes on to flesh out the issues being faced growing shortages of duty solicitors and independent expert; court closures; barriers to accessing legal aid and crucial evidence not being disclosed in court until the last minute. In respect of the former, they argue that in 5 to 10 years’ time there will be insufficient criminal duty solicitors in many regions across England and Wales, mainly due to the age of those practising. This could have a significant effect on the criminal justice system, as members of the profession retire and leave behind a shortage of experienced practitioners. The problem also presents itself in Scotland, with a recent Scotsman report revealing the number of solicitors withdrawing from the legal aid programme of providing duty solicitors in police station has seen a fourfold increase in the number. As a result, there are now eight areas without local private duty solicitors on the police station plans including Edinburgh, Falkirk and Livingston. Ian Moir, convener of the Law Society of Scotland’s legal aid committee, said the matter was “worrying” and that “the level of remuneration available for legal aid is a significant concern for access to justice. The Young Legal Aid Lawyers group published a report, ‘Social mobility in a time of austerity’, which found that low salaries and high debt levels were a “significant barrier” felt deeply by young criminal lawyers and deterring them from criminal duty work. This has led many within the profession to call for an independent and wide-ranging review of criminal legal aid fees and the sustainability of the criminal justice system. If this were to happen and an increase in fees occurred it is likely that this would address the current recruitment and retention crisis, suggesting that while the system may be in crisis, the challenges it faces are not totally insurmountable. While this is clearly a massive issue, it is the view of the Law Society that “urgent action can prevent the system from falling apart”. However, getting them government to actually take this action is another thing entirely.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The over-use of CCTV and the threats this causes to our rights is a big issue being faced by the criminal justice system. The UK is one of the most watched countries in the world, with an estimated 2 million cameras, one for every 32 UK residents, and these are in place, apparently, to reduce crime and increase public safety. This is similar in US cities, with Chicago having around 15,000 cameras and this is one of the most watched cities there. It has led people to express strong concerns that the governments of democratic countries are gathering information on law-abiding citizens, which could potentially be misused. The development of automatic recognition technology could potentially be used to monitor peoples’ movements and to exclude people from public areas without reference to the criminal justice system, which is a real worry both here and elsewhere.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Arguably the biggest issue the system faces is the continued inequality faced by ethnic minorities within the system. The Lammy Review, an investigation into the treatment of ethnic minorities in the criminal justice system across England and Wales, found that Black men are over three times more likely to be arrested than White men, ethnic minorities are more likely to receive prison sentences, and Black men are more likely than White men to be placed in high security prisons for some categories of offence. Another report from around the same time, Healing a divided Britain, revealed that Black men are five times more likely to be stopped and searched than White men, ethnic minorities in police custody are significantly more likely to be physically restrained than White people, and 40% of prisoners under the age of 18 were from Black, Asian, Mixed or 'Other' groups. All of which gives rise to continued claims of institutionalised racism within the system. David Lammy in fact says the treatment of BAME groups in criminal justice system has got 'considerably worse' since his review. This is comparable with the treatment of ethnic minorities in other countries, like the USA, where a recent report for the UN, by the Sentencing Project, outlined that African-Americans are 5.9 times as likely and Hispanics are 3.1 times as likely to be incarcerated than whites. As of 2001, one in every three black boys born in that year could expect to go to prison in his lifetime, as could one in every six Latinos—compared to one in seventeen white boys. In addition, in 2016, black Americans comprised 27% of all individuals arrested in the United States—double their share of the total population. While this is a clear comparison between England and Wales and the USA, it is very different to Scotland where most prisoners are in fact white. The proportion of black and minority ethnic (BAME) individuals in prison is numerically proportionate to the general population, around 4%. Unlike in other jurisdictions, including England and the USA, ethnic minorities are not over-represented in the Scottish prison population, though they are still likely treated more harshly in other parts of the Criminal Justice System.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and another country, and an evaluation of their similarities.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The Criminal Justice System is clearly in crisis and faces far too many issues to overcome. The reason for this is that there is simply not enough money being invested in the system to put things right. This causes problems for the day-to-day running of the system and access to the solicitors and it is no surprise then that very few cases are successfully prosecuted. As the money that is spent on the system comes from the government, there is very little that the system can do to overcome these problems if those in power do not want to help or if voters do not like the idea of more money apparently being wasted on a system they already think is overfunded and ineffective. It makes it clear then that the issues are too much for the system to handle and this is not going to improve any time soon.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Therefore, most criminologists would agree, overall, the Criminal Justice system is very much in crisis. It faces a myriad of problems, each of which would be hard to tackle in its own right, far less as a totality. As such the system has rightly been described as being “at breaking point” by, among others, Judge Anthony Lowe, in September 2019, after he was forced to adjourn a trial due to start that month until February of the following year. He said that “the lives of witnesses and defendants were being unfairly ‘put on hold’ by delays to trials” as a result of a lack of police, solicitors and court staff. This particular issue has not appeared overnight and is not something that can be fixed easily or quickly either. In addition, the problem of underinvestment further exacerbates, creates and is inextricably linked to other problems the system faces. The reduced number of successful prosecutions, shortages of staff, barriers to legal aid and issues with evidence not being properly disclosed, are all linked to money and have led to a declining confidence in the system. Add into the mix, concerns about equality within the system, concerns over national security and issues regarding surveillance and it is clear the problems being faced are massive. However, to suggest that because it faces many problems, they cannot be overcome is short sighted to say the least. Recent reviews by organisations who work closely with the system both here in the UK and further afield have recommended a plethora of solutions to the various issues being faced. If the government chose to listen, then the system could, though clearly not easily, begin to address and put some of these issues behind them.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
11.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • moral panics • role of the media • changing legislation • validity and reliability of crime surveys • validity and reliability of police recorded crime statistics • evidence which supports the view that crime is exaggerated/not exaggerated • measuring the extent of crime is challenging • social and emotional cost of crime to victims is often not recognised widely by society • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Another reason to suggest that crime is exaggerated in society today is due to the role of the media in giving the impression that the United Kingdom is unsafe. Research suggests there is a disproportionate amount of crime presented in the news with more violent crimes such as homicide appearing more frequently in newspapers and the mass media. The mass media is known to distort extreme and sensational cases making people feel as though there is more violent crime in society than there really is. Many criminologists that study the media such as Tim Newburn also suggest that the way stories are framed and constructed contribute to anxiety and fear, especially among pensioners. The language and punctuation used is designed to capture the attention of potential readers at the news stand. This proves that the media conditions the population to think that more crime is happening than official crime statistics indicate. An article from the Guardian proves this as official statistics reveal that crime is dropping, yet nearly two-thirds of people believe that crime in England and Wales is on the rise. Despite crime levels falling to their lowest in thirty years many people think otherwise, and this is because of the influence of the mass media, especially tabloid newspapers.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Whether official crime statistics accurately reflect real crime levels in the United Kingdom or not has long been a subject for debate. For years criminologists and politicians have pointed to the Crime Survey of England and Wales as a valid and reliable measure of crime. Continual improvements in the survey, such as measuring crime committed against children and an increased number of follow-up interviews with crime victims have increased its trustworthiness. Despite this, recent criticism of the survey suggests it falls short in providing the full picture of crime in society. For example, critics of the survey charge that repeat victimisation is still not reliably counted. The survey caps the number of crimes one can be victimised to just five, which distorts crimes such as domestic and sexual abuse. Some claim that domestic abuse, were there no repeat victimisation cap, would be 140% higher. The cap has also resulted in over a million fewer incidents of violent crime per year. This suggests that far from crime in society being exaggerated, it is under estimated especially in measuring violent crimes committed in the home out of public view. Therefore, while improvements in the Crime Survey of England and Wales should be applauded and suggest that crime is falling in comparison to police recorded statistics, a more critical look at one of the Government's most successful methods of measuring crime reveals that some types of crime are still considerably underreported.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The extent to which crime is exaggerated in British society can also be compared to other European countries that have low crime rates but are perceived to be unsafe. Some media outlets have reported for example that there is now more theft and robbery in Norway's capital Oslo, than London. Norway's capital has also gained a reputation for being unsafe for female tourists and some guidebooks have called Oslo 'The Crime capital of Scandinavia'. Despite these crime statistics crime comparisons indicate that the UK has twenty times more total crime than Norway and 97% more violent crime. This shows that the media do not always portray the full story and can often focus on one alarming statistic. Scandinavian countries such as Norway have always had a more restorative approach with offenders in comparison to offenders in England and Wales and this results in less reoffending, thus less crime. Norwegian prisons prioritise inmate integration and are far less punitive than English prisons, so it is not surprising many English prisoners continue to reoffend and this adds to the perception that Britain is unsafe. These repeat offenders sometimes appear in tabloid newspapers contributing to the perception that Britain is unsafe. The mass media in Scandinavian countries generally refrain from presenting crime in this manner and as a result crime is not exaggerated in society to the extent that it is Britain.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>In Brazil for example, it is difficult to argue that crime is exaggerated. With growing levels of inequality and a president that has pledged to reduce gun restrictions, crime has become endemic throughout the nation. Even the Brazilian Forum of Public Security (BFPS), an independent organisation that tracks national crime statistics, points to a 3% crime increase from last year. Rapes were also up 8% and over 4,500 women were murdered in 2017, a rise of 6.1%. Feminist arguments used to explain violent crime against women often point to the idea of masculinity. Such views suggest that when men suffer humiliation in the workplace, such as unemployment, and cannot provide for their families, this frustration can often result in increased violence against women. Therefore, for women in Brazil who are the victims of domestic and sexual violence, crime is certainly not exaggerated. Feminists such as Tomes reinforce this view and argue that spousal abuse is often linked to changes in the economic position of men within the family. She argues that the wife's economic independence exerts a challenge to male authority within the family and this climate can result in husbands battering their wives to re-establish their control. This view not only helps explain increasing levels of violence toward women in Brazil, especially in areas of high unemployment, but explains crime committed against women in more economically developed countries as well such as the United States and Britain. During times of recession, notably in 2008, when unemployment rose so did crime committed against women. However, some forms of violence against women has decreased in recent years. Data from the United Kingdom in recent years show a decrease in police-reported attempted murders and physical assaults against women. In addition, in countries where women have made recent legal and political gains, such as in India, some women have been experiencing less violence committed against them. After women were granted equal inheritance rights to those of men research found that women who owned property in India were less likely to be the victims of violent crime.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>In conclusion, crime in British society is exaggerated as the likelihood of being a victim of crime is small. This is best highlighted when examining robbery figures as people perceive their risk to be much greater than it really is. As people get older research also suggests that people worry more about certain kinds of crime such as on-line identify theft. Research proves that crime is overrepresented in the media and especially in newspapers. Many newspapers contain sensational headlines because crime stories increase sales. In addition, the Crime Survey of England and Wales also proves that statistically most people do not experience violent crime ever in their lives, suggesting most in society feel safe and crime does not impact their lives much.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>In conclusion, while some suggest that crime in British society is exaggerated others believe this is hardly the case. There is ample evidence from criminologists and sociologists that the media play a substantial role in amplifying the presence of crime not just in Scotland but around the world. This is particularly true of newspapers and television as research from Jaclyn Schildkraut and Schlesinger & Tumbr prove that crime is overrepresented in the mass media throughout Europe. However, victim rights' groups and those that work within the criminal justice system would argue that crime is a very real and tangible aspect of British society today. For many, especially repeat victims, crime has made some parts of Glasgow, London, São Paulo and Johannesburg unsafe especially for women. In addition, criminologists agree that perhaps 40% of crime is not even reported let alone recorded, suggesting that crimes such as sexual assault and domestic violence have long been invisible crimes, not seen or discussed by society. Only recently has sexual assault entered public discourse in a meaningful way thanks to the #MeToo movement. Therefore, crime is not exaggerated and a £700 million plus price tag for Scotland's criminal justice system only serves to reinforce this.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
12.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • impact of crime on perpetrators loss of liberty, psychological and/or mental health impact, financial, emotional and social costs, stigma, social exclusion, crime-specific consequences • impact of crime on victims physical impact, financial, emotional and social costs, psychological and/or mental health impact, stigma, social exclusion, crime-specific effects • impact of crime on families financial, emotional and social costs, deepening disadvantage, stigma, psychological and/or mental health costs, impact on children • impact on wider society social cohesion, population reduction and/or victimisation avoidance, community empowerment, costs of crime eg victim costs, costs of criminal justice, costs of repairing criminal damage • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award credit for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>To suggest perpetrators pay the heaviest costs of crime, either socially or economically, is just plain wrong. The short and long-term effects on the victims of criminals can be seen to be far worse. Victims of crime experience various short- and long-term emotional and psychological effects. Victims of violence describe feelings of shock and loss of trust in society, and guilt at becoming a victim of crime, as they typically feel they could have prevented the incident from occurring. Violent crime can also cause victims to feel a sense of uncertainty and experience high levels of worry about personal safety. Violent victimisation has also been found to bring on fear, anxiety, depression, sadness, anger and stress. A recent Office for National Statistics (ONS) report on violent crime found that 81% of victims of violence reported being emotionally affected by the incident, including 17% who were affected very much. Research into the emotional effects of burglary found that 73% of burglary victims worried about repeat incidents, 70% were very distressed following the burglary and 40% were afraid to be alone in their property for some weeks following the incident. It is also the case that the victims of violent crime can be left with a long term injury or even a disability. This could prevent them from being able to work and so victims are paying emotional, physical and economic costs. These are in no way felt less heavily than the costs of a perpetrator, who through their own choices have faced costs, unlike the majority of victims.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence, but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>When we consider the costs of crime, our first thoughts are often of the individual victims of offences, with little consideration given to the more diffuse effects on society or the burden of cost that falls to the actual perpetrator. While this is perhaps understandable, it seems clear that the costs of crime fall very heavily at the door of perpetrators, albeit it very different ways to their victims. The effects of offences on perpetrators can be seen as threefold- short term there is the obvious loss of liberty, if they are convicted and sent to prison, secondly there is the significant emotional effects of their offending and subsequent punishment on their mental health and, finally, there are also the longer term consequences tied into stigma and denunciation by society, social exclusion and the inability to get a job, as a result of convictions. Arguably these costs are far greater than the short-term effects of being an individual victim, at least in some instances, as much support is given to victims, via organisations like Victim Support Scotland. Economically, perpetrators of crime are likely to find that their employment opportunities are severely curtailed. According to UK government figures, only around a quarter (26.5%) of prisoners enter employment after release. The criminal record tick box, often used on mainstream application forms, can automatically filter ex-offenders out of jobs, condemning them to unemployment. A YouGov survey commissioned by the Department for Work and Pensions found that 50% of employers would not consider employing an ex-offender, regardless of the offence or sentence received. It seems quite clear then that perpetrators, even of so-called minor offences pay quite considerable costs for their offending even once they have served their time and been released, the consequences continue. However, it could be argued that this cost is not felt as heavily now by perpetrators than used to be the case. A large number of UK companies have got behind 'Ban the Box', a campaign calling on employers to give former offenders a fair chance to apply for jobs by taking the tick box out of application forms and asking about criminal convictions later on in the recruitment process. In addition, a growing number of companies are working with prisons and offenders during their sentences in order to skill them up and offer them employment on release. Timpson is one of the largest employers of ex-offenders in the UK. Approximately 10% of their workforce is made up of people who have criminal convictions. Their CEO, James Timpson says "we don't judge people on what they have done in the past, preferring instead to focus on what they can do in the future." While stigma remains an issue for perpetrators in general, this does suggest the picture is not as bleak as it might once have been.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Beyond the effects on victims, crime also has a massive effect on families (of both victims and offenders) and this should not be overlooked in assessing the costs and who suffers most. About 16,500 children in Scotland have a parent in prison at any one time, with just under 2,000 separated from their mother through imprisonment. More children experience a parent's imprisonment than a parent's divorce. This is a problem the world over 5 million children (about 7%) in the USA have a parent who is currently or was previously incarcerated. Children of offenders are six times more likely to become incarcerated themselves, which is a big cost to families. A recent study in the UK, Germany and Sweden, found that children with incarcerated parents were 25% more likely to develop mental health problems compared to children whose parents were not in prison.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>According to the Scottish Crime and Justice Survey (SCJS) victims of violent crime experience strong negative emotions as a result of their victimisation 54% felt angry, 37% felt annoyed, 30% felt shock, 26% felt fear, 16% a loss of confidence and 16% suffered from anxiety or panic attacks. This is comparable to results of the National Crime Victimization Survey (NCVS) in the USA. 68% of victims of serious violence experienced socio-emotional problems as a result of their victimisation. Among all victims of violent crime, the two most widely experienced emotional symptoms were feeling worried or anxious (72%) and feeling angry (70%) for a month or more. The most common physical consequence of experiencing socio-emotional problems was having trouble sleeping for a month or more (47%). The costs are even more pronounced when looking at particular types of victim. Age UK found that 49% of older people in South Africa felt unsafe alone at home, compared to only 3% in China. Older women and poor older people are consistently more afraid of crime than older men and richer people. Both victim surveys and work carried out by charities in this area outline, in depth, the wide array of long-lasting effect for victims of crime and suggest that these are heavy costs to bear.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and another country, and an evaluation of their similarities.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Victims, families, perpetrators and society as a whole all face costs of offending. While offenders themselves do face costs, like society shunning them or losing their liberty for 12 months to life, it could be argued that victims are the ones who suffer most. Victims pay costs in the short term, having to recover from an injury or replace stolen goods for examples, but they also pay longer term costs, related to fear and anxiousness about the crime happening again. This clearly shows that victims face heavier costs than perpetrators ever could.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>There is a multitude of evidence to show that perpetrators face heavy costs as a result of their crimes even beyond the initial loss of liberty they may experience, beyond this they are then stigmatised by society, labelled for life, struggle to access employment and often end up homeless, are cast out by their friends and family and face difficulties at every turn in trying not to reoffend. The cycle of offending continues to occur, for many as a result of the situation that find themselves back in rather than any deliberate choice to reoffend. That Scotland's reoffending rate sits at around 30% is, therefore, unsurprising and is a direct result of the costs perpetrators face. However, to argue that their costs are worse than that of victims or families, is a stretch. The cost of crime is usually measured in emotional or psychological terms, rather than economic ones. Nonetheless there is no denying that there is a profound financial cost to wider society for each crime committed. A recent report for the UK government estimated that the total costs of crime in England and Wales is around £50bn for crimes against individuals and £9bn for crimes against businesses. Added to this, serious and organised crime costs the UK economy £37 billion a year, according to the National Crime Agency. In addition, it is important to recognise that the costs incurred by violent crimes across the UK are borne by the emergency services, a further indication of the diffuse nature of costs to wider society.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
13.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • contemporary relevance of theories of punishment, including denunciation, deterrence, rehabilitation, incapacitation and retributivism • definitions and key features • theorists including Beccaria, Bentham, Durkheim, Hobbes, Marx, Foucault, Von Hirsch, Garland • modern relevance and contemporary examples of punitive approaches. • criticisms of punitive theories and approaches • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award credit for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Denunciation is arguably no longer the most relevant theory of punishment. While many people in Britain do still buy into the idea of shunning people who commit crimes, there has been a growing push towards other, better responses that actually work. Increasingly it is recognised that 'Lock him up and throw away the key!' approaches are useless beyond simply protecting the public in the short term. In the longer term, rehabilitation is a much more effective and far more relevant theory. Successful rehabilitation of a prisoner is achievable if prisoners are not placed in health-threateningly bad conditions, enjoy access to medical care and are protected from other forms of serious ill-treatment, if they are able to maintain ties to the outside world and if they can learn new skills to assist them with working life on the outside. Scottish reoffending rates have hit a 19-year low thanks to the use of rehabilitation schemes, which shows just how successful this approach can be. If the UK wants to reduce offending, reoffending and prison numbers, denunciation is not the way.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and brief evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>The idea that punishment does, and indeed should, demonstrate society's abhorrence of the offence, and that this in some way justifies punishment, remains a popular one in 2021. Despite much evidence suggesting this does little or nothing to resolve offending behaviour, as a society we are still very quick to cast out those who are seen to have wronged us and slow to offer second chances. Traditional denunciation as part of the justice system would have been through exile and shunning in pre-modern societies such sentences were often the equivalent of the death penalty, as individuals would find it impossible to survive without the support and protection of the society that they had wronged. While we clearly don't exile people in this way today, we are still guilty of shunning those who have committed offences and today's denunciation usually comes in our media coverage of those who have done wrong, in our labelling of people with convictions and in our approaches and negatives views towards non-custodial sentences. Examples of recent headlines in the Express "Soft-touch justice setting lifers free", The Herald "There cannot be justice or retribution if a life sentence does not mean life" and The Daily Record "Evil child killer Aaron Campbell will think he's beaten system", all prove the point that our media reports in a way that is about denouncing offenders and denouncing the system that does not treat them harshly enough. Such behaviour has a hugely negative affect on criminal justice policy, but as a vote winner remains a key part of many political parties' responses to offending. In the 2019 General Election, the Conservative party pledged to introduce tougher sentences for some violent and sex offenders and to end automatic early release at the half way point of a sentence for the most serious of crimes. At the time, the Guardian's analysis of this was that they were getting tough on crime, without getting tough on the causes of it, with policies that, for the most part, go against what the evidence shows works, but which buy into what their voter base believe should be happening. An Ipsos Mori Issues Index Poll in July 2019 showed that concern over crime increased significantly in the past year, though still lags behind Europe and the NHS in the public's priorities, and the policies from the Conservative party Manifesto are an attempt to alleviate and address some of these fears. However, while denunciation seems to be popular with at least some sections of the electorate, much has been said in both the House of Commons and the House of Lords to suggest that it is not the best response and that other approaches are far better. Big Issue founder Lord Bird, who has spoken openly about his own time in prison as a youth, and in 2018 said that "An eye for an eye does work in certain circumstances. But then you've got an even bigger problem because the person goes in bad and comes out worse. We need to rethink prisons as opportunities for transforming naughty boys like me, who may even end up in the House of Lords." Far from denouncing and writing off trouble-makers then, perhaps more relevant is introducing processes and schemes that help them and help tackle the causes of their behaviour in the first instance.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Incapacitation aims to prevent future crimes by taking away the offender's ability to commit offences. In the last couple of years, however, it has been increasingly clear that this is not working. In Scotland, the 2019 prison population stands at more than 8000, up from 7400 the previous year, and the reality is that incapacitation only seems to work for a short time. We are locking more people up and using alternatives, like Home Detention Curfew, less frequently. Whereas 19 prisons in the Netherlands have closed because they did not have enough prisoners to fill them. This has been put down to relaxed drug laws, a focus on rehabilitation over punishment, and an electronic ankle monitoring system that allows people to re-enter the workforce.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>In general, the view of US responses to punishment is that they tend to focus on rehabilitation as a secondary element. Some states have, however, begun to change their approach. North Dakota has always been a low-crime state, but since 1992, the number of inmates has gone up 250% and this figure is projected to continue to rise. Missouri River Correctional Center in North Dakota has tried to prevent that from happening by emulating what has been seen to work in the prison system in Norway. Norway rejects life sentences and solitary confinement in favour of programmes that focus on successful re-entry into society. The Director of the Missouri River facility, Leann Bertsch believes that responses to punishment need to focus on "long-term results" and a more "normal" environment and an investment in behavioural training could help prisoners to re-enter civilian life better able to cope with its challenges. She feels that her "job is to rehabilitate people and you can't do that if you treat people inhumanely." One inmate at Missouri River said "I don't always feel like I'm in prison. I feel like I'm somewhere bettering myself." That Norway has two-year recidivism rates as low as 20%, and the rate is three times this in the USA, indicates the extent to which rehabilitation is a better approach than the likes of denunciation and retributivism.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from two other countries, and an evaluation of their similarities.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>While there are many theories of punishment and all continue to play a part in the way we respond to crime in 2021, it is clear that some are more relevant than others. As a society we continue to see denunciation of offenders on a day to day basis and many British people are simply unwilling to accept that people who have committed crime need help and are capable of change. The tabloids are full of stories that vilify offenders, using language that separates them out as being evil, thugs, beasts, monsters and mindless. It's perhaps no surprise on reading this kind of story that society quickly jumps to the defence of the victims, rather than stopping to consider what help the offender might need or deserve. As such, while charities seeking reform might push for rehabilitation to be expanded and more money to be given over to approaches than move offenders away from being locked up, it seems clear that denunciation is here to stay.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Denunciation, Retributivism and Incapacitation are far from being relevant in modern day society. While general deterrence still has its place and keeps most people in our society on the right side of the law, specific deterrence clearly does not work. People do not choose to commit crime, having weighed up the costs and the benefits and it is clear from high reoffending rates that teaching people by punishing them severely does not achieve positive results. Beccaria argued, "punishments are unjust when their severity exceeds what is necessary to achieve deterrence" If The sole purpose of punishment is to prevent crime in society excessive severity will not reduce crime, it will only increase it. Corporal punishment, longer sentences in prison, three-strikes laws, mandatory sentencing, and other "get tough" policies have not demonstrated greater deterrent effects of punishment than less severe penalties. Nor does casting people out and expecting that somehow, they will choose to behave, when society is working against them now more so than ever. There is scope to argue that locking people up works because they are incapacitated and cannot harm us while they're behind bars. Since the 1970s, crime rates in Scotland have consistently fallen at a time when more and more people have been locked up. Research suggests an estimated 10 to 30% of potential crimes have been prevented through collective incapacitation strategies this suggests the theory is not only relevant, but clearly works. That said, we also remain a nation with ridiculously high rates of reoffending and most offenders who are currently in prison in Scotland will be released at some point, making rehabilitation necessary. We live in a culture that believes that tougher laws will change behaviour and act as a deterrent, that longer and even whole-life sentences work. John Podmore, writing in <i>The Justice Gap</i> in 2019 said "we need to reduce the prison population - to lock up only those we are afraid of, not those we are mad at. Prison is not for those whom</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p><i>the rest of society has simply given up on.” Our Politicians and academics know what works rehabilitation.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
14.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • policing strategies • multi-agency approaches • early intervention • success of youth justice programmes • education-based interventions • potential pitfalls of preventative responses • many initiatives are short-lived • interventions only displace crime • effectiveness of custodial sentences • effectiveness of non-custodial sentences • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award marks for any relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Another preventative response to crime is the Scottish Government's Violence Reduction Unit. The VRU was founded in 2005 by Strathclyde Police who wanted to address rising homicide rates with a different approach to tackling violence. In that year the World Health Organisation (WHO) labelled Scotland the most violent country in the developed world. Glasgow was known as the 'murder capital of Europe' and it became clear that a preventative response to violent crime was needed. The VRU has several projects that aim to prevent violence and restore former offenders to lead meaningful lives free of crime and violence. A programme which has helped reduce violence is the Medics Against Violence programme. Made up of NHS volunteers this programme works with local schools to speak to young people about avoiding confrontational violence. This programme has helped over 150,000 young people make better choices when placed in a situation that could result in conflict. Glasgow has seen fewer murders and a 69% decline in the number of people carrying knives in the last decade.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>What is clear is that if the right preventative response to crime is put in place and receives the necessary funding, crime can be reduced. There remains considerable debate regarding the effectiveness of preventative responses to crime. While there is near universal agreement that programmes such as the Violence Reduction Unit have been effective, this is largely down to sustained funding and broad support from politicians, the National Health Service and the criminal justice system. Some estimates place the total cost of violent crime to Scotland at nearly £3 billion a year. Therefore, with a budget of just £1.5 million a year the Violence Reduction Unit seems like good value for the European Union and the Scottish Government. It has reduced knife crime considerably and offenders that participate in its mentoring programme are much less likely to reoffend. However, not all preventative responses to crime receive sustained funding. The Scottish Centre for Research and Justice estimates that many educational interventions are well intentioned but not sustained and therefore have a limited impact. Furthermore, other preventative responses to crime such as neighbourhood watch schemes merely displace crime from one neighbourhood to another. Finally, as the Joseph Rowntree Foundation has found in their extensive research on crime and poverty, crime is often generational and factors such as employment levels and access to quality education and healthcare are more than just casual factors causing crime and violence. Changes to the economy, globalisation and national policy often play a significant role in fostering the conditions for crime to occur. Preventive education programmes that go into schools can hardly reverse long-term trends such as job losses relevant to a specific area or industry for example. Therefore, while preventive responses to crime should be explored and crime statistics examined post rollout, in some ways their impact can be minimal.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Some countries also have preventive responses to crime and many of these responses have been a success. The Centre for Justice and Crime Prevention in South Africa is a non-profit organisation that aims to intervene early to limit the risk of young South Africans falling into a life of crime. The CJCP has several programmes aimed to help at-risk youths gain access to work and receive extra support in school. The Western Cape in South Africa has also begun to tackle crime through legislation. A new law has begun the process of reforming South Africa's criminal justice system and how it handles juvenile cases. In addition to protecting the rights of children accused of crimes, the new law also diverts the cases of minors away from the formal courts. This shows that South Africa is taking steps to ensure that children who commit crime can be reintegrated into society and do not go in and out of prison for decades. Scotland's Hearing System also aims to protect the identity of those caught up in crime, as it provides a diversion from the formal court system. The Hearing System is made of volunteers who sit on panels to hear cases, while always keeping the child at the heart of the decision. The Hearing System is credited with keeping minors out of the criminal justice system and saving taxpayers millions of pounds in the process.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p> <p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Preventative responses to crime can be most effective in dealing with drugs and drug addicts. While the Netherlands and more recently Portugal have reformed their criminal justice systems to better combat offenders with persistent drug habits, in the United States and Scotland drug crime is also being handled differently in comparison to just ten years ago. America's opioid crisis has resulted in the nation's first opioid court, designed not to lock people up but to help sort their addiction out through treatment and access to health professionals, not prison officers. Funded with a three-year \$300,000 US Justice Department grant, the city of Buffalo, New York became the nation's first opioid court in 2017. Buffalo had over 300 deaths attributed to opioid overdoses in 2016 alone. Designed to help approximately 200 people a year the court has had mixed results. Hundreds have stabilised their lives and remained out of the criminal justice system while others have not shown up for court appearances and vanished from authorities. While Scotland may not have the opioid crisis that parts of the United States has, offenders in its prisons still have drug addictions. The growth of Psychoactive Substances (PS) has led to an increase in NHS staff working in prisons. Health teams work across the prison estate 'treat' prisoners rather than punish them and together, with Addiction Prevalence Testing (APT) only about 30% of prisoners test positive for illegal drugs on liberation. Considering that over 70% of prisoners test positive for illegal drugs on admission, this suggests Scotland's drug rehabilitation in prison, often delivered by NHS staff, is working. Therefore, preventative responses have largely been positive with drug offenders, with Scotland's approach being particularly successful.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>To conclude, preventative programmes aimed at reducing crime can be very effective. The Violence Reduction Unit (VRU) in Scotland is a good example of a programme that can make a difference. These programmes are largely educational in scope and move away from punishing those who need to be punished least. Opioid users need help to sort their addictions out, not prison time and a criminal record. As the VRU illustrates taking former offenders and using them to be at the heart of the solution is not only rehabilitative for them but effective in getting others to avoid using violence to solve problems. This essay also examined other responses to crime such as tagging. Tagging does not always prevent crime and contains no rehabilitative role unless part of a larger community sentence.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>To conclude, while some preventative responses to crime can be effective others can be wasteful of taxpayer and European Union money. Many times, preventative responses to crime are a reaction to pressure from the public caused by media publicity. They often can be a quick and sometimes short-lived reaction to what is viewed as a public health epidemic. When the public turns its attention to something else, the programme or programmes designed to curtail the public health epidemic end. Preventative responses need adequate funding which is sustainable and tied to realistic and measurable goals. Crime which is endemic to urban centres for example is often the result of generations of neglect. Short term preventative measures are often unable to arrest the long-term decline of social and economic conditions in some parts of Scotland. The limits of preventative responses to crime can also be seen in places such as Cape Town and São Paulo, where no education intervention will change the massive inequality existing in both South Africa and Brazil. However, suggesting that prisons in Scotland, South Africa and Brazil will help reduce violent crime is both inaccurate and misleading. Incarcerating and warehousing repeat offenders leads to a crime cycle that often causes more harm to society in comparison to more restorative approaches that aim to reach young people before they have a criminal record.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Part B

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
15.			15	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 15 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <p>Benefits of official statistics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • easy and cheap to access – saves time and money as data already exists • Usually high-quality data based on large, representative samples • contemporary, for example, official statistics will be gathered and published periodically • usually collected in a standardised and systematic manner – makes it easier to analyse • trends over time can be identified • comparisons can be made between groups and countries. <p>Limitations of official statistics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • may not relate exactly to the issue being studied due to definitions by the collector differing from the user • open to manipulation and being ‘massaged’ for political or economic reasons • socially constructed, may be more useful as studies of the collector rather than the respondents • quantitative data tells us very little about the human stories or interpretations of why things happen as they do • statistical data is only a snapshot of an issue at that moment in time and only represents a partial picture of reality • Marxists criticism of official statistics that their purpose is to conceal or distort reality to maintain the hierarchical status quo. <p>Reference to alternative methods could include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • interviews • focus groups • surveys • questionnaires • case studies. <p>Ethical issues including</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • consent • privacy • harm • deception. <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Official statistics have limited use for researching youth crime as official crime figures only capture crime which is reported to or recorded by police which is a small proportion of crime committed.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>This example contains analysis of a relevant issue.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Official statistics have limited use for researching youth crime as official crime figures only capture crime which is reported to or recorded by police which is a small proportion of crime committed. They fail to capture the true picture of crime, missing significant amounts of unrecorded crime, known as the ‘dark figure’ of crime, crimes that have not been witnessed by the public or reported to the police or which are not recognised as criminal by the victims or police.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a relevant point and supporting evidence.</p> <p>Response 3 <i>Official statistics have limited use for researching youth crime as official crime figures only capture crime which is reported to or recorded by police which is a small proportion of crime committed. They fail to capture the true picture of crime, missing significant amounts of unrecorded crime, known as the ‘dark figure’ of crime, crimes that have not been witnessed by the public or reported to the police or which are not recognised as criminal by the victims or police. However, official figures of crime such as police recorded crime statistics provide a detailed measure of local and national crime which are regularly updated and provide an accurate indicator of emerging trends in crime as they occur.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point and supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario.</p> <p>Response 4 <i>Official statistics have limited use for researching youth crime as official crime figures only capture crime which is reported to or recorded by police which is a small proportion of crime committed. They fail to capture the true picture of crime, missing significant amounts of unrecorded crime, known as the ‘dark figure’ of crime, crimes that have not been witnessed by the public or reported to the police or which are not recognised as criminal by the victims or police. However, official figures of crime such as police recorded crime statistics provide a detailed measure of local and national crime which are regularly updated and provide an accurate indicator of emerging trends in crime as they occur.</i></p> <p><i>An alternative method that could be used to research youth crime is participant observation. This is a qualitative method of research which allows the researcher to observe the actions and meanings of the observed group in a natural setting to achieve a state of verstehen or empathetic understanding.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point, supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario and analysis of an alternative method.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 5 <i>Official statistics have limited use for researching youth crime as official crime figures only capture crime which is reported to or recorded by police which is a small proportion of crime committed. They fail to capture the true picture of crime, missing significant amounts of unrecorded crime, known as the ‘dark figure’ of crime, crimes that have not been witnessed by the public or reported to the police or which are not recognised as criminal by the victims or police. However, official figures of crime such as Police recorded crime statistics provide a detailed measure of local and national crime which are regularly updated and provide an accurate indicator of emerging trends in crime as they occur.</i></p> <p><i>An alternative method that could be used to research youth crime is observation. This is a qualitative method of research which allows the researcher to observe the actions and meanings of an observed group like a youth gang in a natural setting to achieve a state of verstehen or empathetic understanding. However, the use of participant observation has several risks. If observation of the group is overt there is a risk of the observer’s presence affecting the behaviour of the group who might act unnaturally. Covert observation is less likely to lead to this situation but also has a risk of the researcher ‘going native’ and getting too close to the group, losing objectivity. A further issue associated with covert participation is that it poses several ethical problems. Researchers will often have to lie or deceive the group to gain access and acceptance. In a case where a researcher infiltrates a criminal gang, such as Pearson’s 2009 study of football hooligans, there is a risk of having to break the law to retain the trust of the group.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point, supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario, analysis of an alternative method and consideration of ethical issues related to one method.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 6 <i>Observation is a more effective method for gathering data on youth crime because it allows the researcher to understand why people are motivated to commit crime.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark summarises key points – 1 mark.</p> <p>Response 7 <i>Observation is a more effective method than official statistics for gathering data on youth crime because observation allows the researcher to understand why people are motivated to commit crime. Although this approach requires a huge commitment in terms of time from the researcher it provides a realistic, in-depth picture of criminal behaviour.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark clearly shows which method is preferred, supported with reasons – 2 marks.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 8</p> <p><i>Official statistics are not the best method for investigating this issue. To a large extent, observation is the more effective method for gathering data on youth crime because observation allows the researcher to understand why people are motivated to commit crime. Although this approach requires a huge commitment in terms of time from the researcher it provides a realistic, in-depth picture of criminal behaviour. Despite official statistics giving us an idea of the volume of crime in society, this method gives a false picture as it only records a fraction of the actual crime being committed in society.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark clearly shows which method is preferred, supported with reasons and reasons for rejecting an alternative method – 3 marks.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
16.			15	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 15 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <p>Arguments that the source is valid and/or reliable</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> researched, produced and published by an academic institution carried out by trained researchers following academic protocols national cohort of more than 19,500 in study is a large sample argument that 11,726 participants from a cohort of over 19,500 is collectively high longitudinal cohort studies risk sample attrition – members of the cohort dropping out or not being contactable, which reduces reliability conducted between January 2015 and March 2016 so relatively up to date web, telephone or face-to-face interviews conducted – likely to gain a higher response rate interviews allow researchers to clarify questions to respondents which increases reliability data relates to the deviant and criminal activities, like binge drinking, habitual smoking and anti-social behaviour, of young people meaning it would be valid to researchers of law and order matters longitudinal studies can produce both quantitative data and rich, qualitative data longitudinal studies trace developments over time, rather than just taking a one-off ‘snapshot’ of one moment – this mean there will be other data sets available to examine and identify trends and causes of issues over time. <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Arguments that the source’s validity and/or reliability are questionable</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> time lapse of over one year to conduct sweep of cohort is also a significant as recall of incidences and experiences recounted by respondents may be inaccurate date of publication was December 2018 which is a significant time lag between research stage (January 2015 – March 2016) and publication relatively low response rate of 11,726 out of a cohort of over 19,500 no indication cohort or sample is representative or weighted web and telephone interviews cannot authenticate identity of respondents – may be completed by others further information is required on use of interviews to ensure reliability source appears to only contain summary information information is omitted from the source, for example, no information or data relating to figure 1 yet this is available for figures 2 and 3. <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Source B has been produced by academics from the Institute of Education at UCL. This could be one reason for it to be considered trustworthy, as the research will have been produced by trained researchers who have followed academic protocols.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of one key aspect related to the trustworthiness of the source.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Source B is based on responses by a sample of 11,726 respondents which is a large sample which will have been calculated by the research designers to allow generalisations about the wider UK population of 14-year olds to be made and is therefore reason to consider the source trustworthy. A variety of methods for contacting respondents were also used, including web, telephone and face-to-face interview, which has ensured a high response rate from the 19,500 strong cohort and increases trust in the source further.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis, supported by evidence, of one key aspect related to the trustworthiness of the source.</p> <p>Response 3 <i>Source B was conducted between January 2015 – March 2016 which makes the data fairly up-to-date and therefore an accurate reflection of the cohort and young people in the UK's experiences of criminal and deviant behaviours. However, as these findings were conducted over a period of over a year and not published until January 2018 there may be inaccuracies in the recollection of the respondents or the recording and transcribing of data by researchers which reduces some of the trust we can have in Source B. Nevertheless, as this source is part of a longitudinal study the researchers can revisit, check and repeat this research with the cohort to update their findings.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis and evaluation of strengths and weaknesses of one key aspect of the source, supported by knowledge of social science research.</p> <p>Response 4 <i>Source B can be considered reliable as it is from a longitudinal study. This research method can produce both quantitative data and rich, qualitative data depending on the design of questions. Quantitative data is produced from closed questions or scaled closed questions with a rating scale. Figure 2 in Source B illustrates quantitative data which presents the results of a closed question relating to respondents' 'Most serious level of contact with the police' in an accessible, tabular form which makes it easier for the reader to analyse and interpret. The fact the question asked has been the same for all respondents increases the reliability. This also means that the research can be repeated as the same question can be asked again in the future to see if the results are similar or different at different ages and stages. The ability to repeat the same research with the same cohort or sample is a further reason the source is trustworthy.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>This example contains analysis and evaluation of a key aspect of the source supported by knowledge of social science research and reference to additional or alternative approaches which increase the trustworthiness of the source.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 5 <i>Overall, Source B is extremely trustworthy as it has been conducted by trained, academic researchers who have gathered information from a very large sample.</i></p> <p>This example contains a simple summary of key points – 1 mark.</p> <p>Response 6 <i>Despite some limitations associated with use of longitudinal studies, such as sample fatigue, Source B is largely trustworthy. The methodology employed by researchers will be academically robust and the sample size ensures that the findings are likely to be an accurate reflection of the study population.</i></p> <p>This example contains a clear overall judgement about the trustworthiness of the source supported by reasons/evidence – 2 marks.</p> <p>Response 7 <i>Source B is highly trustworthy. The source is valid to a large extent as a piece of social research as it details information on criminal actions of young people. Trust in Source B is also enhanced by the fact that it has been researched and produced by academic researchers using an extensive sample population and methods which can be repeated, all of which increase the reliability of the information presented. Although further information on why information relating to 'Figure 1' is omitted and what that information was related to would increase our trust in Source B, it is not enough to make us question the validity or reliability of the information it does present.</i></p> <p>This example contains a clear overall judgement about the trustworthiness of the source supported by analysis and evaluation – 3 marks.</p>

Section 3 – Social inequality and research methods

Part A

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
17.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that make reference to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • discussion of definitions of poverty • extent of poverty in Scotland/UK • evidence to document the prevalence of poverty • different ways to measure poverty including criteria used by governments • reference to social stratification and life chances • extent of social mobility Scotland/UK • evidence of a lack of social mobility in Scotland/UK • validity and reliability of social surveys • validity and reliability of official statistics • measuring the extent of poverty is challenging • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>In December 2006, the UN adopted a definition of child poverty which noted that children living in poverty were deprived of nutrition, water and sanitation facilities, access to basic health care services, shelter and education. The definition noted that while poverty hurts every human being ‘it is most threatening and harmful to children’. It means that they are unable to enjoy their rights, to reach their full potential and to participate as full members of society. Researchers have developed ways of measuring deprivation which are similar to the UN definition of child poverty and can be used to examine the extent and nature of child poverty in poorer countries. These new methods have transformed the way UNICEF and many countries understand and measure child poverty.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>It was deduced that the UK Government is in a ‘state of denial’ about poverty. This was the conclusion reached by a UN expert after commissioning a 12-day study of the UK. Philip Alston, special rapporteur on extreme poverty, stated that despite being in one of the world's richest countries he had encountered ‘misery’. Levels of child poverty were found to be ‘staggering’ and 1.5 million people were destitute at some point in 2017. However, the government rejected his analysis, countering by highlighting rising household incomes. Prof Alston, an expert in human rights law based at New York University, visited locations including Belfast, Bristol, Cardiff, Edinburgh, Essex, Glasgow, London and Newcastle on a fact-finding mission. He met people affected by poverty as well as government officials, discussing the impact of austerity, changes to benefits and local government funding. At a news conference in London, he said he witnessed ‘a lot of misery, a lot of people who feel the system is failing them, a lot of people who feel the system is really just there to punish them’. Quoting figures from the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, it was reported that more than 1.5 million people were destitute at some point in 2017, meaning they lived on less than £70 a week or went without essentials such as housing, food, clothing or heating. According to Joseph Rowntree Foundation a fifth of the population, amounting to around 14 million people, are living in poverty. This metric is disputed by the government whose measure of poverty indicates there are a million fewer people living in poverty. As such, the government would argue that academics and interest groups have exaggerated the true level of poverty.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The UK has been left without an official measure of poverty since the Conservative government abolished Labour’s child poverty targets. Although, the previous measure remains in Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. The Child Poverty Action Group said measurement alone would not improve the lives of struggling families. They claim that we now need set targets for reducing and eradicating child poverty. The government claims that measuring poverty is difficult and additional measures need to be taken into consideration. The number of children living in poverty is predicted to increase due to government welfare cuts. Similarly, due to the economic crisis and years of austerity, child poverty is on the rise in other wealthy countries, according to UNICEF. In Spain, the proportion of children living below the poverty line increased by nine percentage points between 2008 and 2018, to reach almost 40%.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>While there have been concerns about relative poverty rising in recent years, particularly in the UK, fewer people are now living in absolute poverty around the world. The amount of people living in absolute poverty globally fell to a new low of 10% in 2018, down from 11 % in 2016, reflecting steady but slowing progress according to the World Bank. The number of people living on less than \$1.90 a day fell during this period by 68 million to 736 million. Despite the tremendous progress in reducing absolute poverty, rates remain stubbornly high in low-income countries and those affected by conflict and political upheaval. Although half of the world's countries now have poverty rates below 3%, the world as a whole is not on track to achieve the target of less than 3% living in absolute poverty by 2030. In the 25 years from 1990 to 2015, the absolute poverty rate dropped an average of a percentage point per year – from nearly 36% to 10%. But the rate dropped only one percentage point in the two years from 2013 to 2015. The deceleration in global numbers stems mainly from an increasing concentration of absolute poverty in regions where poverty reduction has lagged. A case in point is Sub-Saharan Africa, where, under all but the most optimistic scenarios, poverty will remain in double digits by 2030.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Overall, it is difficult to measure the amount and type of poverty which exists today. This is because there are different ways of measuring poverty. The official measure was abolished by the UK Government in 2015. This has led critics to argue that the poverty levels in the UK are much higher than the government is willing to admit. This may be because government policies of austerity and welfare cuts have contributed to poverty increasing. Therefore, poverty in the UK is not exaggerated but worse than figures suggest.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Poverty in the UK is primarily caused by structural factors relating to the economy, such as low wages, a lack of jobs and the lack of state provision to adequately compensate those engaged in unpaid work, particularly caring work. It is widely documented that the extent of those experiencing deprivation is continuing to increase. This is despite the fact that it is difficult to apply a universal consensus on actually defining poverty. However, the Social Metrics Commission concludes that 12% of the total UK population is in 'persistent' poverty, meaning that they have spent all or most of the last four years below the breadline with workless families, and families that contain a disabled person, most likely to be stuck in poverty. Furthermore, regional variations in terms of poverty rates apply across the UK and can be demonstrated by the North South divide. Similarly, in Germany, the East continues to be much poorer than the West, where wages continue to be lower as a consequence of structural factors related to Germany's historic division. These factors combined with ideological economic policies and welfare reform, has served to increase poverty. Therefore, although there is an ambiguity surrounding poverty in definitive terms, it is conclusive that poverty rates are ascending and therefore not exaggerated.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
18.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that make reference to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • discussion of what social inequality is/definition • discussion/evaluation of sociological theories that attempt to explain the existence of social inequality and/or changes over time • critical evaluation of conflict/functionalist explanations • discussion of the impact of social inequality in society and different groups in society • the impact of government policies on social inequality • explanations of social stratification and its impact on individuals and groups in society with reference to gender, race, age and class • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Any other valid point that meets the criteria described in the general marking principles for this kind of question.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>In the United Kingdom today it is clear that minority ethnic groups continue to be disadvantaged, thus contributing to inequality. Researchers examining employment and fair pay point out that all ethnic minority groups in the UK have less chance of gaining professional and managerial jobs in comparison to the white majority. In addition, the weekly earnings of ethnic minorities, especially for men, was worse as was promotion once in employment. While the evidence suggests that Pakistani/Bangladeshi women have made some moderate strides in job promotion, Black Caribbean men still experience considerable employment discrimination in earnings and access to managerial positions. Therefore, as the middle class continues to shrink in the UK Black Caribbean men will have an even more difficult time gaining employment equality with their male white peers.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks developed evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>In explaining inequality in the United Kingdom today some sociologists have laid the blame on the educational system. French sociologist Pierre Bourdieu, drawing on Marxism, argued that the main role of the education system is to ensure that the dominant class passes on their culture to the next generation. He referred to this as cultural reproduction and suggested that the culture of the higher classes, because of its association with high-status, translates into power and wealth. This cultural capital, which includes ways of talking, certain leisure, food and music pursuits is given greater status in the education system. Bourdieu goes on to argue that success in education therefore largely depends on possessing and displaying this cultural capital and this is often reflected in formal assessments and the curriculum. From Bourdieu's perspective education is not to provide equal opportunity for all but to ensure the dominance of the upper classes as their cultural capital provides a major advantage in their educational success. This may help to explain why middle-class white children, who possess the most cultural capital, get higher GCSE results in school. However, other socialists such as Alice Sullivan argue that educational success, a key factor in social mobility for disadvantaged groups, has less to do with cultural capital and more to do with parental aspirations and the resources that parents commit to their children. Surveys that she carried out to test the cultural capital theory found that attending cultural events and playing a musical instrument had little to do with academic success. This suggests that perhaps cultural capital is less important in explaining how advantaged groups, such as pupils from upper-class backgrounds, have maintained their power and wealth in an unequal Britain.</i></p> <p>This example contains quality analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Where groups are most disadvantaged, more inequality exists in society. This is true for example in South Africa which has high levels of inequality and high levels of physical and sexual violence committed against women. In 2018 roughly 3,000 women were murdered in South Africa, more than five times the global average. In addition, the United Nations ranks South Africa first in rapes per capita in the world. It is believed that a woman is raped in South African approximately every 30 seconds. Therefore, it is no surprise that a World Bank report in 2018 ranked South Africa the most unequal nation in the world. Social scientists have therefore concluded that where there is less physical and sexual violence against women there is likely to be greater levels of equality in society.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>It has also been found that countries with fewer disadvantaged groups have stronger economies, lower levels of crime and fewer social problems. For example, women in the UK today still face discrimination and unequal access to the opportunities that men have. Although in Scotland the 2019 National Statistics Survey reports that the gap between men and women in work has narrowed considerably. Since 2008 the employment rate for women has increased in 23 of Scotland's 32 local authorities, a much greater increase when compared to the rise in employment for men. However, on average women in Scotland still earn £182 less per week in comparison to men in a similar occupation. Some sociologists such as Mairtin Mac an Ghaill argue that there is a "crisis of masculinity" in Western democracies with a steady decline in manufacturing and traditional blue-collar jobs, areas traditionally dominated by men. In societies where all groups, including women, have an equal chance at sharing in society's opportunities, everyone benefits. One considerable barrier for women entering the workforce is child care costs. With Scottish parents now paying on average £5800 a year for just a part-time nursery place no wonder many Scottish women find it difficult to justify going back to work. In contrast to Sweden, a recent law has mandated that all four and five-year old children can attend day care for free. Furthermore, one year of parental leave in Sweden at 80% of pay means women can make choices allowing them to better balance work and family life. This contrasts with Scotland where women receive 90% of their pay but only for the first six weeks and then just £148 per week for the next 33 weeks. The United Nations recently ranked Sweden third in the world in gender equality, so it is not surprising that this contributes to Sweden's strong economy. Sweden has the highest GDP in Europe and one of the lowest murder and homicide rates in the world. With its high wages, strong unions and generous welfare provision, Sweden has fewer disadvantaged groups. This greater level of equality ends up benefiting society.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of an alternative argument.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>To conclude, disadvantaged groups do prove that inequality persists in society. Functionalists argue that in advanced industrial societies some level of inequality is inevitable. For talented and highly-skilled people there needs to be an adequate level of rewards to attract talent to society's most important jobs. This inevitably leads to resources and rewards being distributed unequally perpetuating the inequality and lack of opportunity some groups in society face. However, Marxists see society through the lens of conflict with one class, the bourgeoisie (ruling class) exploiting and dominating the proletariat (working class). Marxists view disadvantaged groups because of the actions of the bourgeoisie, enacting laws and using the police to protect their interests.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Disadvantaged groups do prove that inequality persists in society. The greater the disadvantage that some in society have higher levels of inequality follow. This is true in many of the Nordic countries which place greater emphasis on giving everyone equal access to resources and opportunities found in their respective societies. Free day care and generous maternal and paternal rights tend to place women, regardless of wealth, at less of a disadvantage in gaining promotions at work and pay packages equal to that of men. Feminist arguments put forth by Dale Spender around gender socialisation are less persuasive in countries such as Sweden. In more unequal countries, such as the United Kingdom, where the gender gap is more pronounced feminist arguments do indeed carry more weight. While comparisons across countries can sometimes lack validity, the United Nations carries out plenty of them. Their data tends to find that new democracies in Africa and Asia, with less developed economies, almost always have groups with considerably more disadvantages, both in education and as victims of violence. South Africa perhaps most illustrates this. To ignore the link between disadvantaged groups such as women and ethnic minorities, many of whom are asylum seekers, and societal inequalities is ill judged.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
19.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • educational attainment levels • positive destinations • independent and state schools' comparisons • educational reforms • employment • mental health • lifestyle • hereditary factors influencing inequality • evaluation of social mobility in society • relevant global factor(s). <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Inequality in England's schools has increased following government reforms, with fewer children from less well-off backgrounds now attending higher rated schools. Current policies were increasing inequality. Two thirds of school leaders surveyed as part of the study agreed that inequalities between schools are becoming wider as a result of current government policy. The system has become worse, with higher achieving schools accepting fewer pupils from disadvantaged backgrounds than before. At present there appears to be a system of winners and losers, with a loss of equity as a result. However, mental illness, violence and unemployment are important causes and consequences of social inequality. Mental health problems can lead to inequality as it can reduce educational achievement and employability and also increase the risk of damaging relationships. Drug and alcohol misuse, crime and mental illness can also increase social inequalities because of their impact on employment and housing status.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant contemporary supporting evidence but lacks evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>While higher status schools seem to be benefiting from government policies, schools on the other end of the spectrum are facing more challenges, such as being undersubscribed and having disproportionate numbers of disadvantaged, migrant and hard-to-place children. The government introduced the £2.5 billion Pupil Premium to support the education of disadvantaged pupils, and in recent years, the attainment gap between disadvantaged pupils and their peers narrowed by over 10% in both primary and secondary schools in England. The government claims that the vast majority of pupils are in a good or outstanding school, 1.9 million more than in 2010. Moreover, it claims that it is investing £23 billion by 2020 to create more good school places and are targeting £72 million at the areas that need it most to help improve prospects and opportunities for some of the most disadvantaged young people. Similar provision was made in Scotland with the Pupil Equity Fund (of £120 million); although it is too early to assess its impact. One way of measuring the impact of these policies is the numbers of impoverished students going on to higher education. However, within Scotland, the leading universities, particularly St Andrews, are facing increasing pressure from Scottish ministers and student leaders over the low number of students from the poorest households who gain entry, St Andrews having admitted just 13 students from the poorest households in 2012. By contrast, Oxford University announced it had extended its support package for poor students to Scottish applicants they would receive £22,000 over three years towards living and university costs. This suggests poverty can have a negative impact on the individual's education, but this can be mitigated by government funding and educational policy directed to support those most in need. Despite this, the evidence available appears to show current interventions have had mixed success.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Many UK citizens are destined to end up in the same positions occupied by their parents due to wealth and educational factors – particularly those on the lowest or highest rungs of life's economic ladder. Wealth and educational opportunities are not evenly distributed in the UK with 7% of those privately educated dominating the top professions. Similarly, in Germany, the 2018 Education in Germany report highlighted that although more citizens are getting an education, a person's educational opportunities are still closely linked to their social and economic background. This research warned that education opportunities were still unevenly distributed throughout German society and that the poorest were most disadvantaged, just like the poorest in the UK.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>A further impact of inequality is on health. The impact of educational inequality and the limits this has on work opportunities, along with a lack of social connections, has an influence on whether an individual suffers from the physical and mental health effects of inequality throughout life as well as into old age. The health implications of these factors are exacerbated by further reduced income in retirement. Older people with the least wealth are more likely to have one or more health problems, including angina, diabetes, depression, osteoarthritis and cataracts. Poorer people in later life are also up to four times more likely to have diabetes and up to fifteen times more likely to have osteoarthritis. While women suffer from these inequalities more than men, people from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) backgrounds and some from LGBT backgrounds are also disproportionately disadvantaged. Internationally, it is also well established, in both developing and developed countries, that ill health follows a socio-economic pattern, to the disadvantage of the poorest. The social determinants of health, not just biological or genetic issues, contribute substantially to inequality. For example, a South African study (McIntyre, 2011) found that illness and disability were greater among lower socio-economic groups and that employment, education, and housing contribute to these disparities in health. Studies also highlighted a racial aspect to inequalities in South Africa. Therefore, the circumstances into which individuals are born, grow up, live, and work all have a bearing on circumstances and behaviours which impact upon their health, for example, smoking, alcohol abuse, physical inactivity and unhealthy diet. These factors entrench inequality and disproportionately affect low socioeconomic groups. Therefore, although inequality can have a negative impact on education the consequences for health are wider and more damaging for the individual and minority groups within society.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>For the individual, the impact of inequality can be linked to a range of factors. Education combined with employment, mental health, lifestyle and hereditary factors can all contribute to impact upon inequality. Political factors can also generate inequality depending upon government responses to socio-economic issues. Inequality which often leads to disadvantage throughout life means that many people will suffer poor health, financial insecurity, weak social connections and ultimately a shorter life. These inequalities - with richer older people living around eight years longer than those with less advantage - have sustained over time, despite policy and practice designed to reduce them. While inequality has an impact on education, the impact is greater and wider than just this for the individual.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>For the individual, the greatest impact of inequality can manifest profoundly and adversely upon a range of variables and not merely upon an individual's quality of education. Substantial investment has been made by the public sector in both Scotland and wider UK to alleviate inequality by attempting to close the poverty related attainment gap across primary, secondary and tertiary education. Despite these efforts significant inequalities persist. Indeed, growing wealth inequality in the UK has been analogised as a ticking time bomb. This growing inequality can be partially explained by unequal distribution and access to education but also household wealth, employment, social protection, housing, infrastructure and geographical area of residence. This implies that factors which lie outside of education may have a significant impact upon an individual's status and standard of living. Wealth can be argued to be more significant in the way it can sustain inequality experienced by the individual and leave them less able to challenge the social status quo. Undoubtedly, education contributes to preserving inequality, but this is a symptom of the advantages and disadvantages that wealth confers rather than a cause.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
20.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • discussion of what wealth distribution means • discussion of the types of health and social problems that exist because of inequality • references to some of the following health and social problems caused by unequal wealth distribution – low life expectancy, mental illness, teenage pregnancy, violence, higher crime rates, low educational attainment, poorer health levels, drug use, etc. • evaluation of theories and recent studies that have found that each of these problems was much worse in countries that are more unequal • recognition that health and social problems are directly linked to the size of the gap between rich and poor • the impact of government policy on income distribution and disparity between countries • critical evaluation of different countries' experiences. <p><i>Any other valid point that meets the criteria described in the general marking principles for this kind of question.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Some suggest that the impact of inequality is less easily seen today because many in society ignore it and blame individuals for making poor choices. More conservative explanations of poverty tend to blame the moral failings of those stuck in the “poverty trap” for example. Some see those dependent on benefits as part of a “dependency culture” where families become reliant on benefits and come to expect government assistance because there are no available jobs. Still others from the left disagree that the impact of inequality is less easily seen today in comparison to past decades. These politicians, social scientists and others in academia see deregulation, privatisation and tax changes beginning with the Thatcher years as causing huge levels of inequality much of which can still be seen today. Several former mining communities in Scotland today illustrate the impact that inequality can have. The Coalfields Regeneration Trust recently concluded that many coal mining communities were “still scarred by a legacy from the past” and experienced higher levels of unemployment, ill health and social disadvantage which had extended far beyond ex-miners in certain communities. This suggests that the impact of inequality can be seen more easily by some than others, depending on one’s political ideology and how they view the causes of poverty.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks developed evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>The impact of inequality can be seen in some communities in Scotland more than others. For example, the life expectancy for men growing up in Glasgow is nearly seven years below the national average. In the poorest 10% of communities in Scotland a boy will die 13 years earlier when compared to a boy growing up in one of the nation's most affluent areas, according to data published by the National Records of Scotland. Social scientists who favour the Functionalist approach suggest that in many communities with poor health outcomes, dysfunctional schools and high crime rates mean a sense of social solidarity has been lost. French sociologist Emile Durkheim argued that if a shared set of norms and values was interrupted or lost then community decay would inevitably result. Critics of Durkheim and the Functionalist approach view his explanation as outdated in an increasingly global world where young people have less in common with their local community and more in common with other young people from around the world. In addition to poor life expectancy in some of Scotland's communities, inequality can also lead to generational poverty. The Scottish Index on Multiple Deprivation (SMID) illustrates that 56 of the 100 most deprived areas in Scotland are in Glasgow. The consequences of generational poverty mean that poor communities pass on poor infrastructure, high unemployment levels, poor local services and unstable communities to the next generation of inhabitants. Starting out poor in life greatly increases the risk of remaining poor later in life. Therefore, in some communities and individuals the impact of inequality is easily seen and very difficult to escape.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The impact of inequality on countries such as China and India cannot be ignored. For these fast-growing economies, inequality can mean instability and political uncertainty. Both China and India have experienced sustained economic growth in recent decades, and this has helped lift millions of people out of absolute poverty. But the benefits of this growth have not been distributed evenly and some suggest this is a growing threat to the Communist Party in Beijing. With home prices in China's first tier cities such as Beijing, Shanghai and Shenzhen doubling since 2013 it has become increasingly difficult for China's middle class in some regions to grow. Many commentators have suggested that rising inequality is behind the recent protests in Hong Kong. Only about half of Hong Kong's residents own their own home compared to about 90% of Chinese residents on the mainland. Similarly, for young people in South-east England, home ownership has fallen by 50% in the last twenty years suggesting that for many, entering the middle class is no longer possible. With globalisation, technological change and laws that allow for wealth accumulation for the very richest, many cities and countries are struggling to address the rising tide of inequality and real estate inequity. Inclusive growth, where all share in economic prosperity, does not seem to have been found.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>One country where the impact of inequality is easily seen is in Romania where many rural communities have been left behind by capitalism and poor government investment. While inequality is growing in Wales for example, it is more easily seen in some parts of Romania where alcoholism, unemployment and poor schooling is fuelling bribery and threatening the rule of law. The European Commission issued a recent report that Romania has one of the highest levels of income inequality in the EU. Sergiu Tara from the Polytechnical University of Bucharest has found that excessive austerity measures adopted by recent Governments have resulted in the purchasing power of Romanians decreasing by more than 9%. Coupled with increased VAT rates this has pushed many Romanians into poverty. With many Romanians currently spending about 25% of their income on food it is clear that, at least in comparison to Wales, Romania has a much smaller middle class and greater levels of poverty. This has resulted in Romanians leaving the country in search of better paying jobs elsewhere in the European Union and greater levels of urbanisation within the country, especially to the capital, Bucharest. When examining the impact of inequality to Wales, the trends occurring in Romania are different. While the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) recently cited Wales as having improved since 2015, a recent report concluded that the Gypsy, Roma Traveller community in Wales was falling further behind in education and homelessness was growing. Despite such divisions in Welsh society the sheer number of people in poverty in Romania would suggest a greater level of desperation. The impact of inequality on groups like the Gypsy, Roma Traveller community in both Wales and Romania may be comparable but wider similarities involving migration and urbanisation are harder to find.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>The impact of inequality is seen in some communities and individuals more than others. Dilapidated buildings in parts of Lanarkshire and Fife for example are visible but the impact of inequalities in health are much less visible. Life expectancy, often used to illustrate disparities in health, is seen only by politicians and social scientists. Heart disease and alcohol-related hospital admission is the result of generations of inequality. While the Scottish Government may claim that the gap in health inequality is narrowing across the country, perhaps due to the smoking ban, the gap is difficult to ignore. Poorer Scots are still three times more likely to die before the age of 25 in comparison to those living in the wealthiest areas. Across the world life expectancy is greater for everyone when societies are more equal. Therefore, despite the United States having a high GDP, in less wealthy countries with greater levels of equality people live longer. Wealth inequality therefore is more easily seen in comparison to health inequality.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Some argue that the impact of inequality is more visible today in comparison to years past. Younger generations in Scotland and indeed throughout the UK are now finding that their wealth has fallen behind that of the recently retired. However, while earning gaps have increased for men they have been narrowing for women. Inequality across regions of Britain is also less pronounced. Current unemployment rates across the country are now more evenly spread suggesting that the North-South divide is not what it used to be. But there is no denying that for some individuals, inequality is very visible. Those with disabilities, asylum seekers and refugees continue to experience both direct and indirect discrimination. A lack of social mobility persists proving that the UK is still one of the most unequal countries in Western Europe. But when compared to the United States, where income inequality is rising even faster, the impact of the “haves” and “have nots” is much more easily seen. In parts of the mid-west and the “rust belt” unemployment is higher, working class men are dying younger and real wages have fallen. In these communities not only is inequality visible but it cannot be ignored.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
21.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • discussion of inequality • individualism • functionalism • structuralism • conflict theory • collectivism • government responses • non-governmental organisation responses • relevant global comparator(s). <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Individuals' status depends on the environment in which they live. An alarming statistic, from the House of Commons, is that by 2030 the richest 1% will own two-thirds of global wealth. The distribution of wealth, or rather the lack of it, may well be the biggest issue facing society. Marxists claim that capitalism will not lift the working classes out of poverty and only exists to perpetuate the material advantage of the middle and upper classes. By emphasising the importance of social class, Marxists focus on collective rather than individual action as a response to inequality. Within a capitalist system, this would require pressure on the government by bodies such as trade unions to force them into introducing collectivist solutions, for example minimum wage laws.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks evaluation.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Different schools of political thought have a range of views on how inequality is generated and how it should therefore be overcome. Classical liberalism contends that individuals are ultimately responsible for their own poverty and argue for laissez-faire policies. Marxists consider class and group discrimination as central to poverty and assign a key role to the state in intervening and regulating markets. These two theories digress in terms of whether individuals should be considered actively responsible for their well-being or as passive victims of a flawed socio-economic system. Thus, they have divergent views on the role of government, redistribution and the implementation of public policies such as providing public goods and establishing minimum wages and anti-discriminatory laws. Each approach has an important contribution to make to our understanding of whether overcoming inequality is the individual's responsibility or whether collectivist approaches are of greater importance.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p><i>Typically, Labour Governments have been influenced by the more collectivist theories of inequality whereas Conservative policy has treated inequality as a problem the individual has to overcome in line with neo-liberal theory. Poverty rates under the current Conservative Government have increased and compare unfavorably with those under the last Labour administration suggesting collectivist approaches do more to overcome inequality.</i></p> <p>This example contains detailed analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1 <i>In Britain where the emphasis has shifted more and more towards the individual to overcome inequality, the gap between the very rich and the rest is wider than in any other large country in Europe, with UK society the most unequal it has been since the First World War. Income inequality in the UK is higher than in any other European country, except occasionally one of the Baltic states. This poor record in terms of addressing the wealth gap in the UK compared to other nations may also be something which the government is trying to conceal as they appear to have instructed HMRC not to make the publication of income inequality statistics a priority.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Inequality is now a marked feature of socio-economic structures and factors which underpin this are widely debated. Compared to USA, Europeans are twice as likely to believe that luck is the main determinant of inequality. Similarly, people in the US are twice as likely to believe that the poor are lazy, and that hard work leads to higher quality of life. This is despite the fact that the poor (the bottom 20%) work roughly the same hours in the US and Europe. This is because European countries have more redistributive tax systems and more welfare benefits for the poor, and therefore less inequality. Being poor in the US is tougher, given the limited welfare benefits and relatively high levels of post-tax inequality. Therefore, such individualistic, structural needs and beliefs may play a powerful role in motivation to work hard to avoid poverty. This is not just a US issue. Britain is an outlier within Europe, with relatively high inequality. The result is taxation policies that are sometimes perceived as inefficient and wasteful. Left-wing critics have called it “socialism for the rich”. The richest 1% of Americans take 20% of national income, but the richest 1% of Danes only 6%. Affluent British people have seen their share of national income double since 1980. One key factor is government policy, especially taxation. Countries that have made the biggest reductions to their top rates of income tax have seen the largest increases in top income shares. For example, in more equal France, the top rate in 2018 was only 10% lower than it was in 1950. In the more unequal US it was 50% lower. Huber, Huo, and Stephens found that centre and right-wing governments increased the top share of income while left-wing governments reduced inequality.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>To conclude, rather than being the individuals responsibility to overcome inequalities, it should be down to the government. Social equality does not happen automatically. It happens because of leadership, political decisions and because of the allocation of resources. Not all individuals have the capacity to overcome these factors on their own and require government interventions to help them. The UK government does not appear as committed to generating equality and those in other nations given its less favourable record.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Overall the evidence underlines that a more collectivist approach should be pursued in order to reduce inequality and promote social equality. Britain's individualistic approach has led to little progress being made to tackle social inequality in the last decade. This compares less favourably to Sweden, Denmark, Finland, the Netherlands and France in the EU's latest equality league table. However, although the UK's record in tackling inequality is relatively poor, neo-liberals would still persist in arguing that the UK's economic approach creates greater wealth and a more efficient tax system which sees wealth 'trickle down' to the poorer in society. Ultimately the UK joins Slovakia and the Czech Republic among the EU's member states in having made no significant advances in reducing levels of inequality when taking into account a range of fields including the workplace, income, education, health or political engagement.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
22.			30	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 30 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • explanation and evaluation of non-governmental organisations • comparison(s) with other non-governmental organisations in another country or countries • effectiveness of Scottish/UK policies regarding inequality • discussion of Scottish/UK levels of inequality and its impact on communities, groups and/or individuals • comparison(s) with another country or countries and their policies regarding inequality • comparison(s) with another country or countries and their levels of inequality and impact on communities, groups and/or individuals • evaluation of the importance of other factors such as ideology, global economic trends and/or events, etc. <p><i>Any other valid point that meets the criteria described in the general marking principles for this kind of question.</i></p> <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Since the Thatcher administration the growth of NGOs in Britain has expanded considerably. Since 2008 and the beginning of austerity many would claim that NGOs are crucial in helping the poor and softening the blow for so many who were victims of the economic recession. Half the nation's 14 million people living in poverty have a disabled person in their household and this figure is expected to climb. It is hard to imagine where society would be without the work of Disability Rights UK, the British Deaf Association (BDA) or Inclusion Scotland for example. Were these NGOs not around it is clear that the disabled would be worse off. In the 2017 General Election both the Labour and Green parties had separate disabled manifestos suggesting that society is gradually becoming more educated, inclusive and less discriminatory around disability rights. The Equality Act of 2010 has also helped prevent discrimination particularly in the workplace. These measures should gradually reduce the inequality faced by so many, but rights' groups would claim that these measures are well overdue and will take years to make a meaningful difference for some families.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence but lacks developed evaluation.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Whether non-governmental (NGOs) reduce inequality or perpetuate it has long been debated. Conflict theorists such as Max Weber could very well be sceptical of the role NGOs play and the degree to which they may help perpetuate Britain's unequal social structure. Weber, like Marx, believed that different social classes compete for resources such as food, housing, employment, education, and leisure time and that government institutions such as schools and religious institutions help maintain the status quo. Some individuals and organisations can obtain and keep more resources than others and this includes NGOs. If large NGOs are too influential and are linked to the upper-class Weber would accuse NGOs of reinforcing existing class divisions and contributing to inequality. However, if Britain's NGOs are helping to reduce inequality, as many conservatives argue then this may help to explain why NGOs continue to grow and expand, supplanting the role that government would have played years ago. 90% of NGOs have been created since 1975 and proponents see their role as vital in reducing inequality as government budgets shrink. However, many international NGOs with multi-million-pound budgets are increasingly seeing NGOs as part of the problem. Critics point out that large NGOs are worried more about their own survival as an NGO than reducing poverty and clothing the poor for example. Many multi-national NGOs have become too removed from the everyday survival of Britain's poor. Some are also too reliant on pleasing their corporate partners and this distraction inevitably impacts how successful they are in reducing the nation's inequality. Some estimates claim that over 20 new NGOs are created in Britain every day. With such a large Third Sector it would be unfair to judge all of them together. Crisis UK's campaign to end homelessness has made a meaningful impact to thousands as has the work of Shelter UK. So, clearly some organisations are making a difference but non-governmental responses to inequality do not come without criticism.</i></p> <p>This example contains basic analysis of a key aspect with relevant, contemporary supporting evidence and accurate evaluation.</p> <p>Comparison</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>In Russia NGOs have faced many challenges and inequality keeps growing. Since 2012 international NGOs operating within Russia have had to register as foreign agents. Many international NGOs are in Russia to promote human rights and a civil society. Such causes assist minority groups and women for example, thereby helping to ensure a more equal society. There are domestic NGOs such as the Rights of the Disabled and a refugee assistance organisation called Hope because Russian society does not offer the same protections for these groups in comparison to nations in the European Union. Most troubling is the lack of NGOs to support the health care system which is under considerable strain. According to the World Health Organisation Russian men have the second highest suicide rate in Europe and heart disease has ravaged many rural parts of Russia due to high rates of alcoholism. Wealth inequality in Russia is arguably even worse as the richest 10% of Russians own 87% of the country's wealth. To curb such inequality efforts have been made to enact tougher anti-discrimination and tax laws but the Third Sector, in comparison to the UK, is small and underdeveloped. Bribery and corruption have dogged some and many international NGOs have left. Therefore, non-governmental responses to inequality have made little difference to the lives of ordinary Russians.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>This example contains analysis of a key aspect, supported by relevant, contemporary evidence which refers to the UK/Scotland and another country.</p> <p>Response 2</p> <p><i>It may be worth comparing non-governmental responses in the UK to that of other countries to determine the extent of their success in reducing inequality. NGOs in the developing world have poured billions of pounds into programmes trying to eradicate poverty, eliminate disease and provide clean drinking water but they are often accused of gaining too much influence in some countries. Called the “humanitarian face of imperialism” by some and sceptics such as Vladimir Putin suggest that NGOs merely do the bidding of their financial backers. Even internationally recognised environmental NGOs such as Greenpeace are accused of being more influenced by commercial and political interests rather than science. It is perhaps the professionalisation of NGOs in recent years that has attracted the most scrutiny. High overhead costs have meant that some NGOs have been accused of operating simply to benefit the people working for them. However, one such country that benefits from the Third Sector is India. With over three million NGOs India needs this sector to serve an aging population in sometimes remote locations. Therefore, NGOs are a vital tool for local and state governments to provide decent healthcare and play a much greater role in India than in the UK. For example, HelpAge India is one of the leading mobile healthcare providers to disadvantaged elderly and operate in over 21 states. HelpAge provides tens of thousands of cataract eye surgeries a year and this organisation also provides palliative care to end-stage cancer patients. It therefore has a very different role to that of Age UK which does not perform medical procedures. Consequently, while many NGOs have been scrutinised by Russia and some African nations, in places such as India, they clearly play a valuable and more important role when compared to NGOs in the UK. The Indian government simply cannot provide all the services required in some remote and rural parts of the country.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a key aspect, relevant contemporary evidence from the UK and other country/countries, evaluation of their similarities/differences and/or evaluation of the validity of alternative arguments.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Responses to inequality are most effective when governments commit to and fund legislation to change the status quo. The smoking bans, and the high taxation of tobacco products has reduced heart disease and lung cancer for example. It is difficult to see how NGOs could ever have had the same effect on the health of a nation. The Equality Act of 2010 helped make salaries for men and women more transparent and further protected the rights of those disabled in the work place. It was therefore the threat of legal action which forced many businesses to comply, thereby helping to reduce inequality. There is no doubt that NGOs had a significant role in helping to bring about both the smoking ban and the Equality Act of 2010 but what has become clear is that government responses in tackling inequality are more effective than non-governmental ones.</i></p> <p>This example contains a basic conclusion, draws analysis of key factors together and provides an overall judgement supported by reasons/evidence.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Non-governmental responses to inequality in the UK have become more important in recent years. The number of NGOs has grown both in the UK and abroad. NGOs have also become more professional incurring higher overhead costs and initiating much larger fundraising efforts. For many living in Britain they are an important support in the everyday lives of the homeless, disabled and those who are ill. NGOs have also been successful at narrowing the pay gap between men and women and helping to pass the Equality Act of 2010. The Fawcett Society and Action Aid have been leading voices to combat violence against women for example. However, income inequality has widened in Britain in the last 30 years suggesting that non-governmental responses to wealth inequality at least have not worked. To redistribute resources in society and make Britain a fairer society there must be the political will and widespread popular support for such change. A more progressive tax structure, like that in Finland and Norway would be a good place to begin because non-governmental responses can help some groups but will never have the far-reaching effect that significant tax legislation would have. Only strong government bent on redistributing wealth more broadly across society can make such a dramatic change in the UK.</i></p> <p>This example contains a detailed conclusion that evaluates key aspects of the question with a justified, balanced conclusion.</p>

Part B

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
23.			15	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 15 marks.</i></p> <p>Credit responses that refer to</p> <p>Benefits of official statistics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • easy and cheap to access – saves time and money as data already exists • usually high-quality data based on large, representative samples • contemporary, for example, official statistics will be gathered and published periodically • usually collected in a standardised and systematic manner – makes it easier to analyse • trends over time can be identified • comparisons can be made between groups and countries. <p>Limitations of official statistics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • may not relate exactly to the issue being studied due to definitions by the collector differing from the user • open to manipulation and being ‘massaged’ for political or economic reasons • socially constructed, may be more useful as studies of the collector rather than the respondents • quantitative data tells us very little about the human stories or interpretations of why things happen as they do • statistical data is only a snapshot of an issue at that moment in time and only represents a partial picture of reality • Marxists criticism of official statistics that their purpose is to conceal or distort reality to maintain the hierarchical status quo. <p>Reference to alternative methods could include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • interviews • focus groups • surveys • questionnaires • case studies. <p>Ethical issues including</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • consent • privacy • harm • deception. <p><i>Award marks for any other relevant points.</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Analysis and evaluation</p> <p>Response 1 <i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching youth unemployment as unemployment statistics have been collected over a long period of time which allows patterns and trends over time to be analysed by the researcher.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a relevant issue.</p> <p>Response 2 <i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching youth unemployment as unemployment statistics have been collected over a long period of time which allows patterns and trends over time to be analysed by the researcher. A further benefit of using this method is that as official statistics on unemployment involves quantitative data which can be presented in a variety of tabular or graphical formats to make it easier to analyse.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of a relevant point and supporting evidence.</p> <p>Response 3 <i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching youth unemployment as unemployment statistics have been collected over a long period of time which allows patterns and trends over time to be analysed by the researcher. A further benefit of using this method is that as official statistics on unemployment involves quantitative data this can be presented in a variety of tabular or graphical formats to make it easier to analyse. However, official statistics are often manipulated by governments to disguise or hide issues. Successive governments have changed the criteria for classifying people as ‘unemployed’ in order to reduce the headline figure. For example, at the moment the overall UK unemployment level is at a record-breaking low of 4% but this figure fails to include the economically inactive (anyone not looking for work or in receipt of benefits), anyone on zero-hour contracts or those in part-time work who cannot secure full-time employment.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point and supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 4</p> <p><i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching youth unemployment as unemployment statistics have been collected over a long period of time which allows patterns and trends over time to be analysed by the researcher. A further benefit of using this method is that as official statistics on unemployment involves quantitative data this can be presented in a variety of tabular or graphical formats to make it easier to analyse. However, official statistics are often manipulated by governments to disguise or hide issues. Successive governments have changed the criteria for classifying people as ‘unemployed’ in order to reduce the headline figure. For example, at the moment the overall UK unemployment level is at a record-breaking low of 4% but this figure fails to include the economically inactive (anyone not looking for work or in receipt of benefits), anyone on zero-hour contracts or those in part-time work who cannot secure full-time employment. This suggests that official statistics are only partially useful for studying youth unemployment as they are only likely to give us a partial view of the numbers out of work.</i></p> <p><i>An alternative method which would be useful for researching youth unemployment in the UK would be to conduct focus groups. By interviewing groups of 7-10 young people affected by unemployment, researchers would be able to gather rich, qualitative data by drawing on and finding out about respondent’s attitudes, feelings and experiences of being unemployed and seeking work. By carrying this process out over different areas and regions around the country a researcher could to get an understanding of whether or not young people across the nation had similar or different experiences. This might not tell us how much unemployment there is but it would tell us about the impact of unemployment on individuals and young people in general and how they ended up in that situation.</i></p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point, supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario and analysis of an alternative method.</p> <p>Response 5</p> <p><i>Official statistics are a useful method for researching youth unemployment as unemployment statistics have been collected over a long period of time which allows patterns and trends over time to be analysed by the researcher. A further benefit of using this method is that as official statistics on unemployment involves quantitative data this can be presented in a variety of tabular or graphical formats to make it easier to analyse. However, official statistics are often manipulated by governments to disguise or hide issues. Successive governments have changed the criteria for classifying people as ‘unemployed’ in order to reduce the headline figure. For example, at the moment the overall UK unemployment level is at a record-breaking low of 4% but this figure fails to include the economically inactive (anyone not looking for work or in receipt of benefits), anyone on zero-hour contracts or those in part-time work who cannot secure full-time employment. This suggests that official statistics are only partially useful for studying youth unemployment as they are only likely to give us a partial view of the numbers out of work. An alternative method which would be useful for researching youth unemployment in the UK would be to conduct focus</i></p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>groups. By interviewing groups of 7-10 young people affected by unemployment, researchers would be able to gather rich, qualitative data by drawing on and finding out about respondent's attitudes, feelings and experiences of being unemployed and seeking work. By carrying this process out over different areas and regions around the country a researcher could, to get an understanding of whether or not young people across the nation had similar or different experiences. However, this method is extremely time consuming and expensive to plan and conduct. A further weakness of using focus groups is that the groups are not representative of the general population so the researcher cannot make generalisations that can be applied to the wider population.</p> <p>If a researcher was to decide to go ahead with using focus groups they would need to gain informed consent from participants. The British Sociological Association states that it should be the researcher's duty to explain to participants what the research is about, who is undertaking and financing it, why it is being undertaken, and how it will be distributed and used before going ahead.</p> <p>This example contains balanced analysis of a relevant point, supporting evidence and explanations which address the specified scenario, analysis of an alternative method and consideration of ethical issues related to one method.</p> <p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 6 <i>Official statistics are a more effective method for gathering data on youth unemployment people because the figures over time allow the researcher to analyse trends and patterns and possible links to events.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark summarises key points – 1 mark.</p> <p>Response 7 <i>Official statistics are a more effective method for gathering data on youth unemployment people because the figures over time allow the researcher to analyse trends and patterns and possible links to events. Official unemployment figures can also allow comparison of youth employment with other groups to determine whether this is similar or different.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark clearly shows which method is preferred, supported with reasons – awarded 2 marks.</p> <p>Response 8 <i>Official statistics are a more effective method than focus groups for gathering data on youth unemployment to a significant extent because the figures over time allow the researcher to analyse trends and patterns and possible links to events. Official unemployment figures also allow comparisons between youth employment and other groups in society to determine whether there are similarities or differences. Although the focus groups can produce more qualitative information to provide an understanding of the experience of unemployed youths these findings are only valid for those small groups interviewed.</i></p> <p>This concluding remark clearly shows which method is preferred, supported with reasons and reasons for rejecting an alternative method – 3 marks.</p>

Question		Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
24.		15	<p><i>Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 15 marks.</i></p> <p>Arguments that the source is valid and/or reliable</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> researched, produced and published by an academic institution carried out by trained researchers following academic protocols nationally representative sample of children born in the UK with a cohort of 19,500 in study is very large – accurate generalisations can be applied to wider population arguments that a response rate of 11,726 out of a cohort of 19,500 is relatively high conducted between August 2015 and September 2016 so relatively up-to-date participants were interviewed face-to-face and completed a questionnaire – multiple methods reinforce reliability of information and conclusions reached by the study face-to-face interviews offer several advantages including yielding more truthful responses and allowing researchers to clarify questions to respondents which increases reliability data relates to links between weight and family background of young people meaning if used as secondary data it will be valid to researchers of inequality longitudinal studies can produce both quantitative data and rich, qualitative data longitudinal studies trace developments over time, rather than just taking a one-off ‘snapshot’ of one moment – this means there will be other data sets available to examine and identify trends and causes of issues over time. <p>Arguments that the source’s validity and/or reliability are questionable</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> this source is only a summary of the research findings time lapse of over one year to conduct sweep of cohort coupled with time lapse from end of research in March 2016 to publication in December 2017 – findings in this report only accurate at time when ‘snapshot’ of cohort was captured relatively low response rate of 11,726 out of a cohort of over 19,500 longitudinal cohort studies risk sample attrition – members of the cohort dropping out or not being contactable – which reduces reliability further information is required on use of interviews and questionnaires to evaluate validity and reliability information appears to be omitted from the source, for example, no information or data relating to figure 2 yet this is available for figures 1 and 3. <p>Possible approaches to answering this question</p> <p>Response 1</p> <p><i>Source C has been produced by academics from the Institute of Education at UCL. This could be one reason for it to be considered trustworthy, as the research will have been produced by trained researchers who have followed academic protocols.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis of one key aspect related to the trustworthiness of the source.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Response 2</p> <p><i>Source C is based on the responses of 11,726 respondents from a nationally representative sample of over 19,500. This is an extremely large sample which will have been calculated by the research designers and will allow generalisations about the wider UK population of 14-year olds to be made and a reason to consider the source trustworthy. A variety of methods for contacting these respondents were also used including</i></p> <p><i>face-to-face interviews and questionnaires which would have ensured a high response rate from the cohort and increases trust in the source.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis, supported by evidence, of one key aspect related to the trustworthiness of the source.</p> <p>Response 3</p> <p><i>Source C was conducted between January 2015 – March 2016 which is fairly up-to-date and therefore accurately captures the health, obesity and socio-economic circumstances of the respondents and their families. However, as these findings were conducted over a period of over a year and not published until December 2017 there may be inaccuracies or discrepancies in the recording and transcribing of data by researchers which reduces the trust we can have in Source C. There is also a possibility that respondents have not answered truthfully in interviews or questionnaires and have tried to provide researchers with the information they feel they seek. Nevertheless, as this source is part of a longitudinal study the researchers can revisit, check and repeat this research with the cohort to update their findings.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis and evaluation of strengths and weaknesses of one key aspect of the source, supported by knowledge of social science research.</p> <p>Response 4</p> <p><i>Source C can be considered reliable as it is from a longitudinal study. This research method can produce both quantitative data and rich, qualitative data as it has used interviews and questionnaires during the course of this study. Quantitative data is also illustrated in Figure 3 in Source C to show results of research into weight and obesity amongst 14-year-olds by sex in a graphical form which makes it easier for the reader to analyse and interpret. This research can be repeated in future when the respondents are older to determine if the results and patterns are similar or different at a different age or stage. The ability to repeat the same research with the same cohort or sample is a further reason the source is trustworthy.</i></p> <p>This example contains analysis and evaluation of a key aspect of the source supported by knowledge of social science research and reference to additional or alternative approaches which increase the trustworthiness of the source.</p>

Question			Max mark	Detailed marking instructions for this question
				<p>Conclusions</p> <p>Response 5 <i>Overall, Source C is extremely trustworthy as it has been conducted by trained, academic researchers who have gathered information from a very large sample.</i></p> <p>This example contains a simple summary of key points – 1 mark.</p> <p>Response 6 <i>Despite some limitations associated with use of longitudinal studies, such as sample fatigue, Source C is largely trustworthy. The methodology employed by researchers will be academically robust and the sample size ensures that the findings are likely to be an accurate reflection of the study population.</i></p> <p>This example contains a clear overall judgement about the trustworthiness of the source supported by reasons/evidence – 2 marks.</p> <p>Response 7 <i>Source C is highly trustworthy. The source is valid to a large extent as a piece of social research as it details information on inequalities in health between young people from different educational backgrounds. Trust in source C is also enhanced by the fact that it has been researched and produced by academic researchers using an extensive sample population and methods which can be repeated, all of which increase the reliability of the information presented. Although further information on why information relating to 'Figure 2' is omitted or what that information was related to would increase our trust in Source C, it is not enough to make us question the validity or reliability of the information it does present.</i></p> <p>This example contains a clear overall judgement about the trustworthiness of the source supported by analysis and Evaluation – 3 marks.</p>

END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS